

**CASINO ADVISORY PANEL**

**PROF. STEPHEN CROW CHAIRMAN  
JAMES FROOMBERG, CHRIS COLLISON,  
NEIL MUNDY, DEEP SAGAR**

**GLASGOW 04/09/2006**

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Quick fix was the word they used. It seems to dispute that. There's a theological term for that I understand, it's called 'invincible ignorance'. We're not beholden to any local authority, nor to any casino developer nor to operator, nor are we subject to any political pressures of interference with our work. We were appointed by Richard Caborn, Minister of State in DCMS in September last year, and I should stress that that was after an open competition and interview by a board that included two independent members, so it wasn't a political appointment by any means. The panel's proceeding on the basis that it is consulting widely and seeking out evidence, and we were praising all that evidence in the light of all the professional experience before coming to our decisions, and every member of the panel is committed to the seven Nolan principles of public life. We're assisted by a secretariat which is based on a Department of Culture, Media and Sport office, but it does function separately from DCMS under my direction, and I would like to put on record now how grateful we are for all the hard work, and I really do mean hard work. I don't think in all my professional career I've actually come across people who've worked quite as hard, so thanks very much, secretariat. One of the things they've had to do, of course, is answer a lot of questions from the press, which has kept them up rather late quite a lot of nights. I make no complaint about that but, you know, it has happened.

Criteria, now the primary criterion a laid down by the Secretary of State is to ensure that locations satisfy the need for the best possible test of social impact, which may require a range of locations of different kinds, such as sea-side resorts, edge-of-town developments, or inner city centres, and subject to that, the Secretary of State has also asked us to include areas in need of regeneration, and which are likely to benefit in these terms from a new casino, and we've also got to ensure that the areas selected are willing to license a new casino, and we need to pay, of course, attention, due regard, to government policy in other respects. And just to make things clear, we on the panel well understand the social issues related to gambling, including problem gambling, and one thing we're looking out for in the proposals is how these problems can be minimised. Openness and transparency, we're committed to the principles of openness and transparency, and all the documentation are already on our website, or will be as we come to it. The processes we're due to report with our recommendations to Tessa Jowell, the Secretary of State for Culture, Media and Sport, by December this year. Actually the deadline is 31<sup>st</sup> December, and whether that means on New Year's Eve we have to stand with a thing in our hands outside 2-4 Cockspur Street, I don't know. But our programme of work well speaks for itself, I think, scoping to start with and then we ask for formal proposals, and now we're examining them, we're coming to the end of the examining. These examinations in public are really the tip of the iceberg, because a lot of the examination of course is examining all the written material. Then we've got to look at all the evidence, consider it carefully and write our report, and it is a really big job. The examination in public that we hear today, we've time only for proposals for a regional casino to be given examination in public. The large and small proposals we'll be dealing with by written representations. The main purpose of an examination in public is to provide an opportunity for the discussion and testing in public and before the panel of the selected matters, and these matters have been selected by the panel following a consideration of the proposals, the representations made, responses received by the panel to specific questions put to the short-listed local authorities, and what it considers it needs to hear about in order to select the area to be recommended, and we're having a session of the examination in the locality of each of the proposals that have been short-listed. We've been to London to consider the Greenwich proposal, we went to Cardiff on Friday to look at theirs. We're up in Glasgow today, we're going on to

Newcastle, Sheffield, Manchester and Blackpool. Is the examination like a public meeting? Well, no, it isn't a public meeting, it's an examination held in public, and I think a few centuries ago, we'd have called it an inquisition, but I think I want to be a little kinder now. Incidentally, somebody was complaining the other day that the proceedings are so tame. Well, you know, I'm just recalling the sort of the things that went on in the Coliseum in Rome. If the lions just sat quietly and munched away at the Christians, then the people that kept the lions usually ended up being fed to them the next day, so they had to make them roar. Well, I'm quite happy if the lions quietly munch the Christians here, so we're not into the business of stirring them up and making them roar, we're not here to provide a public entertainment. Anyone can come along to see and hear what goes on but only those invited can participate in the discussions, because it does actually, it may only need one person to make a good point, so we're looking for proper discussion, not a succession of speeches. All the papers that have been submitted in evidence are on our website. Now let me anticipate a few questions. Have we been to see any casinos? Well, we didn't think it was our job to go swanning round the world at enormous public expense. However, having said that, when I was over in Dortmund, in Germany, in February this year taking some students to look at urban regeneration there, it was suggested by a professor at Dortmund University that I looked at their casino, which I did. Were we entertained there? Yes, we were given coffee and biscuits. We've also looked as a panel, or two of us from the panel and the secretariat, looked round Star City in Birmingham, where we were given some sandwiches, if I remember. Star City is actually the largest in Britain. One of the questions that we constantly get asked particularly by one group of newspapers is, what's the role of John Prescott? Well, the answer is none. We got appointed by open competition and interview by a board containing independent members. What else? What do we think of Brent pulling out? Well, it gave us a day off to do something else. Why did we look at Greenwich first? Answer, because Brent pulled out, otherwise Brent would have been first. Are there any preferred areas for selection? Well, no. We don't think anybody would think that we'd go spending all that time going all round the country if we'd already made our minds up. We haven't made our minds up, and we won't until we've heard and considered all the evidence, and any talk, you know, about how one area is favoured over another, of course is just actually silly speculation. What does the panel think of the bid in Glasgow? Well, we certainly thought it was worth coming here to examine it more closely, and examining it more closely we will today, and we'll be hearing both people for it and against it, and then we'll have to think about it. We do have to remember that of course we're not just thinking about Glasgow, we're thinking about Glasgow in relation to the competition with all the other six competitors. Is Glasgow going to win? Well, I'll tell you, I'm afraid you'll have to wait till, I think you call it Hogmanay, don't you? Is that right? Yes. I'm afraid you'll have to wait till then. How do we ensure there's no conflict of interest? Well, we do actually tell everybody what interests we've got in the particular area. For example in Cardiff, I've got an honorary chair at Cardiff University, so you know, I said that, if anyone wanted to say, 'Well, you know, that's going to bias you towards Cardiff,' it didn't and I'm not, but that's how we protect it, and we make sure that when we are discussing things, that people that do have interests in a particular place aren't allowed to prejudice the discussions. Are there any discussions between the panel and ministers? Well, we've got a duty to provide regular reports but there's no feedback the other way, so I'm afraid that's all we've got time for because I do want to make a prompt start at 9.30, so thank you all very much, ladies and gentlemen.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** ... make something of the proceedings, and I know you will all behave yourself as though you were in court. Mind you, I've never been in court to hear people behave themselves, so I don't know, but anyway, you've got the point I hope. As for the press, beyond what you've already seen, I'd be grateful if you would not film or televise, don't sound record, and please no press photography. I should mention also that we came up in the very early evening yesterday and we did have a look round the four places where we're going to hear more about today I hope. If anything does turn up, anybody wants to mention anything special, then I suppose we could make a return visit, but I thought I should mention that we have looked around. Some of us know Glasgow quite well anyway, I'm pleased to say. I used to come here quite a lot but I must admit, I haven't been here for some years. I don't know whether there's any queries about the proceeding. Does everybody understand it? Good, thanks. The agenda today will

follow the list of issues that have been circulated. I do apologise for the short notice. We have been rather rushed as the time to these proceedings came about, but I do appreciate all the hard work you've put in. Thank you for your hard work and forbearance. I'm now going to ask the secretary to tell us what to do in the unlikely event of an emergency, as they say on a ship, or an aeroplane.

**WOMAN:** If there's a fire or any other emergency, you'll hear the following message. 'An emergency situation has arisen, please leave the building by the nearest available exit' and that message will be interspersed with a two-tone siren. If you hear that message, you need to go through the fire exit which is the doors that you came through at the back of the room there. Turn right where there are some stairs. Go down the stairs to the marshalling area which is at the front of the hotel.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you very much. It's our custom to ask the proposing authority just to give a very short statement, I think as much as anything for the benefit of the public, so that people do know what it is we're talking about today. I'll ask you to give the short statement. The questions about it will follow during the course of the day, so Glasgow, who's going to be your spokesman?

**STEVEN PURCELL:** I am, Steven Purcell, the leader of Glasgow City Council, and can I first of all welcome the panel and Professor Crow to Glasgow formally on behalf on the City.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you.

**STEVEN PURCELL:** And just to convince you that we intend to be entirely open about Glasgow's economic success, our social challenges, I would say to you that I don't think it's so much the panel or so much Glasgow that has put on the sunshine today. I suspect that you have brought the sunshine to Glasgow. Professor, Glasgow has been transformed. Its modern-day renaissance has delivered a record number of jobs. All across the city there are new homes, schools and leisure facilities, and part of this success is due to high value projects. This includes Glasgow's ambitious bid to host the 2014 Commonwealth Games. A regional casino would add to this. It would make a major contribution to Glasgow's ongoing social and economic regeneration. It would ensure more local people could share in the city's success. A regional casino is much more than just a new leisure investment opportunity for the city. The proposed sites contain plans for entertainment venues, hotels and restaurants. A regional casino would be a key catalyst to furthering regeneration in neighbourhoods along the River Clyde corridor, one of the key priority regeneration areas identified both locally, regionally and nationally, and an area which continues to experience multiple disadvantage. The synergies between a regional casino and Glasgow's future tourism growth would complement each other to confirm the city's reputation as a global destination for leisure, commerce and investment. Glasgow has a strong track record in regeneration and inward investment, and provides an environment that can accommodate and maximise the economic and social benefits from such a major private investment, providing the necessary ingredients for a successful pilot regional casino. Of course in all of this we recognise that some people have concerns of what a regional casino might mean. Glasgow will insist that any regional casino operator must fund intervention programmes and education programmes designed to prevent excess of gambling and assist the minority who have gambling problems. We are determined to protect and support the minority of people who may face gambling issues, but also note that the vast majority of adults who will choose to visit the regional casino would do so entirely responsibly. Glasgow's economic case is sound, and the bid is supported by a rigorous, realistic, independent and highly credible economic impact assessment. Casino visitors are expected to contribute as much as £26 million towards Glasgow's annual GVA, attract as many as 600,000 visitors each year, and create as many as 2½ thousand FTE jobs. Our estimates are backed by the casino operators who have provided us with information on the scale and nature of potential job creation and applicable wage rates. This can also bring a significant boost to tourism in Glasgow and the surrounding area. Independent figures suggest an additional 600,000 would

be attracted to visit the casino each year. This is to say nothing of indirect benefits such as improved hotel provision which would bring further advantages. Forecasts show that if our new joint economic strategy for Glasgow is successful, international tourism revenue in Scotland is likely to double by 2015. In the last 20 years, Glasgow has delivered some of the UK's most successful regeneration programmes. The city has gained a reputation for innovative and successful urban regeneration. Glasgow already has in place a well-developed infrastructure, adaptable business locations, strong economic foundations, a well-established and internationally recognised tourist product, and positive, confident partnerships between public and private sectors. These are the fundamentals necessary to ensure the success of a regional casino development. In the last year alone, there was a record £3.4 billion of private investment under way in the city. Glasgow's regeneration success has created an environment that can accommodate and will maximise the economic and social benefits from such a major private investment. There is much, however, that still has to be done. A regional casino development is an opportunity to bring a new dimension to our regeneration and a chance to give jobs to those who need them most. Furthermore, we would expect any casino operator in Glasgow to provide tangible benefits to the local area. We will work with any operator and communities to develop plans for ongoing projects which will bring benefits to the neighbourhood. On top of the regeneration and employment opportunities, this can only be good news for the city and another example of why we are bidding to host a regional casino. In drawing to a conclusion, the transformation of Glasgow over the last few years has been nothing short of remarkable, and we are absolutely determined to build upon the success. We recognise the need for a balanced economy, whether this is in promoting our service sector, working with manufacturing industries, and in supporting our very successful international financial services district. We have achieved a great deal. Alongside this, we recognise the benefits that high value projects can bring. That is one reason we are bidding to host the 2014 Commonwealth Games, and why we believe a regional casino would add to this. We recognise that a regional casino is not simply about the casino itself, but one of a number of added-value projects such as hotels, restaurants, entertainment venues and much more. This can bring significant regeneration and employment benefits to our city. Indeed there are obviously a number of bidders expressing an interest in running such a casino in Glasgow, should we be successful in winning the licence. I believe that this competition is a good thing and will ensure that we get the best deal possible. We recognise the strongly-held concerns that some people have about such a development, and respect these, but we also believe that we can put in place measures to mitigate against any such problems, to say nothing of the already stringent measures included in parliament's Gambling Bill. Overall, I am confident that a regional casino has enormous value to Glasgow, and I'm glad to have the opportunity to put this case forward. I would be happy to take any questions that you have over the course of the morning, and of course call upon the wide range of people here today to offer their support. I'm sorry about the sunshine.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Well, thank you very much, Councillor Purcell. I know that it's customary to turn the lights down in the last waltz in a ballroom, but we haven't quite got to that stage yet. Can we get it put right please before we go on? Could you have a word with the house management please? Thank you. If anybody is severely inconvenienced, I'll adjourn the proceedings but I'd rather press on if we can. Right, well let's get on then. The first issue I'd like to address is are the demographic characteristics of Glasgow such as to offer the best test of social impact, and we know quite a lot about the demographic characteristics about, you know, the numbers of population, the social deprivation and so on, the proportion of people in ethnic minorities and so on. Who would like to speak first on this? Perhaps you in Glasgow would, would you, Councillor?

**STEVEN PURCELL:** Well, Mr. Steve Inch would like to speak on behalf of Glasgow.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Of course, yes.

**STEVEN PURCELL:** Mr. Inch is the Director of Development and Regeneration Services.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Sorry, I couldn't quite catch the name.

**STEVEN PURCELL:** Steve Inch. He's the Councillor Director of Development and Regeneration Services and as such he's the city's Chief Economist but also has responsibility for social policy in the city.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** All right.

**STEVE INCH:** Yes, thanks. I'll be brief and maybe provoke some further questions, but I think we've looked at the population structure of Glasgow and the population structure of the other cities who are bidding to host a regional casino and to secure the licence, and the population structures are generally similar. Glasgow has, I think as you've hinted, does have a higher percentage of people living in areas of multiple deprivation and that comes out in the Scottish Index Multiple Deprivation statistics. It has got lower activity rates, although catching up quite quickly on the other cities, but correspondingly a higher rate of worklessness and it's got a higher incidence of low-income households, so we feel that some of the concerns about the social impact of casinos can be tested in Glasgow simply because of the nature of that population. In terms of ethnic mix, 5% of the city's population, or between 5 and 7½ per cent given recent changes are in ethnic minority groups. So we think this is a good area to test the social impact for a number of reasons. We think we can test whether the higher-than-average percentage of low income groups actually go to our casino or will gamble, and I'll give you that in just a minute. We think we're well placed to test whether the prevention and mitigation measures that we are proposing to put in place and already have in place to do the measures detailed in our bid document would actually work and how effective they would be, and we think that the work we're doing on debt profiling will actually produce valuable information on the extent to which people in various types of income households, various social groups, actually gamble or don't. So we think we can actually use the techniques we've got in the city and the social groupings we've got to measure very accurately who gambles, at what they gamble, how they gamble, what impact that gambling has on their households and their income, and what types of prevention and mitigation strategies will actually work to ensure the problem is actually under a degree of control.

**STEVEN PURCELL:** And if I could just say briefly, Professor, that that research that we're undertaking that Mr. Inch referred to, at the end of his contribution, we believe is almost unique anywhere in the UK and trying to get a real profile of what level of addiction there is in our city and what intervention strategies are making a difference.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. Mr. Mundy, you had a detail that you wanted to pick up on, didn't you?

**NEIL MUNDY:** Yes. The Licensing Board appears to be very innovative in the way in which it deals with licences. It would be extremely helpful to find out a little bit more of some of the examples of where they've applied that innovation, you know, picking up on Mr. Inch's point about the various groups, as to how that might help in the context of the casino licence.

**STEVEN PURCELL:** Very quickly I'll just explain the nature of the Licensing Board first of all. The Licensing Board is the quasi judicial licensing authority of the city, so it's independent of the City Council, and I think I wouldn't be sharing a state secret if I said they guard that independence jealously.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** The situation is different here from in England, isn't it?

**STEVEN PURCELL:** Yes. It's very different.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** We did actually go to Edinburgh and they explained it to us at some length, as though they were talking to primary schoolchildren.

**STEVEN PURCELL:** Well, I hope that we don't do that in Glasgow. They do sit independently of obviously the Council, indeed any other parts of the city, and I think that's again one of the strengths of the Glasgow bid. I would also not be sharing any state secret when I say that they are an extremely active licensing board, and they take their responsibilities very seriously. But to answer this specific question, the Board like the City Council and other public and private agencies in the city are extremely aware of the social challenges that still face our city, and as a result in terms of things like tackling binge drinking, tackling cut-price drink promotions which they believe lead to binge drinking and alcohol abuse, particularly I'm sorry to say amongst young people, they have put stringent measures in place to stop that kind of approach within the licence bid. They have also taken a very tough stand on the use of glass in establishments that they believe have had a high number of violent incidents, and they have been rigorous in their application of these policies, and they regularly visit premises, they work in strong partnership with the police, Strathclyde Police is our force here, and I think they would be happy to say a few words in this regard as well, and in the current review that's been conducted by the Scottish Executive, the Nicholson Review, that their practice is held up as good practice, and I think will influence any new licensing legislation in the city, and they have made it clear that in awarding any licence because it's they that would award the licence, to any operator in Glasgow, that they would intend to look very carefully at the regulations they would like to see applied in the conditions of the licence that would tackle issues of social impact, they would tackle the issue of driving up the best of standards within this industry. Like the City Council in its bid, they believe that much of the purpose of the parliament's gaming legislation is in fact to drive up standards within the gambling industry, and of course it's important to remember, as they recognise at the board, that the regional casino itself will be the most regulated part of the gaming industry in the UK. They recognise that but they also want, and I've made clear, that there will be Glasgow-specific responses in the conditions of the licence, and I can assure you, they will make it clear to any operator that they award the licence, that it will be active in monitoring and enforcing each and every condition they impose on the licence.

**MAN:** Mr. Purcell, that's very helpful indeed. Chairman, I wonder if I could hear from the police on this point, just to enhance perhaps what Councillor Purcell said.

**JOHN POLLOCK:** Yes. We have a very good ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Could you come forward please, Superintendent.

**JOHN POLLOCK:** Yes.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** I've just been trying to work out, Chief Superintendent, what the medals are. One of them's the Jubilee Medal, but there's some more prestigious ones, aren't there?

**JOHN POLLOCK:** There's one for good conduct. I wondered I might only get half of the medal but they did give me both. John Pollock, Head of Community Safety for Strathclyde Police. My department deals with licensing boards across the force and in particular with Glasgow. We have a very good working relationship. They are indeed an independent organisation. They are very pro-active, they are regularly going out on visits to licensed premises to see for themselves firsthand what some of the issues are in the city in terms of licensing matters, and in that respect I would say that they're really quite learned in terms of what the issues are. They have encouraged a number of initiatives to increase safety within licensed premises, training initiatives for licensing staff, and as the leader of the council has said, they have been looking at initiating bans on glass in establishments which would merit further consideration of that because of the profile of the area.

**STEVEN PURCELL:** I'll add very briefly that the visits which are an important part of the work of the board are unannounced.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes. I think perhaps, Chief Superintendent, will you be able to spend much more time with us?

**JOHN POLLOCK:** I'll be able to spend until roughly 12 o'clock, I have a meeting in Edinburgh to attend at 2 o'clock and we'd prefer not to be caught speeding.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** I suppose it must be true, yes, but I'll try and call upon you later on this morning if I may.

**JOHN POLLOCK:** Thank you. Thanks very much indeed.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Mr. Sagar, you've got a few details to ask about.

**DEEP SAGAR:** Yes. Thank you, Mr. Chairman. If I could take Mr. Inch and Councillor Purcell back to the best test of social impact, please, when considering the representativeness of Glasgow for Britain, Mr. Inch, you touched on the ethnic make-up. Would you like to talk a little bit more about the fact that when you look at the UK, it's 9% BME and Glasgow is 4-5% roughly as you mentioned, and similarly in inactivity, in Glasgow as we know, roughly one out of four adults are inactive or unemployed, which is totally unrepresentative of what happens in the rest of Britain, so perhaps some more, if you could say. Thank you.

