

Review of the September 2012 UK Border Agency Country of Information Service *Republic of Sudan Country of Origin (COI) Report* on behalf of the Independent Advisory Group on Country Information (IAGCI)

Prepared by Elizabeth Williams (Asylum Research Consultancy – ARC) and Peter Verney (Sudan Update), October 2012

Background to the authors

Elizabeth Williams – Asylum Research Consultancy (ARC)

As a specialist Country of Origin Information (COI) researcher, Elizabeth has over five years experience of conducting COI research to support individual asylum and human rights claims and for UK Country Guidance cases. Asylum Research Consultancy (ARC) was set up in October 2010 in order to continue to provide a case-specific COI research service (following the closure of the Immigration Advisory Service) and to undertake research, advocacy and training to improve the quality of refugee status determination, and in particular, the production and use of COI. ARC also produces a free bi-monthly COI Update which provides notification of new UK Country Guidance cases, new UKBA COI publications and developments in the top refugee-producing countries including Sudan, which can be viewed with other recent publications and projects on ARC's [website](#).

Peter Verney (Sudan Update)

Peter Verney is a specialist in Sudanese current affairs who has worked on publications about Sudan since 1980. These include materials produced by Anti-Slavery International and Minority Rights Group. He is the author of reports on oil, slavery, music and minorities, and has been editor at the briefing service Sudan Update since 1990. In the 1990s he was a member of the Sudan Analysts' Forum convened by the School of African and Oriental Studies (University of London) and the Foreign and Commonwealth Office. In the mid-1990s he wrote the annual critiques of the US State Department reports on Sudan for the US Lawyers' Committee for Human Rights. In 2005 he was an adviser to the House of Commons parliamentary committee on Darfur, and a member of the European Coalition on Oil in Sudan. Since 1999 he has worked on more than 1000 Sudanese asylum cases as a Sudan country expert witness, interviewed over 300 asylum applicants, and given evidence in court at more than 50 asylum hearings, including AA, AH and HGMO (2006). He maintains extensive contacts among the Sudanese community, as well as with academics, journalists and aid workers dealing with Sudan.

Scope of the review

The reviewers understand that the Republic of Sudan Country of Origin (COI) Report is to be used by UKBA decision makers in assessing asylum and human rights claims made by Sudanese nationals and that the main issues currently arising in such cases as set out in the Operational Guidance Note (OGN) on the Republic of Sudan are:

- Civilians from South Sudan
- Members or associates of the SPLM/N
- Civilians fleeing violence in the states of Blue Nile, Southern Kordofan and Abyei
- Members or associates of Darfuri rebel groups
- Members of non Arab ethnic groups from the Darfur states
- Members of opposition groups and perceived government critics, including students, journalists and human rights defenders
- Prison conditions.

Methodology

This review is based upon an analysis of all of the sources and information cited in the September 2012 Republic of Sudan Country of Origin (COI) report. This comprised a cross-check of each excerpt included in the COI Report against the original source of information, and a comparison of the excerpts included in the COI Report to other publicly available sources. This analysis was based on the established best practice criteria for COI research: accuracy, range and reliability of sources, relevance of the information, currency and transparency and retrievability. The Republic of Sudan COI report was also checked for errors, omissions and inconsistencies and its structure and general user-friendliness was assessed.

Research was also undertaken for additional sources of information that may be useful for inclusion in future COI reports on the Republic of Sudan by consulting a variety of publicly available sources including governmental, online libraries of human rights organisations, think-tanks, the media, and academic articles. Sources recommended for inclusion are presented in reverse chronological order. Periodic reports (such as those from the UN) published since the cut-off point of 1 August 2012 from those sources already included in the COIS Service have not been suggested for inclusion, apart from when a new publication raises an issue not already addressed in the current COIS report, as it is presumed that these will be consulted in advance of the next publication of the COIS Service report.

Executive Summary

The September 2012 COI Report on the Republic of Sudan is extremely detailed and thorough with an impressive range of sources. It is significantly (1.75 times) longer than the previous COIS report on Sudan and given its size (388 pages) in some areas the report could be improved by increased cross-referencing between certain sections and by re-ordering particular sections. General findings and recommendations are listed under the respective best practice criteria for COI research:

Accuracy

- No instances were found in which the excerpt of the COI Report was not fully representative of the original source of information.

Range and Reliability of Sources

- Some sections of the COI Report could be improved by including more detailed information from a wider variety of sources, particularly news sources which have access to local contacts.

Relevance of information

- No instances were found where the information included was not relevant to the section or to the purpose of the COIS report.
- Whilst the majority of the sections are very thorough and adequately address the relevant issues, some sections contain more limited source material. In order to emphasise certain issues, additional sources of information and new sub-sections have been recommended for inclusion.

Currency

- On occasion the most recent reports available from particular sources were not always cited, despite being available at the time of publication.
- Some sections of the report could be improved by including more up to date information, particularly in relation to the security situation.

Transparency and Retrievability

- In limited cases, sources of information have been inaccurately or incompletely referenced.
- In some instances inactive hyperlinks were provided.

COIS: We welcome the comments made by the reviewer and have responded in further detail in relevant sections of the review below. Below are comments in response to the general observations above:

- We do not agree with the suggestion that some sections may be 'limited'. Although we acknowledge some sections are more comprehensive than others based on a range of factors including the significance of the issue in Sudan, the availability of information and the demand for COI from UK Border Agency (Agency) officials.

- We do not agree with some of the reviewers comments regarding the range of sources used, in particular the inclusion of news media in the Security situation chapter – see comments on that section.
- We do not agree with the suggestion that the report includes material which is 'dated', or that not the most up to date information available at the time the report was constructed has been included. The report accurately reflects the current situation in the country as of 1 August 2012 (which is the cut off date of the report) and note that the reviewer has not provided specific examples of incidents or issues which are not covered up to and including this date. Many of the reviewers suggested additional sources relate to material published after 1 August 2012 (and many of the documents are reports from sources already included in the current report).
- We have accepted some of the reviewers' suggestions to include hyperlinks and some restructuring but not all of these. It is interesting to note that the reviewers' comments are at odds with feedback in the IAGCI-commissioned review of children, which was complimentary on the structuring and use of cross referencing in the children's section specifically but also in the report generally.

General comment on referencing

The COIS Service report does acknowledge the difficulty in providing direct hyperlinks for UN sources:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

Annex N: References to source material

The web links provided below for UN documents are those used in order to access the source material listed and compile this report. However for some documents, due to the configuration of the UN's website, the links below may not allow documents to be re-accessed. In such cases the document should be searched for via the UN's Official Documents Search System by inputting the document's title and/or reference number (included in brackets).

However, it is suggested that rather than providing inactive hyperlinks for UN sources, that where available, the direct web link to the UNHCR Refworld page is cited or that the Sudan publications page of the relevant UN body is provided. Active hyperlinks for UN sources have been presented as 'tracked changes' to the Annex of Sources which can be found at the end of this document.

COIS: Consideration will be given to the referencing of UN documents in COI reports.

Whilst recognising the terms and conditions of private subscription sources, it was also not possible to review the following subscription only sources: [4a-b] [7a-c] [21a] [31a-f] [120a] [124a]

General observations

The current government of Sudan has by common acknowledgement created more refugees than any of its post-independence predecessors. It has engaged in a succession of internal conflicts around Sudan's periphery as well as quashing attempts in the capital to remove it.

The vast majority of those affected remain either displaced within its boundaries or in neighbouring countries, while a tiny percentage reach Europe and the UK.

The independence of South Sudan has not ended the conflict between the two Sudans, but internationalised it. The 2005 Comprehensive Peace Agreement, like others before it, has not been fully implemented. Without stability and a properly comprehensive approach to peace, the flux of refugees and displaced people is sure to continue.

The COI Service Report reflects these added dimensions to the conflict in a compendious reference work. To an informed researcher with some grounding in Sudan seeking to learn more, it provides a broad spectrum of valuable references. For a less experienced reader there remains the risk that some essential pointers get lost amid the wealth of meticulously-compiled detail.

By its own definition it does not set out to provide a narrative, although several can be derived from within it.

The ideology of the current Sudanese regime and its methods can be seen in snatches, as can the shifting alliances among “rebel” groups, although studied evenhandedness can sometimes obscure the sheer disproportionate scale of the government's campaigns of violence, usually against civilians.

The ostensible “confusion” of new alliances can lead to outside observers overlooking the deeply-rooted reality of Sudanese aspirations towards democracy. Without a sense of Sudan's history, it is impossible to understand what drives the process today.

The report's format does not highlight any particular quotes, and an item's significance is implied only by its length, which can be misleading.

For some users, it would be worth emphasising key points – widely acknowledged facts that summarise the reality – which are already in the report, but buried in the text body.

For example, this (from Small Arms Survey, currently cited at paragraph 11.04 in the ‘Availability of arms’ section of the report):

“The Sudan government has been the primary source of weapons to armed groups and militias”

Sometimes the inevitable focus on published sources, particularly English language sources, can mean that the actual discourse among Sudanese people is overlooked. The result can be factual accuracy which nevertheless misses key points.

One illustration of this would be the section on Sudanese currency. In the face of revaluations and new denominations – with the new Sudanese pound worth one thousand of the old - Sudanese people on the street often still think and speak in terms of the old currency. This needs to be reflected in the report to avoid misunderstandings in asylum interviews.

To get a grip on the complexities of the situation, some analysis and narrative are essential. The frequent absence of political analysis or context in the source quotes can obscure the underlying

causes of problems and the likelihood of their recurrence.

It is possible, out of a wish not to appear biased, to be so studiously apolitical that the perspective is adrift from realities.

It is important to minimise the hazard of misapplication or misinterpretation of the information provided.

“What do you need to know to, to understand where you are?” should be the guiding question.

If the purpose of the report is to monitor developments in Sudan, its readers must also have a sense of how Sudanese society works, of its politics and sociology.

If the concern is for stability, then the report should also provide a sense of continuity and connectedness, and of the “Whys” as well as the “Whats”.

To this end, the Rift Valley Institute's Sudan Handbook - cited once in the report – [source 121] could usefully be cited more often. It provides some of the outlines and framework necessary for making sense of otherwise isolated facts and news events.

It would also benefit the report's level of insight to refer to Africa Confidential newsletter. This is a key resource which reports events ahead of mainstream media or institutional reporting, in closer detail, and in far less formulaic terms. Africa Confidential is especially useful for its grasp of continuity and motive in Sudanese politics, for example in the historical and contemporary behaviour of the National Islamic Front / National Congress Party.

Africa Confidential's article “Rockets and meetings” (Vol. 53. No.11, 25th May 2012), includes details on the Sudanese Revolutionary Front (SRF). On 27 April 2012, Vol 53 N° 9 of Africa Confidential reported how “Khartoum is fighting on three fronts: a determined Southern army, confident armed oppositionists and a hostile population”. Edition 48.05 of Africa Confidential included a Darfur Who's Who. The BBC Monitoring Service also provides a unique set of insights into Sudanese current affairs, albeit of a more fragmented nature, through its coverage of the Sudanese media.

It needs to be emphasised that material should not be taken out of context, nor should it be treated as “gospel” rather than as the perspective of a particular source.

COIS: Thank you for the observations and general comments.

In response to some of the reviewer’s comments, it is perhaps worth clarifying that COI Service’s remit is to provide accurate, up to date, relevant (to the asylum decision making process), balanced and impartial information, based in internationally accepted guidelines for COI research to assist officials involved in the asylum decision making process. Additionally, all reports are based on a standard template, which sets out the structure and issues to be covered in general terms though researchers are allowed to depart from this and tailor reports to the specific issues of the country and needs of decision makers.

Our methodological approach often leads to reports that do not provide a single, distinct narrative or interpret information in a more user-friendly way however we consider it essential to maintaining the report’s objectivity and fulfilling its purpose as a practical tool to inform decision makers on variety of relevant matters. Against its

stated purpose in our view the Sudan report does generally provide a clear explanation of the current complicated and ongoing human rights issues, providing background information interweaved with a mix of headline facts, trends, as well as more detailed studies and reports. The sections on the security situation, women and children are examples of this. Additionally, extensive cross referencing means that sections are clearly connected to other relevant sections, allowing users to access information in a more holistic way than a single, lengthy narrative.

Some of the reviewer's general observations on how the report may be used or misused by officials appear to be somewhat speculative, at least not evidenced in the above text. The only example where the reviewers provide relates to the presentation of information about the availability of arms in Darfur suggesting this is 'buried in the text'. However, taking this example, we think this issue is adequately explained in various sections of the report, largely under the thematic subsection entitled 'Drivers of violence' which explains some of the key factors causing violence in Darfur (chapter 8) and throughout chapter 11 on 'Non-government armed forces', which includes a dedicated subsection entitled 'Availability of arms' in Sudan.

Last, we welcome engagement with external stakeholders and sources of COI to help further explain the nuanced nature of Sudanese society. Accessing Arabic and other language sources to reflect Sudanese 'discourse' is certainly interesting but difficult in practice for a number of reasons. We will consider the merits of subscribing to BBC Monitoring and Africa Confidential, both looking potentially valuable sources, but unfortunately funding such subscriptions is challenging in the current period of tightening budgets.

Review (by section of the report)

Reports on Sudan published or accessed between 2 August 2012 and 11 September 2012

The 7 publications provided in this section are not a comprehensive update of relevant sources published in the period between 2 August 2012 to 11 September 2012. Given that there are so few sources listed in this section, would it not be possible to include these reports under the relevant subject heading? These reports are clearly thematic such as the Waging Peace report 'The Dangers of Returning Home', and there is the possibility that relevant information will be overlooked if it is not included in the corresponding section of the report, in this case 'Returnees'. It is therefore suggested that this section is deleted as it may give the false impression that no other relevant sources were published in the reporting period, and that instead the links to the reports are presented under the relevant subject heading.

COIS (1): Not accepted.

The reviewers have not indicated what reports should have been include so it is difficult to comment on what other sources the reviewers are referring.

We included only noteworthy reports and publications in this section, which admittedly is somewhat subjective but doesn't detract from their potential usefulness. We think it unlikely that users might conclude that there is no reports were released

in the time-frame, though we will look to include a disclaimer that the list of sources is not exhaustive.

Regarding the suggestion of including the sources referred in the main narrative, since the narrative cut-off is 1 August we think this would only serve to confuse users.

