

Professor Shaun Gregory, Pakistan Security Research Unit, SSIS, University of Bradford, Bradford, BD7 1DP. srgregor@hotmail.co.uk 01422-882669 / 07795-952978

Review of the UKBA Country of Origin Report for Pakistan (Report dated 17 January 2011) for the IAGCI.

Introduction

I have accessed the COI Pakistan Report through the RDS website as requested. The document is in PDF and I cannot therefore provide comments directly on the text [in track changes] as I did when I reviewed the COI Pakistan Report in 2009. This document therefore contains all of my comments on the 2011 Report.

Overall I found the COI Report to be an impressive document in terms of its scope and inclusiveness, and in terms of the focus and balance of material selected. It seemed to me throughout to have found its way to the most pertinent issues and developments and to be up-to-date (subject to the caveat discussed below) in its considerations. It draws on an extensive and, in most cases, exemplary range of reliable sources from within and outside Pakistan and its region.

In addition to the guidelines setting out the nature and purposes of the COI reports I would also want to reflect on how successfully this iteration has responded to the issues I raised in 2009. It is good to see that the current report continues to be comprised of extracts from reliable sources rather than, as was floated in 2009, that the report move over to an integrated narrative. I argued against the latter last time on the grounds that (a) it was likely to add unnecessary padding to the report; (b) it would make it harder for the UKBA to keep opinion and policy out of the Report.

One further framing point is this: quite a few (indeed I'd say most) of the major annual reports on Pakistan appear in the spring of the year subsequent to the year under consideration (typically between January and April). This is true of the US State Department, UNHCR, HRCR, Amnesty, etc. It follows that your COI report, by being slightly out of synch with that, is necessarily going to be completed and reviewed in a change-over period. It might be better for your COI's to be completed around April 20XX (rather than January), such that it can be informed by the latest country relevant reports elsewhere and then reviewed in the next quarter period (to August 20XX for example)? Presumably there are good reasons for the present phasing which I am not aware of, so this is just an observation.

HO: Your positive and constructive comments on the Pakistan COI Report have been gratefully received and are conducive to the way in which the report is used by asylum decision makers in UKBA.

Latest News

If you wish to update the latest news beyond mid January 2011 then the following need to be added:

6 January The HRCR issue a report which details 748 targeted political killings in Karachi through 2010.

<http://www.dawn.com/2011/01/06/karachi-targeted-killings-claimed-748-lives-last-year-hrcp.html>

2 March Pakistan's Federal Minister of Minorities Dr Clement Shahbaz Bhatti, the only Christian in the Pakistan cabinet, was killed in Islamabad close to his mother's house by gunmen, thought to be Pakistan Taliban. Like Salman Taseer, murdered in early January, Bhatti was an outspoken supporter of the amendment or repeal of the blasphemy laws and a defender of religious minorities. Of the three senior Pakistani politicians who led the attempts to address the blasphemy laws only former information minister Sherry Rehman remains alive. Herself subject to death threats and *Fatwas* Rehman has been effectively in hiding for many months. Bhatti's death effectively ends the struggle to repeal the blasphemy laws for the foreseeable future.

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-south-asia-12617562>

<http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2011/mar/10/shahbaz-bhatti-obituary>

<http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2011/mar/02/sherry-rehman-pakistan-blasphemy-laws-hitlist>

8 March A massive car bomb killed at least 32 people and injured 125 in the heart of Faisalabad in central Punjab, one of the areas least affected by terrorist violence in recent years, but now increasingly subject to attacks.

<http://www.dawn.com/2011/03/08/explosion-heard-in-faisalabad-reports.html>

9 March In Adezai, about 12 miles from Peshawar (KPK), a suicide bomber blew himself up at the funeral of the wife of the leader of the Aman Lashkar killing 43 and injuring 52. This Lashkar (army) was comprised of tribal opponents of the Taliban and the attack is understood to be a reprisal for resisting the Taliban.

<http://tribune.com.pk/story/130104/suicide-blast-in-adezai/>

24 March Report that 50 people have been killed in targeted killings in Karachi between 12 and 24th March. Most of those killed are from Karachi's Pashtun community, swollen by internal refugees from the fighting in the FATA/KPK and from the floods. Many lay the blame for the violence on the MQM party which dominates Karachi.

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-south-asia-12846677>

3 April Two suicide bombers, thought to be Afghans, attacked the Sakhi Sarwar shrine at Dera Ghazi Khan in the Punjab killing at least 41 Sufis and injured many more. Taliban spokesmen routinely criticise Sufis for the "un-Islamic" use of shrines and other features of their religious observance.

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-south-asia-12951923>

7 April A grenade attack in Sardar district, Karachi, killed a Pakistan Intelligence Bureau [IB] officer and injured 19 others.