**STEVEN INCH:** I'll maybe take the second point first. In terms of inactivity, I think Glasgow is still suffering some of the problems of the consequences of long-term industrial decline. We have seen a problem particularly of middle-aged men finding it hard to reintegrate into the modern workforce, but in the last five years there's been a huge turnover in the number of Glaswegian residents actually in work, and I think Councillor Purcell mentioned in his introduction the number of jobs created in Glasgow, something like 60,000 net additional jobs created in the city since 1998, and our best estimate is that 40,000 of those have actually gone to people living in the city, so what we're actually seeing is quite a turn round in Glasgow's rate of economically inactive, and we're now catching up, we're still slightly adrift of the national average, we're certainly catching up very quickly, and the rate of job growth in Glasgow is substantially ahead of any other city in the UK, I think barring Manchester, which is doing particularly well at the moment. So I think the workforce is changing. As you say, we have got a problem with worklessness and there are just under 100,000 people who are of working age but not in employment. Again, five years ago that was 126,000, so that figure again has changed quite quickly as a result of some of the labour market interventions of the council, Scottish Enterprise, Jobcentre Plus and various other organisations have taken, so we are seeing I think the number of people in Glasgow coming into work, we're seeing average household income starting to go up quite quickly, certainly faster than the UK rate, and we're seeing average incomes start to rise, so the gap between Glasgow and other cities is closing. In terms of ethnic minority population, 5% was the figure in the census. I think that's maybe starting to change quite quickly as a result of the accession states. We're certainly seeing an inflow of migrant labour from the new member states in Eastern Europe and I think that 5% might be heading to nearer 7½ per cent, so again I think that ethnic balance is changing quite considerably. In terms of the mix, the biggest ethnic groups in Glasgow are Pakistani Scots, followed by Indian Scots and Chinese, and those three groups between them are the bulk of the ethnic groups within the city.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** I think what's worrying us really, the government has said in parliament that the casinos that parliament's allowing will, as it were, enable a trial of casinos, to see whether the ill effects that are said about casinos really would happen. If we were to have such a trial in Glasgow, could perhaps people say about the trial, 'Well, let's invalidate it because Glasgow has, you know, fewer ethnic minorities than other towns in Britain,' and so on. How would we get round this particular problem? I'm sure there must be a way but perhaps you can tell us.

**STEVEN PURCELL:** I think maybe the best way to answer the question again is to go back over the point I made to Deep there, that although Glasgow, its mix is different from other cities, it's actually starting to close the gap and it's becoming more like other cities, so I think in terms of the test of social impact, Glasgow's worklessness figure is not that dissimilar now from the other five or six cities who we would see as a major provincial competitor, that's the best way of putting it. And again with the current changes in the, you know, the trends in migrant labour, that gap again is actually closing, so Glasgow's becoming more like other cities, having been quite different from other cities maybe ten years ago.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you.

**STEVEN PURCELL:** And that's been a consistent trend over the past few years, it's not a sort of one-off. Look at the figures which I'm sure the panel appreciates.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. Let's more on then to social impact and you mentioned, Councillor, in opening that you expected a large number of jobs. I do want later on just to test some of the assumptions you've made on that. We're doing this all round the country so don't worry, we're not just picking on you. To what extent would the employment opportunities offered benefit the unemployed and disadvantaged, the people economically inactive, in this area?

**STEVEN PURCELL:** Oh, I think the important people to test on this is the operators who are vying for a casino license in Glasgow, and I would ask Mike Closier first of all from the SEC proposal to answer in the first instance.

**MIKE CLOSIER:** Thank you, Steven, Chair.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** So you are ...

**MIKE CLOSIER:** I'm Mike Closier, I'm the Group Chief Executive of the Scottish Exhibition and Conference Centre ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes.

**MIKE CLOSIER:** ... which is the largest integrated conference centre actually in the United Kingdom.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes, we had a good look at it last night.

**MIKE CLOSIER:** Did we have the lights on for you?

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Sorry, did you ...

**MIKE CLOSIER:** Did we turn the lights on?

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** The lights were on, yes ...

**MIKE CLOSIER:** Oh good. It looks stunning.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** ... which is perhaps as well because it was getting dark.

**MIKE CLOSIER:** That's good. We have experience of dealing with major events both in terms of business events. We have a major conference with us at the moment, 4½ thousand people, for four days, and major entertainment events. Now, we therefore test the employment market both for long-term jobs and for short-term jobs, and we need trained personnel. One interesting fact

which backs up what was said earlier, I tested what we were doing at the moment, for such a large influx of people. Now, just on the catering staff alone, front-of-house hospitality, we're employing something like 200 extra people, over and above our fixed complement of staff. Now, out of those, 23 are from the succession states and 5 are Chinese, which I think actually meets quite closely with the sort of mix. Going forward to a possible regional casino ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** The rest are actually from Glasgow.

**MIKE CLOSIER:** Yes, indeed.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Not other parts of Scotland or ...

**MIKE CLOSIER:** We don't differentiate in terms of, you know, that sort of thing, but they are indigenous Scots.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** OK, thank you.

**MIKE CLOSIER:** Thank you. As is well-known, we are associated with Kerzner International in terms of the desire to have a regional casino on our site, and one of the things that attracted us to Kerzner was their training programme which was very, very comprehensive and much in line with what we do at the moment. This was from entry level jobs right the way through IT, management, accounting, right away across the board, where training was given, excellence was rewarded, and there was an ethos there that met our aspirations. Giving one example on this, that, you know, people talk about these jobs being very low quality, dishwasher-type jobs, not at all. Serving staff, even in the restaurants and bars, would be trained to recognise if a customer was maybe a little bit under the weather, shall we say, and draw that to the attention of management, because the last thing we want is people who are incapable to actually gamble. This ties up with the licensing that we were talking about earlier, and not only in terms of enforcement but in terms of the possible loss of the licence if this continued, so we were very, very assured that a training programme going forward to a special university for people to give them the additional skills, but this is over and above the on-site training that will be given. Quality jobs across the board.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. I'll take Mr. Mundy as a supplementary question and then Mr. Froomberg as well.

**NEIL MUNDY:** Thank you very much indeed. I think what I'd like to exploit, I understand that the individual operators will have their own training programmes and very good that is. What I'd quite like to do is to explore with the City Council and perhaps with Scottish Enterprise the sort of standards that they would look for, so in other words, if they were looking at a range of operators, what would be the gold standard they would look for.

**STEVEN PURCELL:** Well, as I said, I think Glasgow has a tremendous track record in urban regeneration and in connecting local people, Glaswegians, to the employment opportunities that that brings, and I would ask Mr. Inch to give some specific examples of the standard and efforts of the City Council with the Enterprise Agency would go to with any anticipated operator.

**STEVEN INCH:** Yes, we mention in the bid document the work we're doing with the Glasgow Fort Project and it might be helpful if I explain how that works.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes, I can hear you because you're near to me. It's just possible it might be easier to put the microphone nearer to you.

**STEVEN INCH:** Right, is that helpful to the audience? Can everyone hear back there? Yes, if I maybe talk about or describe the work we've done to the Glasgow Fort Project, which is a major recruitment and training partnership for a very large physical development on the east side of the

city, and I'll refer to some of the other projects we're bringing on on the back of that, and I think maybe Stuart Patrick from Scottish Enterprise can talk about the work that's been done specifically on construction and how people are involved in construction. The Glasgow Fort is a shopping centre of approximately 280,000 sq. ft. on the east side of Glasgow, and when the project was first announced, we formed an early partnership agreement with the developer and the agent, a company called Hercules, and we ended up with a partnership which had the council, the developer and the agent, Jobcentre Plus, the local FE college, the local development company, and we have local development companies in Glasgow who undertake training, business training, property initiatives, and 30 of the retailers who'd signed up for the park, so a very big partnership in there, and we had specific agreements with some of the tenants there to basically do all the on-site equipment for them, to do the pre-vocational screening, to do interview training, and then once people were in work, to do post-employment follow-up to ensure that people actually stayed with it. So Asda, for example, recruited 100 staff, all of the staff in their store, through this project. Next recruited all of their staff through this process, and the training provided was to the standard specified by the tenant, so they basically provided the training programme and the training organisations delivered to the standard that the retailers demanded. So the general approach we used, and I think this would be very applicable to this project, we had on-site recruitment centres while the development was being built, there was actually an on-site centre there with all the retailers represented who could provide information on the sorts of jobs, everything from working on the shop floor through to stores, stock control, security, office work, so it's the whole gamut of employment. With Jobcentre Plus, we had road shows and job fairs round the areas, so the opportunities were taken out to people so they could actually go and see what sort of jobs would be provided, with an internet site and you could apply directly from the internet for either training or employment. As I said, we provided interview training, we provided pre-application screening, which saved employers having to do it. We provided off-the-job and on-the-job training using the colleges. We had an email and text service so you could actually register to have employment opportunities, emailed or text, texted to your phone, and the final element was the aftercare service, so once somebody was in work, and for this particular project, a lot of people were coming from long-term unemployment, actually getting into work and staying there is quite a challenge if you've been out of work for some time, so the aftercare is extremely important in there. So the outcome of that was 50 additional people were engaged in construction from within the local area. Locally they defined it within walking distance of the actual construction site. Of the 1200 jobs filled in the development, 576 came from Greater Easterhouse, one of the areas of highest unemployment in Glasgow, and 250 came from other areas of high unemployment, from the east end of the city, so over 800 or 1200 jobs effectively filled locally in an area of very high unemployment and low economic activity. The final benefit, quite small but quite significant, is the landscaping on the site was contracted out to a local social business who we set up to do landscaping environment work. I think that that just shows that this is not simply employment and training within the development, it's about spin-off work that can actually be done by other organisations within the area.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Just a little detail. Easterhouse is on the other side of the city.

**STEVEN INCH:** Easterhouse is right at the far east end of Glasgow.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes, yes, I gathered, that's why it's called Easterhouse I gather. I just mentioned that because I did visit it some years ago and one hopes that things have improved since.

**STEVEN INCH:** Easterhouse I think is one of the areas in Glasgow which is likely to experience the largest increase in population growth to the period 2014, according to earlier forecasts, a lot of private housing investment coming in, obviously a lot of retail and commercial investment, so the area's changing quite rapidly. Just to finish off my side of the story, the approach we've used in the Glasgow Fort has now been applied to a development called Silverburn, which is on the south-west of the city and that's a development of about 450,000 sq. ft, again a retail development.

We've worked on three individual projects with Tesco, who've set up their social economy partnerships, and again, very high numbers of local people going into employment in the new Tesco stores. We are working on construction projects, for example on the north-west of the city, Drumchapel new neighbourhood is an area of very high unemployment, that'll be a housing developer about to do seven phases of development which will produce about 1200 houses and we've signed an employment and training contract, they will recruit unemployed young people and take them all the way through an apprenticeship. Stuart Patrick, as I said, is the sort of expert in the construction programmes in Glasgow.

**MAN:** Remind us just of the number of apprenticeships in Drumchapel.

**STEVEN INCH:** I think it will eventually be about 70 over the ...

**MAN:** ... proceedment to the planning application.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes, of course, if one was to object to a planning application and one said, 'I object to this planning application because I think gambling is a dreadful thing,' that would not be a material consideration for the planning committee, would it? So perhaps knowing that, I wouldn't object.

(most of Tape 2 was duplication of Tape 1)

**DEEP SAGAR:** ... and Scottish Executive than Mr. Perry's letter which is with us, indicates, which is not necessarily a ringing endorsement of everything. Thank you.

**STUART PATRICK:** I'll certainly take the point here. I mean, it's worthwhile noting that I sit here as a representative of Scottish Enterprise as the senior lead role in Glasgow, and just clarification on the role that I play. My role is Operations Director for Scottish Enterprise Glasgow in formalities, but I am actually a Scottish Enterprise employee, and I am the lead representative of Scottish Enterprise in Glasgow responsible for all matters to do with Glasgow, so in essence I think Jack Perry's letter may not have been extensive in its coverage of the issue, but I think it would be a mistake to suggest that there is an under enthusiasm for the role that a casino would play in the Clyde waterfront, and I know we're going to talking a great more about the role that Clyde waterfront plays, and I particularly want to emphasise just how significant the Clyde waterfront is to the whole plans that Scottish Enterprise has for the West of Scotland. So I just simply don't want to suggest that a short brief note from Jack Perry makes any message or suggests any lack of enthusiasm for the role the casino plays in the Clyde waterfront.

**STEVEN PURCELL:** Can I very briefly on this issue add that Jack Perry's letter was written before the short list was announced and at a time when there was more than one local authority in Scotland bidding for the regional casino and that's certainly a point he drew to my attention, so things have moved on in that respect.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Mr. Froomberg.

**JAMES FROOMBERG:** Thank you, Chair. Councillor Purcell, I'd not heard before what you just said, which was Edinburgh's city council's explicit support for Glasgow's proposal here, which personally I find something quite exciting. Is there anything more substantive behind that other than you sitting here describing it? I'm not doubting your word but sort of letters and minutes and this sort of thing all obviously carry more weight with us.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. Yes, the last thing we want is to be deluged with letters. So evidence please.

**STEVEN PURCELL:** Yes. The leader of Edinburgh Council wrote to the advisory panel a very substantial letter outlining why the City of Edinburgh Council believe a regional casino in Glasgow would benefit the whole of the central belt, so he did make a submission.

**JAMES FROOMBERG:** My embarrassment.

**STEVEN PURCELL:** I have a copy of it if you've lost your copy anyway, not with me but I can ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Well, I hope we don't lose copies. Our secretary's going to check on it. I mean, if you want to give us a copy now, we'll be able to read it on the train. Why else does one go on the train? Anyway, thanks for that. Was there another question, Mr. Froomberg?

**JAMES FROOMBERG:** It was just really a point of clarification, and do forgive my lack of knowledge of the local geography, but you mentioned, Councillor Purcell, the Glasgow and Clyde Valley Partnership, and I just wasn't quite sure what sort of area, does that go out as far as West Dunbartonshire, for example?

**STEVEN PURCELL:** If it's helpful for the record, I will list the local authorities: The City of Glasgow; West Dunbartonshire; East Dunbartonshire; North Lanarkshire; South Lanarkshire; East Renfrewshire; Renfrewshire; Inverclyde. And that's it.

**JAMES FROOMBERG:** I'm very impressed, thank you.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Could I just ask one factual question please, before we break. It's a fairly short one. I'm right in thinking that you've got three casinos with planning permission in addition to the five you've already got.

**STEVEN PURCELL:** Yes.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** What's happening in respect of those three with planning permission?

**STEVEN PURCELL:** One of the casinos is under construction at the moment, which is down on the south bank of the river. One of them is underneath Central Station and it's potentially affected by a CPO for the direct rail link to the station, and I understand the developer is trying to market the site at the moment so I think there is no ... It's a planning consent which covers four different land uses so I think it's speculative rather than in any detail in there, and the third proposal is very small and my understanding at the moment is no action has been taken to enact planning consent.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Is that for commercial reasons, to your knowledge?

**SEVEN PURCELL:** I don't know.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Mr. Froomberg?

**JAMES FROOMBERG:** Thanks very much. I'm grateful for the clarification of which authorities are in the Glasgow and Clyde Valley Partnership. As you know, we had, as well as Glasgow's proposal, we did have one from one of your other Partnership members in West Dunbartonshire which hasn't been short-listed. At the time that there were two proposals before us from the Partnership, did the Partnership have a preference, and obviously now you're in a one-horse race, it's a bit easier for you, but I'm just trying to establish whether the Partnership would have wanted to give us an indication in the first place, one or the other.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** I'm not sure that we should ask that without West Dunbartonshire being here to refute what might be the answer.

**STEVEN PURCELL:** In any case, the simple answer is no, the Partnership didn't express a preference, because they were both on the waterfront.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes. OK, thanks very much. Well, look, I don't know whether anybody promised you all a lunchtime, starting at half-past-twelve, it's now quarter-to-one or thereabouts. I think we can break now for lunch until quarter-to-two, is that acceptable all round? So can we be back please promptly at quarter-to-two.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes, of course, if one was to object to a planning application and one said, 'I object to this planning application because I think gambling is a dreadful thing,' that would not be a material consideration for the planning committee, would it? So perhaps knowing that, I wouldn't object.

**STEVEN PURCELL:** Well, our experience in Glasgow is when people object to something, they let us know very often very vocally, I may add. However, the point I was making, Professor, is that any objections regardless of whether the Planning Committee can give them material consideration, I should have been clearer, would be reported to Committee, and it's certainly our experience and we can document this for you, that regardless of whether anyone is making a material objection, when there's something of this significance, we generally experience a large number of objections that the Committee has to wade its way through and decide what is material and what is not.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. Councillor Paris.

**STEVEN PURCELL:** Sorry, just to give one example of that ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes, sorry.

**STEVEN PURCELL:** The Tesco planning application, the one that was referred to earlier for Silverburn, got 600 objections, it was report to Committee. I'm sorry, the Partick Tesco proposal.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** What were they objecting to?

**STEVEN PURCELL:** A lot of it was the principle of a superstore being developed in their neighbourhood. So just to be clear, it was Partick, not the Pollock one.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Anyway, I won't follow that because ...

**STEVEN PURCELL:** The transport issues, you can imagine the scale of issues.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Tesco would quietly complain, they'd think that we'd got on to them rather than the subject. Councillor Paris.

**MARY PARIS:** Yes, well, I had noticed the March survey and of course I know about the business research, but I was particularly interested at looking on your own website to what other areas had done in the way of consultation, and I was particularly impressed by the Manchester example where they carried out a number of surveys, they ran focus groups, and they held discussions with 150 organisations, community organisations, faith organisations, minority groups and so on, and as far as I can tell, nothing like that has happened in Glasgow at all. Public consultation is confined to that one March survey. I know for example that the Presbytery of the Church of Scotland was not consulted, the mosques weren't consulted and that they're becoming somewhat agitated about this. I'm actually surprised that the arch diocese of Glasgow hasn't responded, which suggests a very low-key approach to consultation with groups, because all these groups tend to make their views known on matters certainly of social concern. I take the point that Steven's made about vociferous objectors, but what I would expect to happen is that at this stage people think, 'Oh yes, casino, we mightn't get it anyway,' and it'll be at the point where it becomes a reality and where we're looking at specific plans which what's more might be in your area, that's where people will start saying, you know, 'How can I make my voice heard?' and the answer might be, 'It's too late.'

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thanks. First of all on the facts of the city council, is it the case that you've not consulted these various religious bodies?

**STEVEN PURCELL:** No, we haven't formally consulted them.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Right. Do you want to make any comment about your consultation in comparison with Manchester? We ought to ask Manchester what they thought of yours, of course. Do tell me what you think of Manchester first of all.

**STEVEN PURCELL:** Well, I mean, we're open to looking at any examples of how we can improve consultation or indeed any other approach that the city takes to our governance or our ambitions for a community plan or economy and other things. What I can say, hand on heart, to the panel is that the publicity that has surrounded the regional casino in Glasgow has been immense. The daily evening newspaper, which is the most popular read newspaper in the city, has given this extensive coverage and rigorous examination, and my experience when there is publicity about anything involving the Council's plans is that you very quickly, certainly to my office at the council, get plenty of letters, emails and indeed telephone calls, and when I compare this to another big issue that the daily evening newspaper has given a huge profile to and that is transport issues in the city, I have had dozens upon dozens of letters about transport issues, and I have only had one letter to my office about the principle of a regional casino.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Isn't it the case though that people are more likely to complain about what they see as deficiencies in something existing like, you know, the buses not doing what they ought to, than they are, as it were, to object to something they don't really know much about.

**STEVEN PURCELL:** Well, a survey in March told us that 50% of people in Glasgow have heard about the proposal. I think that's a high awareness level of a single issue, and I do agree with you that people tend to object more about the deficiency of something, and as the objectors today are making the essentially the principle of a regional casino, their central objection is to the principle of it, I would suspect that those that do object in Glasgow would do the same. I mean, we would argue that the principle has been settled by Parliament and what our city is involved in is trying to take advantage of what we believe would be a positive regeneration benefit. This is debated in a parliamentary democracy, voted upon. I think it's important to remember the House of Commons before the dissolution voted for 8 regional casinos, but it was as part of the compromise because of the dissolution for the General Election that it was reduced to one, so the principle as far as the city's concerned was determined by our parliament.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you.

