

**Review of the January 2012 UK Border Agency Country of Information Service *Nigeria Country of Origin Information (COI) Report* on behalf of the Independent Advisory Group on Country Information (IAGCI)**

Prepared by Gernot Klantschnig (University of Nottingham, Ningbo, China)

February 2012

**Contents**

Background to the author .....	p.2
Scope of review.....	p.3
Methodology.....	p.3
General comments.....	p.4
Detailed review.....	p.6

## ***Background to the author***

Gernot Klantschnig is Assistant Professor in the Politics of International Law at the University of Nottingham (China campus). He completed his DPhil in Politics at St Antony's College, Oxford in 2008. His doctoral research, which is now in the process of being published as *Drugs, Crime and the State in Africa: The Nigerian Connection*, examined Nigeria's drug and crime control policies. This research involved ethnographic and interview-based fieldwork on Nigerian and UK law enforcement agencies, and work in Nigerian prisons and detention centres. He has acted as a consultant to Austrian, Swiss and UK government bodies in this area of expertise (with reference to particular asylum cases). He is also the co-author of the forthcoming *Africa and the War on Drugs* (Zed 2012). His recent research and publications have also focussed on the politics of human trafficking, West African law enforcement, as well as trade and migration between China and West Africa.

## ***Scope of review***

The review followed the general guidelines provided in the preface of COI reports, which state that the author on behalf of the 'IAGCI reviews the content of selected UKBA COI documents and makes recommendations specific to those documents and of a more general nature.' Very helpful comments on the nature of the review were also kindly provided by Dr Khalid Koser in correspondence with the author. The author was advised to use the review of the August COI report on China as a template for his review.

The preface to the COI report also states the aims and purposes of the report: 'This Country of Origin Information (COI) Report has been produced by the COI Service, United Kingdom Border Agency (UKBA), for use by officials involved in the asylum/human rights determination process. The Report provides general background information about the issues most commonly raised in asylum/human rights claims made in the United Kingdom. ... [It is] compiled wholly from material produced by a wide range of recognised external information sources and does not contain any UKBA opinion or policy. ... COIS will bring the discrepancies together and aim to provide a range of sources, where available, to ensure that a balanced picture is presented.'

Based on the aims set out in the report itself and in line with established best practice criteria for COI research, the review focussed on the accuracy, reliability and range of data used, the presentation of a relatively 'balanced picture' on human rights issues in Nigeria, as well as the accessibility and up-to-date nature of sources used.

## ***Methodology***

The review is based on an analysis of sources and information cited in the January 2012 COI report on Nigeria. The review scrutinised all paragraphs individually, as well as whole parts and sections of the report. Paragraphs were checked for factual errors and whether they make sense to a reader unfamiliar with Nigeria. The majority of the sources were also checked online for accessibility and accuracy of reproduction in the report. Dubious and relatively unknown sources were inspected in greater detail. Whole sections and parts of the report were also examined for their relative cohesion (this is at times difficult with a report based solely on quotations), their structure and whether they provide a well-balanced representation of a specific topic. Additional and alternative information sources, such as official reports, newspaper articles and academic works, were searched online and are mentioned in different parts of the review. They can be used in future versions of the COI report on Nigeria.

## ***General comments***

The January 2012 COI Nigeria report is very well-researched and presented and it is clearly suited to its purpose. General comments are made regarding (1) Accuracy, (2) Range and reliability of sources, (3) Relevance and balanced presentation, (4) Currency and (5) Accessibility

### **1. Accuracy**

- The information provided in the report can be considered accurate representations of the sources used.
- In very few cases the reviewer detected inaccurate representations of original source material. In the majority of these cases, it was a matter of a too short quote that led to a slight misrepresentation of the source. In these cases, it was suggested to replace the original quote with a longer one.
- In rare cases, personal views of officials and academics were not acknowledged as such. This can lead to potential confusion about government policies and more objectivity-driven academic views. In such cases a mention of the nature of the statement was recommended.

COIS: We will ensure that it is clear in what capacity information has been provided by academics/officials. Regarding where we have done this, we believe we have been clear though there might be scope to make references more explicit.

### **2. Range and reliability of sources**

- The report uses an impressive range of sources and it is commendable that in most sections foreign sources are combined with domestic Nigerian views, in particular from the Nigerian press. In cases where there was no local view represented, additional sources have been suggested by the reviewer.

COIS: Thank you for the additional sources mentioned.

- Several sections would benefit from a reference to the academic literature, for example the country's complex politics, the security forces, armed groups in particular in the Niger Delta etc are now well-understood through academics' work. Related academic readings have been suggested in relevant sections.

COIS: Academic sources are used where possible but are often subscription only and therefore inaccessible to COI Service.

### **3. Relevance and balanced presentation**

- The report's content is clearly relevant to the work of UK asylum case workers, as far as an external reviewer can judge this.
- A few sections are slightly long and not well-structured and additional headlines are needed to provide easier access to relevant information. Some other long parts (e.g. LGBT, women and children) are exceptionally well structured and presented and can serve as models.

COIS: We work from a template but it is accepted that we can continue to clarify by use of additional headlines/sub sections and cross referencing.

- A few sections read slightly unbalanced, as they rely heavily on one type of source. The reviewer added some suggestions on how to provide a range of different perspectives on these issues, in particular from non-government organisations, the media and academia. Corruption is an example of an issue presented in a slightly unbalanced way. See note below.

COIS: Please see below for comments on corruption.

#### **4. Currency**

- Over the last month and after the publication of the report a number of important events have occurred in Nigeria and several parts of the report will need to be brought up-to-date. Some important new documents have also been published in the month after the publication of this report and the review makes a mention of them. These events and sources need be included in the next version of the COI report.

COIS: We will update at the time of the next report.

- More significantly, three very important reports on the Niger Delta published in the second half of 2011 have only been mentioned but their findings have not been properly included in the report. The findings of these three reports will also need to be included in the next version of the COI report.

COIS: It was felt important to flag up these reports but their focus on the history of events and touched on environmental as well as human rights issues which were not immediately relevant to the 'latest developments' section.

#### **5. Accessibility**

- A small number of sources is not accessible online, as a wrong URL has been provided. In these cases, the correct URL has been provided in the review and references should be updated accordingly.

COIS: We will correct these, if the sources are retained, for the next update.

- In few cases sources were not available to the reviewer, as they were based on internal government communications or confidential reports.

COIS: We use a limited number of subscription only websites but aim to restrict such usage as far as possible. The 'internal government communications' can be made available on request.

#### **Note on corruption**

Corruption in Nigeria is presented as a vague and all-encompassing concept in most parts of this report. It is mentioned in the context of security forces (meaning mainly extortion and extrajudicial killings), in parts on the political system (meaning the diversion of public funds for private gain, particularly from Nigeria's oil industry), with journalists (referring to the limits of the independence of the media from politicians) as well as in a separate Part 19. It needs to be specified what is meant by corruption in each individual case, or else it remains an all-encompassing and inadequate term. The blame for this problematic depiction of corruption (in particular in the Nigerian context) should not be with the author of the report but with a public discourse on corruption prevalent in the international media and policy community. A few sources challenging this problematic and vague nature of corruption have been suggested to address this shortcoming. A related point is also being made in relation to 'trafficking' as the term is used too broadly and all-encompassing. See the sections on corruption and trafficking for details.

COIS: Accepted. Thank you for the observations. We will try to improve the context to corruption as far as possible although many academic sources, which might help, are subscription only and inaccessible to us at the moment. Does the reviewer know of other, open sources?

## *Detailed review*

### **LATEST NEWS**

Since the publication of the report on 6 January 2012, several important events have occurred in Nigeria that need to be included in any future report on the country.

The fuel subsidy protests have led to the re-instatement of parts of the state subsidy and there continues a civil society debate about the importance of such protests for the accountability of the government and unity of the country shaken by the continued attacks by Boko Haram.

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-africa-16579001>

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-africa-16584410>

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201202130890.html>

The same is true for Boko Haram and government responses to the militant actions of the movement. Attacks on public and civilian institutions have continued and the most lethal ones occurring in Kano on 20 January 2012. Nigeria's security forces have continued their brutal response, while the President has claimed to make some efforts to negotiate with members of the movement and initiate a reform of the security forces in the light of the continued violence in many parts of Northern Nigeria and the Middle Belt.

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201202160852.html> supposed BH attack on Kogi prison

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-africa-16663693> Kano blasts

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-africa-16761670> dialogue with BH

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-africa-16860954> extra-judicial killings in Kano

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201202160499.html> army shake up

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201201310463.html> police chief sacked

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201201241116.html> journalist killed by BH

Some groups claiming to be linked to MEND in the Niger Delta have attacked oil installations in February 2012.

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-africa-16896508>

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201202100544.html>

COIS: Accepted. Thank you for the above sources, we will look to include these in the next report if still relevant.

### **USEFUL NEWS SOURCES FOR FURTHER INFORMATION**

This section could be improved by adding some additional reputable news sources from Nigeria. Many of them have good archival facilities to access back issues of newspapers:

Guardian (Lagos) <http://www.ngrguardiannews.com/>

This Day (Lagos) <http://www.thisdaylive.com/>

Punch (Lagos) <http://www.punchng.com>

COIS: Accepted. Thank you. If regional media were to be referenced, it would also seem appropriate to include publications from other parts of the country, such as Abuja, Port Harcourt, Kano etc.

### **REPORTS ON NIGERIA PUBLISHED AFTER 15 DECEMBER 2011**

A few official documents have been published since the COI report was completed in January 2012. One of the most important ones that will need to be included in the next version on the COI report is:

Human Rights Watch, *World Report 2012 - Nigeria*, published in January 2012 ([www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4f2007cc5.html](http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4f2007cc5.html))

COIS: Accepted, will add the next update.