<http://www.dawn.com/2011/04/08/explosion-near-rainbow-centre-in-karachi.html>

7 April A small arms and car bomb attack on the Deputy Inspector General of Police in Quetta kills 2 and injures 9. Thought to be the work of Baloch nationalists.

<http://www.dawn.com/2011/04/07/blast-rocks-quetta-police-official-targeted.html>

21 April At least 16 people have been killed in a blast in one of the largest gambling dens in the volatile Pakistani city of Karachi. Some 30 people are reported to have been wounded in the explosion. Police say the blast was caused by a bomb which rocked an illegal gambling den run by a local crime gang. Officials have told the BBC that the nature of the bomb suggests it was planted by Islamist militants

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-south-asia-13165174>

HO: Thank you for your suggestions for the Latest News section. The purpose of news pages is to bridge the gap between finalising main text and publication of the report, bringing the currency of the report right up to the date of issue. This period will usually cover a maximum of 4 weeks. Therefore the information you have provided is now more likely to be included within the main text of the next report.

P 11

To your list of news sources for further information you might usefully add the Pakistan Institute for Peace Studies [PIPS], which is at: <http://san-pips.com/> Like the Indian SATP PIPS now documents violent incidents across Pakistan and provides an annual security report which now has considerable credibility and reliability.

HO: Thank you. This source will be included in the next report.

P 13/14

1.06: the section on languages is slightly incorrect and slightly misleading. I'd suggest two changes:

(a) the decision to make Urdu the official language was promoted by General Zia ul-Haq [Pakistan's ruler 1977-88] but not instigated by him. It was introduced as the official language in the 1973 constitution prepared and implemented under Zulfikar Ali Bhutto [see: <http://www.pakistani.org/pakistan/constitution/>] and it was intended to be rolled out over 15 years.

(b) although it is the case that only 8% or so have Urdu as their mother/first language, estimates suggest that around another 80-90% have Urdu as their second functional language making it a virtual lingua-franca. It is misleading therefore to allow the suggestion – as the present text does - that only 8% speak Urdu.

HO: Thank you. Regarding point (a) Article 251 – National Language – of the Constitution: noted. On point (b): it would be useful to have a source to quote the estimates suggested. <http://pakistani.pk/pakistan/languages> indicates Urdu being the lingua franca but doesn't offer percentages.

P15

1.08-1.10: A great deal more information is available on Pakistan's telecommunications if you wish to include it. The Pak government has a telecoms regulatory authority, the Pakistan Telecommunications Authority [available at: <http://www.pta.gov.pk/index.php>], there are good Telecoms industry sites mapping the marketplace [particularly good is: <http://telecompk.net/service-providers/>], and business analysts provide quarterly analysis of the Pakistani Telecoms market [e.g. http://www.researchandmarkets.com/research/0a008a/pakistan_telecommunications_report_q1_2011] .

HO: Thank you. This section is intended to just give a brief overview of the telecommunications available, and its ease of access. The sources suggested will be considered for the next report.

1.11 the public holidays listed contain two errors: it should be Eid al-Fitr and Eid al-Adha, not Id al Fitr and Id al Adha.

HO: Thank you for the corrections, which will be updated in the next report.

P16

2.03 As you will be aware the Pakistan HRCP issued its latest annual report (for 2010) on 14th April 2011, after this COI report was drafted. It means that all the relevant sections in the report can now be updated. The report is available at: <http://www.hrcp-web.org/Publications/AR2010.pdf>

HO: The next Pakistan COI Report will be updated with the latest HRCP annual report.

P17

3.02: there is a risk of slight misunderstanding creeping in here given your links at the end of this section to “ethnic groups”. The 10 seats allocated in the National Assembly are for religious minorities (ie non-Muslims) not ethnic minorities. There is some overlap between the two but many/most of the latter are Muslims. I'd suggest that if you do have a link at the end of this section beside that of women it should be to religious minorities, something you might also want to make explicit in the text.

HO: Thank you. This will be made clear in the next report and will include a hyperlink to Freedom of religion as opposed to Ethnic groups.

P18

This section (3: History) needs to update the narrative before it moves on to the discussion of issues from January to December 2010 in the next section. While it is true that Zardari did a deal to cede Sharia in the PATA (and it would be more correct

to say that Zardari agreed the imposition of Sharia rather than that he imposed it himself) this deal fell apart within a month. In April/May 2009 the Pakistan Army began major military operations (Operation *Rah-e-Rast*) in the PATA/KP to clear out the Pakistan Taliban group there (the *Tehreek-e-Shariat-e-Nifaz-e-Mohammedi* “TNSM”) from Swat, Buner, Dir, etc; and in October 2009 began a second wave of military operations (Operation *Rah-e-Nijat*) in the eastern half of South Waziristan in the Mehsud Tribal areas to clear out the Mehsud *Tehreek-e Taliban Pakistan* [TTP]. It was Mehsud’s displaced militants the Pakistan Army then chased further into Orakzai and Khyber (FATA provinces) in 2010 as the COI reports in section 4.03.