**KEN ROLWEGAN:** Mr. Chairman.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Mr. Rolwegan.

**KEN ROLWEGAN:** The consultation, a survey of one thousand people out of a population of 600,000 people or round about, is pretty small, and I think if the folks have looked at *The Glasgow Herald* on Saturday, they would see an article which indicated that I would be the only member of the public who would be present today, because of the lack of consultation in this city, and therefore I think the evidence is clear, that there would have been a lot more people complaining if it had been more publicly announced. The number of people that have phoned me in the last 48 hours since reading the article in *The Glasgow Herald* have all commented that they knew nothing about it.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Of course the reason you're here, Mr. Rolwegan, is that I looked through all the letters and came to a conclusion that you were best able to represent that particular point of view. Sorry to be unnecessarily flattering.

**KEN ROLWEGAN:** No, but did you receive any other letters from Glaswegians?

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes, yes. OK, thank you. Mr. McEwan, I do think we're just about to take a break but just one thing, of course.

**SAM McEWAN:** It's just on the theme of consultation, Professor. We in Rangers have in fact consulted with our local community. The area opposite the stadium is administered by something called the Ibrox Community Trust, which is made up of lay people and politicians. We have shared all the detail of the development with them, showing them obviously the architects' drawings, we're showing them artists' impressions, we've talked about wage rates we've talked about working conditions and training, and we have their full support for this development. There are two politicians who sit on it, they're the local councillors, Councillor Gogh and Councillor Donan. We have also spoken with our M.P., Ian Davidson M.P. We have consulted with Mohammed Sarwar, we've consulted with Gordon Jackson, MSP, and I'm sure those of us who know those personalities involved, they would not be shy in coming forward to tell you that you'd gotten it wrong, and I'm glad to say that we've got the support of all of those people. Through Mohammed Sarwar, M.P., we have consulted with the Asian community, which we have a large Asian community around the stadium, many of them in fact come and, I was going to say enjoy the football on a Saturday. Perhaps that's not always the case, but they come to the football on a Saturday. We have announced it openly at our last AGM what we were doing, what the plans were. The plans have been available for everyone. Lots of our supporters live in that area, so we have consulted and we, like Councillor Purcell, have not received any indication of a problem. We're open to offers, if people want to come and see, we'll happily talk to them. The people we have talked to, and it has been extensive, have not objected.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. You're keeping us from our coffee, Councillor, but a quick one.

**MARY PARIS:** I am very fond of my coffee and looking forward to it, but I'm glad to hear that Ibrox have consulted but I would just make the brief point that both the people who would be employed at the casino and the people that would be clients of the casino don't just come from the Ibrox area, they come from across the city and therefore I think something wider in the way of consultation is needed. There is a whole network of community councils, community groups, community centres, across the city. It would be a relatively easy matter to consult through those established networks.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. I thought we'd have a break at about 11. It's just gone 11, ten past. How long do we usually have? Quarter-of-an-hour. I think quarter-of-an-hour should give everybody a chance to have a cup of coffee or whatever special needs they've got to exercise. Don't go yet because you don't know when to come back. Can we come back please promptly so we can make a start at 25 past 11. Thank you.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** ... dealing about a super casino here, as they call it, particularly with regards to your experience of existing ones.

**JOHN POLLOCK:** Thank you. I think there are probably two points to be made. The first is that the design of any development is critical. Strathclyde Police is very aware that crime is a threat to regeneration. The force, as a result, as a long tradition of using crime prevention through environmental design, in co-operation with local authorities, but most particularly including Glasgow City Council and regeneration companies as a means to ensuring that as far as possible we cut out the opportunities to commit crime, at the planning process. As I say, local authorities are very supportive of the police, none more so than Glasgow, to the extent that this year we've been invited to provide a direct input to the city's plan. I should also point out that Strathclyde Police is a strategy member of the Community Planning Partnership. It's also represented in the Community Safety Partnership and also in the Clyde Valley Community Planning Partnership, and as a result, there are excellent links between the police and the council in terms of development, and indeed we have a dedicated Police Liaison Officer currently working with a very major

regeneration project in the city. I think in relation to your question about crime and casinos, certainly we are unable to provide any information which would provide evidence of a direct link between any of our existing casinos and disorder. There is very little indication of disorder taking place within the premises themselves. It is of course very difficult to ascertain if disorder should occur, whether or not it has actually been as a result of any particular premises, unless any witnesses could speak to that. And certainly as far as claims of dishonesty are concerned around the areas of the city casinos, although there is some, that's almost entirely related to shoplifting from the very many retail outlets that exist within the city centre.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Would you, if Glasgow became the chosen one, as it were, presumably you would be doing some sort of good preparation of intelligence and so on. Obviously you won't want to tell me just what that would be, but I mean, in general terms, what sort of things would you be sort of planning to make sure it didn't happen?

**JOHN POLLOCK:** Well, the first responsibility of the police service is to protect the public, and we'd be looking at the customer profile, to have a look at the opportunities for casual surveillance at any of the environs, the car parks, and I should point out also that Glasgow, with some assistance from Strathclyde Police, has ensured a very comprehensive and effective public space CCTV system which I would expect the environs would be linked into, and that these have direct links to local police area control rooms, and that ensures an appropriate policing response. We would also be looking at issues in relation to staff, and be providing assistance to them in terms of personal safety, which we would do for any large, and have done for a number of large organisations. Obviously some of the particular issues in relation to casinos would relate to fraudulent activities, which would be in the interests of the developer and ourselves to work hand-in-hand and I'm quite confident in their ability to do that. Probably some of the concerns that people might have would be about money laundering. Obviously there would be a requirement to complete information notes, sars as I think they're referred to, which would ensure that we are aware of any financial transactions which may have some suspicious element to them.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Is that a particular problem in casinos in your experience?

**JOHN POLLOCK:** I think it's just the fact that, well, one, I don't have any experience of casinos and I would not wish to suggest that I do.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** But your force does, because you've got Clyde already, doesn't it, yes.

**JOHN POLLOCK:** At the moment we are quite happy with the support that we are provided by the casinos in that respect.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** OK. And money laundering touches everybody. I have to fill in a form from the Chartered Surveyors once a year which asks me, have I been doing any money laundering, or words to that effect.

**JOHN POLLOCK:** I have no information on you particularly ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you.

**JOHN POLLOCK:** .... which I would wish to divulge.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes, thanks very much for that. Prostitution, that's one of the things that, you know, one reads about in relation to casinos.

**JOHN POLLOCK:** Well, certainly we have prostitution issues in this city. Once again I'm pleased to say that they are dealt with as part of a partnership. There is a Social Inclusion Partnership

called Roots Out where the varied partners including the council, the police support agencies get together in order to take what I would regard as a holistic approach to the problem. It does identify that prostitution in particular, street prostitution is a social nuisance but it also looks at the fact that prostitutes themselves can come under attack and that they can often be victims too, so our efforts are two-fold, attempting to ensure that the wider community is impacted as little as possible, but also ensuring as well that there's a harm reduction element and that we do try and signpost them also to employment opportunities.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** And international organised crime?

**JOHN POLLOCK:** There has recently been an operation in Scotland, part of the UK-wide operation, Operation Pentameter, and there is evidence of some prostitution taking place that's now off-street, which involves trafficking of women, and we have been able to identify a number and release a number, I'd have to say this is something which is an unfortunate and tragic part of proper European boundaries and some of the social conditions that take place elsewhere.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes, one has read about that. Is casinos an element in this, or are casinos an element in this trafficking, do you know?

**JOHN POLLOCK:** We have no information that would suggest that casinos are linked to this.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Mr. Sagar.

**DEEP SAGAR:** Would you see a regional casino to be in the league of say a major stadium in terms of possibilities of disorder, and would you have any views about should such a casino be close to where people live or close to shops?

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you.

**JOHN POLLOCK:** Certainly one could make a case for saying that, and Strathclyde Police obviously has a number of very high profile venues which it polices on a regular basis, Hamden, Ibrox, Celtic Park, Scottish Exhibition and Conference Centre as well, and we've policed Robbie Williams concerts and Rolling Stones concerts in the very recent past. We also have a history of working with the council in terms of we man emergency planning, but I have to say that in terms of the operation of a regional casino, I would see it as being along with a very large retail area of the kind that perhaps Sheffield has and other areas of other cities has in terms of what the effect would be on policing. I think much of it would depend upon the ability to create good working relationships with security in order that they can identify issues. What I should say in relation to that is that they recently, Strathclyde Police and Glasgow City Council has initiated a joint problem-solving approach which will shortly include the sharing of a database, and it also includes shared analytical work in order that we can identify hotspots very quickly and create joint action plans in order to solve them. So I would see that any development of a regional casino would be dealt with under that model, and I would suspect that the impact of that in Glasgow could be well dealt with because of partnership responsibilities.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. The Chief Superintendent did say that he needed to get away pretty shortly, so I think if anyone has any questions they want to ask him, probably now is the best time. Councillor Paris?

**MARY PARIS:** Not in particular. I'm interested in what he has to say.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** What he's said already, yes, of course.

**MARY PARIS:** Yes, that's right. One very quick point. I don't know if you've looked at all at a very critical research report of the casino industry that was done by the Royal Canadian Mounted Police into casino development in Canada. It makes interesting reading.

**JOHN POLLOCK:** Thank you. I have not seen that particular piece, but I will ensure that I do, thank you.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** To your knowledge, have police in Britain generally studied the overseas situation, do you know?

**JOHN POLLOCK:** I'm not aware of any official documents on it, although I am aware that obviously in terms of financial units and financial investigations, there is a much degree of expertise which can be called upon, and obviously we do have good relationships with American, North American and European agencies that we can gather information as necessary and act upon it.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. Well, thank you very much indeed, Chief Superintendent, and for coming along, and if you want to get across to what I think, for local sensitivities, I'll call 'another Scottish city'.

**JOHN POLLOCK:** Where I'll have my tea, no doubt.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. Well, keeping on with the theme of social impact, Mr. Mundy, you've got a question here about the Economic and Social Research Council study, I believe.

**NEIL MUNDY:** Yes, Chairman. The proposal was very helpful in setting out a lot of background information. I think this is of very sort of general benefit, you know, as background to the work that we're doing. I understood that Dr. Gerda Reith had been working with the Research Council in looking at the problem of gambling in its social context, and I was wondering if at this stage your adviser had come forward with any initial findings that the panel might find of interest to help their deliberations.

**MAN:** Yes, we have made a very detailed examination of the findings. Mr. Inch.

**STEVEN INCH:** Yes, I mean, there are two pieces of work that Dr. Gerda Reith has done. One of them is obviously the longer-term study and that's still early days to determine what will come out of that piece of work, but Dr. Reith has I think agreed to work with us as more findings come forward from that piece of work. I think perhaps the most relevant piece of work is the piece of work she's done for the Scottish Executive, which looks at, I suppose it's a summary of all of the work done to date on the economic and social costs which potentially go with gambling, and we've built some of the findings of that into the second response we made with additional questions.

**MAN:** Right. There was mention of the, yes, presumably that's not yet in a published book form I take it.

**STEVEN INCH:** It's a three to five-year piece of work which is quite early on in its life. We've got some very, very early conclusions from that, but I think it's too early to make any real meaning of it.

**MAN:** Too early, yes, I did read the additional information but I was just exploring that. Thank you very much indeed, Mr. Inch.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Do you want to ask the next question? Yes, Mr. Mundy, we've got one or two questions now.

**NEIL MUNDY:** I think we did explore this a little earlier, but we looked at where partnerships with developers had been successful in achieving benefits for disadvantaged communities in Glasgow. What I'd quite like to ask is if there are any examples, any experience where the expectations of those partnerships have actually not delivered what was expected, and you know, what the conclusions were that you reached, both on the public and the private sector side.

**STEVEN INCH:** Yes, I mean, there are various sorts of partnership. I spoke at length earlier about the sort of employment and training partnerships we work to, and I think by and large all of these projects have delivered on the commitments which developers have made. I think there are always instances where it's been difficult to maybe deliver one specific type of training, for example. I think in terms of numbers, the developers have tended to live up to the promises they've made. Other types of partnerships we're involved with are partnerships where a developer will make a contribution to another type of project, for example the major shopping development in Drumchapel, the developer made a contribution to a local sports centre. In the proposal for the Ibrox casino, the developer and the operator are making commitments to develop local sports facilities. In the Glasgow Harbour Project the developer has already made a substantial commitment to the provision of a site for the construction of a new museum, so it's not linked to the casino, it's linked to the overall bigger development. And in the ACCC project, the developer/operator has made a contribution towards the development of a community fund. I think there are lots of examples in Glasgow where planning gain has been secured, you know, in line with the protocols which allow planning gain to be secured, and I can't think of an example where a developer has defaulted on the commitments which have been made through that negotiating process.

**NEIL MUNDY:** Thank you, that's a very good record, thank you.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Councillor Paris.

**MARY PARIS:** Yes. With regard to the research in progress, I mean, Dr. Gerda Reith's a very well respected researcher, and I look forward to reading what she has to say when the research is completed, but I know that there has been quite a lot of research done at Glasgow University preceding this particular bit, and they identified that younger age groups, unemployed males, particularly those of low educational achievement, were particularly prone to having problems with gambling, compulsive gambling, and that compulsive gambling is linked to depressive illness and to sadly sometimes suicide attempts. Will these be elements of Dr. Reith's research?

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** I mean, this might be the point to just put in something that I was going to raise later but I'll raise it now. You may have heard, what was the programme I spoke of this morning, can you remember?

**MAN:** *Good Morning Scotland.*

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** *Good Morning Scotland* it was, and one of the things that the interviewers did speak about was some research that they, BBC Scotland, had done. They'd got a Scottish firm Hall Aitken to produce a report. Well, I am familiar, I don't know about that particularly, though I guess everybody's going to tune in tonight, so they tell me. But I mean, I have come across Hall Aitken's work before. It's pretty critical of casinos in general for regeneration, and one got the feeling this morning that they were going to be pretty critical of casinos in Glasgow. Now, it may be that when you do hear the programme or see it, whatever, you may feel moved to write in, because you know, it's a piece of evidence, and it does seem to be well-researched, and there might be some good evidence there. If it's something that hasn't, something comes up and it hasn't been referred to here, then I'm duty bound to offer to people the opportunity to write in, again, copying it all round of course, but specifically, are you aware of Hall Aitken's work? What do you want to tell me about it?

**STEVEN PURCELL:** We don't accept the bases on which they have determined their research. I think first of all it's important to make the point that Hall Aitken have made it clear that they're opposed to regional size casinos, and the BBC approached ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** They're opposed to them wherever they are, you mean?

**STEVEN PURCELL:** Yes. And the BBC approached a firm that had already determined that that was their position. But specific research in relation to Glasgow has been based on an original report by Hall Aitken which has been in our view discredited by the most credible expert on gambling in Britain, Professor Peter Collins, which I think is an important point to make to the panel, Professor, and in relation to the specific criticisms that we expect to hear in *Frontline Scotland* tonight from the BBC in relation to Glasgow's bid for a casino is again we cannot accept the bases of their research. They are comparing, they visited Detroit and I believe Las Vegas also, and Glasgow doesn't want to copy a Detroit or Las Vegas example. We don't want to be Detroit or Las Vegas for two specific reasons. One, Detroit decided to approach, tackle its economic problems and find a future, that the future was gambling, and we don't want that in Glasgow, thank you very much. We only want one regional size casino which is part of a diverse Glasgow economy, and in itself is part of a diverse regeneration package which would become we hope a high-class high-value leisure destination, in the main for leisure and business and tourists, and we also don't want to be Las Vegas with, you know, dozens and dozens of casinos, and many of them of the size of a regional casino. We're very specific, we want one regional casino, we want it to be part of a major regeneration package, only one part of that leisure attraction, and it's one that should be high-class, high-value, and will be because the legislation demands this. It will be part of the, most regulated part of the gaming industry.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** But to what extent, thanks for mentioning Detroit. Sorry, I'll forget what I was going to say for the moment. Carry on.

**STEVEN INCH:** It was just to add a point to what Councillor Purcell has said, that we've actually got an excerpt from a piece of work that Dr. Reith has written, which looks at the whole Aitken study, and I think it's fairly critical of it, and I could read you the whole three pages but I'm sure you wouldn't want to hear it, but it's things like the calculations in Hall Aitken are based on the assumptions that casinos account for all problem gambling, for example. They look at prevalence figures which are not applicable to casinos, and the view of Dr. Reith is that the information is simply not robust. It's certainly not been accepted by the DCMS, and I think we think, as Councillor Purcell said, the way they went about the piece of work and the assumptions they made was quite heavily flawed. I'm quite happy to make this rather scribbled version available if that's of assistance to you.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Would you mind making it into a little document and circulating it, and again, if anyone has any points to make on it, and I'm sure they will ... I mean, I am aware that there's an enormous amount of research. I think having been in the quiet, uneventful world of Town Planning most of my life, I've discovered just how much research there is in gambling, so quite a new world and a very well researched one. What was the question I was going to ... Oh yes, that's right. To what extent do you agree that Detroit and Glasgow are comparable?

**STEVEN PURCELL:** In terms of coming from an industrial past, I think it's for all to see that we have a comparative history in terms of our economy. Where I don't think they're comparable is in approaching, tackling all of the problems.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** But as cities with problems.

**STEVEN PURCELL:** No. We would be strongly of the view that the cities are not comparable in terms of the problems we face, and that's one of the reasons we believe that the analyses by the BBC is flawed.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** In what way aren't they comparable?

**STEVEN PURCELL:** I'll ask Mr. Inch. We have looked at the detail of this on the bases of the research that's been done and Mr. Inch has looked at the detail of it, so I'll ask him to speak about that.

**STEVEN INCH:** I think, as Councillor Purcell has said, Glasgow and Detroit both lost their traditional economies about 20 years ago.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes, yes.

**STEVEN INCH:** Glasgow's actually found a new style of economy, and as we said earlier, we are now very much an international city which trades very much on tradable services, inward investment, tourism, conferences, consumer and retail. Detroit I think is not an international tourism destination in the same way that Glasgow is. Detroit also chose to allow, I think three casinos opened in 1999 within a very short space of time. I don't think they'd really thought through what they thought those style of casino destinations could create without the international tourism base to sustain them, so I think the circumstances for their casino development is entirely different. I think if you look at the facts and figures about Detroit, it's still not found its new direction. I think we're quite clear that Glasgow has and has made tremendous strides to carve out where it thinks it is and where it thinks it wants to be going in the next 10 – 15 years.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Do you think that Detroit Council would agree with that?

**STEVEN INCH:** I think if they had an honest look at the facts and figures, they would I think agree they'd still got a long way to go to create the sort of city they might aspire for Detroit.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes. I mean, I should say that I'm a member of the American Planning Association and periodically, you know, one does read in their papers that Detroit's in rather a bad way. Councillor Paris.

**MARY PARIS:** Apologies but just a quick point of clarification. Dr. Reith's a sociologist. The research I referred to was carried out by various people within Glasgow University's Psychology Department, hence the interest in the state of mind of compulsive gamblers.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. It's Mr. Patrick, isn't it.

**STUART PATRICK:** Just to say that we are very familiar with how we benchmark our city with a variety of cities across the world, and Detroit is generally not on that list, for various reasons, not least the social make-up of American cities is very, very different to European cities as we know, and also the central city phenomenon in Detroit, as in so many other American cities, where the central city is emptied out to the suburbs. It's just not a phenomenon that is well-shared in European cities, as you will know very well from a planning point of view.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** I mean, are you then pointing to racial polarisation?

**STUART PATRICK:** Not so much, no, although there is an element of that but it's more to do with economic polarisation than it is to do with that. The race I think is really just a side aspect of that. But really I mean, the cities that we tend to compare ourselves with are the European cities where we can see the social, cultural and governance comparisons that was much more easily accommodated than those we see in America, so Detroit just doesn't feature in our bench-marking.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. Mr. Taylor. I haven't heard from you today, have I? Have I?

**SCOTT TAYLOR:** Thank you, Professor. I just wanted to comment on your point about Detroit and the comparison with Glasgow. Glasgow has successfully followed a policy of implosion in encouraging in-town developments and that's led to its retailing offering being substantial and recognised as the best retail opportunity outside London. The centre of the city has been developed in such a way that the offering of Glasgow compared to Detroit is significantly different, and the attention to the cultural developments within the city, the awarding of its accolade 'European city of culture, city of architecture and design, UK city of sport' point to a policy that Glasgow's developed and been very successful in encouraging the approach to concentrating on major events and major projects that provide a significant step change to lead a very rapid growth, a very rapid jump in its economy and in its growth, and the ambition for a regional casino in Glasgow would provide yet another dramatic step change in that growth and in the development of the city.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thanks. Mr. Froemberg.