## **BACKGROUND INFORMATION**

### **1. GEOGRAPHY and 2. ECONOMY**

These two sections need to be better organised, as some paragraphs make little sense in the order they are presented. For instance, it is unclear why national holidays should be mentioned together with languages spoken in the country. In order to solve this problem, subheadings should be added. This will make it clearer to the reader what these sections contain. See the China COI report of 24 August 2011 for examples of subheadings.

#### Paragraph 1.04

While taken from an authoritative source, this paragraph on the official and national languages spoken in Nigeria is vague about official languages in Nigeria. A clearer quote would be:

‘The official language is English. Other widely used languages are Edo, Efik, Fulani, Adamawa Fulfulde, Hausa, Idoma, Igbo (Ibo), Central Kanuri, Yoruba, and Yoruba.’

From the Library of Congress Country Profile of Nigeria of July 2008  
(<http://lcweb2.loc.gov/frd/cs/profiles/Nigeria.pdf>)

COIS: Accepted. We will improve the construction of the section and the use suggested.

### **2. ECONOMY**

This section gives a rather uneven overall background by providing a lengthy discussion on economic prospects of the country, one paragraph on exchange rates and a paragraph on the minimum wage. Some additional sources are suggested for inclusion.

#### Paragraph 2.02

This paragraph cites an academic article that mainly deals with the economic situation in the Niger Delta. While it complements the quotes in 2.01, it needs to be supported with a more general paragraph on the poverty levels and income gaps after 2.02. The following quote from the Foreign and Commonwealth Office’s (FCO) *Nigeria Country Profile* would be appropriate for this purpose

(<http://www.fco.gov.uk/en/travel-and-living-abroad/travel-advice-by-country/country-profile/sub-saharan-africa/nigeria?profile=all>):

Despite Nigeria’s oil wealth, a large population means Nigeria’s GDP per capita is low. Few Nigerians, including those in oil-producing areas, have benefited from the oil wealth. Estimated GDP is over \$200bn but only \$1400 per capita. Adjusted for purchasing power roughly two thirds live on less than \$1.25 per day and more than four fifths less than \$2 per day. The trade in stolen oil, alongside poor governance, has fuelled violence and corruption in

the Niger Delta. Nigeria has some of the worst social indicators: 1 in 5 children die before the age of 5; 12 million children are not in school; approximately 6% of the population are now HIV positive.

For a more detailed account of Nigerian development indicators, see UNDP, *Human Development Report Nigeria 2008-2009* available at [http://www.ng.undp.org/documents/NHDR2009/NHDR\\_MAIN-REPORT\\_2008-2009.pdf](http://www.ng.undp.org/documents/NHDR2009/NHDR_MAIN-REPORT_2008-2009.pdf)

#### Paragraph 2.03

This paragraph on exchange rates should be placed at the end of the ‘Economy’ section.

#### Paragraph 2.04

This paragraph on the minimum wage should state at the outset that the minimum wage is one of the many measures introduced by the government in recent years that try to alleviate poverty. The Nigerian government report cited in 2.04 provides details on the many other efforts.

**COIS: Accepted. We will aim to improve the structure of this section and implement all the suggestions above in the next update.**

### **3. HISTORY**

#### Paragraph 3.02

The quote from the FCO *Nigeria Country Profile* should include more detail on the existing historical divisions in Nigeria, as the above paragraphs state that history was important but do not exactly detail what part of Nigeria’s history. Hence the existing quote should be replaced with a slightly longer version:

Nigeria was a British colonial creation. It came into being in January 1914 with the amalgamation of the Colony of Lagos (first annexed in 1861), the Southern Protectorates (established 1885 – 1894) and the Northern Protectorate (pacified by 1903). Hitherto, the British had administered them as separate but related territories. Local involvement in government was introduced as early as 1922 when southern politicians, from Lagos and Calabar, took seats in the central legislative assembly. Their northern counterparts did not have legislative experience until 1947 when a new constitution introduced the principle of regional representation. The 1954 constitution created fully-fledged regional governments, and federal elections were held in 1959 the year before independence.

Nigeria was granted its independence on 1 October 1960, originally with Dominion status. In 1963, Nigeria broke its direct links with the British Crown, and became a Republic within the Commonwealth. The independence constitution provided for a federation of three autonomous regions - Northern, Western and Eastern - each with wide-ranging powers, its own constitution,

public service, and marketing boards. The overarching but weaker federal government had powers limited to national issues, including control of the police and army, and economic planning.

#### Paragraph 3.05

As this paragraph clearly relates to the April 2011 elections and its outcomes, it should be moved into the next section just before paragraph 4.01.

COIS: Accepted. We will rework this section in light of comments above.

### **4. RECENT DEVELOPMENTS**

#### **ELECTIONS: APRIL 2011**

This headline should be changed to 'APRIL 2011 ELECTIONS AND AFTERMATH', as this represents the contents of this sub-section more accurately.

#### Paragraph 4.04

This paragraph can be deleted, as it is fairly simplistic and one-sided about the violence related to the elections (only mentioning Muslim attacks on Christians) and its actual factual content is limited.

#### Paragraph 4.07

This paragraph should be moved into the BUILD-UP TO THE APRIL 2011 ELECTIONS sub-section and be inserted just below paragraph 3.04. This will help to keep the section's chronological character.

The moved paragraph should also include more details about the nature of the source. This is an opinion piece by a Nigerian novelist and activist and provides a more optimistic view about Nigerians' involvement in the 2011 election campaign and tries to relate the situation in Nigeria to the so-called Arab Spring. It stands out as a more optimistic view among the largely negative reports on the elections and the spiralling violence.

COIS: Accepted with regard to the slight re-structuring of the section; and we will clarify the nature/origin of an 'opinion piece'.

### **BOKO HARAM**

#### Paragraph 4.14

This quote is not available at the provided link and cannot be checked for accuracy. A related article and more updated article of 26 January 2012 is available at <http://www.stratfor.com/weekly/nigerias-boko-haram-militants-remain-regional-threat>

The quotes in this paragraph are slightly confusing as quotation marks at the end of paragraphs are missing. Thus, it is unclear if these are quotations or summaries

provided by the COI report author. Quotation marks need to be added at the right place or the paragraph should be replaced with a more recent one from the 26 January 2012 article.

COIS: Not accepted. The quotation marks are in accordance with our house style. When quoting a source of several paragraphs in length, we quote at the start of each paragraph but not at the end apart from the final paragraph in the quote. Of course the reviewer would not necessarily be aware of our house style when looking at the report.

Thank you for the additional source.

#### Paragraph 4.19

An additional paragraph mentioning the changing and splintered nature of Boko Haram should be added after paragraph 4.19. This will help to strengthen this section on Boko Haram, as most of it portrays it as a unified and militant movement. See the following sources for details:

<http://africanarguments.org/2012/01/19/boko-haram-the-answer-to-terror-lies-in-providing-more-meaningful-human-security-by-olly-owen/>

<http://africanarguments.org/2011/11/09/african-arguments-editorial-boko-haram-is-another-consequence-of-unequal-development-in-nigeria/>

COIS: Accepted. We will add these suggestions to the next update, if still relevant.

## **HUMAN RIGHTS IN THE NIGER DELTA**

#### Paragraph 4.20

The 3 reports mentioned in this paragraph are very important and their findings need to be included in the COI report. It is unclear why this was not done.

This paragraph should also identify Platform UK as a ‘non-government organisation working on human rights and art’, as this might not be known to the reader. See their website for further information:

<http://platformlondon.org/aboutplatform.asp>

COIS: Accepted re Platform UK. Re the point about the reports, see comments below.

#### Paragraph 4.21

The quote from the Council of Foreign Relations (CFR) of the USA provides too little information about the three reports mentioned in paragraph 4.20. The CFR statement was published before two of the reports were made public and could not synthesise their findings.

The quote from the CFR only highlights the role of the Nigerian state – which was clearly very important – but it remains unclear what role corporations such as Shell and Exxon and other Nigerian and non-Nigerian actors play in the field of human rights in the Niger Delta. The Council article attempts to defend these other actors but does not tell the reader what they are accused of. In order to provide a more balanced section, the roles of these other actors need to be mentioned preferably by drawing on the findings of the three reports mentioned in paragraph 4.20:

1. United Nations Environment Programme, *An Environmental Assessment of Ogoniland* (commissioned by the Nigerian government, August 2011)
2. Platform UK, *Counting the Cost: corporations and human rights abuses in the Niger Delta*. (October 2011)
3. Amnesty International, *The True ‘Tragedy’: Delays and Failures in Tackling Oil Spills in the Niger Delta*. (November 2011)

The following paragraph from Human Rights Watch, *World Report 2012 - Nigeria*, published in January 2012 ([www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4f2007cc5.html](http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4f2007cc5.html)) should be added in this section:

Decades of oils spills – from multinational oil company operations, sabotage of pipelines, and bunkering (theft) of crude oil – and widespread gas flaring have left the Niger Delta heavily polluted. A UN report in August found that oil pollution in the Ogoniland region of Rivers State may require the world's largest clean up ever, at an initial cost of US\$1 billion, and take up to 30 years. The UN team found that oil contamination had migrated into the groundwater in at least eight spill sites that Shell – the largest oil company in Nigeria – had claimed they had remediated.

COIS: Partially accepted. We agree that these are significant reports but they are more historic than specifically reflective of the recent situation. Thus, it seemed appropriate to reference them without drawing out information from such given the scope of this section of the report, which is to briefly set out Nigeria's recent history.

We consider using the reports mentioned where relevant elsewhere in the COI report.