These military operations in 2009 (April/May and October) provoked a huge internal movement of the mainly Pashtun population of the FATA/PATA/KP as IDPs (internally displaced persons). At its peak in 2009 more than 3 million people were on the move, though perhaps half returned home within three to six months. However many are still displaced both as a result of this fighting and of the floods in 2010.

For sources on this see the following:

<http://www.crisisgroup.org/en/regions/asia/south-asia/pakistan/B111-pakistan-the-worsening-idp-crisis.aspx>

[http://www.internal-displacement.org/8025708F004CE90B/\(httpCountries\)/D927619B0A8659BB802570A7004BDA56?OpenDocument](http://www.internal-displacement.org/8025708F004CE90B/(httpCountries)/D927619B0A8659BB802570A7004BDA56?OpenDocument)

<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/8065320.stm>

<http://www.nytimes.com/2009/05/31/world/asia/31pstan.html>

<http://www.nytimes.com/2009/10/18/world/asia/18pstan.html>

<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/8311927.stm>

<http://www.doctorswithoutborders.org/publications/topten/2009/story.cfm?id=4102&cat=top-ten-humanitarian-crises>

HO: The narrative of the History section will be updated in the next report to reflect this additional information you have provided.

P20

6.02 This quote is helpful but slightly misrepresents the issue in allowing the suggestion that somehow the way was open for minorities to claim four seats in the Senate in Spring 2009 but they didn’t take the opportunity (“not able to secure the seats”). In truth having agreed in 2008 that religious minorities would have five reserved seats, then four, in the Senate, the Pakistan Prime Minister Gilani made it clear in early 2009 that this commitment could not be implemented in time for the next round of Senate elections due on 4 March 2009 and that minorities would have to wait until 2012 at the earliest.

I could not find a good source on this, but the issue is discussed in: <http://www.christiantelegraph.com/issue4709.html> You might, in any event, think this an overly pedantic point for your purposes.

HO: Thank you. This information will be considered for the next report.

P21

6.07 The 1974 Interim Constitution is available at:
<http://www.ajkassembly.gok.pk/ajkinterimconstitutionact1974.html>

HO: Thank you; this link will be added to the next report.

P26

It might be worth adding around 7.06 that Pakistan has more than 8,000 people on “death row” some having been there for more than 20 years. Pakistan as a result tops the international “death row” league table and – by some recent(ish) accounts – has around one third of the entire world’s death row prisoners.

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-south-asia-12745032>
http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/world/south_asia/6597507.stm

HO: This information will be included in the HR section as suggested as well as in section 14: Death penalty.

P28

8.05: It would be worth adding updated figures from PIPS 2010 Security report (and updated figures from SATP for 2010). This describes a considerable drop in terrorist violence during 2010 against the SATP figures for 2009/10, which in part can probably be attributed to the “success” of Pakistan Army operations in the FATA and KPK in 2009. The text of the PIPS report includes:

“A total of 2,113 militant, insurgent and sectarian-related terrorist attacks were reported from across the country in 2010, killing 2,913 people and injuring another 5,824. The worst affected region of the country was the insurgency-hit province of Balochistan where the highest number of attacks was reported (737), followed by the militancy-infested Federally Administered Tribal Areas (720). Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK) was the third most volatile region of the country with 459 attacks; while 111 attacks were reported in Sindh, 62 in Punjab, 13 in Gilgit Baltistan, six in Islamabad and five in Azad Kashmir”

Source: <http://san-pips.com/>

Another important development here is that Balochistan appears to have overtaken the KPK as the locus of the most terrorist attacks (if not of the most casualties).

HO: Thank you. The figures from the PIPS report will be included in the next update, along with SATP figures.

P 29

It would be worth adding a section at or after 8.07 (this section could also go into 9.24) on the sustained allegations of extra-judicial killings by the Pakistan Army in the FATA/KPK (238-249 in Swat alone, allegedly, between 30 July 2009 and 22

March 2010). These reports have led the US Government to sanction military aid to the Pakistan Army units identified as having been involved.

It should be added that the Pakistan Army has long been charged with similar extra-judicial killings in Balochistan, including during the years under review in this COI.

<http://www.reuters.com/article/2010/04/05/us-pakistan-usa-rights-idUSTRE6340HN20100405>

<http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2010/oct/22/us-cut-pakistan-military-aid>

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-south-asia-10667545>

<http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2010/nov/30/us-pakistani-army-swat-murders-secret>

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-south-asia-11832034>

HO: Thank you for the additional sources on extra-judicial killings, which will be included in both the Security section and the section on extra-judicial killings in section 9: Security forces, in the next report.