**JAMES FROEMBERG:** Thank you, Chairman. I was going to pick this one up later but I thought I'd ride on the back of your coat tails in raising that. We've seen in the documents that have been submitted to us a theme along the lines you just suggested, that a regional casino here would lead to increased international tourism, increased conference delegate days, increased hotel developments and phrases like 'other leverage' to pick up anything that hadn't already been specified, but I've been scrabbling through looking for some evidence and some quantification around all this, and if you've got any, or any of your colleagues here have got any, it would be really helpful for us to understand what else actually comes rather than the generality of, 'Well, if we get this big thing, you know, it's going to be good and life will move forward faster.' If you can help us with that, that'll be much appreciated.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes please, Mr. Taylor.

**SCOTT TAYLOR:** Certainly in response to that question, Cambridge Policy Consultants have been employed by Glasgow City Council and a very detailed summary and survey of the likely potential of the increase in tourist numbers has been made to that, and I'm sure that would be circulated to the panel and audience. In terms of the estimate of tourist trips for Glasgow, the casino has estimated at its top end to increase the number of tourist visitors by some 600,000 additional visits to the area, and that will undoubtedly raise our occupancy in the city by about 2%. Now, Glasgow has grown in the region of 2% year on year for the past four years, and the demand for the city has never been at a higher pace. If you look at the combination requirement for instance in Glasgow in the past year, our occupancy has been something in the order of 74%, and on many number of nights the city has been totally full, as it was on Friday night, Saturday night, Sunday night, and very much tonight as well. The city is running at its peak occupancy, and when I mean the city, I mean the city and its outlying area, so all some 12½ thousand rooms have been fully taken up. Glasgow does need a regional casino because its very point about being able to leverage additional accommodation and the provision of additional accommodation is well-founded, and I think not just will that satisfy the need for people coming in and visiting the attraction in itself, but also people who want to come to the city to meet in the city, and Glasgow, as you're probably aware, is the conferencing capital of Scotland. It handles more conference business than any other cities added together. Now, the difficulty for conference delegates coming in town is that some 2,000 of them stayed over in our sister city at the weekend because of the availability of space in Glasgow, and there's no doubt that if a casino leverages additional hotel accommodation and we estimate it will leverage somewhere between 7 and 10 hotels, then the results from that will be not just additionality from leisure guests coming to the city but the opportunity for us to be able to address the conferencing market, and specifically our key areas of

activity are on the international conferencing sector, and some 40% of all conference delegates are international, and I think the opportunity for us to leverage greater access into this market will give us additional benefit, not just from casino leisure guests but also from additional conferences.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you.

**JAMES FROOMBERG:** Just to follow up on that, and they are very helpful and I've written down some of the things you've just said. Is there anything specific, if one said a regional casino would attract 600,000 visitors and you know, raise hotel occupancy and the trickle through of that in terms of hotel developments, is there anything specific about Glasgow compared to the other cities that we're going to see that would make that effect stronger or less strong that we ought to be taking into consideration?

**ANDY HURST:** Andy Hurst, Cambridge Policy Consultants. We took a detailed assessment of the analysis of not only where people would come to, to spend money in this casino, but how many times they would visit, and we made very detailed assumptions around how those two things combine. The difference between, in our view, between Glasgow and other cities which we may consider for a location for a regional casino is quite considerably in terms of the amount of existing international and UK tourists who already visit Scotland but may not spend that much time in Glasgow currently. More than half the additional visits will not come from people deciding to visit Scotland and previously would not have done so, but will be about people diverting days and nights into staying in Glasgow because of the location of a casino, and a casino leisure destination. It's very important to understand it in those contexts.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Mr. Collison, you've a specific question about Ibrox and its location and social impact.

**CHRIS COLLISON:** Yes, thank you, Chairman. Whilst the panel are tasked with recommending a local authority area for the regional casino and not specific sites, the Glasgow proposal does identify possible sites and possibly others could emerge at some later date, but from our tour yesterday, it was evident that Ibrox is within close proximity to residential areas. Some seem to be exhibiting signs of stress. We saw a number of boarded-up properties and so on in that area, and possibly the harbour area didn't seem to be too far away from residential areas either, so we'd be interested to hear views on the potential social impact of a situation where the regional casino would be close to residential areas.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Could I couple that question with something that, I think it was the Methodist Church asked in another place. Well, they didn't ask, they gave their view, which is that in a poor area, people are, you know, more likely to find, thinking, well, is there a quick way out of all their problems.

**STEVEN INCH:** ... all Glaswegians and hopefully all coming from Drumchapel. And the file project where we're pioneering a direct intervention with an employer is in Glasgow Harbour Ltd. It's Phase 1 of the Glasgow Harbour project which Euan Jamieson can speak about, where again we've been doing work with young people and construction skills to do things like paving, landscaping. But Stuart, Euan can say a bit more than that.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Well, thank you, Mr. Inch. I'll open the discussion up to others in just a minute, but Mr. Froomberg, you have details about ...

**JAMES FROOMBERG:** Thank you, Chairman, but I suspect the fact that Mr. Jamieson and Mr. McEwan have their cards up means that they wanted to answer the question I was going to ask, which having heard from Mr. Closier about SECC's employment activity and their operator partner, I suspect we're going to hear something similar about both Ibrox and Peel and their operator partners so I'll let them do that for themselves, Mr. Chairman.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thanks. Well, in that case I'll ask Mr. Jamieson from Glasgow Harbour to ...

**EUAN JAMIESON:** Thank you, Chairman. Euan Jamieson, Glasgow Harbour and Peel. From the early stages of Glasgow Harbour, we've embarked on employment and training programmes which initially have been based on landscaping both hard and soft and maintenance thereafter. This has been quite a successful programme targeted locally in partnership with Glasgow City Council at the unemployed, and in a very modest way, in the initial stages, 18 full-time fully trained jobs were created out of that. We're not moving on to subsequent stages of landscaping and more intense construction work within Glasgow Harbour, and we're expanding that programme as we go forward. In relation to the casino in partnership with MGM Morag, we would establish an active recruitment and training programmes including targeted recruitment in areas of high unemployment. This would involve training academies, pre- and post-recruitment training, and would cover a wide range of jobs. Again, this would be achieved in partnership with Glasgow City Council and Scottish Enterprise.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. I think I'll go to the other side. It's Mr. McEwan from Glasgow Rangers.

**SAM McEWAN:** Yes, thank you, Chairman. This issue really gets, is the crux of the issue for us. We feel very, very strongly. We've been involved in, we've been in Govan for well over 100 years and we've witnessed it first-hand, the decline of that particular community, and I'm sure I don't to give anyone on the panel a history lesson as to the extent of that decline, so in spite of it, it's vitally important for us, and right from day one along with Las Vegas Sands, and I really don't want to turn this into a, you know, an advert for the operator. This is Glasgow's day, and we believe that one of the strengths of Glasgow's case that we have areas here that can actually prove the regeneration, but it's vitally important that that regeneration goes to the local people and the local communities. So we've been speaking to Govan Initiative, we've been speaking to local politicians and we have set a target of 30% of people in the travel-to-work area of Govan who would get jobs there. Now, perhaps the cynical would look at that and say, 'Well, how are you going to manage that? It's not exactly a skill that Govan is renowned for,' and I would remind the panel that, you know, less than 100 years ago, the term 'Clyde-built' was synonymous with quality, long before we knew what quality circles were or six sigma measurements, and that 'Clyde-built' term came on the back of the pride that people had for the jobs that they did, the pride in themselves that grew from that. And what we would do is working along with local colleges, and Las Vegas Sands, is take the actual job specs, the job specifications of the jobs which will be on offer within the casino and the leisure centre, we will work with the Govan Initiative people and with the local colleges. We will establish courses hopefully to SVQ, which would be a vocational qualification, that those successful on the courses would come out with a certificate that say that they understood what the job was going to be, they understood the skills that would be required, and we would also add a degree of social

training into that to deal with the issues such as interviewing. We've got a lot of people in, and I'm sure you know this, Chairman, in our deprived communities who really feel that life's passing them by, that they really don't have the opportunity, the opportunity is not for them, and that's why I'm sorry if I'm being passionate, well, I'm not sorry if I'm being passionate about this, but we are very, very passionate about this. We have to, it's not just jobs we offer people. This is not about giving people a uniform and telling them to turn up at a certain time. This is to give people real hope, real opportunity, a real sense of responsibility. It's about empowering people, it's about giving them a skill, and Mike touched on it earlier, and I was glad that he did, that if we brought some people over from America to speak to some Scottish parliamentarians some time ago, and before we did that I was talking about what they did, and let me share an anecdotal story with you in fact if I may. We apologise to people who have heard this before. I asked a young lady what she did and she told me that she was a beverage seller, and I said to her rather naively, 'Does that therefore mean that you're a waitress?' and she said, 'Well, no, let me tell you what it means,' and what she's trained to do is, yes, she will sell beverages, and I stress beverages, not just alcoholic drinks, it can be whatever the customer wants, but she's trained to recognise the first signs that perhaps someone is over-imbibing, just a little bit, and she has the power, she is empowered to say to her manager, 'Mr. McEwan is, I think it's time we invited him over to have a coffee and take him away from the gamings,' and there is no debate about that. She is the sole arbiter of that decision, so she is empowered and she feels responsible. We had a gentleman over who described himself as 'a meeter and greeter' when you arrive, took his responsibilities extremely seriously, knew all about the surrounding area and could advise visitors on what travel attractions to go to. That's just not a job, that's empowering people, it's giving them hope, it's giving them opportunity, and what we want to do is to make sure that the people who come and work at our facility, who have a skill that they can feel that they don't have to stay there, they can take it anywhere in the world, so they will be empowered by the financial gain that they have, they will be empowered hopefully by the sense of confidence and the sense of opportunity that will be presented to them. They can move to a different geography sphere of the world with the skills that they have. They can perhaps take an entrepreneurial view and say, 'There's a job share that needs to be done, I could perhaps think about setting up a company to do that.' That's not a forlorn hope. If you look at the history of Scotland, you will find that that's how small medium-sized companies and larger companies do. Rangers are owned by a man who is actually a wealthy man, but a man who employs over 3½ thousand people. He started by selling shirts in the school playground when he was 13, and we all know stories like that, so it's about instilling a sense of, it's not just a job, I repeat myself, it's about instilling a sense of citizenship into people, empowering them, leading them on to a different way of life, and economically viable, perhaps they'll think about their life-style, perhaps if we can, well, we will provide facilities to allow people to enjoy a healthier life-style should they choose to do so, and we'll link that up with the rest of the initiatives throughout the city. So the economic gain is also a social gain. The two of them are linked.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you very much, Mr. McEwan. It's Mr. Patrick from Scottish Enterprise please.

**STUART PATRICK:** Yes, good morning, Chair. Just really to add a few thoughts to Mr. Inch's comments earlier. First of all to comment on importance that Scottish Enterprise places on the construction skills. A couple of years ago, Scottish Enterprise approved a funding round of £25 million towards a 5-10 year, depending on the demands, programme of support for enhanced skills availability for people in Scotland, predominantly in the West of Scotland where there were issues about skills shortages. One of the side benefits of regeneration as you're making an issue of today is all the employment opportunities that arise out of the construction associated with that, and because of the sheer scale of the construction opportunities, whether it be in housing or schools or motorway development or other transport mechanisms, or indeed a lot of the projects along the Clyde waterfront, it was becoming apparent that we were running short of folks to do the jobs for construction companies, and so we set aside £25 million from our budgets to handle that with additional programmes partially to provide support through the National Training Programmes that we have here, and also to enhance the capabilities of the industry to handle increases in the level

of training, so there's some institutional elements to this. We've set up a Scottish Construction Forum which the industry lead, which the industry set the standards for the training, and we push the levels as high as we can. I'd also just like to add to the point that's been made about the local development companies, just to emphasise the point that the local development companies provide a framework that's usable right across the city, that there is a local development company in every area of the city, and that the ones along the riverside are just as capable as the local development company that was highlighted in Easterhouse, and particularly in the Govan area, I would emphasise that we've already had some experience of this specific key in development of the Glasgow Sign Centre and the BBC Building, again in making the linkages in construction jobs to locals. It's those local development companies that do much of the groundwork to make the connection between local people and the jobs. Whilst we in Scottish Enterprise might help set up the framework so we might provide some of the funding for this, local development companies are the ones that really do the hard work on the ground, and it's worth remembering that many of those local development companies have now been on the ground for nigh on 20 years, so they have considerable experience in the task.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. Yes, I'll hear Mr. Rolwegan in a minute. Before that, I'll ask Miss Sawers, have I pronounced your name properly?

**LESLEY SAWERS:** Thank you. It's Lesley Sawers from Scottish Enterprise Chamber of Commerce.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you.

**LESLEY SAWERS:** I really just wanted to emphasise the point that Mr. McEwan has made, that within Glasgow we actually have a very strong track record of private sector engagement, and very much a partnership and keen Glasgow approach that we have the private sector engaged at a whole host of levels, show the welfare to work through the employer's correlation, that we're creating real sustainable jobs, that not only add to the economy and grow the city but as Sam has actually remarked, actually are transforming and changing people's lives. But it's not only in terms of jobs in the private sector. We're also working with the schools. Just last week we had the launch of the New Vocational Strategy For The City. We had 50 business sign up to work with the council to actually get engaged in training people, young kids who are third and fourth generation families of worklessness, to actually give them the sort of skills, the life skills that hopefully will change their futures and their families' future. So I think certainly in terms of the private sector, I think in all the projects and programmes that both Scottish Enterprise and the city council have outlined, we're very heavily and actively involved.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. Mr. Rolwegan.

**KEN ROLWEGAN:** I think actually Mary Paris was looking for speaking before myself, so ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Well, I was looking for Councillor Paris to raise her name-plate and if she hadn't, I was going to ask her, so have you decided which of you wishes to speak first?

**KEN ROLWEGAN:** OK, I'll go first. Thank you. I would like to pay tribute to Glasgow City Council and all who have been involved in the regeneration of the city. I've lived in the West End of the city for 36 years, and the transformation has been absolutely wonderful. Glasgow as the City of Culture has been put on the map, and the facilities for both culture and leisure are second to none in this city now. This has paid off, as we read in last weeks' Glaswegian newspaper, Steven Purcell backed by Scottish Enterprise say that jobs growth, a major economic indicator, is booming in Glasgow, 8,000 jobs created in the last year alone, this swelling the employment figures to 404,000 in the city. Finance and business services have been in the area of largest growth, and Glasgow's growth stands at 8.1% where London has fallen to 2.6%. I represent a congregation in the parish which the SEC is part of our parish. This area has transformed. I was a student here in

Glasgow in the 50's. This area was total deprivation. If you can remember back to Anderson of the 50's, anybody here will know what it was like. It's completely transformed. This area now has up-market housing, one-third of the residents in this particular area are young professionals with good salaries in the region of 40,000 a year, owning or purchasing houses at the cost of £180,000 a year. The other third of this area is students. In the street where our church is, there are four student halls of residence with over 800 students living in them, and the remaining third are elderly, original Glasgow people with a smattering of ethnic minorities. The unemployment area of this particular parish done by a profile from a local supermarket, shows that the unemployment area in the immediate area is only 4.5%, much less than in the greater area of Glasgow. To say we need a casino to help to regenerate this area, I feel we've had so much said today by the council about the developments, this is not going to add one jot or one tittle to that development, we don't believe. The short-term construction stage may produce a lot of workers, some people have tried to tell us, whereas the unemployment benefits of the employment benefits of a casino when it's finally built I reckon are minimal, and there will be low wage rates. They might get a lovely uniform but they won't get a big wage, and it's very unsociable hours which on top of the problems which affect social gambling, the actual employment will cause social problems to the families employed in the unsocial hours as well, so our congregation are totally opposed to the need for a casino in this area. Where has the investment come from? It's muted that it might have come from the United States, or some of it may come from the United States, so where will the profits go? To lining the pockets of people outside our city. I am sure that even the taxes which are regenerated are a tax on the poor. Thank you, sir.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. Councillor Paris, we've read your statement. Is there anything particularly on the material you've heard so far, particularly about the training programmes and the local employment aspects you wish to challenge? I'd like to hear from you on all sorts of subjects later on, but on this one particularly, if you please.

**MARY PARIS:** Yes. There's certainly a question I would like to ask about that, if I may, and what Ken has said leads nicely into it. Now, my impression from looking at recruitment websites for the casino industry is that there's a great proportion of the jobs that are indeed low-paid, low-skilled, and although they may get training, it's of a very basic nature. This is not to despise these jobs as potential entry jobs which can lead someone back from worklessness to other things, but it's that avenue I would like to explore. One of my own children has worked for a number of years as bar staff and he left in the end because although he also was trained to recognise a drunk when he saw one, it still remained a low-paid job with anti-social hours, so he then moved on to other things. My question would be about what proportion of the anticipated jobs are higher skilled and higher paid with a higher level of training in perhaps IT, you mentioned accountancy, in management, that kind of thing. And the second part to that would be what roots might be put in place for the ambitious person coming back into work in such an organisation to be encouraged to take far more than the kind of basic troubleshooting training that any responsible body would give to its staff to deal with immediate situations, but how much would they be encouraged actually to progress in what they're doing up to these higher level jobs, and what likelihood would there be that there would be opportunities there.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. Well, there are two questions there. Who wants to answer them? Mr. Closier.

**MIKE CLOSIER:** Thank you. Thank you, Chair. I don't want to bore anybody with too many figures but just answering your point directly ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** There were two questions there of course.

**MIKE CLOSIER:** There are two questions and ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** And you're answering which one?

**MIKE CLOSIER:** I'll answer the one about the mix of skills first.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes.

**MIKE CLOSIER:** And then if I may I want to touch on the unsocial hours.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes.

**MIKE CLOSIER:** On the mix of skills, there are obviously more at the entry level than at the top. It's a pyramid, and the estimate that we put on is 65% of the workforce will not need any entry qualifications, and that leads up to the top of the pyramid, where 18 people with degrees, but these are in between our majority with 300+ people which will have skills training and management training. I'll lead that on to the unsocial hours question. Yes, it is anticipated that a regional casino will be open 24 hours a day, and typically that gives you three shifts, so you've got three different teams, all with management, all with their skills, coming together. As part of preparation I have spoken to a number of councillors, a number of MSP's and a number of M.P.'s of all persuasions, and one in particular sticks in my mind, and I think answers this question. I was actually following a surgery of a particular MSP, when he was interviewing a young lady, finished and we started discussing the casinos, and he said, 'Well, some people would say working round the clock is unsocial. However, for that particular lady, she has a young child, has a steady partner. Only one of them is economically active because the other one's looking after the bairn.' Now, if it was job opportunities, for shift-work, for the individual, they don't have to come at a particular hour, the shifts can be inter-related to meet personal circumstances, then you can get two economically active people whilst still giving good childcare themselves. That then increases the family income perhaps to a stage where they can have professional childcare and both be full-time economically active. The flexibilities of the shift system is such that you don't have everybody leaving at the same time, clocking off like a, you know, as it used to be in the shipyards and then everybody came back again. It's a rolling pattern, and it does meet quite a few people's needs, rather than just saying it's anti-social. For some people it's a very social way of working.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes. You seem to be painting a picture of one parent goes out and the other one comes in. The child sees both during the day but they don't see each other.

**MIKE CLOSIER:** Yes, but not all shifts are, you know, there is still the equivalent of weekends. That may not actually be Saturday and Sunday because of the rolling nature.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Presumably weekends are the busiest time in a casino.

**MIKE CLOSIER:** Sundays and Saturdays tend to be, yes.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes, I see. So they have days off during the week.

**MIKE CLOSIER:** Yes. People query the number of jobs that are going to be created for casinos. We started off talking about that. The number is large because you do have a complete three teams in there. Those teams are not fixed in terms of, 'Here is your team leader, you will do this particular time, and then everybody leaves.' The hours are set to meet the individual's requirements as well as the job requirements, and it's, you know, taken into account that some people will have children, some people will not, that there's a great deal of flexibility that you can get, given that you've got three shifts to cover.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. Councillor Paris, do you want to just respond before I go on?