## **6. POLITICAL SYSTEM**

### Paragraph 6.03

Add a short quotation after paragraph 6.03 that is more critical of the quality of Nigerian democracy and the many limitations it has. See for instance a source mentioned later on in the report:

”Democracy index 2010: Democracy in retreat, available at [www.eiu.com/DemocracyIndex2010](http://www.eiu.com/DemocracyIndex2010)

At the end of this section, there is need for a cross-reference to the following part on HUMAN RIGHTS, in particular paragraphs 7.05 and 7.06.

There is a well-developed academic literature on elections, democracy and its limits in Nigeria. See, for example:

Raufu Mustapha and Lindsay Whitfield, *Turning Point Points in African Democracy* (2010). Available at:

[http://books.google.co.uk/books?id=gmiILKu5O10C&pg=PA71&lpg=PA71&dq=lindsay+whitfield,+democracy,+nigeria&source=bl&ots=X7SkwIHP0s&sig=xJESWcwarPiegB1RwtBG16HMqXs&hl=en&sa=X&ei=Lys-T9\\_7NM-jiAe9--zmBA&ved=0CC0Q6AEwAQ](http://books.google.co.uk/books?id=gmiILKu5O10C&pg=PA71&lpg=PA71&dq=lindsay+whitfield,+democracy,+nigeria&source=bl&ots=X7SkwIHP0s&sig=xJESWcwarPiegB1RwtBG16HMqXs&hl=en&sa=X&ei=Lys-T9_7NM-jiAe9--zmBA&ved=0CC0Q6AEwAQ)

<http://afraf.oxfordjournals.org/content/109/437/535.abstract?sid=cab5339f-e729-4649-8995-4b2aa3435dd7> - article on elections and democracy (2010)

<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/03056240902888428> - article on Nigerian elections (2009)

COIS: Accepted. We will add the suggested sources to the next report, if still relevant and current.

## HUMAN RIGHTS

### 7. INTRODUCTION

#### Paragraph 7.03

The following paragraph from Human Rights Watch, *World Report 2012 - Nigeria*, published in January 2012 ([www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4f2007cc5.html](http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4f2007cc5.html)) should be added after this paragraph to explain the lack of international pressures:

‘Because of Nigeria's role as a regional power, Africa's leading oil exporter, and a major contributor of troops to UN peacekeeping missions, foreign governments – including the United States and the United Kingdom – have generally been reluctant to publicly criticize Nigeria over its poor human rights record.’

COIS: The HRW report was published after the COIS report was published. We will add this, if still relevant, to the next update.

#### Paragraph 7.05

It makes sense to add a sub-heading here: ‘DEMOCRACY AND POLITICAL REFORM’, as the last three paragraphs in this section are dealing with quite a different subject compared to the initial ones.

The following academic literature can also be consulted here to strengthen this section on democracy, political reform and stability:

Raufu Mustapha and Lindsay Whitfield, Turning Point Points in African Democracy (2010). Available at:

[http://books.google.co.uk/books?id=gmiILKu5O10C&pg=PA71&lpg=PA71&dq=lindsay+whitfield,+democracy,+nigeria&source=bl&ots=X7SkwIHP0s&sig=xJESWcw arPiegB1RwtBG16HMqXs&hl=en&sa=X&ei=Lys-T9\\_7NM-jiAe9--zmBA&ved=0CC0Q6AEwAQ](http://books.google.co.uk/books?id=gmiILKu5O10C&pg=PA71&lpg=PA71&dq=lindsay+whitfield,+democracy,+nigeria&source=bl&ots=X7SkwIHP0s&sig=xJESWcw arPiegB1RwtBG16HMqXs&hl=en&sa=X&ei=Lys-T9_7NM-jiAe9--zmBA&ved=0CC0Q6AEwAQ)

<http://afraf.oxfordjournals.org/content/109/437/535.abstract?sid=cab5339f-e729-4649-8995-4b2aa3435dd7> article on elections and democracy (2010)

<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/03056240902888428> - article on Nigerian elections (2009)

There should also be a cross-reference to 6. POLITICAL SYSTEM at the end of this new sub-section on DEMOCRACY AND POLITICAL REFORM.

COIS: Accepted. We will aim to add additional sources referenced on democracy, though some of the detail from these sources might be better placed in later sections of the report to keep this introduction relatively brief.

## **8. SECURITY FORCES**

### Paragraph 8.02

There should be additional information in the report about quite similar human rights violations by these other law enforcement bodies. While these violations are not so well-documented, it is important to note that they exist. See the following sources for some examples:

<http://thestreetjournal.org/2011/11/court-orders-ndlea-to-pay-baba-suwe-n-25-million/>

<http://www.punchng.com/metro/man-accuses-ndlea-of-causing-wifes-death/>

COIS: Accepted, we will add additional information. Thank you for the sources.

### Paragraph 8.03

At least in the next version of the COI report on Nigeria there needs to be mention that high level police officials have in fact been sacked and that some further reforms have been initiated due to continued attacks by Boko Haram and the police's and military's inability to stop them. It is also important to highlight that police and military actions have led to the escalation of the violence due to their repressive approach in places such as Maiduguri, Kano and elsewhere in the Middle Belt. For instance, see:

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-africa-16860954> extra-judicial killings in Kano

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201202160499.html> army shake up

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201201310463.html> police chief sacked

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-africa-14136185> police officers in court for BH leader killing

<http://www.nigeriannewsservice.com/nns-news-archive/headlines/five-joint-task-force-members-in-maiduguri-to-face-trial> police officers in court for BH leader killing

COIS: Accepted. We will aim to add additional sources detailed above.

## **POLICE**

There is need and the possibility to draw on some academic work on the practices of the Nigerian police in this section.

<http://afraf.oxfordjournals.org/content/111/442/46.abstract?sid=cab5339f-e729-4649-8995-4b2aa3435dd7> - article on policing in Kano (2012)

<http://journals.cambridge.org/action/displayAbstract?jsessionid=82E724051CFA3358A2DD149588518BEB.journals?fromPage=online&aid=1206912> - article on police governance in Nigeria (2007)

<http://journals.cambridge.org/action/displayAbstract?fromPage=online&aid=1874752> - article on police reform in Nigeria (2008)

COIS: Accepted, these sources appear useful and will add these to the next update.

### Paragraphs 8.06 and 8.07

These paragraphs should be made into a separate subsection at the end of the POLICE section with a headline: ‘CORRUPT POLICE PRACTICES AND EXTORTION’, as this appears as a major sub-theme in this section. It will also help to highlight the diverse practices vaguely labelled ‘corruption’ that a body like the police is involved in. Extortion is the most common and day-to-day practice faced by most Nigerians and hence needs to be highlighted.

This new sub-section should also have a cross-reference to the 19. CORRUPTION part.

COIS: Accepted, will do.

### Paragraph 8.09

While a great example demonstrating the lack of capacities of the Nigerian police, most police officers do not work out of makeshift containers. Some brief alternative illustrations of police work is needed after this paragraph. An example from Alice Hills’s research on the police in Nigeria is available at

<http://journals.cambridge.org/action/displayAbstract?fromPage=online&aid=1874752>

‘Take the case of Garki police station, a local station in an unfashionable and poor

district of the federal capital, Abuja. ... The national police headquarters are new, quiet, smartly functional and staffed by efficient and educated officers in well-pressed uniforms. Half a mile away is the federal capital's administrative police headquarters. It is older and its front courtyard is full of vehicles, officers greeting each other or waiting for orders, and civilian staff and visitors. The concrete of its overcrowded buildings is decaying, but it is busy, people move purposively and the noise levels are lower than in comparable stations elsewhere in West Africa. As usual, there are large televisions in the offices of senior officers, and photocopying machines and copying paper (as well as ledgers) in their support offices. Elsewhere in the building, paper is under lock and key. Garki is nearby. Its functional single-storey building of small rooms, offices and cells is neat and tidy, and its cells do not smell, but the officers at the check-in counter wear stained and crumpled uniforms, and the station's special units operate out of lean-tos in a dusty courtyard. The cars and mopeds scattered around the courtyard were taken from armed robbers, and are used by police in the absence of alternative vehicles. The station gained notoriety in June 2005 for the involvement of four of its officers in the arbitrary execution of six innocent market traders – 'armed robbers' according to the officers concerned, but more generally known as the Apo Six. Local residents then burned Apo police post, which had for several years been the base for Garki's openly abusive policemen.'

COIS: Accepted. Thank you for these useful additional sources on the police which we will make use of in the next report.

## **ARMED FORCES**

This section needs some mention of the continued influence of the military on politics. This is most easily illustrated by the representation of former high-level military officials in politics. The two former military rulers, Muhammadu Buhari and Ibrahim Babangida played important roles in the PDP and opposition parties' election campaigns in 2010 and 2011.

See, for instance:

<http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/africa/8615529.stm>

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201103100972.html>

COIS : Accepted, we will add further sources on the influence of the military on the police.

### Paragraph 8.12

This paragraph should be removed. The actual *Guardian* article of 8 November 2011, 'Nigerian Taliban threat prompts US military training' states that much of what is claimed about the intensification of US-Nigerian military relations after the recent Boko Haram attacks is based on speculation. Aside from being speculative, the quote uses highly sensationalist language about Boko Haram, as the 'Taliban of Nigeria' and a 'state of armed Islamist insurgency'. The complete quote reads (formerly omitted parts are highlighted):

More than 100 people have been killed in recent days by the radical Muslim sect Boko Haram, dubbed the "Nigerian Taliban", in Nigeria's north-east. One rights activist described it as "a state of armed Islamist insurgency" likely to

spread. Nigeria has sought to crush the group with military force but faces criticism from human rights activists for alleged extra-judicial killings. The military said some battalions had received training in the US. "The army is in the process of setting up a division that is effectively looking at warfare tactics," a spokesman said. "Various battalions were in the United States earlier this year for training to that end." It is though these include specialist units such as bomb disposal. US officials confirmed it has a longstanding deal with Nigeria with soldiers travelling to America for training. It could not comment on whether the exercise was aimed at combating Boko Haram.