P32

8.23 There is more PIPS data (as well as updated SATP) which might be of use to you here, as already outlined in detail above (under notes on P28)

HO: PIPS figures will now be included in the next report, as suggested.

P33

Around 8.30: There has been a lot of disappointment with the lack of progress in implementing the “Balochistan package”. The problems in implementation have been caused mainly by military opposition but also by some political opposition and lack of resources. The following is a good summary as of March 2011:

“The government has only been able to implement 15 of the 61 proposals contained in a much-celebrated reforms package aimed at redressing Baloch grievances regarding the affairs of their province. A 38-page progress report on the Aghaz-e-Haqooq-e-Balochistan package, prepared by the Establishment Division, states that the government has not acted on most of the proposals, 16 months since the package was introduced. Officials said that the provincial and federal governments were constrained by a lack of funds, but would do their best to implement the proposals by the end of 2013”.

Source: <http://tribune.com.pk/story/128835/aghaz-e-haqooq-e-balochistan-reform-package-stopped-in-its-tracks/>

HO: Thank you. This additional information will be included in the next report.

P34

8.32 While it is true that South Waziristan remains an important locus of terrorism and instability, the military operations in the eastern part of SW by the Pakistan Army in October 2009, and the peace deal the Pakistan Army has agreed with the Mullah Nazir-led branch of the TTP in the western half of SW means it is perhaps of less importance than the statement in your section allows.

For the past 18 months or more the security focus (for the US and NATO/West) has been in North Waziristan and this is now considered to be “terrorism central”. The following quote might be usefully added:

“North Waziristan agency is considered to be the epicenter of international terrorism. In addition to serving as a haven for al Qaeda’s leadership, North Waziristan (nestled between eastern Afghanistan and northwest Pakistan) also provides shelter to organizations such as the Haqqani network, the Tehrik-e-Taliban Pakistan (TTP), the Islamic Movement of Uzbekistan (IMU), Lashkar-e-Jhangvi (LeJ), and Lashkar-e-Taiba (LeT), among others”.

Source: <http://www.criticalthreats.org/pakistan/north-waziristan-terror-links>

HO: Thank you. Further information on the situation in North Waziristan will be included in the next report.

P36

8.39 It might be helpful to balance the reliance on the SATP with some PIPS data and with other sources. The Indian-based SATP is widely seen as a reliable source but also to be anti-Pakistani in some of the analysis it carries. UKBA could be open to criticism if the COI were to rely on it too heavily. The PIPS data may vary at the margins but does not present an alternative view of the nature and loci of Pakistan’s problems with violence, instability, terrorism, etc.

HO: Thank you. Data from PIPS will be included in the next update, along with SATP figures.

P37

8.42 Hakimullah Mehsud is not dead and the fact that he escaped the drone strike, despite being wounded, is no longer under dispute. Hakimullah has appeared a number of times since his supposed death to a variety of western and regional media. He appeared *inter alia* in the video of the killing of “Colonel Imam”, a legendary Pakistani ISI spy in February 2011.

<http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2010/apr/28/hakimullah-mehsud-survives-cia-drone>

<http://www.dawn.com/2011/02/19/ttp-issues-video-of-colonel-imams-killing.html>

HO: Thank you for the additional information, which will be added into the next report.

P41

9.04 (Could also be inserted at 9.20) The Pakistani police force is widely known for its corruption and violence, including sexual violence. The following gives just a flavour of this and should feature in the COI somewhere:

“A large number of police officials across Pakistan have been booked for rape and human rights violations in the last three years, says an official report submitted to the interior ministry. The report submitted by the National Police Bureau to the ministry of interior said that 78 police officials in Sindh province were involved in 91 cases - 61 in 2008, 22 in 2009 and eight till mid 2010. Though the year 2008 saw 61 cases of rape and human rights violations in Sindh involving 44 police officials, not a single official was sent to prison”

Source: <http://www.sify.com/news/pakistani-police-involved-in-rape-rights-violations-news-international-klsnElbcbbba.html>

Here is a single case from Taxila, close to Islamabad:

“The Asian Human Rights Commission has received information from The News International about a revolting story of a 13 year-old girl (Natasha Aslam), who was continuously gang-raped, mentally, and physically tortured by police officials during 21 days of illegal detention. After finding that she was pregnant, the policemen produced her before a Session court under false charges. The girl was sent to jail where she was finally released on bail. The judge who heard her case was unable to investigate the perpetrators, as they obtained a “stay order” from the Lahore High Court, which prevents any police action against them. Their barbarian crimes thus remain unpunished.