Also note that the link provided to the Waging Peace report is not active (and the minor error in the title):

- Waging Peace, The Danger of Returning Home, September 2012
http://www.wagingpeace.info/images/pdf/THE_DANGER_OF_RETURNING_HOME.pdf

COIS (2): We were informed by Waging Peace they had revised their website after the Sudan report was finalised. We will update any broken links during our next review.

USEFUL SOURCES FOR FURTHER INFORMATION

It is suggested that to facilitate further research this list could be extended to reflect the range of sources as has been included in the COIS report:

Sudan Tribune, <http://www.sudantribune.com/>
Reuters Africa, Sudan Page, <http://af.reuters.com/news/country?type=sudanNews>
Sudan Human Baseline assessment, <http://www.smallarmssurveysudan.org/>
Enough Project, <http://www.enoughproject.org/>
African Centre for Peace and Justice Studies, <http://www.acjps.org/>
Human Rights Watch, Sudan Page, <http://www.hrw.org/africa/sudan>
Amnesty International, Sudan Page, <http://www.amnesty.org/en/region/sudan>
Refworld Sudan, <http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/country/SDN.html>
Ecoi.net, <http://www.ecoi.net/>

International Crisis Group, Crisis Watch, Sudan pages: <http://www.crisisgroup.org/en/publication-type/crisiswatch/crisiswatch-database.aspx>

Waging Peace: <http://www.wagingpeace.info>

CHR Michelsen Institute, Sudan page: <http://www.cmi.no/sudan/?id=1&Home>

Radio Dabanga: <http://www.radiodabanga.org/>

COIS (3): Accepted. We will include suggested links and other websites which may be particularly relevant.

2. ECONOMY

The inflation rate has now been reported to have increased to 41%. See

- [Sudan Tribune, Analysis: The winds of change in Sudan, 26 September 2012](#)

COIS (4): Noted, thank you.

It is suggested that in addition to including information on the general economic situation, that sources are presented which address access to the employment market in Sudan, such as:

- [IOM, Migration in Sudan: A Country Profile 2011](#), *Economic environment*
- [World Bank, A Poverty Profile for the Northern States of Sudan, May 2011](#), *LIVELIHOODS AND SHOCKS*
- [Internal Displacement Monitoring Centre, SUDAN: Durable solutions elusive as southern IDPs return and Darfur remains tense, 23 December 2010](#), *Darfur: Livelihoods; Khartoum: Livelihoods*

COIS (5): Partially accepted. COIS recognises the value of having information on access to employment, however the decision to include further COI on this subject must be weighed against the overall size of the report, its direct relevance to decision making and the competing demands to cover other issues within the report.

3. RECENT HISTORY (1956-2010)

The title of former Vice President Abel Alier's book, "Too Many Agreements Dishonoured" summarises the experience of many. Unless one knows about the litany of broken deals, then it is possible to accord the latest offerings more importance than they merit. See for example:

- [Department of International Relations and Cooperation, Republic of South Africa, Statement on the attack on a UNAMID Convoy in Darfur, Sudan which resulted in the death of a South African Peacekeeper, 18 October 2012](#)
- [Sudan Tribune, Too Many Agreements Dishonoured – Revisited, 6 April 2011](#)

COIS (6): Not accepted.

The reviewers' comments are not clear about which parts of the section they refer. COIS would highlight in response that the section 'History of Sudan's Regional Conflicts' includes an introductory subsection on the causes of conflict, which highlights some of the main drivers of violence in Sudan's history, including the continued marginalisation of certain groups and the difficulties in resolving disputes. Given the overall length of the report it is not felt further information is required on this subject.

It is also not clear how the press release about an attack on UNAMID in October 2012 (after the publication of the report) is relevant to the history section, or what information it provides which isn't covered under 8.20 Darfur, 'Crime and general insecurity (including attacks on humanitarian staff and UN peace keepers'.

Popular opposition to the National Islamic Front / National Congress Party is under-represented.

The report would benefit from inclusion of more detail about the civil society actors in Sudan, both the generation who were part of the peace process in the 1980s, and those engaged in the non-party opposition today to the National Congress Party.

The section on the brief spell of embryonic democracy in Sudan, from the April 1985 “Intifada” until the June 1989 coup by the National Islamic Front, would be more enlightening if it reflected how this was a fruitful time. The notion of democracy (if not its actuality) runs deep in Sudanese society.

Open debate was permitted for the first time in several years, and was bound to appear messy from the outside. It contrasts strongly with the clampdown on discourse of the current regime.

It was during this period that Sudan's “Modern Forces” in the North worked with South Sudanese to produce the Koka Dam agreement, and initiated frameworks for peace, inclusiveness and wider representation.

The current regime's 1989 coup was timed to undermine and derail the peace process, a factor which would benefit from greater emphasis.

The Islamists also helped foment chaos during their inclusion in the various coalition governments during that time.

For further information on the ‘Modern Forces’ see:

- Darfur and the Crisis of Governance in Sudan: A Critical Reader By Salah M. Hassan, Carina E. Ray (Cornell University Press 2009/ The Journal of Modern African Studies / Volume48 / Issue04 / December 2010, pp 664-665)
- [Washington Report on Middle East Affairs, Don't Neglect the "Modern Forces", July/August 1995, pgs. 42-44](#)

COIS (7): Partially accepted. COIS will consider how improvements could be made to describe Sudan's democratic past and popular opposition movement. However this needs to be balanced against the overall length of the report and competing demands over what issues to cover in our reports.

4. RECENT DEVELOPMENTS (JANUARY 2011 – 1 AUGUST 2012)

The following material was not found in the source cited and thus requires an accurate reference:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

4.51 A briefing from the Sudan Human Security Baseline Assessment on the ‘Darfur Peace Process’, dated 29 February 2012 noted:

—On 13 November, SLA-MM, SLA-AW, JEM, and the Sudan People's Liberation Movement-North (SPLM-N) formed a coalition named the Sudan Revolutionary Front (SRF). While aspiring to be a unified political structure, the SRF is, at this stage, more a coalition of military forces with broad agreement on a political vision. Whether it becomes more than just a loose political and military affiliation remains to be seen. Its main platform is the need for a geographically comprehensive peace process and the further unification of all Sudanese opposition forces. ... The Darfurian components of the SRF have pledged not to enter into armed hostilities with the LJM, a signatory of the Doha Document for Peace in Darfur, allaying fears of a repeat of the intra-Darfurian fighting that characterized the period following the partial signing of the Darfur Peace Agreement in 2006.|| [23q]

COIS (8): The link included in the report was accurate at the time of publication. We note that the HSBA source (listed as 23q) was updated on 19 October 2012 and is

now entitled 'Darfur Peace Process & Chronology'. This would explain why the link was broken when the review was conducted.

8. SECURITY SITUATION

DARFUR

It suggested that this section be cross-referenced with 'Update on Sudan's regional conflicts, Darfur' in order that recent information on the implementation of the July 2011 Doha Document for Peace in Darfur is not overlooked.

COIS (9): Not accepted.

The introductory section to Darfur already recommends users refer to background information and provides a link to 'History of Sudan's regional conflicts: Darfur'. This section in turn refers readers to the recent developments section. It is considered that without reading the two background sections together there is a risk information about recent developments may not be fully understood or misinterpreted.

The introduction to chapter 8 (above 8.01) additionally provides extensive cross referencing.

Levels of violence 2011 – July 2012

The only sources cited in this section published in 2012 are reports from the UN Secretary-General. These reports are only published periodically and the most recent source cited is dated 16 July 2012. This means that recent security incidents in Darfur have not been documented in the COIS report. It is therefore suggested that in addition to reports from the UN Secretary-General that news sources are consulted for up to date information when the next Sudan COIS report is published. For example:

- [UNOCHA weekly Bulletins](#)
- [Radio Dabanga](#)
- [Sudan Tribune](#)

COIS (10): Not accepted.

Reliance is given to the UN Secretary General's reporting on UNAMID as the peace keeping mission is one of the few key international sources which has a constant and significant presence on the ground in Darfur. As the COI report makes clear (end of para 8.11), the UN Secretary General is mandated to report every 90 days on the mission's progress – these reports are therefore not periodic as the reviewer suggests, but rather cyclical. COIS also considers that by presenting the Secretary-General's assessment of the mission's progress against benchmark II (to establish a secure and stable environment), users will more fully understand trends and developments in the security situation. A link is also provided to future reports from the Secretary General to keep this section 'live'.

COIS do not feel that the inclusion of arbitrarily selected media reports about specific events or security incidents from the Sudan Tribune, Radio Dabanga or UNOCHA weekly bulletins will further inform users about the security situation. Indeed such sources may risk confusing readers. COIS will however include links to news sources should users wish to search for additionally information not included in the report.

Finally COIS would make the point that there are a number of other reports in this section not from the Secretary General which were published in 2012.

It should also be noted that the UN Secretary-General reports have also been criticised for under-reporting security incidents in Darfur. See:

- [Eric Reeves \(Reuters Alert\), "Darfur's invisible violence,"](#), 28 August 2012

COIS (11): We are aware of the criticisms made about UN reporting and have included suitable references in the report. Chapter 18 includes a subsection entitled 'Human Rights Monitoring in regional conflict areas' and includes appropriate subsections and detailed COI about the UN's reporting mechanisms in Darfur, this includes at para 18.12 and 18.14 similar critical articles from Eric Reeves. Chapter 8 also includes cross referencing to chapter 18

Compare for example the overview of security incidents reported in paragraph 8.11 to have taken place between 30th December 2011 and 17 April 2012 with the violence and security incidents reported by Waging Peace in the same period:

- [Waging Peace, Humanitarian and Security Update Darfur March 2011 – March 2012, March 2012, *Insecurity and Violence*](#)

COIS (12): Accepted. COIS will include a reference to this report or future editions, as it provides a useful compilation of media reporting in one source.

It may also be useful to sub-divide this section further to document security incidents in each of the three States of Darfur.

COIS (13): Not accepted. COIS assumes the reviewer means subdividing the section to report on the five states which now make up Darfur, not three. Given the number of conflicts in Sudan at the current time and overall size of the report, together with the limited resources in COIS to work on country reports, COIS do not feel it would be appropriate to further lengthen the security section by subdividing information in this way.

If there is a business need COIS will consider producing a other COI products on the security situation which could include a security section on each of Darfur's five states.

The reference for the following paragraph needs to be revised:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

8.10 The 'Report of the Secretary-General on Children and armed conflict', 26 April 2012 (A/66/782 – S/2012/261), covering events in 2011 explained: —The country task force verified 54 cases of maiming and 17 cases of killing of children [in Darfur]. The 17 cases of killing included 7 attributed to crossfire, 5 attributed to the Sudanese Armed Forces air strikes and 5 to explosive remnants of war. Of the 54 cases of maiming, 23 children were shot, and 31 were injured by explosive remnants of war.|| [18f] [18r] (para 110)

COIS (14): Accepted

Paragraphs 8.11 cites several Reports of the Secretary-General in relation to benchmark II – to establish a secure and stable environment:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

8.11 Annex II of the 'Report of the Secretary-General on the African Union-United Nations Hybrid Operation in Darfur' (S/2009/592), dated 16 November 2009, outlined one of the benchmarks of the peacekeeping mission as follows: —... to contribute to the restoration and upholding of a stable and secure environment throughout Darfur, in which civilians, in particular vulnerable groups, are protected and the displaced populations may choose to return to places of origin.|| [18f](Annex II, p.19) The report further explained —... that many of the benchmarks relate to the broader situation in Darfur and are not restricted to activities covered solely in the mandate of UNAMID.|| [18f](Annex II, p.18) Reporting on progress against benchmark II – to establish a secure and stable environment – in 2011 and 2012, the UN Secretary-General's (S-G) reports noted the following:

It is suggested that it is relevant to also include information from the Reports of the Secretary-General in relation to benchmark III in this section which relates to 'enhancement of the rule of law, governance and human rights protections', or alternatively to include it in the sub-sections 'Human rights violations perpetrated by government (ground) forces', Human rights violations perpetrated by pro-government militia groups' / Human rights violations perpetrated [sic] by rebel groups'.

COIS (15): Partially accepted. Benchmark III is more generally related to human rights abuses, mainly in connection to arbitrary arrest, but also physical integrity. Arbitrary arrest by the security forces is included in Chapter 9. Consideration will be given to how reporting on physical integrity under benchmark III can be incorporated into the later sections examining the security situation for non-combatants. Consideration will also be given to how reporting on arbitrary arrests can be incorporated into Chapter 9.

Drivers of violence

The following source has been published since the September COIS report and is recommended for inclusion:

- [Human Security Baseline Assessment, Business as usual: Arms flow to Darfur 2009-12, 20 September 2012](#)

COIS (16): COIS has included a number of reports from the Human Security Baseline Assessment and will include new publications as they become available.

Human rights violations perpetrated by government (ground) forces

No information has been included in this section on arbitrary arrest and detention being committed in Darfur. See for example:

- [United Nations, Report of the Secretary-General on the African Union-United Nations Hybrid Operation, 16 July 2012, V. Rule of law, governance and human rights](#)
- [Amnesty International, Time for change: a need to end continuing human rights violations, Amnesty International Submission to the UN Universal Periodic Review, May 2011, dated November 2010, HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS IN DARFUR](#)

COIS (17): Not accepted. Issues related to arbitrary arrest and detention are included in chapter 9 under the subsections ‘Human rights violations perpetrated by government forces’ and ‘Human rights violations committed in areas of armed conflict’, which include reference to arbitrary arrest in Darfur. Additionally chapter 16 includes relevant information under ‘Treatment of (perceived) supporters of non-state armed groups’ and the further subsection ‘Darfurian groups and government opponents’.

COIS would also highlight that there is extensive cross referencing to all these sections throughout the report, including in the subsection on Darfur in Chapter 8, which introduces the section ‘Security situation for non-combatants’ by providing key links for users.

It is also suggested that this information is cross-referenced with ‘Popular protests’ which as is set out below, is recommend to also specifically address the situation for protestors in Darfur.

COIS (18): Accepted. COIS will consider how to incorporate popular civil unrest in Darfur and Sudan’s other contested regions in the report more fully.