COIS: Not accepted. The source is referenced to a recognised media source and COIS cannot simply dismiss the source. If the quoted persons are being speculative, this would be balanced by providing other source material, illustrating any discrepancies.

The following extract from an eminent academic working on Northern Nigeria will be a better alternative source for a quotation. The quote should read:

An academic expert of Nigerian politics has also highlighted the army's role in countering the recent attacks of Boko Haram in Northern Nigeria., available on the African Arguments site of the Royal African Society (<http://africanarguments.org/2011/07/15/militancy-in-northern-nigeria-who-and-what-are-boko-haram/>):

The military have a different strategy: theirs is the President's 'stick' – in the form of a Joint Task Force combining army and police in an Operation Restore Order. Checkpoints have been set up; initially motorcyclists had to dismount 500 yards from the checkpoint, but now all motorcycles are totally banned within Maiduguri Metropolitan and Jere LGA (the Borno government is replacing their role in everyday transport, it says, by providing 5000 motorised tricycles and 100 buses). Now that the army is patrolling, it too is under attack from BH: in response, the army's de facto policy is to kill not only anyone who attacks them but also, possibly, those whom they suspect may have been 'sheltering' the attackers. These supposed sympathisers or 'supporters' of BH, living as they must either as residents of dense low-cost housing or as petty traders among the stalls that line Maiduguri's roads, pose a problem to the army and police as they rush in pursuit of whomever they believe shot at them: locals are simply categorised as BH and they and their premises are at risk. This is understandable as neither the army nor the police have had experience before of sustained urban counter-insurgency among their own fellow-citizens.

COIS: Accepted, thank you for the source which we will add to the next report.

## **HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS BY GOVERNMENT FORCES**

### Paragraphs 8.13

This paragraph makes reference to the Joint Task Force without telling the reader what this taskforce is. There is no explanation elsewhere in the report either. Edit the paragraphs as follows (see highlights for changes made):

Regarding arbitrary arrest and detention, the USSD 2010 Report stated that “The constitution and law prohibit arbitrary arrest and detention; however, police and security forces continued to employ these practices. The JTF [Joint Task Force; made up of Nigerian police and army officers initially set up to execute Operation Restore Order in the Niger Delta] arbitrarily arrested hundreds of persons during the year during sweeps for militants, and security forces made arbitrary arrests in Plateau State following ethnic violence.” [3a] (Section 1d)

COIS: Accepted, will clarify definition of the JTF.

### **EXTRA-JUDICIAL KILLINGS**

This sub-section refers mainly to the well-documented extrajudicial killings by police officers. However, there is need to mention the same practice by other law enforcement agencies and in particular the armed forces units stationed in the Niger Delta and in the North-East of the country. There needs to be a reference to the recent trial of five law enforcement officials accused of killing the former leader of the Boko Haram sect in Maiduguri, which by some accounts was the trigger for the more recent attacks of Boko Haram.

See the following sources for information:

<http://www.nigeriannewsservice.com/nns-news-archive/headlines/five-joint-task-force-members-in-maiduguri-to-face-trial> - JTF killings of BH leader

<http://www.punchng.com/metro/man-accuses-ndlea-of-causing-wifes-death/> - accusations against Nigerian drug law enforcement agency

COIS: Accepted that reference should be made to the armed forces here. Thank you for the sources.

#### Paragraph 8.22

The second part of this paragraph is about torture and not extrajudicial killings as the rest of the section:

“Amnesty International receives consistent reports that police routinely torture suspects in order to extract information. Moreover, in many cases the confession extracted by torture is used as evidence in court, contrary to national and international law.”

This part of the paragraph should be moved to the torture section or be deleted.

COIS: Accepted, will do.

#### Paragraph 8.24

This quote from the Human Rights Watch (HRW) report of August 2010, *Everyone's in on the Game'-Corruption and Human Rights Abuse by the Nigeria Police Force* should be replaced with the following longer version. In this way the statements in the quote will make more sense to the reader:

The UN Special Rapporteur on Extrajudicial, Summary or Arbitrary Executions found in 2006 that police “checkpoints provide the occasion for a large number of extra-judicial executions by police.” The vast network of checkpoints that exists in Nigeria leads to numerous confrontations between the police and motorists who refuse to pay the bribes demanded. All too often these confrontations escalate into fatal shootings by the police. Human Rights Watch interviewed witnesses and family members of the victims in three fatal shootings at police checkpoints in Anambra State. In each of the cases, the altercation between the police and the driver reportedly began after the driver refused to pay the ₦20 bribe (approximately \$0.17) that is routinely demanded by the police at checkpoints.

Human Rights Watch requested information from the inspector general of police on a total of 16 incidents of alleged extrajudicial killings associated with extortion by the police at checkpoints, either documented by Human Rights Watch or credibly reported in the media. The force public relations officer responded in a letter to Human Rights Watch on March 26, 2010, stating, “While it may not be possible now to respond to them [the 16 cases] one-by-one, be rest assured that the Nigeria Police views every such case as a case of MURDER for which the offending officers are investigated and dealt with in line with extant laws.” The response referred to only two examples from the 16 incidents in which police officers were dismissed and charged with murder. ... In reality, convictions of Nigerian police officers implicated in capital crimes including the extortion-related extrajudicial killings noted above, are very rare. ... Human Rights Watch found that corruption in the Nigeria Police Force leads directly and indirectly to extrajudicial killings of Nigerians. As the UN Special Rapporteur on Extrajudicial, Summary or Arbitrary Executions concluded in his 2006 report, the problem of corruption in Nigeria is “closely linked to the issue of extrajudicial executions.”

COIS: Accepted, will do.

## **9. MILITARY SERVICE**

#### Paragraph 9.01

This paragraph contains seriously problematic contents, such as a reference to ‘military tribes’, a racist term used by colonial administrators to distinguish the ‘tribal characteristics’ of Africans. In terms of factual contents, the paragraph is weak as well. It should be replaced with an introductory quote from one of the following sources:

COIS: Not accepted. The source – Jane’s International - is current and generally considered a reliable provider of COI and the reference to military tribes is in quotation marks suggesting it is a loaded term. Further, not all the

information provided in this quote appears in the sources suggested below, as far as we can tell.

Library of Congress, Country Profile: Nigeria, July 2008,  
<http://lcweb2.loc.gov/frd/cs/profiles/Nigeria.pdf>

FCO Nigeria Country Profile dated 25 June 2010, <http://www.fco.gov.uk/en/travel-and-living-abroad/travel-advice-by-country/country-profile/sub-saharan-africa/nigeria?profile=all>

United States State Department (USSD), Background Note, 20 October 2011,  
<http://www.state.gov/r/pa/ei/bgn/2836.htm>

## **10. NON-GOVERNMENT ARMED GROUPS**

### **BACKGROUND**

This part appears slightly one-sided in large part due to its heavy reliance on certain sources (except for the reference to the Simon Fraser University article). So-called non-government armed groups in Nigeria are largely described as criminal, exploitative and brutal, however, some alternative views of these organisations need to be mentioned. Such views have seen these organisations as a substitute for repressive and disrespected state actors, such as the police. The academic literature and many Nigerians refer to some of these organisations as ‘vigilante groups’. There is a great diversity of them in the country and some have existed for decades and have changed in character from self-help groups representing the interests of certain communities or economic actors into criminal gangs and politically exploited militant groups. Most of these groups have also not always been cohesive, as they include an array of actors and fulfil a diversity of functions, for instance the Oodua People's Congress (OPC) has had militant as well as more political elements. Of course many of them have committed serious human rights abuses.

There is now a well-developed academic literature that should be referred to in this section in order to highlight the historical, diverse and changing nature of these groups in Nigeria. See, for instance:

<http://ire.sagepub.com/content/21/2/217.short> - article on the OPC (2007)

<http://journals.cambridge.org/action/displayAbstract?fromPage=online&aid=763124> - article on the Bakassi Boys in Eastern Nigeria (2007)

<http://journals.cambridge.org/action/displayAbstract?fromPage=online&aid=7932902> - article on vigilantes in Plateau State (2008)

<http://journals.cambridge.org/action/displayIssue?iid=7932886> - special journal issue on vigilantes across Nigeria (2008)

COIS: Accepted. We will diversify sources.

## **GROUPS IN THE NIGER DELTA and MOVEMENT FOR THE EMANCIPATION OF THE NIGER DELTA (MEND)**

These two sub-sections are more balanced than the previous sub-section, however they would also benefit from reference to the extensive and easily accessible academic research on the Niger Delta groups.

<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/03056240701819517> - article on Niger Delta groups and MEND (2007)

<http://afraf.oxfordjournals.org/content/106/425/587.short> - article on Niger Delta groups and MEND (2007)

COIS: Accepted. We will add such sources next time.

### Paragraph 10.20

Add an extra paragraph on renewed attacks on oil installations by some armed groups in the Niger Delta in recent months (after the amnesty programme). This will help to contrast with the more positive comments on the amnesty programme in this section. See, for example:

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-africa-16896508>

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201202100544.html>

COIS: Accepted. We will add suggested sources.