Full story source: <http://www.humanrights.asia/news/ahrc-news/AHRC-STM-078-2010>

HO: Thank you; this additional information will be added to the section on Human rights violations by government forces.

P43

9.11 NACTA is moribund at the moment, in no small part due to ISI opposition (the ISI refuse to be subordinated to a body subordinate in turn to the Ministry of Interior). The Director resigned in July 2010 and resources/political energy have not yet flowed to the organisation:

“National Counter Terrorism Authority (NACTA) hit snags before formally becoming functional due to serious differences among the stakeholders on its mode of functioning. The Govt announced formation of the NACTA in December 2009 and Tariq Pervaiz, who had served as Director General FIA and had vast experience of dealing with counterterrorism strategies, was made its head. However, he stepped down a few days back seeing the non-serious attitude of the Government to make NACTA fully functional”

<http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/Politics/26-Jul-2010/NACTA-is-virtually-dead>

HO: Thank you for the update on NACTA, which will be added to the next report.

P47

9.27 Could add/update:

“ The Pakistan government must immediately provide accountability for the alarming number of killings and abductions in Balochistan attributed to government forces in recent months, Amnesty International said today. In the last four months, at least 90 Baloch activists, teachers, journalists and lawyers have disappeared or been murdered, many in "kill and dump" operations, according to information compiled by Amnesty International. Their bullet-ridden bodies, most bearing torture marks, have been recovered across Balochistan”.

<http://www.amnesty.org/en/news-and-updates/pakistan-must-provide-accountability-rising-atrocities-balochistan-2011-02-23>

HO: Again, thank you. This additional information on disappearances in Balochistan will be included in the next report.

P53

11.16/11.17 I did some extensive checks around the Pak Army’s 2007 amendment of the 1952 Army Act and did not find any evidence that the (2008-date) Zardari/Gilani government had reversed/revised this, nor indeed that they had made any efforts to do so. A measure, perhaps, of the real nature of the military-civilian relationship in Pakistan in the security realm.

HO: Your research on this matter is noted, and much appreciated.

P55

11.23 In case it is helpful *The State of Pakistan’s Children Report* for 2009 (published in June 2010) is now available and can be accessed at:

http://www.sparcpk.org/events/launched_SOPC_2009.php

HO: Thank you; the SOPC 2009 report has been used in the Children's section of the COI Report. SPARC will be reviewed again for any additional information that can be included in the next Pakistan COI Report.

P57

11.30 It may be worth adding here an example of the way in which even the most barbaric “tribal” punishment can be condoned by some of Pakistan’s legislators:

“A Pakistani politician has defended a decision to bury five women alive because they wanted to choose their own husbands. Israr Ullah Zehri, who represents Baluchistan province, told a stunned parliament that northwestern tribesman had done nothing wrong in first shooting the women and then dumping them in a ditch. "These are centuries-old traditions, and I will continue to defend them," he said. "Only those who indulge in immoral acts should be afraid." The women, three of whom were teenagers

and whose "crime" was that they wished to choose who to marry, were still breathing as mud and stones were shoveled over their bodies, according to Human Rights Watch.”

<http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/asia/pakistan/2660881/Pakistani-women-buried-alive-for-choosing-husbands.html>

HO: Thank you; the Country Researcher was aware of this incident and will look to include further detail in the next report.

P65

13.02 It may be helpful to add a few lines about the strata of prisoners in Pakistani gaols:

“Prisons in Pakistan are not salubrious places. The common criminal from a poor background is assigned to Class C confinement, with virtually no amenities. Abuse is common. Prisoners of higher social status are assigned to Class B prisons, where conditions are better, and they can procure better food and some amenities from their own pocket. Class A prisons are for "prominent" offenders. Conjugal visits are not the rule but are allowed in some cases”

<http://www.phaseloop.com/foreignprisoners/pris-pakistan.html>

HO: Thank you; a useful and interesting source that will be included in the next report. It also has helpful information for all Country Researchers who write COI Reports on other countries.

P72

15.11 there appears to be an error in this section as it states: “As per HRCP database, a total of 747 persons were killed in Karachi during 2009. Out of these, 1,415 were men, 198 women and 134 children.”

HO: Thank you for picking up on this error, which will be corrected in the next report.

P75

16.07 There is some evidence that this figure for internet use may be on the high side. The Internet Service Providers Association of Pakistan (ISPAK) website has around 10 million for Feb 2011 and many – perhaps 75% - of those are accessing the internet through mobile phones:

<http://www.ispak.pk/>

HO: Thank you; the figures reported will be checked and updated in the next report.