**MARY PARISH:** Just to come back and say that one of the main reasons that my son left his bar job was because he was getting married and he thought it would be nice if he occasionally saw his wife and their mutual friends, but I may say, I've also worked in Adult Education for most of my life and I have in fact at one stage taught a croupier who was the most lovely lady and was studying all the hours God had given her in order to move on to something that gave her a bit more in the way of hope and satisfaction, and that just brings me to the point that I haven't yet had a response to my point about training and progression.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thanks. Yes, I do wonder sometimes what my students get up to when they fall asleep in my lectures, but perhaps that might be me, I don't know. Mr. McEwan.

**SAM McEWAN:** Thank you, Chairman. I think first of all I'm sure that Councillor Paris is using the licence that politicians think they have to twist people's thoughts when she talks about being trained to recognise a drunk. I don't believe I said that. In fact I didn't say that. What I said was that the young lady in question that I'd referred to was trained to a level that recognised people long before they got to that stage, so I think it's important that we understand what we're, we're talking about proper training here. I think it's wonderful that those of us who are in employment and have been born and brought up and still live in an industrial area not too far from here, which has been decimated by the decimation of traditional industries, I think it's wonderful when I hear people talk about opportunities when we're all got jobs. I worked for 25 years in the electronics industry, most of it funded by American investment. 250,000 people in Scotland had jobs because of American investment. There is nothing the matter with investment. The secret is to capitalise that investment and grow your indigenous industries on the back of it, and I wouldn't seek to teach or bore you about economics, but there isn't, I repeat, if we can grow indigenous industries on the back of inward investment, we will have a long-term sustainable industry here. Now, in terms of wages, they're not low-paid jobs. The jobs will be well-paid, and I'm not going to go into details, because I don't have them, but I'm happy to supply them. I'm happy to supply ongoing training programmes, I'm happy to meet with Councillor Parish or anyone else to detail exactly what Las Vegas Sands programmes are like, how it is ongoing. You can start at the bottom, you can work your way up. Some people, you know, don't want to work their way up. Some people are perfectly happy to come in and do a job and take a pride in it. Others are ambitious and want to work. We can show you both types of people like that. Finally on hours, we work in a, you know, I'm absolutely amazed that people who should be knowing more about economic regeneration, we live in a global market-place now, you know. We have call centres who work 24 hours a day. We have IT people who work 24 hours a day. We have hotel staff who have always had to work 24 hours a day. Shift patterns, that's ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** I guess that the Chief Superintendent at one time worked shifts, keeping an eye on everybody in the night.

**SAM McEWAN:** I can't remember the last time I had the advantage of having a 9-5 job.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** What I would like to do is a point that I don't want just to disappear, and that is the fact that any overseas investment may bring benefits, but I mean, it does take money out of the country in terms of remitted profits.

**SAM McEWAN:** Of course it does.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** I mean, you know, it's, I mean, what have we got to say to that point?

**SAM McEWAN:** Yes, of course it does, and that money will be, the profits will be made on the back of investment, and part of that investment will be in the people who work there, the salaries they are paid, the jobs they get both directly and indirectly, the taxes that they pay, the quality of life it affords them, the fact that they can link into, have a more social life than they have just now,

the fact that they have a future, the fact that they will be bringing information and technology, transfer as we would call it in the electronics industry, bringing skills to you that are transferable, that people can pick up on, raising standards. I don't know anyone who's ever been to America on holiday that doesn't come back and rave about the quality of standards, the quality of service that they get in the American service industries, in restaurants, in casinos, and everywhere, in shops, everywhere else, it will raise the bar for our own indigenous industry to try to strive for. So this idea that inward investment is some kind of devil's child is fatally flawed. We can learn a lot from it, we have learned a lot from it, in our industrial base, and we can learn a lot from it in the service industries, and I'm happy to share those lessons with the councillor, if she chooses to take me up on the offer.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. Did you want to say something again, Mr. Patrick?

**STUART PATRICK:** Yes. It was just really to add to the point that Sam's was making and your question about inward investment and the remitting of profits. I think from an economic development perspective, the most important measure for us in terms of long-term wealth and prosperity is the gross value added created by any investment, and if you look at the gross value added calculations for virtually every investment, 70-80% of that gross value added is going to stay in the country because it goes on wages and salaries, and perhaps 10% at most will go in profits. That is the core reason why we are just as interested in inward investment as we are in indigenous development of industry. Of course indigenous development of industry is more important to us because it encourages longer term development, but nonetheless the sheer benefit of such a high proportion of GVA from inward investment is not something to be ignored.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. Councillor Stevens.

**STEVEN PURCELL:** Could I briefly with your permission just comment on two issues, the unsociable hours and although Stuart Patrick has said more of what I wanted to say about inward investment, if I could just give this a political perspective from the city's administration on that. First of all, we have very deliberately reinvented ourselves as an international city, as a must-see destination, as a tourist destination, so a significant part of our city's economic success has been around the growth of the service sector, and that means we do need a flexible workforce in the city, that people have to be flexible over the hours they work. We are a 24-hour city and we want to remain so, and many investors, not just in the tourist sector but for example in the financial services sector, tell me that one of the attractions when they consider Glasgow as a location is the flexibility of the workforce that we have in the city, so it is an important part of our economic success that we can't ignore. Unless we decide we want to maybe make a reference to the wider economic vision, unless we decide we want to put all our economic eggs in one basket, and we don't, we want a diverse economy with diverse sectors, so that we hope to have a sustainable economic success and not repeat the mistakes of the past when our economy was mainly solely based on industrial work. Inward investment is incredibly important to the city, wherever it comes from. At the moment we are averaging 3,000 jobs a year through inward investment from abroad, and I think Mr. Patrick has dealt ably with what the city and what our regional economy and the British economy gets from that.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you very much. Mr. Sagar wants to ask a question I believe.

**DEEP SAGAR:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Could I ask the council, if you look at the five casinos that have been operating here, would you know what share of employment that they have created has gone to local and disadvantaged people? Thank you.

**STEVEN PURCELL:** No, we don't have that information, I'm sure we could get it, but I don't have it with me at the moment.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Shall we ask them to send it in later? Would you please send it in later? Now, there's a little formality that has to be observed in fairness to all. Would you please, when you send it to Miss Curtis, our secretary, would you be kind enough to send it also to all other participants today, and that's so that they can, if they wish, comment upon it, and that's a formality for fairness. You know, if there's anything else that anybody volunteers today, I think the same applies please. Mr. Froomberg.

**JAMES FROOMBERG:** Mr. Sagar's question made me think of another related one which is clearly we've got the sort of passionate interest of at least three of the four proposers, site proposers with us here today. Have you explored with the operators of the existing 1968 Act (Casinos) their attitude towards the potential for a regional casino here in Glasgow?

**MAN:** It's addressed to the casino operator.

**JAMES FROOMBERG:** Well, I guess it was sort of addressed to the council, but if anybody else wanted to answer it, I'd be delighted to hear a view, one way or the other.

**MAN:** Yes, someone must answer it please, 'cos we want to know.

**STEVEN PURCELL:** Could you maybe summarise the question and I'll focus in on the answer.

**JAMES FROOMBERG:** Is that a polite way of saying you were busy with your papers? What do the existing casino operators think of the proposal to have a regional casino in Glasgow?

**STEVEN PURCELL:** I've met with the Stanley Leisure Group and they're really enquiring as to what the council's approach would be. I've had no adverse reaction to the proposal at all. I wonder if the Chamber of Commerce who have consulted widely with the business community ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes, please, Ms Sawers.

**LESLEY SAWERS:** We have I think it's probably two or three, again we can check that and confirm of the other operators who are members, and something like 77% of businesses actually supported the super casino, so we have consulted quite widely and we've received no objections from any of the operators. Indeed we've had a number of other operators applying for smaller casino licences in the city centre, so I actually think most businesses in the city see it as an opportunity for them to grow their businesses on the back of a super casino.

**JAMES FROOMBERG:** What sort of businesses were the 23%?

**LESLEY SAWERS:** I think they were actually non-respondents.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Mr. Sagar.

**DEEP SAGAR:** Could I ask two things, Mr. Chairman. First, this survey Ms. Sawyer's mentioned, how many people actually responded positively, the number, because I suppose this was a sample that responded, if you wouldn't mind saying.

**LESLEY SAWERS:** We have 1600 members, a circular was sent out to the, this is just actually the quantitative work, we've actually done a lot of qualitative work but we sent our 1600 members and had a 30% response rate. Again we can get that information, but separately from that, we've also had presentations from the three operators here today to some 50 or 60 members. We've actually had presentations to each of our five Issues and Policy Groups with about 10 members represented each from infrastructure, small business, skills and training, and we also presented to the Scottish Council of Scottish Chambers, which represents 9,000 members, 19 chambers across Scotland and all are very positive in terms of the economic benefits the casino will bring to

Scotland. So we have consulted very widely. 85% of the members of Glasgow Chamber are small businesses employing less than 10 people, so we don't just have the large corporates. We've actually got a large number of small businesses who see this as a positive contribution to the city.

**DEEP SAGAR:** Thank you. If I could go back to this issue of the present casinos, please. Somebody might just say this is an over-casino'd city, five casinos for a 500,000 population, per head of population. There is no comparison in Britain. How would you respond to that?

**STEVEN PURCELL:** Can I maybe give you a figure first which might help your previous answer, your previous question, or figure. This is not for casinos but for all gambling in Glasgow in 2003, there were 2,736 people actually employed on a premises. That'd be everything from a bingo hall through to a bookmaker or whatever. That gives you some context for the figures we quote in terms of employment in the new casino. In terms of your second question, I think the point we tried to make in the submission is that we're actually trying to create something that is not simply a casino, and that's one of the reasons we didn't apply for the licence for a small or large casino. I think, let me make it quite clear, the submission we're trying to attract a major international leisure facility which will be quite different to the sort of casinos which have been here in the past. They now operate of course in a deregulated environment where you can simply walk in off the street and play. We're trying to create a facility which is something you must go to, it must be a conscious decision to go to that, and the casino would be part of a much larger leisure offering with hotels, potentially ten-pin bowling or bingo or restaurants, bars, conference facility, maybe a performance venue, so we see this as quite a different product catering for quite a different market.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you.

**KEN ROLWEGAN:** Mr. Chairman.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Mr. Rolwegan.

**KEN ROLWEGAN:** We're asked to discuss the social impact today and therefore I think it's important that the city council tell us just what the social impact currently is with the five casinos that we have in the city of Glasgow. Surely if they're addressing the social impact of a new, large casino, they must have looked at the original social impact as it stands today.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. I'll leave that just for a moment, if you don't mind, because I want to get into more general questions. Mr. Mundy.

**NEIL MUNDY:** Chairman, we've had some really, really helpful information on the training programmes from the developers and from the city council. I'd just like to round one or two things off by asking for clarification on £5.4 million of funding that you mention in your submission, which is designed to address these employment initiatives. Could you tell me a little bit about how that's actually been allocated. And the second point is to try and identify where those initiatives are aligning with the Draft Community Plan which appears to have some sort of excellent principles in it. I'd just like to see how that comes together as a sort of cohesive strategy backed up by an investment action plan.

**MAN:** Maybe I'll pick up a first couple of points on that. I think it's worth noting that 5.4 million is only the sums of money that are going through the community planning structures in the city. Add to that the National Training Programmes funding that would come from Scottish Enterprise, and both of those routes going through your local development companies, so all this money has gone to each of the different local development companies to set up training programmes that will suit the particular circumstances of the economy within which they operate. Underlying that is the principles of the community plan which is if you look at the two major objectives of the community plan, and worklessness is one of those, and so consequence it's absolutely smack in the middle of the major objective of the community plan. I know that Councillor Purcell can say a great deal

more about how the community plan is structured and how that works for the city, but it was really just to set that in context for you.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. Councillor Paris.

**MARY PARIS:** May I return to a point that was made which links to what's been said. It was made back at the start of this session. Steve Inch talked about the tests that would be applied to gauge the social and economic effects of building a super casino, and he mentioned testing the proportion of low income groups that participated in gambling, and how well prevention and mitigation strategies could help to prevent social problems. Could I clarify whether these kind of tests and kind of assessments would be carried out as soon if you like as Glasgow knew that their bid had been accepted, and if the results of these tests were negative, what would they do then? Or is Glasgow in a sense to be used as a guinea-pig. You build the super casino and then see what happens.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Well, I think these are questions for government, but I can answer to the extent of my knowledge, which frankly is, I don't know. Guinea-pig. Guinea-pigs have an unfortunate record in being the tests for everything. I mean, all I can say is that I'm aware that government in UK parliament has, you know, said that they want to go cautiously and put a foot in the water first. I'm not sure whether that was an expression used, was it? Do you remember? Something like that anyway. Beyond that I think that is a question for UK government.

**MAN:** Off mike.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes, I mean, I can see that if you, you know, you really think that casinos were a very bad thing, then you wouldn't want your city to be the testing place.

**MARY PARIS:** No, that is not exactly my point. I'm really wanting to know how soon the council intend to start.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** I don't know and to be frank I don't know whether government knows either. I mean, clearly one tends to think of social surveys and so on, but I think an answer's coming from across the table.

**MAN:** It might not be a full answer but certainly part of an answer. One of the things that we do see in the bid document, and I touched on earlier, was the work we are doing on debt profiling. We've developed our own software package which is now being implemented by all of the advice agencies in the city, 27 of them. We've been up and running on a test basis since December, and what we found with the people coming into the system, that the number whose debt problem is related to gambling is something like 0.73% of everybody on the database, so that system is now up and running, so as we move from here on towards the establishment of the casino, we will be able to track how that figure is changing. The system is there to run that, that's specifically what it was set up to do.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Is that the answer to Mr. Rolwegan's point or are you going to cover that further?

**MAN:** I'll cover that.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Please do.

**MAN:** If I can maybe just address the Community Regeneration Fund ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Before I forget it.

**MAN:** ... about the question, just before I do that. The £5.4 million pounds which was referred to as Community Regeneration Fund money, that was allocated specifically for projects dealing with worklessness and employability, and it was allocated through a competitor bidding process, so organisations who wanted to share the resources had basically to submit a proposal which showed a certain degree of innovation, because what we are keen to do in Glasgow is really go for local solutions to local issues, so we were encouraging organisations to be innovative, to move away from the standard batch of training programmes, and crucially that money was to implement the community plan, so there's a direct relationship between that £5.4 million of additional resources and the community plan.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** And that's able to be focused on, if you were successful, on the regional casino.

**MAN:** The money is flexible enough to move it to any particular programme we would want to apply it to.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** So that would be available.

**MAN:** Yes. It would be available.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes. Thank you. Mr. Sagar, you did actually, when we were just wondering what we were going to ask, you were concerned about the amount of consultation. Was that what you wanted to ask about now? Yes please.

**DEEP SAGAR:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Could you talk a bit about the consultation procedures adopted with the public in Glasgow and around, and would you have a rough assessment of how many people really are in support of this proposal. Thank you.

**MAN:** It deals specifically with public consultation. In March of this year we commissioned Communicate Research to undertake a survey of 1000 people across Glasgow, and the results of that survey informed us that 88% thought that gambling as a principle was acceptable, 58% had heard about the regional casino proposal, 65% supported the development, and 90% thought it would create additional jobs in the city.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Do we have these figures already, otherwise I'll ask you to repeat them.

**MAN:** They're in the bid document, I believe, yes.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you.

**MAN:** In addition, the Chamber of Commerce has, as Lesley Sawers as indicated, has conducted significant research amongst the business community. We were particularly supportive of that consultation because of the large number of small businesses that are members of the Chamber of Commerce. We've had three major debates within the city council, obviously cross-party in the city council, and we also had the consultation element of the planning application for the Ibrox proposal taking place earlier, and given the direct location of the Ibrox proposal, I think it's significant that there was only five objections.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Who's the owner of this paper? Thanks very much for giving me something to read over lunchtime. I don't know that everybody in the room would agree with what you say but I do hope it gets widely read. But enough of that, let's get on. Was there anything more we've had expressly about social issues, before we go on? OK. Let's get on to regeneration. I know a lot of you have been wanting to do that for some time. Need for regeneration, probability of implementation and securing of regeneration benefits. Have we heard enough about how the plans fit in with regeneration plans for the Clyde waterside? Does anyone want to tell us anything more on this subject? Mr. Inch.

**STEVEN INCH:** Yes, Chair. I'm taking over from Councillor Purcell who's our lead person, for the afternoon. He's obviously away on council business. Just to emphasise I think the points that were made before lunch, that the Glasgow and Clyde Valley Plan sets the strategic framework. That framework is set in turn for it by the Scottish Executive's policies on regeneration, and particularly the regeneration statement which came out earlier this year. That statement was subject ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** I'm having trouble with hearing you, I'm afraid, and possibly people are having trouble hearing me, because I did have a lapel mike which I gave away at lunchtime and I haven't got it back. Mr. Inch.

**STEVEN INCH:** I'll try again. Just to emphasise the policy framework's in place in the West of Scotland. It starts off with the Scottish Executive's Regeneration Statement. That Statement made it quite clear that the national strategic area regeneration priority was the river corridor and a project called Clyde Gateway which is effectively the river corridor moving into the East End of Glasgow. That built on some of the early success which had been made really as a result of a Scottish Executive ministerial intervention 4 or 5 years ago, Wendy Alexander who at that time was a Minister for Enterprise instructed, or requested Scottish Enterprise to start preparing a regeneration framework for the River Clyde in recognition of the scale of economic benefit and regeneration benefit that might come from that. That theme has been taken on through the structure plan as we heard from Dr. Buchan, and then in turn taken on by the Glasgow City Plan, Glasgow Economic Strategy, and the Tourism Action Plan, so all of these documents nest within each other. The reality of course is that these strategies are only sets of words. It's actions that actually determine whether a strategy is producing the goods, and there are a number of people round the table today who are involved in actually implementing regeneration projects and can give some substance to the strategy and how that's unfolding. What we've got in the city is a river front which is now proceeding in a wide range of fronts. The Glasgow Harbour Project which Mr. Jamieson is involved with is probably the biggest and certainly the furthest advanced in terms of the regeneration coming from it. The SEC Campus Project which Mr. Closier is involved in again is now starting to generate a huge amount of momentum. Further into the river, the financial services district is halfway through its life and exactly half way on-line to meet its targets, so the big regeneration projects are all coming to the fore, and I think as we said earlier this morning, we see the regional casino development as a major component of the next stage of the River Regeneration Project. We've done very well on business space, we've done very well on generating hotel development within the city, and we now see the need for a major leisure and tourism destination type facility to add to the momentum and to add to Glasgow's package of attractions.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. Mr. Collison, you were concerned about whether there was a critical mass in the Clyde that enable all these benefits, as it were, to multiply, weren't you?

**CHRIS COLLISION:** Well, it's just that that phrase was used, Chairman, in the documentation that we'd been provided for, and I suppose really it was just a question as to, you know, at what point is the critical mass reached. Is that measured in terms of, you know, the number of visitors or whatever.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes, Mr. Patrick, isn't it.

**STUART PATRICK:** Yes, Chairman. I'll just make a couple of remarks on this from a Scottish Enterprise perspective. I think worth saying that in the Regeneration Statement, that Scottish Enterprise was tasked with the role as a strategic leader for implementing the Clyde waterfront, so from our perspective, the issue about critical mass and ultimately I think it would be a question of the extent to which the investment has been proposed, and we're talking in terms of 2 billion pounds worth of investment from both public and private sources, the extent to which that has been firmly committed and implemented, and I would have said by now you can feel fairly confident that virtually all of the proposals that have been outlined in the Clyde waterfront's overall strategic plan are either on the ground in implementation or very well advanced in their planning. So I would have said critical mass was already achieved.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** One thing that we do need to explore, I think, following on the Hall Aitken research is actually the numbers of jobs involved. We got them in the original submission. I'd just like to follow them through. Can you just remind me how many jobs you were expecting from this and how you came about it.

**MR HURST:** Thank you, Chair. You mentioned the word research so I'll just say a little bit about what we did to derive these figures before I go through them in detail.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** So that's Mr ...