## **11. CRIME AND SECURITY**

### Paragraph 11.01

This introductory quote on crimes in Nigeria from a US government report (US State Department *Country Report on Terrorism 2010: Nigeria*) mainly mentions the dangers that crime poses to foreign nationals. There should be an additional paragraph highlighting the domestic impact of crimes, such as kidnapping and advance fee fraud. An excellent academic source for the local dimensions of these crimes is:

Daniel Jordan Smith, *Culture of Corruption: Everyday Deception and Popular Discontent in Nigeria* (2008), available at:

[http://books.google.co.uk/books?hl=en&lr=&id=G3zd2SFAY8EC&oi=fnd&pg=PR9&dq=419+in+nigeria&ots=O9DwU99gk9&sig=m6jW1DwOB-h659DIB\\_nQH44Q\\_dE#v=onepage&q=419%20in%20nigeria&f=false](http://books.google.co.uk/books?hl=en&lr=&id=G3zd2SFAY8EC&oi=fnd&pg=PR9&dq=419+in+nigeria&ots=O9DwU99gk9&sig=m6jW1DwOB-h659DIB_nQH44Q_dE#v=onepage&q=419%20in%20nigeria&f=false)

Parts of the book are also accessible at:

<http://press.princeton.edu/titles/8266.html>

COIS: Accepted. We will refer to this source as far as we are able.

### Paragraph 11.03

This paragraph including its introductory sentence should be moved to 10. NON-GOVERNMENT ARMED GROUPS above, i.e. inserted in the BACKGROUND

section (after paragraph 10.01), as it provides a good introduction on the diversity of non-government armed groups.

The difficulty of categorising and defining different armed groups in Nigeria was noted in the December 2007 Small Arms Survey report, *Small Arms, Armed Violence and Insecurity in Nigeria: The Niger Delta in Perspective*:

“Given the diversity of the armed groups, it is difficult to generate a simple typology. Such groups are often characterized by observers as (ethnic) militias, confraternities or cults, vigilante groups, or (criminal) gangs, but these terms have often been used interchangeably, creating confusion as to the distinctions among the various categories. Some groups fall into more than one type, further blurring the distinctions... Regardless of their motivations or activities, many members of armed groups preferred to be called ‘freedom fighters’ as opposed to any other label, suggesting a strong belief in the reasons why they fight.

“Ethnic militias are defined as youth groups formed to promote and protect the interests of a specific ethnic group, and therefore operate across the territory of that ethnic group. They are not rebel movements, and are not seeking to capture territory or political power; instead, they serve as a pressure group on government.

“Confraternities and cults are similar in their origins, but differ in their areas of operation. These are small groups that originate in tertiary academic institutions. Their origins are in fraternities, initially comprising groups of men with similar interests, but they have since developed over the past few decades into armed groups that are often involved in criminal activities. Confraternities operate on campus, while their affiliated cults operate in off-campus locations. Their activities tend to be localized in proximity to the tertiary institution.

“Vigilante groups are community groups created to fill a security gap and provide protection from violent crime and armed robbery to a specific community. They consist of community members and are extremely localized in their area of operation.

“Criminal gangs tend to be groups of unemployed, poor, and illiterate youths who engage in small-scale crime and offer their services for hire to politicians and others. These gangs go by various local names, such as ‘area boys’ in Lagos or yandaba in the north. They are small groups with little organization, locally formed, and operating in small areas.”

COIS: Accepted, will do.

#### Paragraph 11.05

This paragraph should be deleted. It is a near-repetition of a quote used in 10.01, which comes from the same author. Its contents (vigilante groups) does not directly fit into this section. Paragraphs preceding and following it are about university student fraternities.

COIS: Accepted, will do.

#### Paragraph 11.09

This paragraph ends with a useful suggestion on further literature about cults in Nigeria. Three of those suggested works should be placed as suggestions in the previous part (at the end of the BACKGROUND section in the 10. NON-GOVERNMENT ARMED GROUPS part). The sources to be moved are:

Global Security.org, Military, Nigeria, last updated July 2011

News From Africa, Area Boys – a growing menace on the streets of Lagos, July 2005

Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada, Nigeria: Information on the O'odua People's Congress (OPC), including the methods of recruitment and the selection of members; implications of being a member and the consequences of refusing to join (2003-May 2005)

COIS: Accepted, will do.

## **SEPARATIST VIOLENCE**

This short sub-section (paragraph 11.10) can be deleted as much more detail about the violence is provided in parts 10. NON-GOVERNMENT ARMED GROUPS and in the subsequent part on BOKO HARAM.

COIS: Accepted, will do.

## **BOKO HARAM**

This sub-section would benefit from some academics' views on Boko Haram available at the African Arguments site of the UK's Royal African Society, such as the following quote available at: <http://africanarguments.org/2011/11/09/african-arguments-editorial-boko-haram-is-another-consequence-of-unequal-development-in-nigeria/>:

Since 2001 and the start of the US-led War on Terror the temptation has been to interpret all domestic Islamist groups through the prism of international terrorism. This is plausible. Boko Haram or a faction of it – it may not be a monolithic organisation – has had contact with members of Al Qaeda in the Islamic Maghreb (AQIM) and even the Somali 'Al Shabaab. But the local may be more important than the global. A more fruitful interpretation comes from an examination of Nigerian domestic politics rather than global jihad.

The north-east of Nigeria has been largely excluded from developmental gains that have, to some extent, occurred in other regions of the country, notably the economically explosive region around Lagos. Boko Haram's central demand – the imposition of Sharia law in Northern states – suggests a rejection of the values of westernising Nigerian society that has produced obscene largesse for a few. In addition, the re-election this year of President Goodluck Jonathan, a Christian Southerner from the Delta region, seemed to further signal the decline in the North's political power. Since independence the northern

political elite have been the deciding factor in who rules the country. In forming the Peoples Democratic Party the northern elite helped create a national party which made sure that power was circulated – rather than shared – so each area took it in turns to be President and “chop” (steal from the public purse).

COIS: Accepted, will add the suggested source.

Another citation from the same site but a different academic sheds more light on Boko Haram. It is available at: <http://africanarguments.org/2012/01/19/boko-haram-the-answer-to-terror-lies-in-providing-more-meaningful-human-security-by-olly-owen/>

“It is clear that a variety of interests are sheltering under the umbrella labels ‘Boko haram’ and/or the more formal *Jama’atu Ahlis-sunnah lidda’ati wal Jihad* (claimed as its ‘true’ title by one faction of the group.) The August 2011 attack on UN headquarters in Abuja made it clear that there is an internationally networked aspect to the group, linking with wider jihadi worldviews and activities, but while it is this headline-grabbing set of activities which have caught the attention of the outside world – most recently, the US House of Representatives’ Committee on Homeland Security’s Subcommittee on Counterterrorism and Intelligence – the picture in Nigeria is more complex. Attacks in Kagoro, Kaduna state, in December, and more recently a massacre of (Christian) Igbo businesspeople holding a meeting in Adamawa State, put it beyond doubt that the aim of at least one tendency in Boko Haram is to escalate violence past the state’s capacity to respond, and thereby to destabilize the country into ethno-religious war.

Meanwhile, there seem to be other aspects of the movement more focussed on perceived injustices in the group’s original home of Borno State itself, and the local electoral and traditional political offices there. And other factions or actions of the insurgents seem to indicate deliberate political manipulation. In fact, there is no reason why the group should be more internally consistent than the militants of the Niger Delta, who span the range from the deeply ideological to the greedy opportunists. But it is clear that the longer the insurgency continues, the more the extreme tendencies with an interest in escalation seem to be gaining the upper hand.”

“Religious scholars such as sect leader Mohammed Yusuf preached a pro-poor message which was admired even by some Christians in the city, and gave more concrete help, such as micro-credit, to their own followers. Neither is it surprising that the movement exhibits a marked antipathy to the state – it is after all born in a region which has seen previous millennial Islamic risings such as the 1980s Maitatsine movement, and in which evading the state through border-crossing, smuggling and migration around the Lake Chad borderlands is a virtual way of life for many. But whatever the roots and ideological aims of the cluster of insurgent activities and activists we label Boko Haram, one clear priority of the group is a war against one particular agency of the government – the Nigeria Police. Since the July 2009 crackdown on the movement in Maiduguri, in which the group’s leader and

numerous followers lost their lives in circumstances still unclear, officers of the Nigeria Police Force have been a prime target for attacks.”

COIS: Accepted, will refer to the above source.

#### Paragraph 11.17

The previous paragraph 11.16 provides a typology on Boko Haram attacks, which surprisingly excludes attacks on Muslim clerics. In order to overcome this shortcoming, this paragraph (11.17) should read as follows:

The same CTC report also mentions Boko Haram attacks at Muslim clerics:

“The targeted assassinations are the most revealing, involving political figures, such as Abba Anas bin `Umar (killed in May 2011), the brother of the Shehu of Borno, and secular opposition figures (Modu Fannami Godio, killed in January 2011), but also prominent clerics such as Bashir Kashara, a well-known Wahhabi figure (killed in October 2010), Ibrahim Ahmad Abdullahi, a non-violent preacher (killed in March 2011), and Ibrahim Birkuti, a well-known popular preacher who challenged Boko Haram (killed in June 2011). The shootings of these prominent clerics seem to be in accord with Boko Haram’s purificationist agenda with regard to Islam. It is interesting also that in Boko Haram’s second incarnation there has been no figure who has replaced Muhammad Yusuf as the charismatic leader.”

COIS: Accepted, will amend as suggested.

On a wider point, the structure of sections 11 and 12 will be looked at again for the next report.