P76

Some additional press sources which may be of use:

<http://www.pakistanpressfoundation.org/>
<http://www.apns.com.pk/>

<http://pakistanpressclub.blogspot.com/>
<http://www.ppnewsagency.com/>
<http://pakistanmediawatch.com>
<http://pfuj.pk>

There is also an excellent new EU-sponsored report on the Pakistan media:

Marco Mezzera and Safdal Sial, *Media and Governance in Pakistan*, October 2010, available at: <http://www.initiativeforpeacebuilding.eu/pdf/pakistanOct.pdf>

HO: Thank you for the additional sources, which will be consulted prior to the next report, and added where relevant.

P82

Much of the text in 18.05 is repeated in 18.09. Presumably that is acceptable given how the material is used.

HO: Thank you for pointing this out but, as you suggest due to the nature of how COI Reports are used, there can be repetition across the sections.

P86

19.09 You give data here for many of the smaller minorities - Sikhs, Parsis, Buddhists, etc - but not for Christians (mainly in the Punjab) and Hindus (mainly in Sindh) the two largest non-Muslim groups. Data is difficult to come by, there has been no census since 1998, and in any event religious minorities tend to under-report out of fear and to be under-reported for political reasons. However, reliable estimates suggest about 3-4 million Christians and 3-4 million Hindus.

A good source is the May 2009 UNHCR *Report on the Situation of Religious Minorities in Pakistan*, available at:

<http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/publisher,WRITENET,,4b01856e2,0.html>

HO: This is a very useful additional source on religious groups, which will be incorporated into the next report.

P102

19.72 It may be worthwhile adding a link to one or two of the *Khtam-e-Nubuwwat* websites where they make quite clear the strength and nature of their opposition to the *Ahmadiyya*.

<http://www.khatm-e-nubuwwat.org/>
<http://www.khatmenubuwwat.org/> (London)

HO: Thank you for these links, which will be consulted and added to the next report, where relevant.

P107

19.99 There is extensive quoting in the Ahmadiyya section from the Eastern Canada Regional Amir, for which I'm sure there is a good reason. However the UK Ahmadiyya leadership – which is also the international Ahmadiyya leadership – might be a better place to get detailed and nuanced insight about issues as they pertain to the UK?

<http://ahmadiyya.org.uk/>

Useful bit of background from the BBC: <http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/8711026.stm>

HO: The quoting from the Eastern Canada Regional Amir is primarily due to the usage of the Responses to Information Requests by the Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada. The UK Ahmadiyya website will be consulted and included in the next report, where relevant.

P109

19.108 The numbers in this paragraph don't add up: “ 20 Christians and 21 Hindus were forced to convert to Islam during the year, of whom 15 were men, 13 women, and four children”. Is this a verbatim quote?

HO: Thank you for picking up this error. The source will be checked and, if necessary, an alternative source will be sought for the correct figures.

P109

19.109 There is an overly-rosy faulty picture here. Christians struggle to get a decent education, in part often a result of poverty, but in part also often due to discrimination and repression within (Muslim-dominated) state schools and the fact that they cannot access the madrassa system which is available to poor Muslims. Paradoxically nearly all of the Christian schools which persist in Pakistan as a legacy of the British colonial presence tend to be patronised by the wealthier and often exclusively Muslim pupils/students because of the quality of the education they offer. An interesting aside is that until 1973 the Pakistani education system used to have a 5% quota for Christians in the better schools and university/HE establishments but that was abolished in the 1973 constitution which gave primacy to Islam, helped along after 1977 by Zia ul-Haq's “Islamisation” of Pakistan under military rule.

For example: “In Sargodha, Pakistan, Muslim teachers at a girls school here have derided Christian students for their faith, beat them, pressured them to convert to Islam and forced them to clean school bathrooms and classrooms after class hours, according to area Christians. Muslim teachers at Government Higher Secondary School Sargodha, in Punjab Province, have so abused Christian students that ... two Christian girls at the school have dropped out, said a 16-year-old student identified only as Sana. She said that the school also denied Christian students certificates of completion when they had finished their studies “This was to bar Christian students from gaining admission to other educational institutions or continue their education,” she said”.

<http://www.christianpost.com/news/muslim-teachers-in-pakistan-allegedly-abuse-christian-students-45231/>

HO: Thank you for your insight and for this additional information. In the next report the section on Christians will be updated substantially following recent events affecting the Christian community.

P113

19.121 the BBC provided a useful list of major attacks on Shias in 2009/10 and into 2011:

“The list of recent sectarian attacks makes for grim reading:

- January 2011: At least 10 people killed after twin blasts targeted Shia Muslim processions in Lahore and Karachi
- September 2010: At least 50 people killed in a suicide bombing at a Shia rally in Quetta, south-western Pakistan
- July 2010: Sixteen Shias killed in an attack on Shias in north-western tribal areas
- February 2010: Two bombs in Karachi kill at least 25 Shias and injure more than 50
- December 2009: At least 30 people killed and dozens injured in a suicide bombing on a Shia procession in Karachi
- Feb 2009: Bomb attack on a Shia procession in Punjab leaves 35 dead”

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-south-asia-12278919>

HO: Thank you for this information on violence against Shia Muslims, which will be considered as an addition for the next report.