**MR HURST:** Hurst, public policy consultants. I directed the study looking at the whole impact of this particular casino facility, or the range of casino facilities here. In terms of drawing together the information available, we obviously made a broad assumption about what kind of facility would be involved. There is no one specific plan, or there wasn't at the stage that we started this study, and so there are some certain features of the potential for a regional casino which go beyond just the gaming floor, in terms of a hotel, flexible meeting/conference space and other facilities. In terms of the research we then undertook, we spoke with all the operators that were considering the four sites in Glasgow, spoke extensively with tourism and marketing partners in Glasgow about their views on the market-place, particularly round the conference and elsewhere, and we were very pleased to get a lot of co-operation from the operators, in fact two of them gave us their business plans. We were able to use these alongside other things. However, we are subject to a non-disclosure agreement so I can't tell you about the details. Suffice to say, we were quite surprised to how close they were in their estimates of what would be created in terms of employment within and around the facilities. There's a very close relationship between the number of machines and the number of gaming tables, and the number of people that are employed in a casino. So in terms of putting together an assessment of this process, we were able to use their head-count figures, the understanding of the wage rates that they were likely to apply. They had also provided us with information on the supplies that they were likely to purchase at every level. That gives you most of the key elements in understanding the economic effect of the programme, so what's the level of investment, how much will people put into the conscription of this operation, how many jobs will they create, and then how many indirect jobs will they create through purchases in the operations of their business. We had a lot of precise detail there. We were able to average it out, compare it to other figures. We contrasted that with some of the information on Glasgow's tourist market, made a number of assumptions and created three scenarios. The one that's presented in the bid is the intermediate scenario, it's not the high level one, it's not the base one. Essentially what we assumed was that there would be a small 1% increase in new tourism visits to Glasgow, and that between 2½ and 5% of those who already either visit Scotland or Glasgow would either add a day or divert a day to spend in the casino.

**MAN:** Could I just clarify something there. You said you assumed a 1% increase in visits to Glasgow. When we talked earlier, I was talking with Mr. Taylor, he said that 600,000 visits to the area was an output of the study. Is it an input assumption or is it an output of the work?

**MR HURST:** No, it's an output of the work. The 1% increase is an input. There were 600,000 additional visits and that's the combination of people moving from visiting Scotland and/or Glasgow, spending an extra day or spending a day in the casino, and new trips generated to Scotland.

**MAN:** How many existing tourists are there to Glasgow?

**MR HURST:** This year? Based on the 2003 latest figures provided by IPS, International Passenger Survey, there were 3.4 million tourists to Glasgow.

**MAN:** International.

**MR HURST:** National and international. International is just over 400,000. What I would point out is that the International Passenger Survey figures did not include the arrivals to Glasgow Prestwick International. There are 2 millions arrivals at that airport, of which one million are bound for Glasgow.

**MAN:** I'm just trying to square if you didn't put a 1% increase on 3.4 million, 34,000, how you get an output of 600,000.

**MR HURST:** Because there are two stages to this, there are people already coming to Scotland who will stay longer. That is where more overnight stays come from than new trips completely newly generated. Of those, we estimated only 16,000 would be newly generated from external sources. There are two things here, people who already visit Glasgow, it's a very important part of the offer for the destination casino. There's something to build on here, where people will divert the trip to Scotland and spend more time in Glasgow because they're attracted by a casino, or they may be visiting Scotland for other business reasons such as the conference market which has increased by 200% since '97. So it's the two combinations. You can't just have one or the other.

**MAN:** I'm sorry, I'm being a bit thick, I'm still not with this. 600,000 extra visitors to the area is what Mr. Taylor told us earlier, which sounds like nigh on a 20% increase in visitor numbers and that's fairly significant. Is that or is that not an impact you expect from a hotel/casino.

**MR HURST:** We expect 600,000 extra visits.

**MAN:** Visits, OK.

**MR HURST:** Now actually in our assumptions on the intermediate case, we only assumed that outside of Scottish residents, no-one would visit the casino more than once in a year. That's an important dimension. It's not just how many people in that group but how many times. So these are relatively conservative estimates. We did scan other available sources and other information. We had the gravity models from three of the operators to understand even on their early phase, planning how our estimates worked against theirs. They're well within the range that they gave us, and they compare reasonably to the studies that have been published from other sites. The important thing about why you have to get the demand right and accurate is that that's what drives the additionality. You know, if people spend money in a casino, they will not be spending it somewhere else, or casino development, and the way that we've undertaken that assessment has largely been through the existing parameters about how much people spend in Scotland when they visit here. We've made no changes at all there, and looked at whether they would or would not be diverting from some other activity either in Glasgow, Scotland or in the UK.

**MAN:** But by and large your estimates of additional visitations, spend, retained income, jobs and so on are more conservative than a lot of the others that we've been hearing.

**MR HURST:** Absolutely.

**MAN:** We've been talking to them and will be talking to them about whether theirs are over-inflated, but I suppose the flip side for you is, are you not being too conservative with what you think the potential impact might be.

**MR HURST:** We believe that 2,970 jobs on site and within the facility and induced are fairly accurate. We know 15, 1600 of those come from head-count figures from at least one or two of the operators. We're well within parameters from their business plan, this is not a model of the economy. It's a business plan-based assessment. What we've then done is looked at, well, who's going to play in this casino, who's going to spend money here and where would they get that money from, what would they not spend the money on. That assessment is largely based on, well, would they be coming to Glasgow, would they be coming to Scotland otherwise if there was not a destination casino there. Taking all that into account, and it's quite a detailed assessment, we've estimated displacement at around 66%, so two-thirds of just under 3,000 jobs will displace other jobs in and around the Glasgow economy.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Is this a point on the additionality? Yes. Carry on them please.

**DEEP SAGAR:** Thank you. In quantifying demand for the casino, one method is to make sort of assumptions that you've made. Another could be just asking people, residents in Glasgow and around and visitors and from there one could estimate demand, so I wanted to ask you, would you have considered that method? If not, why? And related to that, if I could ask Mr. Taylor I think in the submission made by the City Marketing Bureau, if I remember right, you say there is a lot of untapped demand for casino gambling, perhaps even 60, 70% if I am not mistaken. Perhaps if you could outline what's the basis for that sort of claim please. Thank you.

**SCOTT TAYLOR:** Certainly we did consider whether or not you could do a survey of potential users of the casino. The big problem there is characterising what that casino might be. I think if anybody here sort of talked about a casino, they think about the small operations that currently exist in the UK. This is a big step change, and the numbers of visitors that the operators are talking about are in the millions, not in the hundreds of thousands to this kind of a destination. It's a huge tourism facility. It's not a small office that quite often is at, you know, the margins of the city centre where you can't get access unless you go back the following day, so the comparability is very difficult to achieve. We certainly scanned what information there was available both here in the UK and internationally and spoke to a number of people, but ultimately it's very difficult to take someone's conception of, 'Well, would you visit this kind of an enterprise if it were based somewhere within Scotland, and if so, how many times would you go, how much would you spend?' You can do that. Experience of doing many of those kinds of operations is that when push comes to shove, you have the difficulties of actually translating those base estimates into real demand, so I would question on both counts whether you can do that.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. I'm looking at Annex C of your additional information, and we've got three possible operators, and three lots of figures.

**MAN:** Before we do that, Chair, could I just pick up on the point that was made by Cambridge Policy Consultants ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes, sure.

**MAN:** ... on displacement. I am comforted that you've done a lot of thinking on how much of the expenditure is just displaced from elsewhere in the Glasgow economy. What I wanted to understand was whether because we're trying to compare Glasgow with other proposers for this regional casino and therefore I'm not looking particularly at the absolute number of jobs created. I'm looking for the structural different economies as to their ability to have minimal displacement or greater additionality than other proposers, and was your 60% displacement, I think it was 60% you said.

**MR HURST:** 66.

**MAN:** 66% displacement, based on quite a sort of thorough understanding of the dynamics of the Glasgow economy or is that a sort of a fairly rounded average of what you would expect of a city that size.

**MR HURST:** It's a combination of two things. Straightforward assessment of whether or not those people would be in Glasgow spending that money anyway. We can take that from the detailed demand analysis that we undertook directly. That is backed by Visit Scotland figures on the spends that are actually undertaken, the duration of trips and all the other factors that go into sort of calculating the expenditure undertaken by people visiting Scotland in a number of ways. The other side of that are the supply, multipliers and linkages. We used out basic assumptions, we always work to Treasury Green book. Our colleagues are involved in designing the Treasury Green book. We don't need to go anywhere else. The multipliers were well within the kind of standards used for the UK at city level and regional level, 1.1 and 1.2 are quite low. A lot of people use higher levels, so we took basic conservative estimates at every stage.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. I just wondered if any of the proposing team can help me out further with this, which is the extent to which Glasgow would have a great degree of additionality. I mean, let's say that the number of employees within the facility itself, that's going to be fairly standard, but it's the extent to which further additional and not displaced jobs arise, and I'm looking to understand about Glasgow that says, yes, it will be stronger or less strong than others, and in sort of words rather than economic theory, if anyone can help me with that.

**MAN:** I'm sure Visit's going to have something to say on that. I think there are a couple of issues there for us. One is, there is an international tourism offer which is already very strong for Scotland and particularly for Glasgow. There are figures from Visit Scotland that show that that is growing year on year. Glasgow's tourism strategy is aiming to draw in higher spend higher value tourists who are attracted by the levels of service that this kind of facility might offer. And it's not just about come to Scotland and visit their casinos, you know, there's heritage, obviously the landscape, and golf. They're all very interesting things that a number of the operators suggested would be a basis on which they could build additional trips to Scotland. It would in effect allow this facility to export more than it might otherwise do. If only local people play, there will be no additional jobs, so the key, my view is to encourage external demand and export more of the service of this facility than you might otherwise do, otherwise you will not create additional jobs.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Let's come back to this Annex C. You've got three operators there, giving rather different results. Did it ever cross your mind to be suspicious of the lot?

**MAN:** No.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** They're so different.

**MAN:** One of the things we did ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** I mean, they can't all be right, can they?

**MAN:** They can't all be right, but then there's variation. I mean, what you're talking about is ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** If all of them can't be right, how do you know that any of them are right?

**MAN:** Well, I'll come to that. Firstly, the subtotal on the first table, the Kerzner Glasgow, I believe these are all taken out of their submissions for the planning, 1,102 jobs, it's not very far away from the MGM Mirage 990 jobs.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Indeed.

**MAN:** And that's, you know, that's what we found in detail, that quite often in terms of the operations, indirect induced net full-time equivalents in the lower table and the tourism jobs, I do not know how they were calculated, I cannot comment on them. In the upper table, they're just headcount figures that would be derived from other facilities in the ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Is it the case that you took the Kerzner because being lower you thought there was less chance of exaggeration or what?

**MAN:** No, 'cos if you take those together and you ensure that, I mean, what I can't tell you is what the net direct FTE's, full-time equivalent jobs of 990, relate to in the lower table.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** No.

**MAN:** I do not know whether the top table is full-time equivalent or whether they're just jobs. You have to translate them into full-time equivalent jobs.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Right.

**MAN:** Otherwise you're not really comparing apples and pears.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Exactly.

**MAN:** So we went through all of these in detail in the information we have, but I don't have that second table, I'm afraid. In general we've seen another analysis that part-time and full-time numbers being merged, and clearly in terms of trying to establish a common base of full-time equivalents, one needs to qualify these things.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Absolutely.

**MAN:** And we did that.

**MAN:** I mean, Chairman, the only really reliable thing that I can go on is the casino I visited myself. Now, plenty of people have said, 'Well, that's not typical.' The fact that it was the second largest in Europe doesn't necessarily make it the typical here because we could be having bigger ones, with more tables and more machines. Is it that you don't think these figures are particularly important?

**MAN:** They're part of the story but they're about a third of the jobs that we would have counted in the total gross of 3,000. We checked out as far as possible, and these are business plan figures, people could be giving us a line about what the scale of this would be, but you know ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** I mean, isn't it your experience, I mean, it's certainly my experience as a planning officer, and I was a real one once, that people come along and ask for

planning permission and you have a little box on the planning application form. It says, 'Number of jobs to be created,' and you get any old numbers put down.

**MAN:** There are two points to that. One is we had the advantage of reading the business plan in detail, not just a box ....

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Right.

**MAN:** ... that had a number in it. So the two things were related, and we have probably more detail than there was here.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Good.

**MAN:** And the second one is, we checked out a number of sources. There's a University in Nevada that has a department looking into gaming, and you can download from their websites spreadsheet sheets that will tell you any game and the number of people you would need to play that game and what the full-time equivalent jobs are related to that, so we did that and checked it out, and it's broadly similar.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** With the curves and the figure.

**MAN:** No, the curves and the figure not far away from the MGM Mirage. The only difference I can see, they looked to account for two different things.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Hold on, there's 500 difference between them.

**MAN:** Yes, but only in aggregate. I mean, what, they're adding up two different things. The Kerzner figures are just, you know, 1200 jobs in the operation of a facility. MGM Mirage looks like 990. The other jobs induced direct are probably generated by supply jobs, so the purchases made by that operation will generate jobs in the Scottish and Glasgow economy, and the tourism-related jobs relate to, you know, induced tourism, extra tourism.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** So you'd say that the 1100 and the 990, those are the two you'd put together.

**MAN:** I think they're very similar, yes.

**MIKE CLOSIER:** Chairman, if I could give some clarification to the Kerzner figures, it may help you.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes, Mr. Closier.

**MIKE CLOSIER:** We obtained these figures from Kerzner during our bid process way back in 2001-2003, before this process was put about, and it was one of the particular things that we wanted to know in our choice of partner going forward, and Kerzner produced us a document outlining every single full-time job, the salary as per then, and the on-costs, and these are the figures that are going forward. I know you're under a no-disclosure and ...

**MAN:** They look similar. They're very similar, they're exactly the same, but one of the things that I can disclose, I can't disclose obviously everything in here because that's in confidence, but out of the 1102 which are the direct casino jobs not including the concessionaires, the average payroll costs, average is 23.2 thousand pounds per annum, with a top job at 70,000, and that the lowest at the entry level at 13.2 thousand. Now this including CTT and National Insurance of course, but that is the cost to the company, and that puts a total wage bill in the order of nearly 26, 25.8 million

per annum, that's the wage bill that we're looking for directly related, that's not supply chain, that's directly related, and before part-time jobs.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. Do the MGM Mirage and the Kerzner business plans relate to one another in terms of the numbers of employees on machines, number of employees on tables and so on?

**MAN:** I have to think carefully about what my non-disclosure agreement says. Broadly speaking, yes, otherwise we would have had an issue with it.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes. In other words ...

**MAN:** We had three sets and they were broadly ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** I mean, can you cross your heart and say you've properly audited these figures?

**MAN:** No, because we didn't go through it line by line in the business plan and challenged every number, no, we did not do that but we did have to access through the detail of ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Do you wish you had?

**MAN:** My business does this a lot, and the number of times we are able to do this at this level of detail is very rare indeed. You know, we've done estimates for Impact Commonwealth Games in Manchester, all sorts of other initiatives, among them North-East Development Corporation. You don't normally get access to this level of detail.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** No, no.

**MAN:** It's not something that, you know, we do occasionally, we do this a lot.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** OK. Well, let's move on then. I think if nothing else I've understood what the figures are, thank you. Oh yes, thanks. We're interested in the transport improvements and want to know how realistic they are. Oh, before we do, yes, sorry, the thing's transparent. It's Mr. McWilliams, isn't it, and we haven't heard from you before. I hope you haven't been too bored so far.

**TOM McWILLIAMS:** No, no, not at all.

**MAN:** Just before we move on just in terms of the additionality question that you had in relation to Glasgow and what there is to put that up into a bigger picture, if you like, at Visit Scotland we not only want people to come here but we want them to come back, and in Glasgow, Glasgow fits many of the markets: freedom, activity, cities and culture, so in each of those areas we think Glasgow has got an offering so when and if a regional casino was placed here, there would be a number of things that would have synergies and symbiotic relationships, very much like a London Eye type offering. When you go to the London Eye, if you want to do a number of things, you can do them in conjunction with that business. So we think that golf tourists for instance would be a big part to play and there would be additionality in terms of how they would react with those businesses as well, and that perhaps would create extra income, extra spend from tourists, extra visitors, when you put those things together, not just the casino.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Have you got any evidence for that assumption?

**MAN:** Well, we don't have any evidence but one of the points I think that I would make in terms of numbers there, 1% is a very conservative estimate, and Scotland is trying to grow her tourism by 50% by 2015, we would need to exceed that, so we think that's a fairly conservative estimate.

**MAN:** But it's not 1%, it's 600,000 which is nearer 20%.

**MAN:** Well, I'm not sure that's the point that was made. It was 1% of visits to Scotland was the point that was made, not visits to Glasgow, as I understand it.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** All right. Councillor Paris.

**MARY PARIS:** Again, perhaps before we leave tourism, I could just make a brief couple of points. I looked at our own marketing bureau's thoughts on what has made Glasgow successful as a tourist venue, and they came up with shopping which has been mentioned, visiting family, and the arts venues, and of course we've built a very strong brand, a city of culture. I wonder if we don't risk confusing the brand, if that's the way that it would be put, and that there may be in fact displacement of tourism as well as accrued tourism, in that you might well get people who are interested in the city of culture, but lose sight of that image, don't want to go to Las Vegas of the North and push off to the castles of Aberdeenshire instead, so there might well be some displacement of tourist activity. And I also had a look at the Visit Scotland website, where they had quite an interesting interactive section which, if you like, was the nearest I came to a public poll on these sort of issues, and as I remember, and I'm sure you'll correct me if I'm wrong, that people were asked what could be done to make Scotland more attractive to incoming visitors, and they came up with all manner of things. Now, I lost energy after 150 hits, but there was not one of the first 150 that mentioned the lack of a casino facility.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Visit Scotland, I mean, supposing it was here in Glasgow, what place in your publicity material would the casino have?

**MAN:** The casino would obviously be unique for Scotland, unique for anywhere.

**MAN:** Unique for Europe by the sound of it, this size and these numbers of employees.

**MAN:** It would play a big part in our marketing material. City Breaks is a major part of our marketing, particularly in Europe and USA, and we market in conjunction with Edinburgh, our 2-cities website, and city break tourism is approximately 40% of tourism in Scotland, so it would continue to be a big part of that. We invest heavily financially in marketing to these overseas markets to bring people here, and it would be something again that's unique for that, something that's different. It's not just the casino, it would be an additional hotel, additional leisure facilities, adding to the existing excellent retail offering, so we would make sure that that was at the forefront of our offer and our marketing activities for our potential visitors, plus the people we want to come back.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Are you being a bit cagey?

**MAN:** In what respect?

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Well, in saying you wouldn't have a publicity that said come to Glasgow because it had the biggest casino in Europe.

**MAN:** We may well have. That would be for the marketeers to decide what the exact wording is, but I can assure you that it would be a big part of our marketing.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** OK, thank you. He's not being cagey, thank you. Councillor Paris's point about displacement. I mean, I know the answer would say that, you know, the casino

would bring extra people to the city and more people would stop and so on, but have you actually taken into account the fact that money that might otherwise go on, I don't know what your idea of culture is, ballet, opera, Rolling Stones, I don't know, might detract from the success of such operations? Yes, Mr. Taylor.

**SCOTT TAYLOR:** Yes, thank you Chairman. It's interesting, I don't, having been in business and working with the businesses in Glasgow, very closely, I don't know a business that worries about displacement, and certainly the businesses that we displace to in Edinburgh at the weekend didn't turn down the business. The business that Glasgow displaced across the central belt of Scotland didn't complain about that business opportunity. In fact what it does do is, it allows those businesses to improve and increase their yield, and as such raises the volume and value of tourism and helps us achieve the objectives that Tom was talking about. I think in terms of the, you know, will expenditure be spent in a casino as opposed to museums? All the museums in Glasgow are free and therefore access to those is one of the unique points about the city. Will expenditure in the casino detract from people going to football? It's a moot point and we don't know the answer to that. Effectively from a displacement point of view, increased visitor numbers to the city will have a burgeoning effect on our economy, and may push out that business opportunity to a wider area, and displace expenditure to a wider area, but we see this as a growing of the whole as opposed to, you know, a reduction in the expenditure for other areas.

**MAN:** But you said you'd taken that into account anyway in the way CPC has addressed displacement in the round, coming to a net additional 1500 jobs after the impact of displacement. I'm seeing CPC nodding away very hard now, so that's presumably the assumption we should take away as well from you.