BLUE NILE AND SOUTH KORDOFAN

It suggested that this section be cross-referenced with ‘Update on Sudan’s regional conflicts, Blue Nile and South Kordofan (Nuba Mountains)’, and especially the sub-section ‘Continued fighting, political stalemate and a deteriorating humanitarian situation (early 2012 – 1 August 2012)’ as this contains more recent COI on the security situation than is included in this section of the report.

COIS (19): Not accepted. See earlier comments under (9).

It is suggested that a direct link to the UNOCHA quarterly reports be provided here to enable users to directly access subsequent reports:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

8.44 The Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs (OCHA), Sudan, provides quarterly updates which included coverage of the conflicts in Blue Nile and South Kordofan. **For updates see UNOHCA, Sudan page**

COIS (20): Accepted. COIS will include reporting by UNOCHA.

The first reference in this paragraph needs to be revised:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

8.49 The 'Report of the Secretary-General on Children and armed conflict', 26 April 2012 (A/66/782 – S/2012/261), observed that during 2011 a number of children had been killed and injured due to conflict in Sudan, including South Kordofan. [¶] [18r] (para 115) The report further clarified that in addition to deaths caused by aerial bombings, —... children were killed or injured as a result of crossfire between the Sudanese Armed Forces, PDF and SPLM-N ...|| [18r](para 115)

COIS (21): Accepted.

The following source is recommended to be consulted for the next COIS report on Sudan:

- [Carleton University, The Nuba of Sudan: From Ethnic War to Insurgent Civil Conflict, 10 September 2012](#)

COIS (22): Noted, thank you.

Security situation for non-combatants in Blue Nile

The following additional COI is recommended for this section:

- [IRIN news, Hamis Hamadin Isa Zaag, "They were killing everyone", 13 September 2012](#)
- [Human Security Baseline Assessment, The Conflict in Blue Nile, 20 August 2012](#)
- [Enough Project, Sudan Field Dispatch: Refugees Provide Details of Attacks in Isolated Blue Nile State, 23 July 2012](#)

COIS (23): Noted, thank you.

ABYEI

It suggested that this section be cross-referenced with 'Update on Sudan's regional conflicts, Abyei' in order that recent information on the implementation of the June 2011 Addis Ababa agreement is not overlooked. Additional COI on this issue includes:

COIS (24): Not accepted. See earlier comments under (9).

- [Sudan Tribune, Sudan turns down mediation's proposal to settle Abyei issue, 25 September 2012](#)
- [Enough Project, Field Dispatch: Abyei in Flux, June 2012](#)

COIS (25): Noted thank you.

The reference in this paragraph needs to be revised:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

8.60 [...] [O]n 9 July, approximately 6,000 Ngok Dinka arrived in Abyei town from Agok to celebrate the first anniversary of the independence of South Sudan. Some Ngok Dinka youth threw stones at

local shops, resulting in minor injuries to three Misseriya. (UN Report of the Secretary-General on the situation in Abyei (S/2012/583), 25 July 2012) [18z](para 3-7)

COIS (26): Accepted

EAST SUDAN

It suggested that this section be cross-referenced with 'Update on Sudan's regional conflicts, East Sudan'. It is also suggested that COI from the following report which documents that tensions are rising in the East is included in this section:

- [Waging Peace, The Human Rights Situation in East Sudan, March 2012, The East today](#)

COIS (27): Not accepted, see earlier comments under (9). COIS would also highlight that the Waging Peace report is included in the recent developments section.

9. SECURITY FORCES

The reference for the following paragraph needs to be revised:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

9.13 International Crisis Group in their report entitled 'Divisions in Sudan's Ruling Party and the Threat to the Country's Future Stability', dated 4 May 2011, highlighted the tribal divisions within the army and also recognised their —lack of readiness|| to operate as an effective security force: —A retired general contends that the Riverine tribes have deliberately kept security officers from elsewhere out of the higher ranks. Over the past six years, many senior officers from the peripheries have been given early retirement rather than promotion. Reportedly many mid-level and junior officers are frustrated, which in turn is the main reason the government has relied heavily on tribal militias (PDF units) to fight in Darfur. Though most SAF commanders are linked to the top elites, the NCP does not trust them. According to an army Brigadier General: ...The few army troops in the capital are not in any state of readiness or have weapons to take any effective action to protect the capital, or to take part in any coup against the regime. The PDF is the army of the country, supported by specific forces within the SAF, such as the air force and military intelligence. ... The majority of the SAF is deployed along the North-South border, in Darfur and to a lesser extent in the East and to provide security for strategic establishments such as dams. For example, when the JEM insurgents attacked Omdurman in May 2008, the NCP relied on their special forces to stop them; only one army tank was deployed, apart from those guarding the TV building and other strategic places in the capital.|| [33a] [32a] (p.14)

COIS (28): Accepted.

It is suggested that the citation in the following paragraphs make the publication date clear, given that the security force figures are now 3 years old and may no longer be accurate:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

POLICE

9.05 Assigned personnel: 100,000. (Sudan Human Security Baseline Assessment, 'Sudan Issue Brief No.15: Supply and demand', December 2009 (Sudan HSBA, No.15, **December 2009**) [23e](p.8) Figures refer to the National Police Service (NPS). —Calculation assumes NPS has for many years consisted of the Central Reserve Police (CRP), Emergency Police, Immigration Police, Petroleum Police, and

Popular Police. Recently, the Prison, Customs, and Wildlife services have been incorporated into the NPS. || (Sudan HSBA, No.15, **December 2009**) [23e](footnote 2, p.9) [...]

ARMED FORCES

9.11 Assigned personnel in the army varies between 100,000 (JSCRA, Sudan, Army, 1 June 2012)[31c](Summary) (comprising infantry, armour, artillery and special forces. (JSCRA, Sudan, Army, 1 June 2012) [31c](Summary)) and 225,000 —Calculation assumes the SAF comprised of 20,000 officers (ratio of 1 weapon per officer), 120,000 infantry (1.5/soldier), 70,000 ‘reserves’ (1.2/reservist), 10,000 air defence units (1.2/serviceman), 10,000 border (Sudan HSBA, No.15, **December 2009**) [23e](p.8) [...]

Air force

9.17 Assigned personnel various between 3,000 (JSCRA, Sudan, Air Force, 23 April 2012) [31d](Summary) and 3,500 (Sudan HSBA, No.15, **December 2009**) [23e](footnote 1, p.9) [...]

National Intelligence and Security Services (NISS)

9.21 Assigned personnel: 7,500 (armed units) with separate NISS forces to protect oil fields. (Sudan HSBA, No.15, **December 2009**) [23e](p.8) [...]

Popular Defence Forces (PDF)

9.27 Personnel assigned varied between sources: Europa World Online, listed 17,500 active members and 85,000 reserves; [7c](Defense) Sudan HSBA, No.15 **of December 2009** listed the PDF force at 20,000 personnel but noted that it once may have been 100,000. [23e](p.8) Additionally refer to paragraph [sic] 9.29. [...]

COIS (29): Not accepted. The full reference to the HSBA paper and date of publication is clearly provided at para 9.05, with the abbreviated title listed as Sudan HSBA, No 15. Users can easily cross-reference the date of the source, either from para 9.05 or through the reference included in Annex N.

The links to the following Waging Peace reports are no longer active:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

9.39 The African Centre for Justice and Peace Studies (ACJPS), Sudan Human Rights Monitor provides reports of cases of arbitrary arrest, torture and extra judicial killings being perpetrated by government forces across Sudan. Additionally see also the Waging Peace reports, ‘The Human Rights Situation in North Sudan: Regression to Repression’, published March 2011 and ‘Sudan’s ‘Silent’ Spring: The Human Rights Situation in Sudan’, dated March 2011 – March 2012.

The active links are:

- [Waging Peace, The Human Rights Situation in North Sudan: Regression to Repression, March 2011](#)
- [Waging Peace, ‘Sudan’s ‘Silent’ Spring: The Human Rights Situation in Sudan’, March 2012](#)

COIS (30): See comments under (2).

It appears that a word is missing from the concluding text to this section:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

For further information on how immunities see: Torture and the use of evidence alleged to have been extracted under torture. To consider human rights violation committed by the security forces see: Human rights violations perpetrated by government forces.

COIS (31): Accepted.

The reference for the following paragraph needs to be revised:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

9.63 The ‘Report of the Secretary-General on the African Union-United Nations Hybrid Operation in Darfur’ (S/2012/548) dated 16 July 2012 covering events since 17 April 2012, reporting on the operational strength of UNAMID noted:

—As at 30 June, the strength of UNAMID civilian personnel stood at 86 per cent of the approved strength of 5,285 (1,107 international staff, 2,962 national staff and 472 United Nations Volunteers). The mission continued to mitigate security risks and enhance living conditions to improve the recruitment and retention of staff. ... The strength of UNAMID military personnel stood at 17,137, representing 87.6 per cent of the authorized strength of 19,555, including 16,562 troops, 294 staff officers, 209 military observers and 72 liaison officers. ... The personnel strength of UNAMID police stood at 3,188, comprising 81 per cent men and 19 per cent women and representing 84.5 per cent of the authorized strength of 3,772. A total of 16 of the authorized 19 formed police units have been deployed (2,171 personnel, or 81.6 per cent of the authorized strength of 2,660). A seventeenth unit has been pledged. ... During the reporting period, UNAMID conducted 12,783 patrols, including 5,727 routine patrols, 2,801 logistics and administrative patrols, 1,788 night patrols, 1,089 short-range patrols, 914 humanitarian escorts and 464 long-range patrols. UNAMID police conducted a total of 12,507 patrols, including 7,180 inside camps for internally displaced persons, 3,021 in towns and villages, 1,807 medium-range patrols, 277 humanitarian patrols and 222 long-range patrols..|| [18 t](para 53-56)

COIS (32): Accepted.

The following paragraph is incorrectly cited as source [39a]. The correct source does not appear in the annex of sources.

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

9.69 Following the independence of South Sudan, several security forces established pursuant to the Comprehensive Peace Agreement (CPA) 2005 were officially decommissioned. The UN Mission in Sudan (UNMIS) website explained that UNMIS:

—...wound up its operations on 9 July 2011 with the completion of the interim period agreed on by the Government of Sudan and Sudan People’s Liberation Movement in the Comprehensive Peace Agreement (CPA), signed on 9 January 2005. ... The mission ended its six years of mandated operations the same day South Sudan declared independence, following a CPA-provided referendum on 9 January 2011 that voted overwhelmingly in favour of secession. ... In support of the new nation, the Security Council established a successor mission to UNMIS – the UN Mission in South Sudan (UNMISS) – on 9 July for an initial period of one year, with the intention to renew for further periods as required. || {39a}

It should be referenced as:

- United Nations Mission in Sudan (UNMIS) website, undated (accessed 23/09/2012)
<http://unmis.unmissions.org/>

COIS (33): Accepted.

10. MILITARY SERVICE

The section on “military service” is essentially correct, but it implies that the age range of recruits is adhered to in practice (which it is not), and makes no mention of the Islamist ideology and indoctrination that accompanies the training.

COIS (34): Partially accepted. The COIS report includes reference to the recruitment of children at para 10.04 and includes a link to the subsection on Child soldiers. COIS will consider the other points raised by the reviewer and whether there is appropriate COI material available in the public domain for inclusion in the next report.

12. JUDICIARY

FAIR TRIAL

It is considered that additional relevant information from the following source should be included in this section:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

12.09 However the US State Department, 2011 Country Reports on Human Rights Practices, Sudan, dated 24 May 2012, observed:

—The interim national constitution and law provide for fair and prompt trials as well as a presumption of innocence; however, this often was not respected. Trials are open to the public at the discretion of the judge. In cases of national security and offenses against the state, trials are usually closed. Juries are not used. The law stipulates the government is obligated to provide a lawyer for cases in which indigents are accused and for which the punishment might exceed 10 years' imprisonment or possibly execution. The accused can also request assistance through the legal aid department at the Ministry of Justice or the Sudanese Bar Association. Defendants and their attorneys generally have the right to present evidence and witnesses, be present in court, confront accusers, and have access to government-held evidence relevant to their cases. However, some defendants reportedly did not receive legal counsel, and counsel in some cases could only advise the defendant and not address the court. Persons in remote areas and in areas of conflict generally did not have access to legal counsel.

There were reports the government sometimes did not allow defense witnesses to testify.

Defendants have a right to appeal, except in military trials, where there is no appeal.

—Lawyers wishing to practice were required to maintain membership in the government controlled Sudanese Bar Association. The government continued to arrest and harass members of the legal profession whom it considered to be political opponents. ...

Military trials, which sometimes were secret and brief, did not provide procedural safeguards. For example, a defendant's attorney could advise the defendant but could not address the court. ... The Special Courts Act created special three-person security courts to deal with violations of constitutional decrees, emergency regulations, and some sections of the penal code, including drug and currency offenses. Special courts, composed primarily of civilian judges, handled most security-related cases. Defendants in these courts had limited opportunities to meet with counsel and were not always allowed to present witnesses during trial. ||

Due to the long distances between court facilities and police stations, local mediation was often the first resort to try to resolve disputes. In some instances unofficial tribal courts operating outside the official legal system decided cases. Such courts did not provide the same protections as regular courts.[2b] (Trial procedures)

COIS (35): Accepted. COIS will additionally consider including further information on tribal justice systems in Sudan.

'Pre-trial detention' and 'Torture and the use of evidence alleged to have been extracted under torture'

It is suggested that these sections are moved down to section '13. Arrest and Detention- Legal Rights' to follow the sub-section 'Emergency and public safety protection act' (1997)'. Whilst it is

recognised that the content of these sections is relevant to the issue of fair trial it is considered that it would make more sense if the information was preceded by the legal provisions which govern pre-trial detention. Furthermore, users may overlook these key sections if they are included here, as they more intuitively relate to 'Arrest and Detention' than to 'Fair Trial'.

COIS (36): Not accepted. Chapter 13 aims to set out laws and legal rights related to arrest and detention. It does not intend to explain practices, including the use of torture or excessive pre-trial detention. This is clearly set out under appropriate subheadings in both Chapter 12 (Judiciary) and Chapter 9 (Security forces), with appropriate cross referencing throughout.

It is further suggested that this section be cross-referenced with '14. Conditions in prisons and other places of detention'.

COIS (37): Accepted.