## **12. JUDICIARY**

#### Paragraph 12.01

This paragraph needs to be shortened to the following version to focus on the judiciary and not on the criminal justice system in general:

The Amnesty International report of 14 October 2011, Human Rights Agenda 2011-2015, stated:

“Nigeria has a weak criminal justice system. ... Court processes are slow, with the result that most detainees, especially the poor, are kept in pre-trial detention for many years. Human rights violations are prevalent in Nigeria’s justice system. Arbitrary arrest and detention, torture and failure to hold trials within a reasonable time are features of many inmates’ experience. Seven out of ten people held behind bars in Nigeria’s prisons have not been convicted of any offence. They are waiting, in appalling conditions, to be tried. Most wait two, three or four years, and some more than seven, with no idea how long they will be held.”

COIS: Accepted, will do.

## **FAIR TRIAL**

### Paragraph 12.05

This paragraph does not fully relate to FAIR TRIAL. Highlighted parts should be moved into the SHARI'A LAW section.

“The constitution provides for public trials in the regular court system and individual rights in criminal and civil cases. The law does not provide for juries. A defendant is presumed innocent and has the right to be present, confront witnesses, present evidence and witnesses, be represented by legal counsel, and have access to government-held evidence; however, these rights were not always respected. Although an accused person is entitled to counsel of his choice, there is no law preventing a trial from going forward without counsel, except for certain offenses for which the penalty is death. The Legal Aid Act provides for the appointment of counsel in such cases and stipulates that a trial should not go forward without it. Defendants have the right of appeal.

“In both common-law and customary courts (including Sharia), indigent persons without representation were more likely to have their sentences carried out immediately, although all convicted persons have the right to appeal. The federal government instituted a panel of legal scholars in 2003 to draft a uniform Sharia penal code to replace divergent Sharia codes adopted by various northern states; however, the panel did not produce a report, and states continued to apply their individual codes.

“There were no legal provisions in common law barring women or other groups from testifying in civil or criminal proceedings or giving their testimony less weight, but the testimony of women and non-Muslims usually was accorded less weight in Sharia courts. Some ‘qadis’ (Sharia court judges) allowed separate evidentiary requirements to prove adultery or fornication for male and female defendants. For women pregnancy was deemed permissible evidence in some Sharia courts. By contrast men could only be convicted by confessing to the crime or by eyewitness testimony. Sharia courts provided women with certain benefits, including increased access to divorce, child custody, and alimony, as to get an audience in a Sharia court was significantly easier, faster, and cheaper than in a common law court.”

COIS: Accepted, will do as suggested.

### Paragraph 12.11

There needs to be a further cross-reference to the ORGANISATION section the 12. JUDICIARY part, in particular to paragraph 12.02 and to the LEGAL RIGHTS section in the 20. FREEDOM OF RELIGION part.

COIS: Accepted, will add these cross-references as suggested.

## **14. PRISON CONDITIONS**

### Paragraph 14.08

At the end of this paragraph there should be a cross-reference to 13. ARREST AND DETENTION – LEGAL RIGHTS and to ARBITRARY ARREST AND DETENTION in the 8. SECURITY FORCES part.

COIS: Accepted, will do.

Paragraph 14.11

This paragraph should be deleted, as it repeats point already made in preceding paragraphs and because the source of the statements cited in the newspaper article remains unclear.

COIS: Accepted, will do.

## **16. POLITICAL AFFILIATION**

### **POLITICAL VIOLENCE**

Paragraph 16.06

Add a mention of the violence in Plateau State, which has at times been closely linked to electoral politics. See, for instance:

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201003150001.html>

<http://library.fes.de/pdf-files/bueros/nigeria/07812.pdf> - academic article on violence in Jos

COIS: Accepted, will add further information. Thanks for the sources.

## **FREEDOM OF ASSOCIATION AND ASSEMBLY**

Paragraph 16.08

Add an extra paragraph on the recent fuel subsidy protests and the security force responses to them. See, for instance:

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-africa-16579001>

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-africa-16584410>

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201202130890.html>

COIS: Accepted, will add to the next report.

## **17. FREEDOM OF SPEECH AD MEDIA**

### **JOURNALISTS**

This heading should be changed to GOVERNMENT RESTRICTIONS. And paragraphs 17.03 and 17.05 should also be placed into this sub-section.

Paragraph 17.08

Add a paragraph mentioning that Boko Haram also killed a journalist in Kano. For details, see:

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201201241116.html>

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201201260539.html>

COIS: Accepted, we review section structure and appropriate sub-headings. Will add further information to the next report if still relevant.

## **CORRUPTION**

As mentioned at the outset of this report, the term ‘corruption’ is vague. This title should be replaced with LIMITS OF MEDIA INDEPENDENCE

COIS: Partially accepted - see comments our response on page 5.

## **18. HUMAN RIGHTS INSTITUTIONS, ORGANISATIONS AND ACTIVISTS**

This part needs to add two subheadings:

LAW AND INSTITUTIONS (for much of the first half of the part, as well as paragraphs 18.05 and 18.06)

HUMAN RIGHTS ACTIVISTS (for much of the second half of this part)

COIS: Accepted, will add these to the next report.

## **19. CORRUPTION**

### Paragraph 19.01

The introductory sentence to this paragraph should be changed, as it needs to be made clear that the person’s statement is based on his personal experience in the country and does not represent his government’s or an academic book’s view. See the General comments at the beginning of this Review for more detail on this point.

Former US ambassador in Nigeria, John Campbell, in his book *Nigeria: Dancing on the Brink* (published in 2011), provided his personal interpretation of corruption in Nigeria based on his many years of service in the country:

This paragraph (19.01) is also not the best choice for an introductory paragraph to this section. Add the following quote from the Human Rights Watch report, *Everyone’s in on the Game: Corruption and Human Rights Abuses by the Nigeria Police Force* of 2010 (<http://www.hrw.org/en/reports/2010/08/17/everyone-s-game>) about the complexities of corruption in Nigeria as the first paragraph of the section.

There is no single or universally accepted definition of corruption in international law. The World Bank and the nongovernmental group Transparency International generally define corruption as “the abuse of public office for private gain.” The World Bank includes in its definition situations

where “public officials accept, solicit, or extort bribes; and when private actors offer bribes to subvert or circumvent public policies for competitive advantage and profit.” The World Bank also classifies as corruption the theft of state assets or the illegal diversion of state revenue, as well as patronage or nepotism by government officials. The United Nations Convention against Corruption defines “bribery” as “[t]he solicitation or acceptance by a public official, directly or indirectly, of an undue advantage, for the official himself or herself or another person or entity, in order that the official act or refrain from acting in the exercise of his or her official duties.” A similar definition is listed under acts of corruption in the African Union Convention on Preventing and Combating Corruption. Extortion, on the other hand, adds a coercive component. The UN Office on Drugs and Crime has noted that, “Whereas bribery involves the use of payments or other positive incentives, extortion relies on coercion, such as the use or threat of violence or the exposure of damaging information, to induce cooperation.”

Nigerian law provides steep criminal penalties for bribery—known also as “gratification”—and extortion. The Corrupt Practices and Other Related Offences Act 2000, for example, provides that “[a]ny person who offers to any public officer, or being a public officer solicits, counsels or accepts any gratification as an inducement or a reward for ... [p]erforming or abstaining from performing ... any official act ... [is] guilty of an offence and shall on conviction be liable to five (5) years imprisonment with hard labour.” Under the Nigerian Criminal Code, extortion is punishable by up to 14 years in prison. ... Human Rights Watch examines the most common and debilitating forms of police corruption in Nigeria, notably bribery, extortion, and related human rights abuses committed largely by rank-and-file police officers, and the embezzlement of public funds, enforcement of a system of “returns,” and abuse of office by senior police officials that drive many of these abuses.

#### Paragraphs 19.01 and 19.02

These two rather sensationalist quotes about corruption need to be moved to the end of this section.

It is useful to consult the academic literature on corruption in Nigeria. Also see the points about the vague nature of the term ‘corruption’ made in the General comments part at the outset of the Review. For the best source on this topic see:

Daniel Jordan Smith, *Culture of Corruption: Everyday Deception and Popular Discontent in Nigeria* (2008), available at:

[http://books.google.co.uk/books?hl=en&lr=&id=G3zd2SFAY8EC&oi=fnd&pg=PR9&dq=419+in+nigeria&ots=O9DwU99gk9&sig=m6jW1DwOB-h659DIB\\_nQH44Q\\_dE#v=onepage&q=419%20in%20nigeria&f=false](http://books.google.co.uk/books?hl=en&lr=&id=G3zd2SFAY8EC&oi=fnd&pg=PR9&dq=419+in+nigeria&ots=O9DwU99gk9&sig=m6jW1DwOB-h659DIB_nQH44Q_dE#v=onepage&q=419%20in%20nigeria&f=false)

Parts of the book are also accessible at:

<http://press.princeton.edu/titles/8266.html>

COIS: Accepted, we will clarify the context of the statement made by the former ambassador, although we think the information still useful.

We will make changes to the order of the section as suggested. Thank you for the additional sources.

## **20. FREEDOM OF RELIGION**

The introductory paragraph to this part should be replaced with the following in order not to generalise too much about links between religion and ethnicity in Nigeria:

Ethnicity and religion are at times closely tied in Nigeria, with differences between groups often falling along ethno-religious lines. This section should therefore be read in conjunction with the section on [Ethnic groups](#).

COIS: Accepted, will do.

## **SECTARIAN VIOLENCE**

Provide a cross-reference to the BOKO HARAM sub-sections in the 4. RECENT DEVELOPMENTS and in the 11. CRIME AND SECURITY parts at the end of this section.

COIS: Accepted, will do.

