

## **BOUNDARY COMMISSION FOR ENGLAND**

Minutes (Part 1) of the meeting held in the 2nd floor meeting room, 35 Great Smith Street, London, SW1P 3BQ on Monday 18 July 2011 at 9.00am.

### **Present:-**

The Hon. Mr Justice Sales	Deputy Chairman
Mr D Elvin QC	Commissioner
Mr N Pringle	“
Mr T Bellringer	Deputy Secretary

1. The presence of the Assessors from Ordnance Survey and the Statistics Authority was not required at the meeting.

### **SELECTION OF ASSISTANT COMMISSIONERS (BCE/2011/Paper 29)**

2. The purpose of the meeting was for Members to:
  - a) consider the selection process for the post of Assistant Commissioner;
  - b) select 27 names resulting from that process to recommend to the Secretary of State for appointment;
  - c) and to identify from within those 27 names who to send to allocate to which region, and who should be offered the ‘Lead Assistant Commissioner’ responsibility in each region.
3. Members declared any prior knowledge of candidates, as set out in Part 2 of these minutes. None were considered to be of sufficient degree to amount to a conflict of interest.

### The process

4. Members considered the details of the selection exercise, as set out in Paper 29 – use of the independent Appointments Commission, public advertising, competency-based application form, sifting, short-listing, and competency-based interviewing – and stated that it appeared to have been a very transparent, fair and robust process.
5. Members were pleased at the number of applications that had been generated, and the diversity of those who applied. They noted that a significant proportion of those reaching the interviews and in the higher reaches of the merit-listing were legally-trained, if not practising lawyers.

### Selection of 27 individuals for recommendation

6. As they were content that the assessment process had been fair and thorough, Members did not consider that there was any sound basis on which to challenge

the merit-listing resulting from that process. Members therefore agreed that the 27 highest-scoring individuals on the merit-listing should be those recommended to the Secretary of State for appointment.

7. Members agreed with the recommendation of the Panel that in the case of the two candidates sharing an equal score in 27th position, the individual with the highest score across the two weighted categories should be ranked above the other.

#### Allocation to regions and identification of Lead

8. Members considered the regional preferences indicated by the 27 candidates and in light of this decided on an allocation across the nine regions of England. In doing so, Members were guided primarily by the need to ensure that every region was allocated a full complement of Assistant Commissioners, and that an individual's expressed order of preference would need to be subsidiary to that.
9. Having identified three individuals for each region, Members then decided which of the three they would wish to allocate the 'Lead Assistant Commissioner' responsibility to.
10. Members indicated their desire that the Lead Assistant Commissioner should not just conduct as many of the lead hearings as possible, but also undertake as much of the analysis work and writing of the overall regional report to Commissioners as they could, so as to maximise consistency. Whilst unlikely, it was therefore conceivable that a non-Lead Assistant Commissioner may not be called upon at all to assist with the analysis and report-writing stage of the task. This would need to be made clear in the letter of appointment that was sent out to successful candidates.
11. Members' decisions on the 27 selected individuals, their allocation to regions, and the identification of the Lead Assistant Commissioner are set out in **Part 2 of these minutes**.

#### Next steps

12. The Deputy Secretary explained that the Members' decisions would be communicated to the sponsor team in Cabinet Office, as the Commission's formal request for appointment of the individuals concerned, along with background information on the selection process.
13. The Secretary of State would be invited to agree the 27 names for appointment. Assuming agreement, BCE Secretariat staff would confirm with the successful individuals the BCE's intentions as to how to deploy them (i.e. to which region and as a lead or non-lead), that the offer of appointment was subject to reference-checking, and their acceptance of such a post. The formal instrument of appointment would then be issued to the successful candidates as soon as satisfactory references had been received.

**Tony Bellringer**  
**Deputy Secretary to the Commission**

## RESTRICTED – APPOINTMENTS

### Assistant Commissioner selections - Members' declarations and decisions

Minutes (Part 2) of the meeting held in the 2nd floor meeting room, 35 Great Smith Street, London, SW1P 3BQ on Monday 18 July 2011 at 9.00am.

#### Declarations

Mr Justice Sales: Clive Lewis (know professionally as a fellow barrister and judge); Stephen Wooler (worked professionally with him on cases in the past).

David Elvin QC: Douglas Edwards; Robert Fookes; Craig Howell Williams; Clive Lewis; Guy Roots (know all professionally as fellow barristers – mostly working in same field).

Neil Pringle: Guy Roots (have instructed him on cases in the past).

#### Decisions

**First-named individual is Lead Assistant Commissioner for the region.**

<b>Eastern</b> Leonard Jackson Heather Peck Jeremy Rintoul	<b>East Midlands</b> Douglas Edwards QC Paul Kernaghan David Riddle	<b>London</b> Judith Farbey QC Nicole Smith Guy Roots QC
<b>North East</b> Clive Lewis QC* Michael Rawlinson QC* Francis Plowden	<b>North West</b> Mark Savill Nicholas Elliott QC Neil Ward	<b>South East</b> Nicholas Griffin Colin Byrne Howard Simmons
<b>South West</b> David Archer James Daniell Colin Wilson	<b>West Midlands</b> Craig Howell Williams QC Keith Budgen Linda Lee*	<b>Yorkshire &amp; the Humber</b> Alan McQuillan* Stephen Wooler Peter Edmondson

\*= Final decisions on these deployments taken post-meeting by e-mail.