P114

20.03 This quote misses the fact that there is a sizeable Baloch ethnic population in Afghanistan too. This suggested quote from the highly respected US journal Foreign Policy from April 2010 might be helpful:

“Balochistan is a region that is spread across Iran, Pakistan and Afghanistan. The combined area of this region is around 600,000 square kilometers, which is about the size of Ukraine; 347,000 km² is part of Pakistan, 181,785 km² in Iran and around 70,000 km² in Afghanistan. Despite having large areas in Pakistan and Iran, the Baloch population is around 5 million and 2 million respectively in both the countries. It is estimated that more than 200,000 Baloch people live in southern Afghanistan”.

<http://www.foreignpolicyjournal.com/2010/04/18/balochistan-the-other-side-of-the-story/>

HO: This quote will be added to the next report.

P118

21.10 It may be only anecdotal but there was a famous/infamous item on the gay scene in Pakistan provided on the BBC website in 2005. It presents a more liberal picture [at least for Pakistan's urban elite who often have lives of much more "western" character] of homosexuality in Pakistan than can be derived from consideration of the undoubtedly draconian legislation.

<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/4583911.stm>

HO: Thank you. The Country Researcher is aware of this article but due to its age it has not been included in recent reports. However, this will be reconsidered. Owing to the distinct shortage of up-to-date information on LGBT issues in Pakistan, any further sources would be gratefully received.

P119

21.11 It is worth adding that there have recently been a number of supportive rulings by the Pakistan supreme court in favour of Pakistan's *Hijra* (transgender "dancing girls"), though Hijra still face abuse and discrimination, including rape (not infrequently at the hands of the police).

<http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2010/jan/29/hijra-pakistan-transgender-rights?intcmp=239>

HO: Thank you. The Country Researcher is aware of this article and has included some detail on the recent rulings affecting Hijra's in paragraphs 21.27-21.28. This additional source will be considered for the next report.

On a not-unrelated theme it is also worth recalling the widespread popularity in Pakistan of the "drag" artist Begum Nawazish Ali, host of a mainstream TV chat show, which suggests that many Pakistanis and Pakistani "society" may not be quite as rigid about sexual boundaries and mores as simple assumptions would suggest. http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/world/south_asia/6111410.stm

HO: It is preferred to use sources published within the last 18 months. This article is dated 2006, though, as it may provide some context to the situation, it will be considered for the next report.

P128

23.19 On grounds that "national conditions are not conducive to local elections" the Gilani PPP government again postponed local elections and has implemented a system (since July 2009) of interim temporary Federal government appointment of administrators to replace the "nazim" system of locally elected mayors and other officials introduced by General Pervez Musharraf in 2001. Opposition to the PPP plan has meant that nazims continue to function in many areas. The following text may be helpful:

"Citing current national conditions as not conducive to local elections, Prime Minister Yusuf Raza Gilani announced July 8 that the national government will appoint

administrators to replace the nazim system of locally elected mayors and other local officials across the country beginning Aug. 1”.

Source:

http://centralasiaonline.com/cocoon/caii/xhtml/en_GB/features/caii/features/2009/07/22/feature-05

See also: Election Commission of Pakistan : <http://www.ecp.gov.pk/> and BBC “Rise of the “civilian dictators” http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/world/south_asia/8161989.stm

HO: This additional information will be considered for the next report although it appears to fit more comfortably in section 6: Political system, as it does not appear to specifically refer to the political rights of women.

P142

23.76 The internationally publicised prosecution of some of the men involved in the village council sanctioned gang-rape of Mukhtaran Mai, received a serious blow in April 2011 (nine years after the offence), when five of the six men charged with her gang-rape were acquitted. Despite the huge international attention around the case state prosecutors were still unable or unwilling to secure a conviction, undermining the confidence of women everywhere in Pakistan that “honour” crimes will be punished.

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-south-asia-13158001>

23.77 There are a number of recent high profile cases which focus some of the issues in this section and could be included as examples, not least the cases of Shazia Bashir Masih (aged 12) and Kiran George (aged 20).

HO: Thank you; this information on recent events concerning rape and violence against women will be added to the next report.

P152

24.13 The Child Protection Bill has made no further progress since it was tabled.

See for example (as of November 2010):

<http://www.dawn.com/2010/11/09/child-protection-bill-rotting-in-parliament.html>

HO: Progress on the Child Protection Bill will continue to be monitored and updated in future reports.