**MAN:** Correct.

**MAN:** Thank you.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. I think I said about 20 minutes ago, let's get on to transport so, not literally of course, not yet. Mr. Collison.

**CHRIS COLLISON:** Yes, thank you, Chairman. You've provided from the city council in response to earlier questions a great deal of information about transport issues and in particular transport improvements, and I thank you for that. It's a two-part question really. Of those transport improvements that are presented to us which are quite wide-ranging in fact, could you just draw our attention in particular to any of them that are dependent on the development of a regional casino? And then secondly perhaps you could tell us something about whether there's a transport management plan in place within the city that specifically deals with the needs of visitors to the area. Thank you.

**MAN:** Yes, I'll deal with both of those questions. In terms of the transport improvements under way, none of these is dependent on the casino going ahead. All these improvements are part of the much wider transport strategy which has been developed in the West of Scotland over the last few years. Most of these have now moved on since the initial evidence was submitted. A number of these are now firmly into expenditure time-scales and a number are starting to get under way. In particular we draw your attention to the improvements in the road network. The M74 motorway has now passed all the legal hurdles, and we're looking for a start in spring of next year, that's the M74 southern extension, as it's called, and that will complete the motorway connection from the M8 through to the other side of Glasgow, through the East End. The East End Regeneration Route which we mention is now being designed and it's firmly in the council's expenditure plans for the period up to 2010. The works which are taking place along the Clyde-side expressway which is next to the SEC and the Glasgow Harbour site are under way at the moment and you'll have seen that as you drove along the river yesterday. So most of the big road improvements are under way. In terms of rail, we're now on site with the improvements to Partick Interchange, and Partick

Interchange is just to the north of the Glasgow Harbour site, particularly important because it's one of the few locations where the two parts of the surface rail network interchange with a bus station and with the underground, so you've got rail and motor transport coming together. Also on the rail front, the heavy rail link to Glasgow Airport is now moving ahead. It's been approved by the Scottish Executive. Money is coming into the budget to do it, and we're still envisaging that being up and running and open by 2010 and that will give us a direct rail connection from Central Station out to the airport. The Cross Rail project is still at the planning stage. Cross Rail will allow the low level railway line north of the river to connect round and join up with the southern line and go from Queen Street Station in the north, again to give you a rail connection to Glasgow Airport. The advantage of that connection to Queen Street is it allows you to access Stirling, Perth, Aberdeen, Dundee, all the cities to the north, Inverness. The Airdrie to Bathgate reopening may seem a strange one to put in our submission, but that actually gives you a direct connection through to Edinburgh on to the southern low level line, and that would allow people coming from Edinburgh to get a rail connection direct to any of the rail stations on the north side of the river and potentially to the sites at Glasgow Harbour and SEC. We've also moved ahead with further improvements proposed to the underground system in Glasgow, and it's likely to include more extended opening including weekend opening and a programme I think will shortly be introduced to start to upgrade the quality of the underground stations so the inner city network will improve. On the airport side, that's maybe one I can pass to Scott. Scott's very heavily involved in the Air Route Fund so maybe pass him that one.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Mr. Taylor.

**SCOTT TAYLOR:** Thank you, Chairman. In respect to the Airport Route Development Fund, the eight contiguous local authorities support the fund, which enables us to work with a number of our key partners to encourage air routes to come to one of the two city centre serving airports, Glasgow International and Glasgow Prestwick International. We work very closely with both airport operators, British Airports Authority and Infratil, and we work closely with Visit Scotland, and the Scottish Executive in encouraging those airport routes. It's very much a team approach to transport our service to tourism. In relation to transport, our support and our funding goes towards creating and sustaining those routes, and certainly in the past 12 weeks Berlin-Schönefeld has announced for Glasgow and is currently now running at 90% occupancy. Gatwick has increased its number of flights to Glasgow via Easyjet. Eindhoven announced, Vigo announced, Boston announced, Gdansk-Warsaw announced. We have three more routes in bid over the next three months, of which two will announce for sure within the next month and one to follow we're hopeful for. The relationship that we have with the airlines is such that we use their distribution networks to promote the city and promote the offering of Scotland. There's no doubt that in discussions with a number of those airlines, they would make available those networks for us to promote the regional casino, as we do with a number of the major visitor attractions that we have on offer in the city, and they have millions of people on their distribution networks. Combine that with Visit Scotland and other networks, I feel confident that the increased routes to the city will significantly benefit by having an offer such as the regional casino behind it, particularly from countries where there's a strong propensity to travel to Glasgow, North America, Canada, USA, Germany, Scandinavia, Ireland in particular, these are all very good stable mates for Glasgow and for Scotland.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. To what extent are these increases just reflections of the national expected increase in aviation? Are you ahead of it, do you think, or just following the trend?

**SCOTT TAYLOR:** I think, you know, if you look at the national increase in aviation, there's something in the region of about 2% in the forthcoming year expected in aviation. I think Glasgow, I don't have the exact percentage figure, whether Glasgow is exceeding that or not. What I can say is that Glasgow's growth is in the region of 13% in the next 3-5 years. The forecast growth of Glasgow International Airport for instance is forecasting at that particular level, and I think partly

due to the fact that Glasgow has been underserved by airline routes over the years, and therefore you would expect its growth to be higher than the national average.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Do you have a separate figure for long-haul?

**SCOTT TAYLOR:** A separate figure for ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** ... long-haul.

**SCOTT TAYLOR:** In respect of whether Glasgow is now performing.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** In respect of Glasgow Airport and increase.

**SCOTT TAYLOR:** I couldn't tell you whether Glasgow has a greater share in the long-haul new route market or not. That's not something I have with me, but I can ask our partners if they can provide that information.

**MAN:** Yes, and at the same time I don't know whether there's been any estimate made of the anticipated modal split of visitors attending the regional casino in Glasgow, but if we could perhaps have an indication of in particular the split between private car arrivals and then breaking other transport down into train, air and long-haul, as the Chairman has just indicated, that would be quite useful. If it's not available just now, then perhaps if that work has been done, then it would be helpful to us to know.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** It's possible the planners or the Highway people might have the answer to that one, of course.

**MAN:** Mr. Closier has got the information for the SEC site and is busy searching for it. Just to finish the story I started, I think there were two questions, and we haven't answered the second one yet, but to finish the first one, the one ...

**MAN:** ... quality state-of-the-art tram-like vehicle which will go from the centre of town along the north bank of the river, through the SEC site and finishing at the far end of the Glasgow Harbour site. That project now has planning consent, is in the very detailed final stages of design, and we are still working towards having Phase 1 of that which will take it out to the SEC site to a new halt towards the end of 2007 and extend it out to the end of the Glasgow Harbour site by the end of 2008. Opportunities to extend beyond that in due course, but that will provide new halts at the SEC adjacent to the Transport Museum and the casino site if that's where the casino was, but that project very much in time-scale, designed and virtually ready to go. Just to follow up Scott's point on the airport, at the moment the airport is running with something like 8.7 million passengers per annum, and the airport is planning to see that rise to somewhere between 12 and 15 million by 2015. So they've got quite ambitious plans and they're lining up their investment in terms of terminal facilities, aprons, runways, piers to accommodate that number of flights. In terms of your second question, there is a millennium transport plan for Glasgow at the moment. That is currently being revised, and Strathclyde Partnership for Transport which is the regional transport body, is currently completing the first draft of its regional transport strategy, and I think that will look at leisure flows, tourism flows, and the relationship with the public transport system to both the resident/business market and the tourism market, so that work is under way at the moment.

**MAN:** Chair, I've put two sets of figures in front of you just to compare. We at the SECC do mystery visitor reports where we actually ask people as they come out, on a statistical basis, all sorts of questions including 'How did you get here and how are you going back?' The nearest one by comparison is concerts and events rather than exhibitions and conferences, which are different. For exhibitions and events, 71% by car, 11% by rail, 10% taxi, 5% bus, and 3% other. Don't ask me what the other is.

**MAN:** And the remaining 1%?

**MAN:** Oh, well done. Rounding. Our estimate for the casino is based not just on the casino but on the leisure facilities within the casino, and that's quite interesting. 47% car, 1.5% rail, 40% taxi, 7% bus, 4.5% other. That adds up?

**MAN:** I wasn't trying that time.

**MAN:** The first one did add up to 100 actually.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Were they the figures you anted, Mr. Collison?

**CHRIS COLLISON:** Yes.

**MAN:** The second set of figures related to what type of activity.

**MAN:** But that's an estimate based on the business plan for the regional casino facilities.

**MAN:** Just for that.

**MAN:** It might be, if we're talking transport, just to explain our *modus operandi* here. We're planning to build a new arena, in fact we've only recently got full planning consent, for 12½ thousand people. One of the things which is such an excellent fit is a regional casino that can take people as they come out, you know, and people arrive at different times maybe over a 2-hour period to go to a concert, but when it's over, it's over and they all want to get out. Rather than clog up the road system, albeit it at 11 o'clock at night you're not disturbing too many people, but it's, you know, it has a finite capacity. Having a facility out with the town centre where you can go to, you can have supper, you can have a drink, you can do whatever you want to do there, and feed those people slowly on to the road network is an integral part of our transport plan that we submitted along with other details as part of our green transport policy and everything else.

Obviously if, you know, no casino, there's nowhere for people to go, they do what they do at the moment but in larger numbers, which is trying to get into the city centre which is already full.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Well, that an interesting point that nobody else has noticed so far, but it does apply everywhere, doesn't it?

**MAN:** I don't know everywhere. I know it works in Glasgow.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. You do know other, you're not a Glaswegian, you haven't spent all your life here, have you?

**MAN:** I've worked in Scotland for over 35 years. I've still got the accent though.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** So, and the other three, you perhaps might know a bit about an English city.

**MAN:** As I said right at the beginning, the facility that I'm ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** I mean, it's a good point but doesn't it apply to every city that we're studying?

**MAN:** I haven't looked at it in that point of view, that a lot of the facilities, as you've mentioned it, that you're going to be interviewing are talking about building the conference facility, building something else, after they get a casino, should they get a casino. We actually have a product in terms of a leisure product, in terms of an exhibition product, in terms of a conference product, that has been with us now for a long time and we've got excellent figures and it makes it quite easy for us therefore to roll that forward into what a casino would do in that terms, and I think the robustness hopefully in the test of time will prove them to be fairly accurate.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** There is something more before we leave the airport. Mr. Taylor, have we any idea of the airport usage, what proportion is people going out presumably with a view to coming back, as opposed to coming in, again with a prospect of coming back.

**SCOTT TAYLOR:** We can get that information quite easily because the airports record out-going and in-going. We don't have it here but we can get that.

**MAN:** I think certainly if we take a particular route ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Because it does reflect upon what we've heard on the international attraction of the place.

**MAN:** Yes.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Well, if you wouldn't mind and again don't forget to circulate it round everywhere.

**MAN:** OK.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** And I'm glad Mr. Rolwegan has reminded me that he's still here. Mr. Rolwegan.

**KEN ROLWEGAN:** Thank you very much. I've got a concern with regards to the road transport in the area of the SECC, Currently the SECC has two venues, the locally known as the Armadillo which houses 3,000 people maximum.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** And I know why they call it the Armadillo.

**KEN ROLWEGAN:** The shape, yes. And then the main conference hall which, when Cliff Richards comes later this year, will house 10,000 people, I'm concerned that they're proposing another 12½ thousand people in this already traffic-congested area in the city, given that on just on the other side of the river, if there was a football match at Ibrox Stadium, I don't know how many other thousands of people would be using this area. In five years' time, it is proposed that overlooking the SECC currently we have Yorkhill Children's Hospital and the Queen Mother Hospital, both of which are planned to close within the next five years and to move to the Southern General which is on the south side of the river, the other side of the Clyde tunnel. The concerts like this plus the additional people using it for a casino would make it very difficult for ambulances and sick children and mothers expecting children to get from the north and the west of the city to the newly-located site in the Southern General.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thanks. To what extent does the point that I think Mr. Closier mentioned about how the casinos are working different hours from even hospitals, affect your analysis of the situation?

**KEN ROLWEGAN:** Well, people are sick at all times of the day and night, and if it's busy at 11 o'clock at night, it could still upset an ambulance trying to get through the Clyde tunnel to the Southern General Hospital.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** OK, thank you. Mr. Inch.

**STEVEN INCH:** Yes, Professor, thanks very much. Just to make a couple of points. The SEC plans have been through the planning process both in terms of the outline planning consent for the overall master-plan, and the detailed planning consent for the arena, and as a council we required Mr. Closier to spend a lot of money doing transport modelling to model basically all the flows at all times of day, assuming that the casino was in place, and also I think with the casino not there. This required a lot of work between the council and SEC's consultants to try and reconfigure the transport system to meet all of the possible contingencies, so we feel we've actually taken the best professional advice to come up with a transport model that actually works for the site assuming it's fully developed.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes. Of course, Mr. Rolwegan, if one were to propose a very large and successful church by which people came by car, the same would apply, wouldn't it. I'm just pulling your leg.

**KEN ROLWEGAN:** Yes, that's correct, yes. Well, we have that in the West End as well.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** I did actually go to a church in Santa Barbara, a vast place, and it had, I think the car parking probably would have covered most of the city centre of Glasgow if it was spread out over it, but that's the west coast of America, of course.

**KEN ROLWEGAN:** Yes, we've not reached that level yet.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Well would that that came about, of course. Where do we go next. We've dealt with transport, haven't we. Mr. Sagar, did you have any more points on regeneration or had you covered it earlier?

**DEEP SAGAR:** One point if you don't mind, which I had asked Mr. Taylor to clarify, that it had been mentioned in the city marketing submission that there was huge untapped demand for casino gambling, so if you wouldn't mind then just clarifying that please. Thank you.

**SCOTT TAYLOR:** In terms of the latent demand for a casino our view is that there's a demand for a casino from a number of different points. One from the requirement for additional venue space, certainly from venue space for conventions and for meetings and for receptions, the demand in Glasgow is significant, and the casino would offer an additional venue space in Glasgow we have a real need and demand for, and that's based on the volume and value of the bookings that we place, which is in economic terms valued at around £68 million and represents again a 10% year-on-year growth on sales, so demand for conferences, meetings and unusual venues is high. There is a requirement for additional space in the city for that. We do know that there is a demand for hotel accommodation that is unfulfilled. At the moment, our demand is outstripping supply and it is causing us opportunities to outpace business, so the second reason is for hotel demand. The third relates to the demand for casino activity itself, and that's really based on discussions that we've had with professional conference organisers whose delegates effectively are looking for somewhere to go at the end of the evening and somewhere to go out at night and effectively don't have the opportunity to go in the numbers that we have, and bear in mind we have conferences today for 4½ thousand people for instance. Those sort of venues just don't exist in size in the city and it's that sort of number, between 3 and 5,000 delegates that we most target for international conferences.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Mr. Froemberg, there's one or two things you want to ask about land sales and dependence with the Commonwealth Games and things, I know.

**JAMES FROEMBERG:** Yes please, Chair. I just want to touch through a sort of suite of questions around investment, and I think I'm reminded by what Mr. Patrick was saying earlier about the very strong link between investment, whether it's inward or indigenous, and GVA, and I'd just like to clarify a few things. Firstly the four proposals that you've had on the table thus far which you tell us range between 120 and £250 million of investment for the casino and related hotel-specific activity. Those proposals were made in the 2001-2003 era when clearly there wasn't the legislation that said there's going to be only one regional casino. The first thing I'd like to understand is whether you've had any further indications since then as to whether that scale of investment is still what you would expect if you got the regional licence, or whether we should be going away thinking that Glasgow would get any higher or lesser amount of investment of the casino-specific nature first of all, get on to dependent investments in a moment. Is 120-250 what you still think will be the investment? Anyone?

**MAN:** Yes. Again, taking the one at a time, the £120 million investment proposal was for the Las Vegas Sands and Rangers Project down at Ibrox.

**MAN:** Well, yes, they were 120 and the PLMGM I got down was a 250.

**MAN:** Yes, yes.

**MAN:** Yes.

**MAN:** And the Ibrox development has got full planning consent, and I think other than for adjusting for building cost inflation in the interim, that's still very much the project we would expect to deliver if the licence came to Glasgow and if they were awarded a licence. The Glasgow Harbour project is currently subject to an outline planning application at the moment, and these figures are taken from the presentations that MGM Mirage and Beale Holdings have given to the council about that, so again just a simple adjustment for building cost inflation, and again we're talking about a £250 million project. The SEC Project I think, look to Mr. Closier, but I think 160 million is still the figure they're working to. I think the most uncertain one is the proposal which was by a developer with no operator lined up. Now that was based on a proposal drawn up three years ago. The developer has been looking at alternative development proposals for the site and I think until they get an operator lined up and actually flesh that out into a more definitive proposal, we still have to go with the figure that they've provided to us.

**MAN:** OK, thank you. At some of the places we've seen or are seeing, the land is being sold to the consortium of developer/operator and that land is owned by the council, and they talk to us in their proposals about very large sums of money being received for the land which they are then going to further invest in other exciting regenerative things, so this doubles the money up, and I can't see in your proposals where sort of land value is happening and where that's going and what that's being spent on, 'cos it's obviously all in different ownerships at the moment. Are you able to give me any comfort around what sort of land value's being created and where that land value is then going? Is it of further regeneration benefit?

**MAN:** Yes. Again, if I maybe go through the individual proposals, the Kerzner Project has been developed by SEC Ltd., they're in partnership with SEC Ltd. which is 92% owned by the city council, and I don't know, Mike, if you want to say a bit more about it.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Sorry, they're owned by ...

**MAN:** ... the city council.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** The city council, thank you. I thought you said that but I wanted to make sure, yes.

**MAN:** The St. Inis Project is entirely private sector land and again, there's no real proposal there other than the suggestion that there might be a casino proposal comes forward in due course. The Ibrox Project is again not, no council ownership involved in that project. There is certainly a significant amount of community benefit will come out of that proposal, and in the bid document you'll see a casino with a football pitch on top of it. That football pitch would be managed by a local community trust with community facilities built in. The Glasgow Harbour site, an agreement between the council and Glasgow Harbour Ltd. was put in place some time before a casino proposal was ever thought about, and it was based on the council selling its land at market value, sorry, market value plus a contribution towards the site owned which is to be developed for the new Transport Museum plus a share of development profit at some future point in time, very much a standard sort of development agreement which will unlock value once value is actually generated on the site. It's perhaps best if Mr. Closier talks about the arrangement with Kerzner.

**MIKE CLOSIER:** Yes. Just for clarification, our arrangement is that we are not selling the land, we are leasing the land on a long lease, and there are other commercial considerations that go along with that. Obviously I'm not at liberty to disclose those. It's quite interesting. Because this agreement was reached way back in 2001/2002 before it was thought that there would be eight, let alone one back in the days when we were concerned in canny Scots, if you like, notwithstanding the accent, what happens when it fails, what do we do next? I don't think I'm breaking any confidences here. I mean, Kerzner's business plan assumed that over the piece there would be two regional casinos in Glasgow, and that's what the business plan was predicated on. We haven't changed that so again we've got prudence built into this thing, and on the basis that if there were two and ours was not successful, what do we do with the land then? So it was much easier to discuss a lease rather than outright purchase and that's where we stand at the moment.

**MAN:** I think my summary from that is you don't have in Glasgow the same visibility of creating a substantial land value receipt to the public purse over and above what you've already captured let's say in the Peel arrangement, but interestingly, Mr. Closier, your point was based on the 2001/2 era and yet you are, if you like, still progressing a scheme that was based on there being two in Glasgow rather than one in Britain, so in answer to my earlier question, the level of investment you haven't considered an up-scaling of it.

**MIKE CLOSIER:** Well, I think we're all in a similar situation and we'll come on to discuss this, which is what happens after this, what does the council do in selecting? I think that's when things

will get firmed up. It's, you know, these changes were brought about in spite of us, and I think having invested a lot of time, effort and money in getting to where we are at the moment in terms of traffic schemes, in terms of outline planning and everything else, this process came along so I think most of us said, 'Right, if we're successful in this project, we've got to go through another stage anyway where all these details will be worked out,' because that's one of the tests I know Mr. Inch is going to be talking about when we get to that, is what are the criteria of the council views in selecting the one.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** OK, thank you for that.