Torture and the use of evidence alleged to have been extracted under torture

It is suggested that this section also be cross-referenced with 'Human rights violations perpetrated by government forces'. In addition, whilst this short section sets out the lack of legal provisions criminalising torture, and the difficulties in raising claims of torture, little information is provided on the prevalence or nature of such torture, the perpetrators or the victims. As this is the main section of the COIS report on the practice of torture, additional COI is recommended on these issues, for example:

- [Amnesty International, Sudanese authorities must end its crackdown on demonstrators and activists, 3 August 2012, *Prolonged detention and torture*](#)
- [Foreign and Commonwealth Office, Human Rights and Democracy: The 2011 Foreign and Commonwealth Office Report, April 2012, *Torture*](#)
- [African Centre for Justice and Peace Studies, Report on Pre-trial Justice in Sudan, January 2012, III. VIOLATIONS OF RIGHTS IN DETENTION, A. Torture is a Daily Practice](#)

COIS (38): Not accepted. The subsection 'Torture and the use of evidence alleged to have been extracted under torture' (para 12.15), relates only to the use of torture in relation to fair trial. It is not, as the reviewer, suggests the main section on the use of torture.

COIS would also highlight that the aforementioned subsection includes an introductory paragraph (12.15) which explains how the use of confession based evidence may perpetuate the use of torture and undermine access to fair trial. Additionally it includes links both to the subsections on 'Arrest and detention – legal rights' and 'Security forces, immunities and avenues of redress' in Chapter 9 (the main section of the report covering the use of torture).

Furthermore the subsection 'Security forces, immunities and avenues of redress' goes on to direct the reader to the subsection 'Human rights violations perpetrated by government forces'. It is therefore not accepted that users will be unsighted on either the prevalence or nature of torture, or the perpetrators or the victims of torture.

The following reference needs to be revised:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

12.35 A report from Africa Review dated 6 March 2012 noted:

—Two leading Sudanese musicians are among nine people who received 40 lashings for allegedly consuming alcohol. ... The musicians who are yet to be named were arrested late Monday from a house party in an apartment in Khartoum, where the punishment was delivered on the spot, Criminal Court of Northern Khartoum has confirmed. ... The arresting body, Sudan's Public Order police, is known to apprehend and punish offenders who commit acts deemed 'unIslamic' or 'immoral'. ... The Public Order police regulate morals as determined by the law and advance religious values in Sudan.|| [401a] [133]

COIS (39): Accepted

No reference for source [8o] cited in the following paragraph is listed in the Annex of sources.

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

15.05 The Amnesty International report, 'Death Sentences and Executions 2011', dated March 2012, clarified that there were at least 13 death sentences in Sudan in 2011. [8o](p.7)

Additionally the source noted: —At least seven executions were carried out in Sudan [in 2011]. Seven prisoners in North Darfur had their death sentences under the 2005 Terrorism Act and the Sudanese Criminal Act upheld by the Special Criminal Court in North Darfur on 29 November.|| [8o](p.52) For further details refer to the first case listed below.

It should be:

[8o] Amnesty International, Death Sentences and Executions 2011, 27/03/2012
<http://www.amnesty.org/en/library/asset/ACT50/001/2012/en/241a8301-05b4-41c0-bfd9-2fe72899cda4/act500012012en.pdf>

COIS (40): Accepted

13. ARREST AND DETENTION – LEGAL RIGHTS

The following text needs to be hyperlinked to the relevant sections of the report:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

13.01 [...] For information about breaches of arrest and detention rights, see Security forces, Human rights violations committed by government forces

COIS (41): Accepted. This sentence was included in error, the link is provided at the beginning of the chapter.

14. CONDITIONS IN PRISON AND OTHER PLACES OF DETENTION

It is suggested that information on death by torture in detention be included in this section:

- [Radio Dabanga, Reports of torture and executions in South Kordofan military prison, 25 July 2012](#)
- [Radio Dabanga, Two men tortured to death in detention, 20 April 2012](#)

COIS (42): Not accepted. Information on deaths in custody by torture comes under Chapter 9 and the subsection 'Human rights violations perpetrated by government security forces'. Consideration will be given to including further reporting on such incidents, including those reported by Radio Dabanga.

It is also suggested that this section be cross-referenced with 'Torture and the use of evidence alleged to have been extracted under Torture'.

COIS (43): Accepted.

16. POLITICAL AFFILIATION

Popular protests

It is suggested that this section be cross referenced with '13. Arrest and detention- legal rights' and 'Conditions in prison and other paces of detention'.

COIS (44): Accepted.

It is considered that the Amnesty International publication 'Sudanese authorities must end its crackdown on demonstrators and activists' which is listed above in the section 'Reports on Sudan published or accessed between 2 August 2012 and 11 September 2012' should have been included here. It is considered that if excerpts from that source could not be included, that at least the link to the report could have been included in this section, to prevent it being overlooked.

COIS (45): Not accepted. See comments under (1)

It is also suggested that information documenting the treatment of protestors in Darfur be included in this section. See for example:

- [UNOCHA, Weekly Humanitarian Bulletin Sudan, 6 - 12 August 2012, *New outbreaks of violence in Darfur*](#)
- [Human Rights Watch, Sudan: Police Fatally Shoot Darfur Protesters, 3 August 2012](#)
- [International Federation for Human Rights, Arbitrary arrest and detention of numerous defenders, 30 July 2012](#)
- [Radio Dabanga, Seventh man dies following Kabakabiya protests, 30 March 2012](#)

COIS (46): Accepted.

It is also suggested that a link be provided to the following interactive map of compiled violence throughout the country, cited by the Enough Project in their report of 12 July [‘#SudanRevolts: Crackdown in Sudan Leaves Over 2,000 Activists Detained, but Protests Continue’](#):

- [Sudan Change Now, Interactive map](#)

COIS (47): Accepted.

OPPOSITION GROUPS AND POLITICAL ACTIVISTS

The links to the additional material in this section are no longer active:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

16.29

[...] For further information on the detention of political opponents refer to the African Centre for Justice and Peace Studies Human Rights Monitor reports and Waging Peace’s publication ‘The Human Rights Situation in North Sudan: Regression to Repression’, published March 2011 and ‘Sudan’s Silent’ Spring: The Human Rights Situation in Sudan’, dated March 2011 – March 2012.

They can be accessed here:

- [Waging Peace, The Human Rights Situation in North Sudan: Regression to Repression, March 2011](#)
- [Waging Peace, Sudan’s ‘Silent’ Spring: The Human Rights Situation in Sudan, March 2012](#)

COIS (48): See comments under (2).

The reference for the following paragraph needs to be revised:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

16.36 Referring to the mass arrest of Darfurians in Khartoum in 2008 following the attempted assault by JEM on Omdurman, Khartoum on 10 May 2008, the ‘Report of the Special Rapporteur on the Situation of Human Rights in Sudan, Sima Samar’, dated June 2009 (A/HRC/11/14) observed: —The UNMIS [UN Mission in Sudan] Human Rights section received reports of the arrests of close to 1,000 people, the majority of whom were ethnic Darfurians, and repeatedly sought confirmation of the arrests and detentions from the authorities since May 2008. The Special Rapporteur was pleased to attend the Human Rights Forum on 26 May 2009, where discussions were held to clarify the fate of around 200 people, including eight presumed children, who are not known to have been either charged or released following their reported arrests. || [1k] [11] (para 33)

COIS (49): Accepted.

The link provided for the following source is incorrect.

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

16.47 [...]

For information on political repression of students and youth activists in East Sudan, refer to the Waging Peace briefing paper, ‘The Human Rights Situation in East Sudan’, dated 2012.

It can be accessed here:

- [Waging Peace, The Human Rights Situation in East Sudan, March 2012](#)

COIS (50): See comments under (2).

South Kordofan/Blue Nile-based groups and government opponents

It is suggested that it might improve user-friendliness for users to rename the current subsection 'South Kordofan/Blue Nile-based groups and government opponents including SPLM-N/SRF'. This would also maintain consistency with the section headings included in the Operational Guidance Note.

COIS (51): Accepted

The following source which provides an update in the case of Jalila Khamis Koko, teacher, activist and member of the SPLM-N who has now been charged with 5 counts against the state and faces the death penalty is recommended for inclusion as is a report of an enforced disappearance of a SPLM-N affiliate:

- [Amnesty International, Activist and teacher faces death penalty: Jalila Khamis Koko, 25 September 2012](#)
- [Amnesty International, Torture fears for man disappeared in Sudan: Omaia Abdel Latif Hassan Omaia, 12 October 2012](#)

COIS (52): noted, thank you.

The following paragraph requires updating:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

16.38 The Human Rights Watch, World Report 2012, Sudan, covering events in 2011, dated January 2012 explained:

— In June, when fighting broke out in Southern Kordofan, security forces rounded up ethnic Nuba suspected to be SPLM members or supporters. Among those arrested by NISS was Dr. Bushra Gammar Hussein Rahma, a prominent Nuba human rights activist, who remained in detention without charge at this writing. ... In September, when fighting spread to Blue Nile, security forces, including NISS, arrested more than 100 suspected party members of SPLM-North, including the well-known Sudanese writer, artist, activist, and former state adviser on cultural affairs, Abdelmoniem Rahma. Some were released following renunciations of their political affiliation to the party.|| [18b]

Dr. Bushra Gammar Hussein Rahma has now been released from detention (after being detained for one year without charge and subject to torture). See:

- [Amnesty International, Further information on Urgent Action: 205/11 \[AFR 54/031/2012\], 16 July 2012](#)

COIS (53): Accepted.

17. FREEDOM OF SPEECH AND MEDIA

The introductory text of the following paragraph needs to be revised:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

17.21 The same source also reported in article titled, ~~‘Two private newspapers closed down since start of the year’, 17 January 2012, and referenced in paragraph xxx above, that:~~

—On 2 January 2012, it was the Arabic-language Rai al-Shaab, the official newspaper of the opposition Popular National Congress Party led by Hassan al-Turabi, that was the authorities’ target for suspension. Its premises were closed and 15,000 copies of the paper were seized from its printing plant by NISS officials. Its manager, Nagi Dahab, has received no explanation. ... The closure could be as a result of the publication of an interview with Gibril Ibrahim, the spokesman for the Darfur rebel group Justice and Equality Movement concerning the difference in how prisoners were treated by the JEM and by the Sudanese government. ... The Sudanese Media Centre, a state-linked website, said the action was taken because the newspaper’s behaviour violated the ethical and professional standards of the journalists’ code of conduct. ... The NISS previously closed down Rai al-Shaab in 2010. Its deputy editor Abuzar Ali Al-Amin spent several months in prison, where he suffered ill-treatment. The newspaper resumed publication last October after a court overruled its closure.|| ([57c]

COIS (54): Accepted.

The following reference is incorrect:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

17.22 The BBC country profile, Sudan, media, dated 1 May 2012 stated: Sudan had 4.2 million internet users by September 2009, comprising around 10% of the population (Internetworldstats). ...

According to web filtering monitoring body OpenNet Initiative (ONI), ‘Sudan openly acknowledges filtering content that transgresses public morality and ethics or threatens order.’ Blogging is subject to scrutiny and can incur serious consequences’.|| [3d] [3b]

COIS (55): Accepted.

18. HUMAN RIGHTS INSTITUTIONS, ORGANISATIONS AND ACTIVISTS

NATIONAL MECHANISMS FOR PROTECTING HUMAN RIGHTS

For additional information on access to Sudan’s Constitutional Court see:

- [Project for Criminal Law Reform, Arrested Development: Sudan’s Constitutional Court, Access to Justice and the Effective Protection of Human Rights, August 2012](#)

COIS (56): Noted, thank you.

NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANISATIONS AND ACTIVISTS

Additional COI which specifically documents the arrest and detention of lawyers is also recommended for inclusion in this section:

- [International Federation for Human Rights, Arbitrary arrest and detention of numerous defenders, 30 July 2012](#)
- [Human Rights Watch, Torture, Abuse of Demonstrators, 11 July 2012](#)

COIS (57): Partially accepted. The COI report includes information on the arrest and detention of human rights activists, including lawyers, both under the section 'non-government organisations and activists' and under several subsections listed under 'human rights monitoring in regional conflict areas'. However further consideration will be given to including a dedicated subsection on the treatment of lawyers.

The following reference is incorrect and was not found in the annex of sources:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

18.21 Commenting on the recent operations of Medecins Sans Frontieres in Darfur (one of the groups cited by Eric Reeves) a Reuters Africa report entitled 'Sudan restrictions hamper aid work in Darfur: MSF', dated 22 May 2012 reported that: —Government restrictions on Medecins Sans Frontieres (MSF) have forced the group to suspend key medical activities in part of Sudan's Darfur region, leaving tens of thousands of people without health care, the aid agency said on Tuesday. ... MSF said hurdles to procedures like getting permits and shipping in medical supplies forced it to suspend most of its medical activities in the Jebel Si area, a conflict area in North Darfur state, where it is the only healthcare provider.|| [59a]

19. CORRUPTION

It is suggested that in order to highlight the role of corruption in accessing justice that this section is cross-referenced with the sections on 'Impunity and avenues of redress' and 'Fair Trial', specifically 'Pre-trial detention'.

COIS (58): Accepted.

20. FREEDOM OF RELIGION

The role of religion in Sudan requires closer scrutiny. Readers need to avoid the pitfall of thinking that Islamism is somehow normal in Sudan because the population is largely Muslim. In most Sudanese eyes, Islamism is not Islam, nor is it how Islam is supposed to be.

COIS (59): We would welcome further information, including suggested reading to help illustrate this point. The chapter on Freedom of religion has been produced to highlight the key issues requiring consideration in asylum casework. We would however highlight that the background subsection entitled 'Repression and the extension of political Islam', provides users with some background to the issues raised by the reviewer, but we of course acknowledge this is a complicated and nuanced issue to get to grips with.

ENFORCEMENT OF SHARIA (ISLAMIC LAW) AND PROTECTION AVAILABLE FOR RELIGIOUS MINORITIES

Additional information which documents the Sudanese authorities' unwillingness to protect Christians from societal violence is recommended for inclusion here:

- [Jubilee Campaign, Written statement submitted by the Jubilee Campaign, a non-governmental organization in special consultative status; Human rights and freedom of religion or belief in Sudan, 31 August 2012](#)

For additional COI on the state treatment of church leaders, see:

- [Waging Peace, Sudan's Silent Spring: The Human Rights Situation in Sudan, March 2012, Section 3: Religious Persecution](#)

COIS (60): Noted, thank you.