P164

24.74 More up to date figures were provided by the *Guardian* in March 2011, reporting the UK Governments education aid package for Pakistan:

“One in 10 of the world's out-of-school children live in Pakistan, a nuclear-armed state that last year spent just 2% of GDP on education. The number of children absent

from primary school – seven million – is roughly equivalent to the population of its second largest city, Lahore.”

<http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2011/mar/08/pakistan-faces-education-emergency>

HO: This information will be considered as an addition for the next report.

P171

25.07 For a little more on this see Pakistan’s FIA Anti-Trafficking Unit and Punjab’s Child Protection and Welfare Bureau at:

http://www.fia.gov.pk/dep_trafficking.htm#cj
<http://www.cpwb.gov.pk/whtwedo/CPU/camljock.htm>

It should be added that there is plenty of evidence that camel jockey trafficking has continued after 2005, including to the UAE. See for example the Caritas report (November 2010):

<http://www.ucanews.com/2010/11/29/caritas-highlights-child-jockey-menace-in-pakistan/>

HO: Thank you. This information will be added to the next report.

P180

27.02 Given the scale of the floods and the persistence of their impact, and given you have used maps elsewhere in the report [for IDPs for example] it might be helpful to include a good map of the flood affected area.

The World Food Programme for example has good detailed maps at:

<http://www.wfp.org/maps/pakistan-flood-affected-areas-10-august-2010-high-resolution>

HO: Thank you. A map on the floods, or link to such, will be added to the next report.

P191

33.10 Notwithstanding the clearly legitimate cases listed here by Pakistan MoI for the use of the ECL, it is important to record somewhere that ECLs are also regularly used as a form of repression by the state, barring many Pakistanis from leaving the country because they have been critical of the state, or because they would in some way bring the state into disrepute. A good example is Mukhtaran Mai, the village-council ordered gang-rape victim whose plight in 2002 became an international *cause celebre*. Mai was served an ECL in 2005 to prevent her travelling abroad to tell her story because – in the words of the then Pakistan President General Pervez Musharraf - she would bring the country into disrepute.

<http://www.rediff.com/news/2005/jun/17pak1.htm>

HO: Thank you for this insight. It would be helpful, however, to have more up-to-date sources providing evidence that so-called 'dissidents' are prevented from leaving Pakistan.

P208

Annex C

I'd suggest that you have a short section on the Lashkar-e-Jhangvi rather than list it amongst "other domestic groups". This is an increasingly important and violent group with influence in the FATA/KPK as well as in the Punjab and Sindh, and it is close to AQ.

Some suggested text:

"Lashkar-e-Jhangvi (LeJ), a Sunni-Deobandi terrorist outfit was formed in 1996 by a break away group of radical sectarian extremists of the Sipah-e-Sahaba Pakistan (SSP) an anti-Shia Sunni extremist outfit, which accused the parent organisation of deviating from the ideals of its slain co-founder, Maulana Haq Nawaz Jhangvi. The LeJ has been involved in many assassinations and terrorists attacks, particularly on Shias but increasingly on representatives of the Pakistan state and security forces."

<http://www.satp.org/satporgtp/countries/pakistan/terroristoutfits/lej.htm>

HO: This additional information on the LeJ will be included in the next report.

It might also be useful somewhere to have a short section here on the "Punjabi Taliban". This is usually used (wrongly it has to be said) as an umbrella term to refer to the Kashmiri/Punjabi/Sectarian terrorist groups (including the LeT, JeM, SSP, LEJ, etc) and is being increasingly used by the media to distinguish these groups from the Afghan/Pakistan/Pashtun Taliban groups. It might be useful for UKBA users to know who these are?

HO: Thank you; an additional heading on the 'Punjabi Taliban' will be included in the next report. A number of news sources identify the 'Punjabi Taliban' but if you can suggest anything further this would be gratefully received.

P210

Annex D: Prominent People:

Given the UK connection it might be worth pointing out that former President Musharraf is now in exile from Pakistan and is resident in London.

It might also be worth considering having a section on the MQM leader Altaf Hussain, who holds dual UK-Pakistani nationality and is also in exile and resident in London from where he runs the Karachi-based MQM. Rising violence in Karachi involving the MQM, and the recent murder of senior MQM figures, including that of Dr Imran Farooq killed in London (on 16 September 2010), suggest that the MQM is likely to be important in some future asylum/immigration cases.

Useful sources:

<http://www.mqm.org/>

<http://www.mqmuk.com/>

http://www.pakistanileaders.com.pk/profile/Altaf_Hussain

<http://elections.com.pk/candidatedetails.php?id=6881>

HO: Thank you for this additional information on prominent people which will be considered for the next report.

Ends / SRG

26 April 2011.