Volume 9
Wales, Scotland and Northern Ireland

Terms of Reference, Committee Members and Report Volumes ix
A note on the footnotes x

1 Introduction

The geographical pattern of the BSE epidemic 1
The responsibilities and concerns of Wales, Scotland and Northern Ireland 3
The need for good working arrangements and understanding throughout the UK 4
Structure of the volume 4

Part 1: Wales

2 Setting the scene

Cattle farming 9
The slaughtering industry 9
The rendering industry 10
The animal feed industry 10

3 Statutory framework and responsibilities

The Secretary of State for Wales 11
The Welsh Office 11
Legislation on animal health 12
Legislation on food safety 12

4 Departmental responsibilities

Welsh Office Agriculture Department (WOAD) 14
State Veterinary Service in Wales 15
Welsh Office Health Department (WOHD) 16
Health Professionals Group (HPG) 17
Public Health and Family Division (PHF) 18
Public Health Laboratory Service (PHLS) 18
Local government 19
Other bodies relevant to the BSE story 19
The Agriculture Advisory Panel for Wales 19
The Hill Farming Advisory Sub-Committee for Wales 20
National Farmers’ Union (Wales) and Farmers’ Union of Wales (FUW) 20
5 Chronological account of specific Welsh issues 21

Emergence of BSE 21
The ruminant feed ban, and slaughter and compensation 21
The SBO ban 22
Welsh Office concerns 23
  Risk from slaughterhouse practices 23
  ‘Beef is safe’ 23
  Follow-up action on issues 24
  Concerns over bovine heads 25
  Challenging the DH line 26
  The epidemiology concerns 27
  Restricted access to SEAC deliberations 31
  The meeting with Dr Tyrrell 32
  PHLS involvement in SEAC and the CJD Surveillance Unit 34
School meals 36
The Meat Hygiene Service 37
Identification of vCJD 37

6 Comment 39

Part 2: Scotland 49

7 Setting the scene 49
Cattle farming 49
The slaughtering industry 50
The rendering industry 51
The animal feed industry 51

8 Statutory framework and responsibilities 53
The Secretary of State for Scotland 53
The Scottish Office 53
Legislation on animal health 54
Legislation on food safety 54

9 Departmental responsibilities 56
Department of Agriculture and Fisheries for Scotland (DAFS) 56
  Animal Health branch 56
  Meat Hygiene branch 57
  Food Standards branch 57
  Livestock Industry branch 57
  State Veterinary Service (SVS) in Scotland 58
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Scottish Agricultural Colleges</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research bodies</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scottish Home and Health Department (SHHD)</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical Services</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Health Policy Unit (PHPU)</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chief Scientist’s Office (CSO)</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communicable Disease (Scotland) Unit (CD(S)U)</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Health (Scotland) Unit</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National CJD Surveillance Unit</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scottish Office Food Safety Group</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scottish Office Education and Industry Department</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local government</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other bodies relevant to the BSE story</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Farmers’ Union of Scotland</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Chronological account of specific Scottish issues</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergence of BSE</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The course of the disease in Scotland</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The arrangements for handling Scottish cases</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ruminant feed ban</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction of the SBO ban</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The concerns of Dr Forbes about BSE</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graham Hart’s concern over the handling of the BSE risk</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dissection of bovine eyeballs in schools</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication with the CMO for Scotland</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>vCJD</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scotland and trade with the European Union</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 Comment</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Scottish Office response when BSE emerged</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The SBO Regulations</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bovine eyeballs</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taking the lead from London</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scotland’s assessment of the risk to human health</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access to expert advice</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SVS advice</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Role of the CMO</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Calman’s public guidance in 1990</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Forbes’s alternative views</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Kendell’s public statement in 1995 on the safety of beef</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concluding remarks</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Part 3: Northern Ireland

12 Setting the scene
Cattle farming 107
The slaughtering industry 109
The rendering industry 109
The feed industry 110

13 Statutory framework and responsibilities
The constitutional and legislative framework 111
The Secretary of State for Northern Ireland 112
The Northern Ireland Office 112
Legislation on animal health 112
Legislation on food safety 113

14 Departmental responsibilities
Department of Agriculture for Northern Ireland (DANI) 114
    Animal Health Division 115
    Livestock and Meat Marketing Division 116
    Veterinary Service 116
    The Science Service 118
    The Agri-Food Development Service 119
Department of Health and Social Services (DHSS) 119
    Medical professionals 120
    Medicines and Food Control branch 121
    The Health Promotion and Disease Control branch 121
    The Health and Social Services Boards 121
Other bodies relevant to the BSE story 122
    Regional Communicable Diseases Liaison Group 122
    Ulster Farmers’ Union (UFU) 123
Relationship with the Republic of Ireland 123

15 Chronological account of specific Northern Ireland issues
Emergence of BSE 125
Ruminant feed ban, notification, and slaughter and compensation 127
Reasons for the delays in introducing notification and the ruminant feed ban 132
    (a) Absence of BSE in Northern Ireland and the Republic of Ireland 133
    (b) Low incidence of scrapie in Northern Ireland 133
(c) Different rendering processes 134
(d) Island status 134
(e) Alternative import measures adopted 134
Meat and bone meal (MBM) imports 135
Enforcement of the ruminant feed ban 135
Cross-contamination 136
Introduction of the SBO ban for humans 137
The 1990 ban on SBO in feed for animals 138
Cases of BSE in animals Born After the ruminant feed Ban (BABs) 139
Further SBO controls in 1994–95 140
Other issues in Northern Ireland 141
Professor McFerran’s concerns 141
Waste disposal 142
BSE cases and suspect animals 142
Fallen stock 143
SBO 143
Northern Ireland and trade with the European Union 144

16 Comment 146
Looking to London for the policy lead 146
Northern Ireland’s own responsibilities 146
NI assessment of the risk to human health 147
Delayed introduction of notification and the ruminant feed ban (RFB) 148
The decision-making process 149
Notification requirements 150
Ruminant feed ban 150
Enforcement in Northern Ireland 152
Did the cattle-tracking system help? 153

Part 4: Collective Government

17 Collective government 161
Introduction 161
Policy decisions and legislative action 162
Working relationships between Whitehall and the Territorial Departments on BSE 163
The timing of communication from Whitehall 164
The nature of communication from Whitehall 165
Communication within Territorial Departments on BSE 166
Access to expert advice 168
General conclusions 169
Overview and summary of main findings 170
Findings 171
Wales 172
Scotland 172
Northern Ireland 173
Collective government and working relationships 174

Annex: BSE – a selective chronology of legislation by country 175

Who’s who 185

Glossary 191

Index 195

List of tables and figures
Table 1: A comparison of cumulative herd incidence of BSE in England, Wales, Scotland and Northern Ireland, up to 20 March 1996 1
Chart 1: Number of confirmed cases of BSE by year of clinical onset, up to 20 March 1996 2
Chart 2: Number of confirmed cases of BSE by year of clinical onset, up to 20 March 1996 (logarithmic scale) 2
Welsh Office Ministers 42
Welsh Office Agriculture Department 43
Welsh Office Health Professionals 44
Welsh Office Health Administrators 45
Scottish Office Ministers 99
Scottish Office Agriculture, Environment and Fisheries Department (formerly the Department of Agriculture and Fisheries for Scotland) 100
Scottish Office Health Departments 102
Northern Ireland Office Ministers 155
Department of Agriculture for Northern Ireland: Policy 156
Department of Agriculture for Northern Ireland: Science 157
Department of Agriculture for Northern Ireland: Veterinarians 158