Further information on sectarian violence should be found in related academic and NGO work:

<http://library.fes.de/pdf-files/bueros/nigeria/07812.pdf> - academic article on Jos violence

<http://www.hrw.org/news/2010/01/19/nigeria-use-restraint-curbing-jos-violence> - Human Rights Watch article on Jos violence

<http://www.dfid.gov.uk/R4D/PDF/Outputs/Inequality/wp6.pdf> - academic article on ethno-religious violence in Nigeria

COIS: Accepted. Thank you.

## **21. ETHNIC GROUPS**

### Paragraph 21.01

This paragraph should be replaced with the following paragraph. Reasons for this are the same as in the case of the introductory paragraph in part 20. FREEDOM OF RELIGION:

Ethnicity and religion are at times closely tied in Nigeria, with differences between groups often falling along ethno-religious lines. This section should therefore be read in conjunction with the section on [Ethnic groups](#).

COIS: Accepted, will do.

### Paragraph 21.02

A minor spelling mistake. The introductory sentence to this paragraph should read:

The United States State Department Country Report on Human Rights Practices 2010, Nigeria, released on 8 April 2011, (USSD 2010 Human Rights Report) observed:

COIS: thank you, will amend.

### Paragraph 21.03

The source quoted is not a reliable source and many statements made in this paragraph are unfounded and highly problematic generalizations. This paragraph needs to be deleted.

There is a flourishing academic literature on ethnicity in Nigeria, see for instance:

<http://www.dfid.gov.uk/R4D/PDF/Outputs/Inequality/wp6.pdf> - article on ethno-religious violence in Nigeria

<http://www.dfid.gov.uk/R4D/PDF/Outputs/Inequality/wp43.pdf> - article on ethnic representation in Nigeria

<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/13600810500099592> - article on the study of ethnicity in Nigeria

COIS: Accepted, will look for alternative sources - thank you for those suggested. However, as previously stated, academic sources are often not easily accessible. Any help the IAGCI, academics and academic institutions can offer to gain access to additional academic sources would be welcomed.

At the end of this section there needs to be a cross-reference to issues of ethnicity and ethnic discrimination discussed elsewhere in the report, especially: to INTER-COMMUNAL VIOLENCE IN THE MIDDLE BELT OF NIGERIA in the 4. RECENT DEVELOPMENTS part and in the SECTARIAN VIOLENCE in the 20. FREEDOM OF RELIGION part.

COIS: Accepted, will do.

## **24. WOMEN**

### Paragraph 24.03

This quote appears awkward in its abridged version. The final sub-paragraph of the quoted text should read:

“[W]omen continue to be seriously underrepresented in political and public life, especially in leadership and decision-making positions... the persisting wage gap between men and women, women’s higher unemployment rate, and women’s concentration in certain sectors, namely agriculture, animal husbandry, and service... women are predominantly employed in the informal

sector, resulting in their exclusion from formal social security programmes...the Factories Act, which does not recognize the specific health and reproductive needs of women, and the Nigerian Police Regulations, which prohibit the enlistment of married women and require women officers to request permission to marry in writing...discriminatory practices in the private sector, in particular in the banking sector, with respect to maternity and marital status...the prevalence of sexual harassment in the workplace and the absence of legislation and measures to address this... the precarious situation of women's health, as well as the insufficient number and inadequate health-care facilities, particularly in rural areas...high rates of malaria and HIV/AIDS affecting women and girls in the country... very high maternal mortality rate...lack of access by women and girls to adequate health-care services, including prenatal and post-natal care, obstetric services and family planning information, particularly in rural areas... widespread poverty among women, in particular rural women and women head of households...discriminatory practices with regard to land ownership, administration of property and inheritance, limit women's access to economic resources, as well as credit and loan facilities... the situation of internally displaced women, including women with disabilities, displaced by violence and conflict, in particular in view of their precarious living conditions in camps where they are at increased risk of sexual and other forms of violence and lack of access to health care, education and economic opportunities.”

COIS: Accepted, will do.

## **POLITICAL RIGHTS**

Add one extra paragraph on the few women that have made it into top political posts. They have not usually joined politics through the electoral process but as policy experts, who have gained a national and global reputation outside politics and outside Nigeria:

[http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/programmes/this\\_world/4656627.stm](http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/programmes/this_world/4656627.stm)

<http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/africa/4939858.stm>

COIS: Accepted, will do.

## **SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC RIGHTS**

### Paragraph 24.22

In the introductory paragraph state that BAOBAB is a Nigerian non-government organization.

COIS: Accepted, will do in the next report.

## **INHERITANCE**

The sources for this section are more than ten years old and it would be beneficial to add a few newspaper quotes related to inheritance and court cases to demonstrate that

the situation is still the same today. See, for instance:

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201201040627.html>

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201202170384.html>

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201108231819.html>

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201111070759.html>

COIS: Accepted, will look for more recent information – thank you for the sources suggested.

#### Paragraph 24.41

A minor spelling mistake: The paragraph should read:

The same source stated: “The statutory, religious and customary laws in Nigeria allows [sic] for violence against women as they give some provisions in support of such. The penal code [section 55(4)], which is applicable in the Northern part of the country, allows the correction of child, pupil, servant or wife by beating in as much as the beating does not amount to grievous hurt. This encourages wife battering, and diverse forms of violence against women.” [31]

COIS: Accepted, will amend.

### **FEMALE GENITAL MUTILATION (FGM)**

Add some Nigerian newspaper views on the issue to balance this section. See for instance:

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201202090914.html>

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201202140971.html>

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201202090914.html>

COIS: Accepted, will do. Thanks for the sources.

## **25. CHILDREN**

### **OVERVIEW**

#### Paragraph 25.03

A minor typo. Introductory sentence should be replaced with:

A report published by the World Organization Against Torture for the 38<sup>th</sup> session of the United Nations Committee on *the Rights of the Child in 2005* stated:

COIS: Accepted, will amend.

Paragraph 25.19

Provide a cross-reference to the RAPE AND SEXUAL ABUSE section in the 14. WOMEN Part at the end of this paragraph.

COIS: Accepted, will do.

Paragraph 25.24

The introductory sentence to the paragraph should be replaced with (highlighted parts are new):

A report by Stepping Stones Nigeria, a UK charity working with children in the Niger Delta, of December 2009, *Witchcraft Stigmatisation and Children's Rights in Nigeria*, stated:

COIS: Accepted, will do.

### **FEMALE GENITAL MUTILATION (FGM)**

Add some Nigerian newspaper views on the issue to balance this section. See for instance:

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201202090914.html>

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201202140971.html>

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201202090914.html>

COIS: Accepted, will do.

### **WITCHCRAFT**

Add some Nigerian newspaper views and if possible academic views on the issue to balance this section. See for instance:

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201110270508.html>

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201112121577.html>

<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1525/ae.2001.28.4.803/abstract> - academic article on witchcraft in Nigeria (2008)

COIS: Accepted, will do.

### **CHILD MARRIAGE**

Provide a cross-reference to the MARRIAGE section in the 14. WOMEN part at the beginning of this section.

COIS: Accepted, will do.

Paragraph 25.34

The slightly amended paragraph should read (highlighted parts are new):

A report of 27 June 2011 **by the charity Plan UK**, *Breaking Vows: Early and Forced Marriage and Girls' Education*, noted statistics indicating that 25 to 49 per cent of Nigerian females aged 20 to 24 were married by the age of 18 although the report also noted that “in states in Nigeria that have legislation abolishing early marriage there is much more awareness amongst girls in the last year of primary school of the importance of abolishing early marriage.”  
[132]

COIS: Accepted, will do.

**TRAFFICKING**

Possibly add additional information on what ‘trafficking’ can include and what it entails, as it is a very broad and contested concept. See remarks and further sources in the 26. TRAFFIKING part, as well as in the General comments at the beginning of this Review (Note on corruption).

COIS: Not accepted. While we accept that trafficking might have a complex definition in general we consider this goes beyond the remit of the COI Report, which is to provide information about a given subject rather than attempt to define concepts for users. However, we will give further consideration as how we may be able to provide context on trafficking to assist readers regarding the broader concept.

UKBA decision makers receive training on trafficking issues.

**ORPHANS AND VULNERABLE CHILDREN**

This section could benefit from the use of more official sources. For example, see:

[http://www.unicef.org/media/media\\_39655.html](http://www.unicef.org/media/media_39655.html)

[http://www.unicef.org/media/media\\_27420.html](http://www.unicef.org/media/media_27420.html)

[www.msh.org/news-bureau/upload/Engendering\\_CUBS\\_Report\\_FINAL.pdf](http://www.msh.org/news-bureau/upload/Engendering_CUBS_Report_FINAL.pdf)

COIS: Accepted, will look to add these in the next update.

Paragraph 25.40

The reference mentioned at the end of this paragraph is not leading to the right article. It should lead to a *Leadership* article at this location:

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201012200248.html>

The quotation from the newspaper article should also be extended and read as follows:

An article of 20 December 2010 in the online publication *Leadership* (Abuja), *Nigeria: How well are orphans and vulnerable children provided for*, noted:

“The phenomenon of orphans and vulnerable children (OVC) in Nigeria is rapidly on the increase, stated the Head of OVC division in the Child Development Department of the Federal Ministry of Women Affairs and Social Development, Abuja, Barr Gloria. O. Ezezika. According to her, the report of the National Situation Assessment and Analysis carried out in 2008, and disseminated by the Federal Ministry of Women Affairs and Social Development with support from MDG office, National Agency for the Control of AIDS,(NACA), UNICEF and USAID, established that there are 1.75 million OVC in the country cutting across households, homeless children and institutions. .... Though the health-related MDGs report for Nigeria states that the number of AIDS orphans in Nigeria remains on the decline, children and young persons, particularly, orphans and vulnerable children are especially susceptible to HIV/AIDS infection and its impact.”