21. ETHNIC GROUPS

Overall this section has an impressive range of sources and adequately covers the range of issues affecting ethnic groups in Sudan.

Country Guidance Case law has tried to identify likely victims of the regime in terms of targeted groups, including ethnic groups in the case of Darfur. There are recurrent difficulties in distinguishing or defining these groups, and in assessing the risk to a particular individual.

In cases where ethnic origin is disputed, there are no absolute indicators, only pointers of varying strength.

Ethnic origin, in turn is not a guaranteed indicator of political loyalties. It only indicates likely imputed political loyalty or opposition.

Every ethnic group targeted as likely "rebels" by government forces also has a number of quislings and turncoats.

COIS (61): Thank you. COIS concurs with the reviewers general remarks regarding ethnicity and would highlight that in the COI report we attempt to explain these issues through relevant subsections under 'Ethnic demography and diversity'.

COIS is aware of the difficulties in determining ethnicity in asylum decision making. In the case of persons alleging to be from Darfur, we have produced a background report for use by Agency officials.

TREATMENT OF ETHNIC GROUPS

Non-Arab Darfurians

The reference for the following paragraph needs to be revised:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

1.15 A previous report from the UN's Panel of Experts (established pursuant to resolution 1591 (2005) concerning the Sudan), the 'Final report of the Panel of Experts submitted in accordance with paragraph 2 of Security Council resolution 1841 (2008), (S/2009/562), dated 29 October 2009, commenting on inter-tribal conflicts in the area of Wada'ah in February 2009 between the Mimas and Zaghawa tribes, explained with reference the Janjaweed: —Both Mimas and Zaghawas became proxies for the ongoing conflict between the Government of the Sudan and the SLA/M [Sudan Liberation Army/Movement]. [...] Despite the fact that both tribes are of African origin, the Zaghawa call the Mimas 'Janjaweed' and the Mimas call the Zaghawa 'Tora Bora'.|| [69] **[18p]** (para 236)

COIS (62): Accepted.

The link to the following source is no longer active:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

21.26 [...]

See also the paper Transnational ethnic groups and conflict: The Zaghawa in Chad and Sudan', by Joseph Sany and Sameeksha Desai, published in Conflict Trends, Issue 2, 2008.

It can be found here:

http://hawk.ethz.ch/serviceengine/Files/ISN/101857/ichaptersection_singledocument/f09794d3-bd86-4473-80d6-f5116efc7c12/en/Chapter+4.pdf

COIS (63): Noted, thank you.

The end paragraph of this section refers to an additional COI Service product on Sudan which does not have a link provided:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

Additionally see also the COI Service, Background material: Sudan: Non-Arab Darfurian tribes, 10 March 2011. For further information on the current security situation in Darfur and violence linked to intercommunal violence see: Darfur, types of violence – intercommunal violence.

Would it be possible to make this report publically available?

COIS (64): This report is only for use by Agency officials, although the sources included are all from open sources and can be disclosed in asylum casework. Given that the report is used to test ethnicity and its effectiveness would be diminished if it was released in the public domain, we do not propose publishing it.

COIS has, however, shared the report with some stakeholders, including the IAGCI, and welcomes any feedback to help improve this product.

22. SEXUAL ORIENTATION AND GENDER IDENTITY

Source [39d] cited here is not the 1991 Penal Code, but the Criminal Procedures Act. The Penal Code can be found here: http://www.ecoi.net/file_upload/1329_1202725629_sb106-sud-criminalact1991.pdf

COIS (65): Accepted. COIS would however clarify that the penal code is also known as the 1991 Criminal Act, as outlined at para 12.18. The reference to source 39d is however incorrect and will be amended.

It also appears that the translation provided below is not fully accurate- it suggested that the text is replaced with that found in the source above.

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

22.02 Sodomy is prohibited by law in Sudan. Article 148 of the 1991 Criminal Act stipulates:

—148.(1) There shall be deemed to commit sodomy, every man who penetrates his glans, or the equivalent thereof, in the anus of a woman, or another man's, or permits another man to penetrate his glans, or its equivalent, in his anus.

(2) (a) whoever commits the offence of sodomy, shall be punished, with shipping a hundred lashes, and he criminalises capital punishment applies to a man or woman engaging in such acts may also be punished, with imprisonment, for a term, not exceeding five years;

(b) where the offender is convicted for the second time, he shall be punished, with whipping a hundred lashes, and with imprisonment, for a term, not exceeding five years;

(c) where the offender is convicted for the third time, he shall be punished, with death, or with life imprisonment. || [39d](Article 148)

COIS (66): Accepted. As the law is an English translation it is difficult to determine whether it is 'inaccurate', however given the incorrect referencing above COIS will use the version referred to on Ecoi.net.

23. DISABILITY

Only one source of COI is included in this section. Additional sources recommended for inclusion:

- [UNICEF, Disability no longer an obstacle to education in Krinding, 21 September 2012](#)
- [Radio Dabanga, Poor conditions for disabled residents in Dereig camp, 4 April 2012](#)
- [Amnesty International, Sudan-South Sudan: Destruction and desolation in Abyei, 20 December 2011, p.11 and 12](#)
- [United Nations Mine Action Office, Sudan \(Boutros Hobeika\), Victim Assistance for Mine/ERW Survivors and PWDs in Sudan, undated, circa 2011 \[accessed 25/09/2012\]](#)
- [Internal Displacement Monitoring Centre, SUDAN: Durable solutions elusive as southern IDPs return and Darfur remains tense, 23 December 2010, Education](#)

COIS: There is very little demand from our users for information on disability issues in Sudan. Consideration, however, will be given to what additional information can be included against the competing demands to cover other issues in our report.

24. WOMEN

This section has an impressive range of sources and covers the range of issues affecting women well.

To improve clarity, the following addition is recommended:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

24.04 The UN Development Programme's (UNDP) International Human Development Index, 2011, also includes a gender inequality index – described as a — ...composite measure reflecting inequality in achievements between women and men in three dimensions: reproductive health; empowerment and the labour market.|| [64c] Sudan's gender index score for 2011 was 0.611, this compared to 0.653 in 2005 and 0.718 in 1995 (a lower score indicates a higher level of gender equality – for example Sweden was listed top in 2011 with a score of 0.049) [64c]. 'Table 4: Gender Inequality Index and related indicators' of the 2011 Human Development Report published by UNDP ranked Sudan against the gender inequality index 128th **out of the 146 countries ranked**. [64f](p.141) According to the report Sudan fell into the 'low human development' index for gender inequality (the low human development index score was recorded as being 0.606) [64f](p.142)

COIS (67): Accepted.

LEGAL RIGHTS (INCLUDING THE APPLICATION OF ISLAMIC LAW)

It is suggested to include excerpts from the following report which details that in most cases women on trial have no legal representation and that some are reportedly held in shackles whilst carrying infants:

- [UN, Report of the Independent Expert on the situation of human rights in the Sudan Report of the Independent Expert on the situation of human rights in the Sudan, 27 August, para 35](#)

COIS (68): Noted, thank you.

Conflict-related SGBV in Darfur

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

24.47 An article by Eric Reeves for 'Dissent' magazine, entitled 'Darfur and the Consequences of Impunity', dated 9 September 2011, referring to the occurrence of gender based violence in Darfur observed:

—... [I]nstances of rape have been reported continuously, voluminously, and authoritatively for eight years by Amnesty International, Physicians for Human Rights, Human Rights Watch, Doctors Without Borders/Médecins Sans Frontières (MSF/Holland), and many others. The Amel Center for the Treatment and Rehabilitation of Victims of Torture in South Darfur has substantial records of these crimes, and a compelling overview has been provided by the Harvard School of Public Health and the Francois-Xavier Bagnoud Center for Health and Human Rights.|| [36f]

It is suggested to add to this paragraph the overview of the results of the March 2012 Physicians for Human Rights study that provides rare forensic medical evidence of widespread, sustained torture and other human rights violations including sexual violence by the Government of Sudan (GoS) and allied Janjaweed forces against non-Arabic-speaking civilians in South Darfur. For the overview see:

- [Physicians for Human Rights, Medical Evidence of Widespread Torture in Darfur Released by PHR in PLoS Medicine, 4 March 2012](#)

For the full study see:

- [PLoS Medicine, Alexander C. Tsai, Mohammed A. Eisa, Sondra S. Crosby, Susannah Sirkin, Michele Heisler, Jennifer Leaning, Vincent Iacopino, Medical Evidence of Human Rights Violations against Non-Arabic-Speaking Civilians in Darfur: A Cross-Sectional Study, 3 April 2012](#)

COIS (69): Not accepted. COIS includes reference to this very useful study in the history section, para 3.24 and 3.25 as it relates to sexual and gender-based violence which occurred from September 2004 to December 2006. The subsection on 'Conflict-related SGBV in Darfur', includes cross referencing to the Security situation: Darfur, which in turn refers readers to the history section. It is therefore considered that users are sufficiently directed to this source already.

It is also suggested that a link be provided to the following Waging Peace report which documents incidents of violence against women in Darfur between March 2011 and 2012:

- [Waging Peace, Humanitarian and Security Update Darfur March 2011 – March 2012, March 2012, Violence against Women](#)

COIS (70): Accepted.

It is further suggested that information from the following report documenting that internally displaced women have been targeted for rape owing to their perceived support of the SLA/MM or JEM be included:

- [UN General Assembly/Security Council, Conflict-related sexual violence: Report of the Secretary-General: Sudan excerpt, 13/01/2012, paragraph 53.](#)

COIS (71): Accepted.

Employment

It is suggested that additional information on women's access to the employment market is included in this section, given the relevance of a woman's ability to support herself in assessing the possibility of internal relocation. See for example:

- [Government of Sudan and UNICEF, The State of Sudanese Children 2011, 26 September 2012, \(which provides information on the economic situation by state\)](#)
- [Strategic Initiative for Women in the Horn of Africa, Bread for Bread Winners, 7 September 2012 Introduction](#)

- [Institute for War and Peace Reporting, Darfur Women Take on Hard Labour, 8 February 2012](#)
- [ODI Humanitarian Policy Group, City limits: urbanisation and vulnerability in Sudan, Khartoum case study, January 2011](#) *Chapter 5 The urban economy and livelihoods*

COIS (72): Partially accepted. COIS recognises the importance of providing information to assess women's access to the labour market in Sudan. Including further information in the report however needs to be weighed against competing demands to include other information, our limited resources and the relevance of this issue to the bulk of asylum claims.

It is also suggested that excerpts relating to women's access to employment from following sources cited elsewhere in the section on Women be included here:

- [Strategic Initiative for Women in the Horn of Africa, Beyond Trousers: The Public Order Regime and the Human Rights of Women and Girls in Sudan, 12 November 2009](#), *3. Economic and professional life*
- [Social Institutions and Gender Index, Country Profiles, Sudan, undated](#), *Restricted resources and entitlements*

COIS (73): Partially accepted. COIS has included reference to the SIGI country profile, under employment and also provides in this subsection some examples of the impact of public order laws. Consideration will be given to whether it is necessary to include additional information.

It is further suggested that this section be cross-referenced with 'Economy' which as set out above, is recommended to include information on access to the labour market in Sudan.

COIS (74): Accepted.

Source [76a] cited in paragraphs 24.59 and 24.64 is not currently available online and should be referenced as such.

COIS (75): Not accepted. The weblink provided in the report is currently working.

Female Genital [sic] Mutilation (FGM)

The 2006 Sudan Household Health Survey (SHHS) data is cited in this section. This should be updated with the available 2010 data as cited in the following source:

- [Government of Sudan and UNICEF, The State of Sudanese Children 2011, 26 September 2012](#), *FGM/C*

COIS (76): The Sudan report includes reference to the 2010 SHHS at para 24.69. However only a summary report of this survey was available at the time of publication which is why more detailed information from the 2006 survey is additionally included. COIS will include information from the above cited UNICEF report which has since published.

25. CHILDREN

Juvenile justice system

It is suggested that additional COI detailing that children continue to be sentenced to the death penalty is included in this section:

- [Human Rights Watch, SUDAN: Young woman sentenced to death by stoning, 31 May 2012](#)
- [Amnesty International, Annual Report 2012: Sudan, 24 May 2012](#), Death penalty
- [Inter press Service, SUDAN: Still sentencing minors to death, 2 December 2011](#)

COIS (77): Not accepted. COIS includes references to the implementation of the death penalty against minors under Chapter 15 (for example para 15.06). Additionally Chapters 12 and 15 include reference to the recent reports of women being sentenced to death by stoning (for example para 15.06 and 12.36, whilst Chapter 24 includes a subsection on Corporal punishment. COIS also considers there is appropriate hyperlinking throughout the report linking together this information. Consideration will however be given to include cross referencing with the subsection on Juvenile justice system.

The information cited as reference [85a] was not found in the original source and therefore should be accurately referenced, or deleted if it is no longer contained in the source cited.

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

25.16 However a paper from the Chr. Michelsen Institute, 'UTV Working Paper, Sudan Country Case Study: Child Rights', by Samia al-Nagar and Liv Tonnesen (commissioned by Norad and Sida), dated March 2011, observed that despite the work of UNICEF who had successfully contributed to demobilising 1,300 child soldiers, there were —... a significant number ... [remaining] in the North (6,000) [i.e. present day Sudan] and in the South (1,200).|| [71b](p.39) Whilst the Save the Children, Resource Center on Child Protection and Child Rights Governance, 'Sudan Country Profile', undated (accessed 23 July 2012) instead noted that —[a]n estimated 10,000 children remain associated with armed forces and groups.|| [85a]

COIS (78): Accepted. The information included in the narrative of the report is accurate, however the hyperlink provided under source 85a needs changing. (Users currently have to click on the 'Sudan country profile' link from the webpage they are directed to access the above information). An updated web-link will be included in the next edition of the report.