COIS: Accepted, will amend as suggested.

Paragraphs 25.41 to 25.43

As in the paragraph 25.40, the wrong newspaper article is referenced in these paragraphs. They should be leading to the following *Leadership* article:

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201012200248.html>

COIS: Accepted, will do.

Paragraph 25.44

This quotation mentions a clearly inflated number of orphans and vulnerable children in Nigeria (see the highlight in the text). It is necessary to make a note of this inaccuracy in the quote in the introductory paragraph or right after the number.

A subsequent *Leadership* article of 21 October 2011, *Responding to Needs of Vulnerable Children*, noted that:

“Response to the needs of vulnerable children in Nigeria, especially in such vital areas as education, health, shelter and care, legal protection, food and nutrition, psychosocial support and household economic strengthening has been quit [sic] ineffective. This has made communities and households providing the safety net to these children live in perpetual struggle to cope with the high burden of care required by such vulnerable children. Contributions to the response to vulnerable children needs have been largely driven by the civil society organisations (composed largely of non-governmental organisations, community based organisations and faith-based organisations) with gaps in the quality and consistency of care provided.

“As part of effort to bring succour to **the over 17.5 million orphans and vulnerable children in Nigeria**, the global fund on its round 9 consolidated grant through Association for Reproductive and Family

health (ARFH) and Association for Orphans and Vulnerable Children in Nigeria (AONN) supported the process of identifying and selecting 1400 vulnerable children across the 17 southern states of the country who are in dire need of support (especially those infected or affected with HIV/AIDS). To successfully complete this process and arrive at acceptable results, methods were employed with the use of standardised tools such as the orphans and vulnerable children Index (OVI) and child status index (CSI). Direct interviews with selected vulnerable children and their caregivers was conducted and also administration of the tools and other interpersonal interaction with members of the household or community gate keepers.” [79a]

COIS: Accepted, will do.

## **EDUCATION**

Add some Nigerian newspaper views and if possible academic views on the issue to balance this section. See for instance:

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201202090574.html>

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201201120634.html>

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201201120397.html>

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201112290230.html>

COIS: Accepted, will do. Thank you for the additional sources.

## **26. TRAFFICKING**

Provide a cross-reference to the TRAFFICKING section in the 25. CHILDREN part at the beginning of the part rather than at the end. Add the following sentence at the beginning of this part:

This part should be read in conjunction with the section on TRAFFICKING in the part on CHILDREN

COIS: Accepted, will do.

In general and as already mentioned in the TRAFFICKING section in the 25. CHILDREN part as well as in the General comments at the beginning of this review, further information on what trafficking is in general and in Nigeria would make the concept of ‘trafficking’ less vague in this part. For instance, see the following definition from an academic work available at:

[http://iom.int/jahia/webdav/site/myjahiasite/shared/shared/mainsite/published\\_docs/serial\\_publications/mrs23.pdf](http://iom.int/jahia/webdav/site/myjahiasite/shared/shared/mainsite/published_docs/serial_publications/mrs23.pdf):

“Hundreds of thousands of Nigerians have migrated to Europe, and many of them have relied on human smugglers to do so, and many have also been victims of

trafficking. The concepts of migration, human smuggling and trafficking overlap. In relation to Nigerian migration to Europe it is natural to see them in conjunction. Both human smuggling and trafficking may be parts of organized crime, though they do not have to be.

Human smuggling is normally understood as complicity in, or the facilitation of, immigration in violation of local immigration laws and regulations. Some definitions specify that such facilitation must occur for the purpose of profit in order to be referred to as human smuggling. ... While human smuggling in itself does not imply exploitation, it is clear that the human smuggler has the upper hand and may exploit this situation. There are, for instance, many examples of human smugglers abandoning their charges somewhere along the way, tricking them into believing that they had reached their destination and charging the payment.”

“Contrary to human smuggling, trafficking in human beings involves by definition an element of exploitation. The most widely used definition of trafficking is stated in the UN Palermo Protocol: ‘Trafficking in persons shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs.’”

Add the following paragraph to this part available at  
<http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0014/001478/147844e.pdf>:

Despite the widespread nature of the phenomenon, research on human trafficking is concentrated on southern Nigeria with Delta, Edo and Cross Rivers States being the main focal points. Consequently, the northern sector of the country has received relatively little attention. This incorrectly suggests that human trafficking is not a problem in northern Nigeria. The trade in human beings is as prevalent in northern Nigeria as in other parts of the country.

COIS: Not accepted. We are cautious about defining concepts/ideas in the report, the remit of which is simply to provide information. It is also worth noting that UKBA decision makers receive training on trafficking related matters, including definitions of trafficking as set out in various international conventions.

However as mentioned above we will give consideration on how we may be able to assist readers in providing further context to the subject of trafficking that may assist decision makers.

## **27. MEDICAL ISSUES**

### **HIV/AIDS**

#### **Paragraph 27.14**

The source for this quotation could not be accessed and checked for accuracy and reliability.

## **KIDNEY DIALYSIS**

### Paragraph 27.22

This paragraph should be moved to the beginning of this sub-section.

COIS: Accepted, will do.

## **MALARIA**

### Paragraph 27.24

This paragraph should explain what the many acronyms stand for. It should read as follows (changes highlighted):

The WHO World Malaria Report 2010, in relation to Nigeria (published December 2010), observed:

“Malaria transmission in Nigeria takes place all year round in the south but is more seasonal in the northern regions. About 25% of all estimated malaria cases in the WHO African Region occur in Nigeria, Almost all cases are caused by *P. falciparum*, but only a small fraction is tested parasitologically. The NMCP [**National Malaria Control Programme**] reported 4.3 million suspected malaria cases in 2009 (42% increase compared to 2000), representing only a fraction of the real malaria burden due to underreporting. The programme reported 660000 malaria admissions and 7500 deaths in 2009, both numbers fluctuating over the years and still reflecting only a fraction of the actual inpatient malaria cases and deaths in the country. About 29.2 million LLINs [**long-lasting insecticidal nets**] were delivered during 2007–2009, covering nearly 35% of the population at risk, a significant increase from previous years. Approximately 12 million treatment courses of ACT [**artemisinin-combination therapies**] were delivered in 2008 and 9.2 million 2009; these quantities correspond to treatment of only a small fraction of the estimated number of cases, but a much greater amount than needed for the number of reported cases. Funding for malaria control has increased from US\$ 17 million in 2005 to nearly US\$ 100 million in 2008 and US\$ 131 million in 2009, provided mainly by the Global Fund, World Bank, PMI, WHO, and NGOs. The government provided US\$ 200 000 in 2009.” [32b]

COIS: Accepted, will do.

## **MENTAL HEALTH**

### Paragraph 27.35

The source for this quotation could not be accessed and checked for accuracy and reliability.

## **29. INTERNALLY DISPLACED PERSONS**

At the end of this part provide a cross-reference to INTER-COMMUNAL VIOLENCE IN THE MIDDLE BELT and BOKO HARAM sections in 4. RECENT DEVELOPMENTS , as well as to BOKO HARAM section n the 11. CRIME AND SECURITY part.

COIS: Accepted, will do.

#### Paragraph 29.06

There is a spelling mistake in the introductory sentence to this paragraph. It should read as follows:

More recent events were stated in an IDMC news alert of 7 October 2011, *Fear of violence displaces thousands in the north*, observed:

COIS: Thank you, will amend.

### **32. FORGED AND FRAUDULENTLY OBTAINED OFFICIAL DOCUMENTS**

Add some Nigerian newspaper views on the issue to balance this section. See for instance:

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201109290633.html>

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201106140327.html>

<http://allafrica.com/stories/201011290956.html>

COIS: Accepted, will do.

#### Paragraph 32.01

The reference provided for this paragraph is not correct. It should refer to document 44.a in the ANNEX of referenced works.

COIS: Accepted, this will be amended.

### **33. EXIT AND RETURN**

#### Paragraph 33.01

It is unclear why there is a cross-reference to the CORRUPTION and NATIONAL IDENTITY CARDS sections at the end of this paragraph. This needs to be explained in the cross-reference.

COIS: Accepted, we will clarify in the next time.

### **34. EMPLOYMENT RIGHTS**

#### Paragraph 34.02

Provide a cross-reference to the FREEDOM OF ASSOCIATION AND ASSEMBLY section in the 16. POLITICAL AFFILIATION part.

COIS: Accepted, will do.

## ANNEX A

### CHRONOLOGY OF MAJOR EVENTS

#### 2011

There is an error in the 2011 section. The presidential elections were held and won in April 2011 not in March. See highlighted section below.

#### **2011**

##### **March**

Goodluck Jonathan wins presidential elections.

##### July

President Jonathan says he will ask parliament to amend the constitution so that presidents will serve a single, longer term in office.

Government says it wants to start negotiating with the Boko Haram Islamist group blamed for a series of recent attacks across northern Nigeria.

##### August

Suicide bomb attack on UN headquarters in Abuja kills 23 people. Radical Islamist group Boko Haram claims responsibility. **[8d]**

##### November

At least 63 people are killed in bomb and gun attacks in north-eastern town of Damaturu. Boko Haram claims responsibility.

President Jonathan sacks the head of Nigeria's anti-corruption agency, saying that the body has failed to get to grips with graft during her tenure.

##### December

Nearly 70 people are killed in days of fighting between security forces and Boko Haram militants in north-eastern states of Yobe and Borno.

Christmas Day bomb attacks kill about 40 people. Boko Haram claims responsibility. **[8d]**

COIS: Accepted though this is a quoted extract from the BBC Timeline for the country. We will seek to clarify this via another source.

COIS: Many thanks to the reviewer for the additional sources recommended as they will be useful for future updates of the report.