The second reference in this paragraph needs to be amended:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

25.27 With regard to the use of child soldiers in South Sudan by the authorities during the same conflict, the internationally acclaimed film 'War Child: A Child Soldier's Story', released February 2009, tells the story of Emmanuel Jal, born circa 1980 and a former child soldier in Sudan — Emmanuel was taken from his family home in 1987, at the age of seven, and sent to fight with the SPLA [Sudan

People's Liberation Army of South Sudan] ... in Sudan's bloody civil war. For nearly five years, Emmanuel carried and slept next to an AK-47 that was taller than him. He was sent to Ethiopia and Southern Sudan to fight with thousands of other children that were uprooted from their villages.|| (War Child, About) ~~[84a]~~ **[83a]** To see the trailer to the film, refer to the link above. (NB: Refugees International's Young Humanitarian Circle (described as —... a network of over 300 eclectic and sophisticated young professionals interested in humanitarian issues||[82b]) hosted an event in November 2010 promoting the screening of Emmanuel Jal's documentary film —War Child||. (Refugees International, Young Humanitarian Circle, 22 November 2010) [82b])

COIS (79): Accepted.

As do the references for these paragraphs:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

25.54 A paper from the Chr. Michelsen Institute, 'UTV Working Paper, Sudan Country Case Study: Child Rights', by Samia al-Nagar and Liv Tonnesen (commissioned by Norad and Sida), dated March 2011, further explained:

—Forty per cent of under-five deaths are caused by diarrhoea, owing to lack of access to clean water. The infant mortality rate (under 1 years of age) in 2006 was 81 per 1000 live births. The under-five mortality rate is 112 per 1000 live births (ibid). Mortality rates for infants and children under five are among the highest in the world. The national maternal mortality rates are also very high at 1107 per 100,000 live births. According to the 2006 Sudan Household Health Survey, the maternal mortality rate for Western Equatoria, a province in Southern Sudan, stood at 2,327 deaths per 100,000 live births. One of the main reasons is that only 20 per cent of Sudanese women deliver in a health facility (in southern Sudan only 13.6 per cent of women deliver in health facilities).|| ~~[71d]~~ **[71b]** (p.11-12)

25.56 The Chr. Michelsen Institute, 'UTV Working Paper, Sudan Country Case Study: Child Rights', by Samia al-Nagar and Liv Tonnesen (commissioned by Norad and Sida), dated March 2011, more generally observed with regard to child-related healthcare in Sudan:

—Generally, the accessibility and quality of health care is poor (SCS 2006). ... Due to many years of war, displacement and famine, malnutrition is a serious problem, particularly in the peripheries of Darfur, eastern Sudan and southern Sudan. The Child Act (2010) stipulates that the child shall have the right to primary health care free of charge (Article 14), but the Sudanese government has a long way to go in order to fulfil this right. ... Sudan is in the early stages of an HIV and AIDS epidemic which has an almost exclusively heterosexual transmission pattern but with indications of higher infection rates in the South than in the North. Years of civil war and limited epidemiological data make it difficult to generalise about HIV and AIDS in Sudan. The estimated HIV prevalence rate is 1.6 per cent among the adult population in northern Sudan and 3.1 per cent in southern Sudan (UNAIDS Reports 2008). In southern Sudan children below five years constitute 21 per cent of the population while 53 per cent is under the age of 18. The epidemic is more marked in the 20–34 age group, which is similar to data in other countries. The number of children aged 0–14 living with HIV is estimated to be between 18,000 and 33,000 (ibid). Considerably more children die because of malaria, malnutrition and diarrhoea, according to UNICEF statistics 2008. || ~~[71d]~~ **[71b]** (p.12)

COIS (80): Accepted

Child soldiers from the Sudan- South Sudan civil war

Also see:

- [Christine Ryan, University of Winchester, \(for the I.B. Tauris Blog\), Children of War: The Voices of Child Soldiers From the Sudan Civil War, 2 May 2012](#)

COIS (81): Noted, thank you.

Sexual exploitation

It is suggested that this section be cross-referenced with the 'Sexual and Gender Based Violence (SGBV) committed by security forces and militias' and that COI is included in this section which emphasised that rapes are perpetrated against girls (minors) as well as women:

- [Amnesty International, Annual Report 2012: Sudan, 24 May 2012](#), Armed conflict – Darfur
- [United Nations, Report of the Secretary-General on Children and armed conflict', 26 April 2012](#), Paras 111 and 116
- [United Nations, Conflict-related sexual violence Report of the Secretary-General, 13 January 2012](#), Sudan (paras 53-7)

COIS (82): Partially accepted. The section on Sexual exploitation is related more to under-age prostitution and trafficking issues rather than SGBV in conflict areas. COIS will however include a dedicated subsection in the chapter on Children in the next report which will examine SGBV in conflict areas. This will be appropriately cross referenced with other sections.

Abandoned babies

It is suggested that the information in this section is incorporated in the current sub-section on 'Children's homes/institutions and orphanages' and that this sub-section is renamed 'Abandoned babies and Children's homes/institutions and orphanages'. In view of the criticisms of the SOS Children's Village, it would be helpful to reflect other sources on orphans:

- [Government of Sudan and UNICEF, The State of Sudanese Children 2011, 26 September 2012](#), Khartoum, *separated and Unaccompanied Children*
- [UNICEF Sudan, Technical Briefing Paper 1: Alternative Family Care, August 2007](#)

COIS (83): Not accepted. Merging information under the 'Childcare and protection' section and 'Violence against children' section may be confusing for users, however suitable cross referencing will be included in the next report linking these two sections.

COIS will try and source further information about the availability of children's homes in Sudan.

It is also suggested that this information be repeated in a new sub-section 'Stigma against single mothers and abandoned babies' and that this be included in the section on 'Women' given that particular issue it is most likely to be an issue raised in women's claims and not in minors'. Additional information on the stigma against unmarried pregnant women can be found here:

- [Government of Sudan and UNICEF, The State of Sudanese Children 2011, 26 September 2012](#), Khartoum, *separated and Unaccompanied Children*

- [IRIN News, Abandoned and broken hearted, orphans find a home in Mygoma, 28/09/2005](#)

COIS (84): Partially accepted. COIS recognises the potential interest in societal discrimination against single mothers. Consideration will be given to the inclusion of further information on this in the next report. This will be balanced against competing demands to include information on other subjects in our report.

EDUCATION

Additional sources documenting regional disparities and social disparities- including gender and income recommended for inclusion:

- [Government of Sudan and UNICEF, The State of Sudanese Children 2011, 26 September 2012,](#)
- [World Bank, The status of the education sector in Sudan, January 2012](#)

COIS (85): Noted, thank you.

26. TRAFFICKING

It is suggested that this section is specifically cross-referenced with 'Sexual exploitation' in the Children section. It is also suggested that additional COI be included in this section which documents the practice of human trafficking in Eastern Sudan:

- [UNOCHA, Sudan Common Humanitarian Fund Annual Report 2011, 5 June 2012,](#) *Humanitarian context*
- [UNHCR, 2012 UNHCR country operations profile-Sudan \(undated current webpage, accessed 22/09/2012\)](#)

COIS (86): Partially accepted. COIS will include further information about trafficking through Eastern Sudan. The report already includes cross referencing to the chapters on 'Children' and 'Women'. Consideration will be given to additional cross-referencing.

27. MEDICAL ISSUES

Healthcare

The reference in this paragraph needs to be amended:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

27.01 The UN Development Programme's International Human Development Index, 2011, ranked Sudan on the health index 18th out of the 20 Arab States listed and 155th out of the 194 countries globally ranked (with a health index score of 0.654). Against the regional Arab states ranked, Sudan came ahead of Djibouti (19th and 162nd globally) and Somalia (20th and 181st globally). ~~{68a}~~
[64a] The following table illustrates regional and national trends in the health index between 1980 and 2011:

The subsequent paragraph requires the following reference:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

27.02 The UNDP, International Human Development Index, 2011, Country Profile Sudan, listed the following key indicators for health:

- ☒ Expenditure on health, public (% of GDP) – 1.3 per cent
- ☒ Under-five mortality rate (per 1,000 live births) – 108
- ☒ Life expectancy at birth (years) – 61.5
- ☒ Health index (life expectancy) – 0.654 **[64b]**

COIS (87): Accepted.

It is considered that it is not clear that the single reference provided here applies to all the paragraphs. The follow clarification is suggested:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

27.04 The World Health Organisation (WHO) report, 'Country Cooperation Strategy for WHO and Sudan 2008 – 2013' dated 2009 explained:

—The modern health care system in Sudan goes back to 1899, when health care was being delivered by the army. In 1924, the Sudan Medical Services was established and it became the Ministry of Health in 1949. Sudan has 25 states, and each state has a ministry of health **[65a p.19]** (Readers should note this source pre-dates the separation of Sudan and South Sudan. Sudan currently is made up of 17 states. (Sudan Embassy and Mission in Geneva, Switzerland) [9a](Basic facts)). Within each state there are number of localities ... managed through a district health system approach according to the local government.

—...The Interim Constitution (2005), which went into effect after the signing of CPA [Comprehensive Peace Agreement] on 5 January 2005, gives special emphasis to health. The Constitution requires the state to promote public health and guarantee equal access and free primary health care to all people of Sudan. ... The national government has developed a 25-year long term and a 5-year medium term strategic plan. The 25- year plan (2003–2027) gives priority to reforming and rebuilding the health system based on fair financing, and aims to reduce the burden of diseases, promote healthy lifestyles, develop and retain human resources, and introduce advanced technology, while assuring equity, quality and accessibility of health services.

— ... The Federal Ministry of Health works in collaboration with the 25 state ministries of health and is responsible for formulating national health policies, human resources planning and development, strategic planning, health legislation, response to epidemics, international health, in addition to monitoring and evaluation of all health activities and interventions in the country **[65a p.21]** (Readers should note this source pre-dates the separation of Sudan and South Sudan. Sudan currently is made up of 17 states. (Sudan Embassy and Mission in Geneva, Switzerland) [9a](Basic facts)).... The state ministry of health is responsible for implementing policy, detailed health planning, and programming and project formulation. This level organizes health services in state and supports the local health authorities. At the third level, based on district health system, a local health authority delivers health care through the primary health care approach.|| [65a](p.19-20)

COIS (88): Accepted.

It is suggested that additional information to provide context to the data on the functionality of health care facilities is included in this section:

- [Government of Sudan and UNICEF, The State of Sudanese Children 2011, 26 September 2012](#), (this source provides information on health by state in Sudan)

- [Radio Dabanga, Price-increases medical treatment and airline tickets lead to new concerns, 12 August 2012](#)
- [UNOCHA, United Nations and Partners', Sudan Work Plan 2012, undated \[circa late 2011\] p.58](#)
- [ODI Humanitarian Policy Group, City limits: urbanisation and vulnerability in Sudan, Synthesis report, January 2011, 7. Basic services and urban infrastructure](#)

COIS (89): Not accepted. The COI report already includes some information to explain the differing standards of healthcare across Sudan, notably at Annex G, 'Distribution of various healthcare facilities in the different states'. Consideration will however be given to the UNICEF publication released in September 2012 which includes further regional information about each of Sudan's states.

Additional COI on the availability of medical care in areas particularly affected by conflict; Darfur and in South Kordofan is also recommended for inclusion in this section

Medical facilities in Darfur

- [Radio Dabanga, Half of Darfuris lack access to health care, 19 October 2012](#)
- [Radio Dabanga, 'Catastrophic' medical services in Darfur region, 18 September 2012](#)
- [World Health Organisation, Health Resources Availability Mapping System Greater Darfur 2nd Quarter 2012, 3 September 2012](#) [N.B. this is a quarterly publication; a more recent version may be available when the Sudan COI Service report is next updated]
- [Medecins Sans Frontiers, Sudan: 100,000 people left without essential healthcare in Jebel Si, North Darfur, 22 May 2012](#)

Medical facilities in South Kordofan

- [Enough Project, One year later, Sudan continues to target civilians in South Kordofan, 5 June 2012](#)
- [Amnesty International, We can run away from bombs, but not from hunger, June 2012, The Situation in Southern Kordofan and Blue Nile, Indiscriminate bombings](#)

COIS (90): Not accepted. It is not considered there is a specific demand for information on medical facilities in conflict areas.

Pharmaceuticals

It is considered that an additional excerpt from the following source is relevant and is suggested for inclusion:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

27.13 The Republic of Sudan, Federal Ministry of Health report 'Sudan: Pharmaceutical country profile', 2010, stated:

—Sudan is not a member of the World Trade Organization; therefore information on patenting laws is not applicable or available ... There are 19 licensed pharmaceutical manufacturers in Sudan. Sudan does not have the capacity for the Research and Development for discovering new active substances and the production of pharmaceutical starting materials. On the other hand, there is capacity for production of formulations from pharmaceutical starting materials and for repackaging of finished dosage forms. In 2008 the percentage of market share by value of goods produced by domestic manufacturers was 20.6%.|| [65e](p.10)

In the health system of Sudan, at the point of delivery, there are copayments/fee requirements for both consultations and medicines. Revenue from fees or from the sale of medicines is not used to pay the salaries or supplement the income of public health personnel in the same facility. In the Health Insurance Scheme, patients pay only 25% of the cost of the prescription, but the prescribed medicines should be part of the health insurance list. [65e](p.19)

COIS (91): Partially accepted. Consideration will be given to including the above extra reference. It is not however considered that the citation as it stands is either unbalanced or inaccurate.

HIV/AIDS – ANTI-RETROVIRAL TREATMENT

The hyperlink provided for the following source is inactive:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

27.15 The website of the Republic of Sudan, National Medicines and Poisons Board, additionally provides a searchable database of Registered medicines in Sudan 2009'. Although the home page of the database is in Arabic, search results are produced in English.

COIS (92): Noted, thank you.

For information on stigma against people living with HIV/AIDS, see

- [Government of Sudan and UNICEF, The State of Sudanese Children 2011, 26 September 2012, HIV/AIDS](#)

COIS (93): Noted, thank you.

MENTAL HEALTH

Additional suggested sources on mental health in Sudan:

- [International Psychiatry Journal, E. A. Sorketti, N. Z. Zuraida and M. H. Habil, The traditional belief system in relation to mental health and psychiatric services in Sudan, February 2012](#)
- [Radio Dabanga, 75% of Darfur's refugee children show PTSD symptoms, 12 August 2011](#)

COIS (94): Noted, thank you.

28. HUMANITARIAN ISSUES

It appears that source [97b] has been updated since it was last accessed in the preparation of the September COIS report. The following revisions are therefore suggested to be fully accurate of the source. However it is recommended that the original source be consulted again when the Sudan COIS report is next updated in order to ensure it remains consistent with any further updating:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

28.01 The EU Commission's Humanitarian Aid and Civil Protection, Sudan Country website, undated, circa 2011, accessed on 1 July 2012, explained:

—Sudan remains a humanitarian and development challenge. The problems are chronic and those addressing them are few, largely due to the expulsions of many Non Governmental Organizations (NGOs) in 2009. Malnutrition rates are beyond emergency levels and disease outbreaks are common. The number of refugees and internally displaced persons remain high, while access to food for the most vulnerable parts of the population is **an ongoing** concern. ... The humanitarian needs in Darfur remain huge and are a priority for the international humanitarian community. There are now between 1.9 million internally displaced persons (IDPs) living in camps in the Darfur region, in addition to 40,000 refugees from Chad. ~~A renewed wave of violence in 2010 and 2011 has caused large scale displacement of parts of the population.~~ **Continuing fighting in parts of Darfur in early 2012 resulted in new displacements.** Over 2.5 million people are affected by the conflict and are in need of some form of assistance. Incidents targeting humanitarian workers in Darfur occur frequently and have steadily contributed to a reduced humanitarian space. ... Abyei, Blue Nile and South Kordofan are known as the Transitional Areas. In both Blue Nile and South Kordofan, fighting between the Sudan Armed Forces and the SPLM erupted in the course of 2011. ~~It is estimated that 60,000 people have been severely affected by the outbreak of conflict in Blue Nile State. Tens of thousands have sought refuge in Ethiopia and South Sudan.~~ **A total of 665,000 people (520,000 in South Kordofan and 145,000 in Blue Nile) are estimated to be either internally displaced or severely affected by the conflict, but such figures cannot be verified on an independent manner as no neutral and impartial access has been allowed by authorities.** The European Commission is scaling up its response to assist the displaced and is advocating for greater humanitarian access.|| [97b]

COIS (95): Not accepted. The EU Commission's Humanitarian Aid and Civil Protection, Sudan Country website, was updated on 13 August 2012 which is after the cut off date of the report of 1 August 2012. The page will be updated during the next review, as will other web-based source material.

For a current overview of the humanitarian situation in South Kordofan see:

- [Enough Project, Rapid Food Security And Nutrition Assessment South Kordofan, October 2012](#)

COIS (96): Noted, thank you.

FOOD INSECURITY

It is suggested that the following concluding text of this section which currently follows paragraph 28.08 be moved to the end of this section, as its current location may give the false impression that this is the end of the humanitarian section, especially as it is followed by 'International Non-Government Organisations'.

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

For further information on humanitarian issues in Sudan see: OCHA's, Sudan reports; OCHA, 'Sudan Humanitarian Work Plan Quarterly Monitoring Report, 1st Quarter 2012'; FEWSNET's Sudan country page, Seasonal Calendar and Critical Events Timeline and the Food and Agricultural Organisation of

the UN (FAO), Global Information and Early Warning System (GIEWS) 'Country Brief, Sudan', dated 9 July 2012

COIS (97): Not accepted. The above paragraph is located at the end of the 'Overview' subsection, providing users appropriate links to further reading. It is not accepted users will be confused that this implies the end of the chapter on humanitarian issues.

No reference has been provided for source [28e] cited in paragraph 29.04. It should be:

- [28e] Satellite Sentinel Project, Siege: Evidence of SAF encirclement of the Kauda Valley, 25 January 2012
<http://www.satsentinel.org/sites/default/files/SSP%2024%20Siege%20012512%20FINAL.pdf>

COIS (98): Accepted.

30. INTERNALLY DISPLACED PERSONS (IDPS) AND REFUGEES

It is suggested that in addition to directing readers to read this material with 'Security situation' and 'Humanitarian issues' that the section 'Sexual and Gender Based Violence (SGBV) committed by security forces and militias' is also cross-referenced.

COIS (99): Not accepted. SGBV violence is included in the section on 'Security situation' and should be considered together with other material listed under this section.

In paragraph 30.06 the link to the second source is no longer active. It should be:

- [UNHCR, Sudanese Refugees in South Sudan, Information Sharing Portal](#)

COIS (100): noted, thank you.

It is considered that the information which relates to the situation for IDPs in Khartoum is not easily identifiable and may be overlooked given that it is presented along with general additional sources to consult on the situation of IDPs as follows:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

[30.01] [...]

See: OCHA's, Sudan Monthly Humanitarian Bulletin reports for the latest IDP figures.

For further information on IDPs in Sudan refer to the Internal Displacement Monitoring Centre, Sudan country page. For information on IDPs in Khartoum, refer to the following reports:

- Overseas Development Institute, Humanitarian Policy Group, 'City limits: urbanisation and vulnerability in Sudan', Synthesis report, January 2011
- Alex de Waal, 'Do Darfur's IDPs Have an Urban Future?', 31 March 2009
- Feinstein International Center, 'Internal Displacement in Urban Areas: Khartoum, Sudan (The Tufts-IDMC Profiling Study, Case 1), September 2008
- Landinfo, thematic report entitled 'Sudan – Internally displaced persons in Khartoum', 3 November 2008.
- Republic of Sudan, HAC 'Latest update of IDPs in Khartoum', undated circa 2009

COIS (101): Accepted. A subheading will be included to highlight this information more easily.

It is suggested to create a new sub-heading 'Situation of IDPs in Khartoum' which should be listed in the Contents. It would be interesting to note why for this particular issue, no relevant excerpts have been identified and only links provided. It is considered that given the relevance of the possibility of internal relocation to Khartoum for Sudanese asylum applicants, that this section be expanded to include excerpts from sources, and that additional more recent sources be included, for example:

- [Miraya FM, South Sudanese living conditions in Khartoum 'serious', 24/09/2012](#)
- [UNOCHA, Weekly Humanitarian Bulletin; Sudan; 03-09 September 2012, Floods damage houses in Khartoum State](#)
- [UNOCHA, Monthly Humanitarian Bulletin Issue 5, 01-30 June 2012, Rising food prices trigger protests](#)
- [ODI, Humanitarian Policy Group, City Limits: urbanisation and vulnerability in Sudan- Khartoum case study, January 2011](#)
- [Internal Displacement Monitoring Centre, Durable solutions elusive as southern IDPs return and Darfur remains tense, 23 December 2010, Khartoum](#)

COIS (102): Consideration of the situation for IDPs in Khartoum is a complex and multi-faceted issue which can not be easily included in what is a generalised COI report on Sudan. Consequently web-links have been provided to direct users to particularly useful sources, whilst the report is limited to providing a more general overview about IDPs in Sudan.

If there is a demand for further COI products on this subject, which may for example be prompted by a change in UKBA policy, a thematic report or other COI evidence document will be produced and made available to officials.

Additionally, no COI is provided on the situation of persons of South Sudanese origin in Khartoum, whom are described by UNOCHA as 'extremely vulnerable'. See:

- [UNOCHA, Humanitarian Bulletin Sudan, 17-23 September, Returns to South Sudan continue by air](#)
- [UNOCHA, Humanitarian Bulletin Sudan, 13-19 August Heavy rains affect South Sudanese living out in the open at departure points in Khartoum](#)
- [UNOCHA, Monthly Humanitarian Bulletin Issue 6, 01-31 July 2012](#)
- [Refugees International, Sudan Clashes Have Huge Costs Beyond Battlefield, 2 May 2012](#)

COIS (103): Not accepted. South Sudanese nationals residing in Sudan are not by definition refugees or internally displaced persons. Information about south Sudanese in Sudan is extensively covered in chapter 31 'Citizenship and Nationality' for example under the subheading 'Returns to South Sudan'.

Additionally the introduction to chapter 31 provides extensive cross referencing to relevant information in other chapters, for example ‘Treatment of ethnic groups, Discrimination and racial prejudice’ and ‘Societal discrimination and attacks against Christians’. Consideration will however be given to including further cross referencing with chapter 30.

The following paragraph needs to be revised in order to be consistent with the original source:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

30.09 The Enough Project report, ‘Enough 101: Displaced from Darfur - Refugees in Chad and IDPs in Sudan’ dated 24 July 2012 additionally explained with regard to Darfurian refugees residing in Chad: —According to the United Nations, as of January 2012 there were ~~288,000~~ **more than 260,000** Sudanese refugees in 12 refugee camps in Chad, many of whom have been living in the camps for close to a decade. Chad is one of the poorest countries in the world and is inundated by refugees from Central African Republic, Sudan, and South Sudan, in addition to its own IDPs. The international community struggles to provide food, water, health services, and sanitation for the refugees and IDPs, and competition with local communities over access to resources—including water, firewood, and grass for thatching roofs—breeds resentment. ... As in Darfur itself, security for the refugee camps is an ongoing problem. From September 2007-December 2010 the U.N, Mission in the Central African Republic and Chad, or MINURCAT, provided forces to assist local authorities in protecting the refugee camps. MINURCAT left at the request of the Chadian government, and was replaced by a United Nations-supported Chadian security force, the Détachement Intégré de Sécurité, or DIS, in 2011. DIS is tasked with ensuring security in and around the camps, as well as protecting convoys of IDPs. ... Early marriage and gender-based violence is an additional issue in the camps. Family planning is a ‘taboo subject,’ rape and other forms of sexual violence are common, and access to services for the victims is minimal. ... Due to these security issues, most refugees are forced to depend almost entirely on humanitarian assistance because they are unable to legally access farmlands to cultivate their own crops for food.|| [51c]

COIS (104): As the reference is a direct quotation COIS is unable to explain why this text has changed, although notes that the UNHCR’s website on Sudan (which the Enough Project article provides a link to) records the number of refugees in Sudan to be 288,000. The most plausible explanation is that the web article has been amended and re-posted since it was included in the Sudan report. The revised web-source will be included in the next report.

No reference has been provided for the map in paragraph 30.14. It should be:

- Medecins Sans Frontiers, South Sudan Refugee Camp Under Water, 5 July 2012
<http://www.doctorswithoutborders.org/press/release.cfm?id=6106&cat=press-release>

COIS (105): Accepted. The map has been referenced in the narrative of the report at para 30.14 and so can be easily found through any internet search. However COIS omitted to include a reference number. This will be amended in the next report.

31. CITIZENSHIP AND NATIONALITY

RETURNS TO SOUTH SUDAN

It is considered that relevant information on the situation of persons of South Sudanese origin waiting at Khartoum departure points has been omitted from this excerpt:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

31.20 According to the UN's Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs (OCHA), 'Sudan Humanitarian Update, 2nd Quarter 2012', dated 15 July 2012, between October 2010 and June 2012 **In late June, humanitarian organisations assessed the open air departure points in Khartoum used by an estimated 40,000 people of South Sudanese origin who are waiting to return to South Sudan. These departure points lack adequate shelter and some basic services. As most people at the departure points lack the means to travel to South Sudan, they are requesting transportation assistance. Many of them say that they have lost their jobs, with their livelihoods badly affected. They say that they came to the departure points after the Government of South Sudan urged them to do so earlier in the year, promising that their departure to South Sudan was imminent.**

405,000 people had returned to South Sudan, including 33,000 who had returned in quarter two of 2012. [24h](p.5) As of 26 June 2012 movements to South Sudan comprised: 23,292 recorded road (bus/truck) passengers; 19,245 recorded flight passengers and 5,517 record barge and boat passengers. The source listed no figures for recorded train passengers. [24h](p.5) The OCHA report additionally included the following figure:

COIS (106): Not accepted. The Sudan COI report includes information about the difficulties faced by Southerners travelling to South Sudan in the section on 'Returns to South Sudan'. Given the overall size of this section and other complex issues requiring coverage, it was not felt there was a need to cover the specific details suggested by the reviewer.

It is suggested that this section be cross-referenced with the proposed section above 'IDPs in Khartoum' in which it is suggested to include additional information on the situation for persons waiting to depart for South Sudan.

COIS (107): See comments under (103).

TREATMENT OF RETURNING FAILED ASYLUM SEEKERS

It is considered that the following paragraph gives the false impression that no new information has been published since the cited August 2011 Waging Peace report, when in fact Waging Peace recently issued a new report which specifically documents the treatment of returnees which is included in the COIS report under 'Reports on Sudan published or accessed between 2 August 2012 and 11 September 2012'. It is considered that given the report was available at the time of publication of the Sudan report, that if excerpts from that source could not be presented, that at least the link to the report could have been included in this section, to prevent it being overlooked.

COIS (108): The Waging Peace report was published after the cut off date of 1 August 2012 and therefore not included in this section. The issue of including reports published after the narrative cut-off is discussed above (1). The Waging Peace report will be included in the next Sudan report as will any further information which is relevant and is published before the cut off date of the next report.

In light of this material it is therefore suggested that the following paragraph be revised:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

32.05 Officials should note that some information related specifically to the treatment of returning failed asylum seekers is relatively dated and limited in its range and depth. A report from Waging Peace, dated 4 August 2011, citing sources from between 2006 and 2010, explained with regard to Sudan's National Intelligence Service (NISS):

—Returning Sudanese asylum seekers from the UK to Sudan in and of itself constitutes a significant threat to their safety at the hands of the NISS, and in the worst instances can result in death. Claiming asylum abroad is considered an act of regime defiance and, as such, the process of applying for documentation brings an individual to the attention of the NISS. Furthermore, the NISS uses information gathered through an advanced security service network to incriminate detainees, making the risk of imprisonment for failed UK asylum cases high. Detainees are then held without warrant, record, trial or representation, often severely tortured and their lives threatened, in prison conditions that are unacceptable. They are sometimes released only on the basis that they gather information on rebel activity and return to the NISS to be re-detained should they not provide 'satisfactory' answers. With this in mind, returning a Sudanese asylum seeker from the UK can, in the worst cases, amount to sending them to their death, and even in more favourable cases, constitutes a considerable threat to their safety and well-being.|| [35a]

See also: Waging Peace briefing 'UKBA intimidates Sudanese asylum seekers', circa 2011.

[COIS \(109\): See comments under \(108\) and \(1\).](#)

The link to the following source is incorrect. It should be:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

32.05 [...]

See also: [Waging Peace briefing 'UKBA intimidates Sudanese asylum seekers', circa 2011](#)

[COIS \(110\): See comments under \(2\).](#)

ANNEX D ARMED OPPOSITION GROUPS

The second reference in the subsection 'Sudan Liberation Army – Minni Minawi (SLA-MM)' needs to be revised from [23s] to [23t]

[COIS \(111\): Accepted.](#)

Text is missing from the following subsection:

Excerpt from the September 2012 COI Service report

Sudan Revolutionary Front (SRF)

The SRF includes the SPLM-N, JEM, SLA-AW, SLA-MM and the Beja Congress. (IRIN, 'Sudan: Who's who in the opposition', 26 July 2012) [106b]

—Led by SPLM-N (see below) chairman Malik Aggar, SRF is a coalition of rebel groups in Darfur, South Kordofan, Blue Nile and eastern Sudan formed in November 2011. SRF leaders say they want to overthrow the NCP regime 'using all available means' and establish a secular, liberal state. ... In a press statement on 12 July 2012 SRF said it supported the urban protests against the government [see: xxxxxxxx]. It said support by the National Consensus Forces ... [see: xxxxxxxx] for the Sudanese people's 'revolt' was a step in the right direction. It called on all political opposition forces to hold an expanded meeting on how to create a joint work programme, agree on a national democratic programme, and work together to bring down the regime.|| (IRIN, 'Sudan: Who's who in the opposition', 26 July 2012) [106b]

COIS (112): Noted, thank you.

For an update on the group see:

- [Small Arms Survey, Sudanese Revolutionary Front, October 2012](#)

COIS (113): Noted, thank you.

The first paragraph of the 'Beja Congress' sub-section requires a reference as it is not to be found in source [35b] cited in the subsequent paragraph.

COIS (114): Accepted.

Annex N – References to source material

Suggested amendments to relevant entries in the list of sources have been presented as tracked changes:

COIS (115): Consideration will be given to how to reference UN documents in COI reports.

1 United Nations Human Rights Council

b Report of the independent expert on the situation of human rights in the Sudan on the status of implementation of the recommendations compiled by the Group of Experts to the Government of the Sudan for the implementation of Human Rights Council resolution 4/8, pursuant to Council resolutions 6/34, 6/35, 7/16, 11/10 and 15/27 (A/HRC/18/40/Add.1), 22 August 2011

<http://daccess-ddsny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/G11/155/34/PDF/G1115534.pdf?OpenElement>

<http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4e7325872.html>

Date accessed 24 May 2012

c Report on the situation of human rights in Darfur prepared by the group of experts mandated by Human Rights Council resolution 4/8 presided by the Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights in the Sudan and composed of the Special Representative of the Secretary-General for children and armed conflict, the Special Rapporteur on extrajudicial, summary or arbitrary executions, the Special Representative of the Secretary-General on the situation of human rights defenders, the Representative of the Secretary-General on the human rights of internally displaced persons, the Special Rapporteur on the question of torture and the Special Rapporteur on violence against women, its causes and consequences (A/HRC/5/6), 8 June 2007

<http://daccess-ddsny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/G07/128/19/PDF/G0712819.pdf?OpenElement>

<http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/467263c52.html>

Date accessed 24 May 2012

d National Report submitted in accordance with paragraph 15(a) of the annex to Human Rights Council resolution 5/1 (A/HRC/WG.6/11/SDN/1), 11 March 2011

<http://daccess-ods.un.org/TMP/7117078.90033722.html>

http://ap.ohchr.org/documents/dpage_e.aspx?c=174&su=173

Date accessed 24 May 2012

e Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review, Sudan, 11 July 2011

<http://daccess-ddsny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/G11/146/04/PDF/G1114604.pdf?OpenElement>

<http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4e72fa0a2.html>

Date accessed 28 May 2012

g Summary prepared by the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights in accordance with paragraph 15 (c) of the annex to Human Rights Council resolution 5/1' (A/HRC/WG.6/11/SDN/3), 25 February 2011

<http://daccess-ddsny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/G11/113/93/PDF/G1111393.pdf?OpenElement>

http://ap.ohchr.org/documents/dpage_e.aspx?c=174&su=173

8 Amnesty International

f Sudan: Human rights situation continues to deteriorate, Amnesty International written statement to the 20th session of the UN Human Rights Council (18 June – 6 July 2012), 22 June 2012

<http://www.amnesty.org/en/library/asset/AFR54/026/2012/en/c5b14de9-eff2-4158-b3caeb38f9d595b7/afr540262012en.pdf>
<http://www.amnesty.org/en/library/asset/AFR54/026/2012/en/b6da4602-270d-4207-9292-f23917815f1b/afr540262012en.pdf>

Date accessed 27 June 2012

g We can run away from bombs, but not from hunger, June 2012 (listed twice)
<http://www.amnesty.org/en/library/asset/AFR65/001/2012/en/107d41a7-50c9-4eb9-9fe7-59afb3ec63ff/afr650012012en.pdf>

Date accessed 27 June 2012

(this source is listed twice- 8g and 8l)

j Sudan: Human rights situation continues to deteriorate, Amnesty International written statement to the 20th session of the UN Human Rights Council (18 June – 6 July 2012),
22 June 2012

<http://www.amnesty.org/en/library/asset/AFR54/026/2012/en/c5b14de9-eff2-4158-b3caeb38f9d595b7/afr540262012en.pdf>
<http://www.amnesty.org/en/library/asset/AFR54/026/2012/en/b6da4602-270d-4207-9292-f23917815f1b/afr540262012en.pdf>

11 Government of Canada

a Map of Sudan and South Sudan, undated

http://www.canadainternational.gc.ca/sudan-soudan/assets/mapscartes/Sudan_SouthSudan.PNG
http://www.canadainternational.gc.ca/sudan_south_sudan-soudan_soudan_du_sud/sudan-southsudan_soudan-soudandusud.aspx?lang=eng&view=d

12 Sudan Tribune

12 Sudan Tribune

a Bashir establishes two states in Darfur, reshuffles governors, 11 January 2012

<http://www.sudantribune.com/Bashir-establishes-two-states-in-41256.org>
<http://www.sudantribune.com/spip.php?article41256>

Date accessed 22 May 2012

f Sudan accepts humanitarian initiative in S.Kordofan and Blue Nile, 28 June 2012

<http://www.sudantribune.com/Sudan-accepts-humanitarian-43075>

Date accessed 4 July 2012

(this source does not appear in the report)

16 Foreign and Commonwealth Office

b Written evidence (SUD 2) submitted to the House of Lords, Foreign Affairs, Defence and Development Policy (Sub-Committee C) on 'The EU's Conflict Prevention and Peace-keeping role in Sudan', Oral Evidence with Associated Written Evidence, undated circa 2010/11

<http://www.parliament.uk/documents/lords-committees/eu-sub-com-c/Sudan/SudanOralWritEvidence.pdf>
<http://www.parliament.uk/documents/lords-committees/eu-sub-com-c/Sudan/SudanOralWritEvidence.pdf>

18 UN Security Council

a Report of the Security Council mission to Uganda and the Sudan, 4 to 10 October 2010, 7 January 2011

<http://daccess-ddsny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N11/204/39/PDF/N1120439.pdf?OpenElement>
<http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4d4690e82.html>

Date accessed 24 May 2012

b Report of the Secretary-General on the African Union-United Nations Hybrid Operation in Darfur (S/2012/231), 17 April 2012

<http://daccess-ddsny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N12/289/36/PDF/N1228936.pdf?OpenElement>
<http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4fbf7cd02.html>

Date accessed 27 May 2012

c Report of the Secretary-General on the African Union-United Nations Hybrid Operation in Darfur (S/2011/814), 30 December 2011

<http://daccess-ddsny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N11/651/16/PDF/N1165116.pdf?OpenElement>
<http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4f1563f32.html>

Date accessed 27 May 2012

d Report of the Secretary-General on the African Union-United Nations Hybrid Operation in Darfur' (S/2011/643), 12 October 2011

<http://daccess-ddsny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N11/543/27/PDF/N1154327.pdf?OpenElement>
<http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4ec613f12.html>
<http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4ec613f12.html>

Date accessed 27 May 2012

e Report of the Secretary-General on the African Union-United Nations Hybrid Operation in Darfur' (S/2011/422), 8 July 2011

<http://daccess-ddsny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N11/397/97/PDF/N1139797.pdf?OpenElement>
<http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4e772ba32.html>

Date accessed 27 May 2012

f Report of the Secretary-General on the African Union-United Nations Hybrid Operation in Darfur (S/2009/592), 16 November 2009

<http://daccess-ddsny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N09/594/37/PDF/N0959437.pdf?OpenElement>
<http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4b1516c52.html>

Date accessed 27 May 2012

g Report of the Secretary-General on the African Union- United Nations Hybrid Operation in Darfur, (S/2011/244), dated 14 April 2011

<http://daccess-ddsny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N11/298/91/PDF/N1129891.pdf?OpenElement>
<http://www.un.org/apps/news/docs.asp?Topic=Sudan&Type=Report>

Date accessed 28 May 2012

h Report of the Panel of Experts on the Sudan established pursuant to resolution 1591 (2005), 20 September 2010 (S/2011/111), published 8 March 2011

<http://daccess-ddsny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N11/111/11/PDF/N1111111.pdf?OpenElement>

[un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N10/506/11/PDF/N1050611.pdf?OpenElement](http://www.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N10/506/11/PDF/N1050611.pdf?OpenElement)
http://www.un.org/ga/search/view_doc.asp?symbol=S/2011/111
Date accessed 8 June 2012

p Report of the Secretary-General on the United Nations Mission in the Sudan, 5 April 2010 (S/2010/168)
<http://daccess-ddsny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N10/299/70/PDF/N1029970.pdf?OpenElement>
http://www.un.org/ga/search/view_doc.asp?symbol=S/2010/168

r Report of the Secretary-General on Children and armed conflict', 26 April 2012 (A/66/782 – S/2012/261)
<http://www.un.org/children/conflict/documents/A66782.pdf>
<http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4fd706472.html>
Date accessed 23 July 2012

s Annex I, List of Shame, Report of the Secretary-General on Children and armed conflict', 26 April 2012
<http://www.un.org/children/conflict/documents/AnnexI.pdf>
<http://childrenandarmedconflict.un.org/countries/sudan/>
Date accessed 23 July 2012

x UN Security resolution 2047 (2012) passed on 17 May 2012 (S/RES/2047 (2012))
<http://daccess-ddsny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N12/344/09/PDF/N1234409.pdf?OpenElement>
<http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4fbe07522.html>
Date accessed 1 August 2012

y UN Security resolution 2063 (2012) passed on 31 July 2012 (S/RES/2063 (2012))
<http://daccess-ddsny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N12/447/43/PDF/N1244743.pdf?OpenElement>
<http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/5050925c2.html>
Date accessed 1 August 2012

z Report of the Secretary General on the situation in Abyei, 25 July 2012 (S/2012/583)
http://www.un.org/ga/search/view_doc.asp?symbol=S/2012/583&Lang=Eng
<http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/50531eb32.html>
Date accessed 1 August 2012

23 Sudan Human Security Baseline Assessment

d Conflict in South Kordofan/Nuba Mountain, 18 November 2011
<http://www.smallarmssurveysudan.org/pdfs/facts-figures/armed-groups/threecareas/HSBA-Conflict-in-SK.pdf>
http://reliefweb.int/sites/reliefweb.int/files/resources/Full_Report_2344.pdf

(the text found in excerpt 8.47 was not found in the source cited which is the updated July 2012 version, source 23p)

n Forgotten Darfur: [Old tactics, new players](http://www.smallarmssurveysudan.org), by Claudio Gramizzi and Jerome Tubiana, July 2012
<http://www.smallarmssurveysudan.org>

Darfur Peace Process, ~~29 February 2012~~ 19 October 2012 (the original source cited here is no longer available)
<http://www.smallarmssurveysudan.org/facts-figures-darfur-peace-process.php>

<http://www.smallarmssurveysudan.org/facts-figures/sudan/darfur/darfur-peace-process-chronology.html#c1120>

Date accessed 1 August 2012

24 UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs (OCHA)

m UN and Partners World Plan 2012, Mid Year Review, undated circa 2012

http://ochanet.unocha.org/p/Documents/Sudan_HWP_MYR_2012_Final.pdf

http://docs.unocha.org/sites/dms/CAP/2012_MYR_SUDAN.pdf

Date accessed 1 August 2012

25 Centre for Strategic and International Studies

(this source is listed twice; also as 15)

35 Waging Peace

a The Sudanese National Intelligence and Security Service, 4 August 2011

http://www.wagingpeace.info/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=388:thesudanese-national-intelligence-and-security-service-4th-august-2011&catid=21:sudanreports&Itemid=44

<http://www.wagingpeace.info/images/pdf/TheSudaneseNationalIntelligenceandSecurityService4.8.11.pdf>

Date accessed 18 June 2012

b The Human Rights Situation in East Sudan, citing a briefing Sudan Democracy First Group, Weekly Briefing No.2, 24 October 2011

<http://www.wagingpeace.info/images/pdf/eastsudanmarch2012.pdf>

<http://www.wagingpeace.info/images/pdf/EastSudanMarch2012.pdf>

Date accessed 1 August 2012

51 Enough Project

h Down to the Wire, An update on Negotiations Between the Sudans, 31 July 2012

<http://www.enoughproject.org/files/Negotiations%20July%202012.pdf>

Date accessed 1 August 2012

116 Small Arms Survey

a A seminar presentation by Eric Berman of Small Arms Survey entitled 'Small Arms Proliferation in Sudan: The challenges of an independent South Sudan' for the SwissNetwork for International Studies (SNIS) Roundtable on Sudan, presented at the University of St Gallen, Switzerland, 10 March 2011

http://www.google.co.uk/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&frm=1&source=web&cd=5&ved=0CE4QFjAE&url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.swissinternationalstudies.ch%2Fsystem%2Ffiles%2Fsmall%2520Arms%2520Proliferation%2520in%2520SudEric%2520G.%2520Berman.pdf&ei=pcoqUJLNaca40QWF1lCoCA&usq=AFQjCNFALEwcyrDy2q_XS_WQyf-DNzxcOug&sig2=e-D6_ynF6YeCw2pYjcN3BA

<http://www.snis.ch/system/files/Small%20Arms%20Proliferation%20in%20Sud-Eric%20G.%20Berman.pdf>

Date accessed 1 August 2012