**MAN:** Can I just say something?

**MAN:** Sorry, yes.

**MAN:** Just really in support of Mr. Closier, these are extremely prudent figures that have gone forward, because of the situation that has been described, where we all thought it was *carte blanche* and then all of a sudden it wasn't, and we've already, if you take the Ibrox Las Vegas Sands example, we've already lodged with the council a master plan of what we would do afterwards if we were successful, and that's been put together in conjunction with the local community and it involves, and obviously you don't want to go into too much of the detail here, but it will result in huge gain for the local community and the local council in terms of facilities which will be linked into other developments to do with the Commonwealth Games in the other end of the city, and they'll also have touched on some of the things I spoke about earlier about trying to induce people into a healthier life-style. So I wouldn't like anyone to go away thinking that the operators are in some way, they've stuck their bid in and that's it. We stuck our bid in in the arrangements we had at the time, and we will now go and re-assess those once we understand what the decision of the panel is and then indeed what the decision of the council is.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Do you want to go on to the Commonwealth Games?

**MAN:** Not yet. I want to move to the next area which is 'other investment ...'

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Just before you do, I think Mr. Jamieson wants to have a word.

**EUAN JAMIESON:** Yes, thank you. Just to clarify Steve Inch's point, the Transport Museum site was provided as part of the planning gain portion for the partnership with Glasgow City Council at Glasgow Harbour, and the arrangement that we have in place for the site which is now wholly owned by ourselves is that increases in land value will flow in part through to the council.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** I wanted to now look at other investment, be it private sector or public sector that is, if you like, dependent on or catalysed or triggered by the arrival of the casino, and we've heard already and understood in answer to Mr. Collison's question that the transport plans are not dependent on the casino. It's the casino, if you like, that's going to build on the enhanced transport. Mr. Closier, you submitted to us that the development of the arena is not dependent on the arrival of the casino. It's nice to have, it's synergistic and we can understand all that, and certainly some of the money would be helpful to have is what you said.

**MIKE CLOSIER:** Yes indeed. When we started, we've got to go back to then, 2000/2001, it was an integral part and it made adequate sense in all of the business plans, it made adequate sense in capital, and hell, there was a couple of quid left over to put some decent landscaping down. Just to elaborate a little, the arena is essential to our business plan going forward both in terms of entertainment and in terms of mega-conferences that don't even come to the UK at the moment. This is another Glasgow first situation. In order to do that, and it's another part of the Glasgow Plan 1 and 2, is to redevelop the land which is currently grey car parking from our western boundary to the boundary with Glasgow Harbour, a bit of joined-up thinking there, and that over

and above supplying sustainable village-type atmosphere and affordable housing would give us a capital receipt that goes towards the cost of the arena. With the casino there, that would fulfil the balance. At the moment, we have a planning consent, we are talking to other partners in the public sector and, you know, we're talking about taking on a considerable amount of debt to do this. As you can imagine, the arena, the rest of the facilities at the SECC including the car parking spaces is an integral part of our bid for 2014 for the Commonwealth Games. It's central to it.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you, Mr. Closier. Just before we get on to the relationship with the Commonwealth Games which I did want to ask about, I'm just checking that I haven't missed anything that you want us to take into account as casino-dependent investment that will happen to Glasgow either indigenous or inward. Mr. Taylor told us earlier of the potential for half-a-dozen more hotels, what was it 7-10, 7-10 more hotels, and I think was trying to give us the impression that that is in some respects linked to the arrival of the casino. Is there anything else that we should take away saying, 'If Glasgow gets the casino, then these investments are going to happen on top of that.' It's important to us if there is anything that we've missed.

**MAN:** Could I maybe just add, it isn't specific about an investment that you can identify right now but if you were to set this in context with the West of Scotland, and it's worth maybe saying that Scotland Enterprise has taken a view that its overall economic development strategy for Scotland depends on a set of plans for six priority industries and also looks at metropolitan city planning as its core strategic framework. If you look at the Metro West which is the area that we're most interested in and ask the question, 'What's the scale of the investment leap that we have to make to match averages around Europe?' We're talking in terms of £7 billion worth of GVA that we're looking for, so if you go away from this with the impression that, 'Great, the Clyde Waterfront is well advanced,' nothing else is going to happen necessarily out of the casino itself that we've identified or specified as a named project. Actually the role the casino has to play in helping us to get nearer to that 7 billion is in itself very important, because the Clyde Waterfront will only go as far as maybe 1 to 1½ billion. We have an awful long way to go, so I wouldn't under-estimate just exactly how important it is to the overall figure.

**MAN:** I think as well I'd like to make the point that, you know, I touched on earlier. It's very, very difficult for us as Govan residents to see where the sort of life-changing experience would come from, a regional casino could bring, if it were not to come. You know, we'll keep working at it, the city will keep working at it but this is a, a regional casino would bring a huge step change to the quality of life of the people of Govan, and it would be very, very difficult to see another opportunity that would allow that to happen so quickly. I'm not sure if that's what you're looking for in terms of dependency on a regional casino but it's certainly for us to be site specific for a moment, ours are certainly site specific on a regional casino.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Both points are helpful, thank you.

**MAN:** I think, Chair, maybe just this one final point to close that one off. I think it is important to realise that all of the proposals in Glasgow are part of much bigger area regeneration programmes, and it's not simply a case of putting a casino in a master plan without any relationship to focus on round about it, and I think that with the Glasgow Harbour Project and the Ibrox Project, there are other benefits which we expect to flow, which would not flow without the casino being there. I think Mr. McEwan mentioned all the sports facilities. Well, they certainly wouldn't happen because they go on the roof of the casino in a very innovative design. I think you've mentioned some of the hotel developments, they would certainly not flow on those sites, and I think as Mr. Taylor said earlier, there is certainly a deficiency of hotels and the star rating that would go with a major regional casino, and I think that would leave a big gap in Glasgow's hotel infrastructure, and that in turn influences our ability to capture some of the bigger conferences which increasingly demand four star plus or five star hotels. I think in terms of Glasgow Harbour, it might also cause a rethink and I look at Mr. Jamieson to make a comment on that, but it ties in very closely to the amount of retail space they intend to develop on the site, the commercial space they intend to develop, so at the

very least I think it would cause quite a big rethink in the master plan and how that's configured, and that would almost certainly set the project back.

**MAN:** If I could add to that, the development would still proceed, of course, life goes on, but I think what would be lost is the degree of acceleration that the regional casino would bring, adding to the already critical mass that we've achieved and taking us onto another lead in terms of destination.

**MAN:** I find myself writing the word 'accelerate' all the EIP's I've been to so far, but thank you for those words. I just have one point which I know my chairman wants me to get on to and it is my last and it is around the relationship with and the impact on the 2014 Commonwealth Games bid. I think you've suggested to us in either your proposal or your answers to questions that if Glasgow's proposal for the casino licence wasn't the one that went through, it would seriously damage your credibility or your publicity in your Commonwealth Games bid, and I find that a little bit hard to believe. I obviously recognise the arena-related component that we've already talked about. I wondered if there's anything else that you wanted us to understand or be aware of around the relationship between the casino and the Commonwealth Games other than if you've got it and lots of people came to the Commonwealth Games, it would be a great, you know, thing to have there for the visitors, that's obviously apparent. Anything else in terms of the connection between them?

**MAN:** I mean, I think it is really down to the range of leisure facilities that Glasgow can produce for what would be the biggest sporting event it could ever possibly bid to host, either the second or third biggest sporting event in the world, and we're aware from previous games that the quality and breadth of the leisure facilities on offer with the Games are actually a big part of the sale of the city that is bidding to win the games. We are putting our final bid together at the moment. I think we are just about finished draft 2 with a view to the final submission going in in March next year, and then the decision in November next year. We would certainly hope to be able to play up the fact that there will be a regional casino there quite heavily in the bid, and it does add to the extent of attractions that visitors coming to the Games can hope to experience when they're not doing games things or when they're extending their stay beyond the Games. I was out in Melbourne in March this year for the games, and I'm aware that Melbourne marketed very heavily the existing of the Crown Casino Complex as a laser attraction. It was next to the Media Exhibition facilities which did boxing and gymnastics and various other things, but that was a big part of their sale. 'Come to the Games but come to do all these other things as well,' and the casino featured quite heavily in that.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes. I have a rather odd picture in my mind that goes like this, that somebody's just spent all the day running round and round the track, has a shower and says to someone else that's been running round the track, 'Now let's go off to the casino.' Is that a real picture?

**SAM McEWAN:** Can I say something?

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Mr. McEwan.

**SAM McEWAN:** Yes, but no it's not. I don't know how the Chairman spends his active hours, I don't know if he runs round tracks but after you have, I can assure you the last thing you'd want to do is, at that level, the last thing you want to do is go anywhere apart from your bed. But to be serious, we in the city hosted a European cup final in 1960 and people still talk about that year. We hosted another one a few years ago and the whole city's transformed, for a few days leading up to this, the whole city is transformed. It will happen when the Commonwealth Games come here in 2014. But I'd like to make the point that it's not the event itself, it's not people running round tracks of kicking balls that make sporting events special. I've just come back from Germany at the World Cup. The football was average, the atmosphere in the cities was world-class, it was fantastic. It gave the whole place a lift. You speak to people who have handled the opportunity of hosting an Olympic Games properly. It's not the three weeks of sporting activity that's special but it

goes, it comes and it goes. What's important is that we have a legacy from it, and where the regional casino and the Commonwealth Games will come together, it's not so much, and actually whether the Games come here or not, although it clearly will have an influence. What's important is that the facilities that will be put together from some of the bids in support of the Commonwealth Games, and we're talking about people who are at the height of their profession in terms of athletics or whatever their particular sporting prowess is, they have the proper training facilities. Now, that's nice for them and it's wonderful for them. What makes it even nicer is that when they go, those facilities will be there for the people of Glasgow and wider afield to take advantage of, so that we can get our youths involved, get them off the streets. It goes back to this hope and aspiration, optimism. You've worked in your casino all day, you've got your economic viability, let's get you into a healthier life-style let's show you that there's other things to do than hanging around or getting into bad habits or drinking too much or eating the wrong food. So it's the legacy that these sporting events bring, and that's where the regional casino for me ties in with the Commonwealth Games bid.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. Councillor Paris.

**MARY PARIS:** I have to say that from the start I've been the most enthusiastic supporter of the Commonwealth Games bid. As you can see from my badge, I've given out dozens of these in my ward and continue to support the bid. I feel that points that are being raised now are something of a red herring. I cannot see that the Commonwealth Games bid is tied in any way to the casino bid, unless we choose to make it so, and I fully endorse what's been said about the football events. Great atmosphere at the World Cup, tremendous atmosphere at some of the big footballing events that have been at Hamden Park or at the other big grounds, none of them in any way dependent on having a super casino there because there wasn't one, and I cannot believe that our Commonwealth Games bid is likely to be so dependent or have been made so dependent on something which may not happen.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. Mr. Inch.

**STEVEN INCH:** It's just maybe to comment on a couple of points that have been made. In terms of the games, our bid is predicated on 6½ thousand athletes and team officials. Most of those will stay in a Games village which will be built in the East End of Glasgow, and the reality is most of them will stay in the Games village when they're not competing, because a lot come from countries which, to be quite honest, don't have very much money and can't afford to do anything, but at the moment the hotels in Glasgow are holding 70,000 room nights for the Games. In addition to that there will be a huge attendance in terms of visiting friends and relatives market, people who won't stay in a hotel but they'll be in Glasgow or they'll be travelling every day, so there'll be a huge number of people in the city looking for things to do, and I think Councillor Paris is quite correct, the Games don't hinge on the casino but the casino's actually quite a good selling point.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** You've made a convincing case by the sound of it, Mr. Inch, for if you have the Commonwealth Games, then it'll be a jolly good thing for the casino.

**STEVEN INCH:** I think they feed off each other.

**MAN:** When is the decision made on the Commonwealth Games?

**STEVEN INCH:** The decision is due in November 2007 and it's made in Sri Lanka.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** By which time, of course, no, I mustn't speculate. I was going to say, by which time of course the Secretary of State might have made a decision, but don't bet too much on it. And now, as they say on the Monty Python Show, for something entirely different, unless we'd want to raise anything more on regeneration, do we? No? Willingness to license, how can the panel be assured of the Council's willingness to license in the longer term? Well, we've

gone over the question of consultation in some depth. There's a couple of questions remaining. What persuades the present leadership of the council that they're going to be there in a few years? You've got an election, is it next year?

**STEVEN INCH:** In May.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** In May. And you're doing something that England might follow many years later, I understand, having proportional representation. Does that change the likelihoods, do you think?

**STEVEN INCH:** Oh, I'm not sure an officer of the council should be answering that sort of question! Maybe Councillor Paris could give you a bit of insight into the politics.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Well, let's ask Councillor Paris. Councillor Paris is after all a councillor and therefore might know about these things.

**MARY PARIS:** Well, it may surprise you that in fact I'm as cagey as Steve Inch on this one. Who knows? We're going into uncharted waters on this one. All I think I can say is that there is general agreement in all parties that in June the city council will look very different from the way it looks now. And I wouldn't care, partly because we've still got some months to go, I wouldn't care to predict just how different it will look, that a lot may happen between now and May.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Is this very much a party political issue, as it was in the London Borough of Brent?

**MARY PARIS:** Only in that all, I think all opposition parties are at the best sitting on the fence, at the worst against having a regional casino in Glasgow, and it's the Labour groups that have been the engine of this one.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** So the answer to the question is yes, I suppose, is it?

**MARY PARIS:** Yes.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes.

**STEVEN INCH:** No it's not. No, absolutely not. I spend a lot of my time speaking to, first of all let me answer your first point. We've had proportional representation in Scotland now for seven years, with the Scottish parliament, and of course the dynamics of politics have changed, but what we're seeing is in fact consensus reached after a perhaps more open discussion and a wider discussion than we had previously. It was very interesting to someone who spends a lot of time speaking to party leaders, it's very interesting to hear that they're against it because that's not what they tell me. Basically everyone will tell you privately that it's quite a good thing, but really we've got other things to worry us just now in terms of the run-up to the next election, and things like issues such as health, education, business development. Now, in terms of, you know, we have spoken, I'm just trying to think of a figure, it must be well in the region of about 60 MSP's. No-one has said that they are against a regional casino, and that's from all parties. We have had a number of people speak to us quite legitimately about their concerns on problem gambling, and we all have plans to address that, so it's absolutely quite wrong to say that the opposition parties are against it. Many of the opposition MSP's and M.P.'s are not against it at all and will say so privately, so it would be disingenuous to suggest otherwise.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes. Well, let me just mention something else, of course, and that is that there is a convention in government that one doesn't make any controversial announcement on the eve of an election or a local election, that's right, isn't it? Yes, so you can draw what conclusions you like from that opaque remark. Sorry, Councillor Paris.

**MARY PARIS:** off mike.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes, of course. I hadn't understood you to be otherwise. Mr. Rolwegan.

**KEN ROLWEGAN:** This is probably quite different, but I wonder if the council have looked at the laws in Scotland with regards to smoking, because the various outlets for gambling like the bingo halls have found this to be a particular problem.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** I missed the very last word you said.

**KEN ROLWEGAN:** I said the bingo halls have found this a problem and some of them are threatened with closure as a result of the smoking ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Because you can't smoke there.

**KEN ROLWEGAN:** ... inside these premises.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** And I guess you see the connection between casinos and smoking, do you?

**KEN ROLWEGAN:** I've not been inside a casino, but I imagine them to be places where there's a lot of smoke. We should also perhaps for your information point out that the ban in smoking comes in in England next June, just so that we have a full picture.

**LESLEY SAWERS:** And if I could just comment from a chamber's perspective, we've certainly had no negative feedback from our members in terms of its impact on their operations. There have been some publicans, particularly community pubs, who have reported a downfall in business, but research from New York and Ireland is that trade actually recovers.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Do we gather from this that smoking is much more of an exciting issue than casinos? Mr. Inch.

**STEVEN INCH:** Just as a fellow professional planner, smoking's a huge problem in terms of the things they stick in the front of buildings, particularly listed buildings, to hold cigarette butts, but that's not my point. It was just really to confirm the council's position. I mean, as you said, it's unpredictable after the elections next year, but as it stands, the council policy and resources committee, as Councillor Purcell said earlier, have debated casino development twice. The first time it was sent back to work up some further information but that was formally approved by the council on 14<sup>th</sup> September last year, our policy to bid for a regional casino. That was subsequently endorsed at the full council meeting on 22<sup>nd</sup> September, so the full council position is to support a regional casino development. And in terms of the Licensing Board, the Licensing Board earlier this year, I think it was in March, agreed that it would not enact Section 166 of the Gambling Act, which was a restriction on casino development, and the Licensing Board agreed that it would support casino development provided that the proposals complied with the relevant gambling, planning and licensing regulation, so the Board's position was quite clear.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. Something you wanted to ask, didn't you?

**MAN:** Yes, perhaps I could follow on from that, Chairman. The council has four potential groups seeking regional casino sites within the development submissions. Could you tell us what will be the city council's approach to selection, assuming you are awarded that status at the next stage.

**STEVEN INCH:** Ultimately of course it will be a decision for the Licensing Board rather than the council *per se*.

**MAN:** Yes.

**STEVEN INCH:** I think we've made our position quite clear from day one, given that we have an ownership interest in the SEC site. We've got a commercial relationship with the Glasgow Harbour site, and we would effectively distance ourself from the actual technical process of coming up with a recommendation.

**MAN:** Right, right.

**STEVEN INCH:** And that we would take professional advice through an independent appraisal. We're assuming that further information would be made available from DCMS or ...

**MAN:** ... and leaving till last is a project called Clyde Fast Link, that the council would distance itself, take professional advice and the recommendation from professional advisers would go to the Licensing Board, so the council would actually stand to decide.

**MAN:** I think that's hopeful, thank you very much.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. Again, let's just to finish off with or nearly to finish off. Schedule 9 of the Gambling Act, as I'm sure you know, or perhaps you don't because it's a licensing matter, it does refer to community benefits expressly, we've heard a lot about some community benefits like in terms of employment and so on. How do you see other benefits? You've got a point, haven't you, Mr. Mundy, about the Glasgow Fort Agreement for example.

**NEIL MUNDY:** Yes, I think that was touched on this morning, Mr. Inch, but perhaps you could just remind us how that agreement was constructed, just very quickly, just in the context of the Chairman's question.

**STEVEN INCH:** The gains we have in place can either be done under statute, section 69 or 75 of the Planning Act, or done simply through legal partnership agreements. In the case of Glasgow Fort, there was simply an agreement between the partners as to what they would, I mean, they signed a legal agreement which committed them to doing certain actions. In terms of the casino projects, the sort of benefits we would be looking for would be contributions towards community projects, and that may be the advice agencies which we mentioned earlier, expanding the debt profiling, doing public surveys of perception and awareness of casinos, and maybe contributions to community projects in the areas in which the casinos are based. It may be contributions towards some of the transport infrastructure required to improve access to the casinos. In the case of the Ibrox proposal, for example, the community benefit is already quite clear. What is being proposed is a replacement facility for the Ibrox Sports Trust and a new community centre. In the case of Glasgow Harbour, part of that benefits come through the provision of the site for the Transport Museum, which Mr. Jamieson spoke about. And so we feel there's a whole range of benefits in here, and they're to be negotiated. I think we've always got to be very careful that if we are seeking planning gain and development contributions, they're done with all due propriety and it's quite clear that that benefit is being secured against the project, and what is being secured is actually relevant toward the project is trying to deliver.

**MAN:** Yes. Could I just ask in the context of those sites where you have land ownership. Would some sort of share in on running profits be something you might think about, so there'd be a long-term legacy?

**STEVEN INCH:** Yes.

**MAN:** You would look at that.

**STEVEN INCH:** Yes.

**MAN:** Thank you. Could I ask another question, Chairman, whilst I have the microphone. Sustainability is a much sort of discussed principle. Mr. Inch, what sort of conscious steps does your council take in trying to secure sustainability in new developments, and I'm thinking perhaps in the context of the casino. How would you go about that in your appraisal process? In terms of the development, that is, I mean, not the licence obviously.

**STEVEN INCH:** We again have got a track record of working with developers on major projects to apply the principles of sustainable development. For example the council has got a sustainable construction policy in place, and we're trying to develop agreements with developers about the sorts of building materials they use recycling systems, water recycling, sustainable urban drainage and we looked at all of that in development proposals and we've done that with some success. All

of these projects are on land which is or has been brown-field land. Therefore we are meeting the council's and the Scottish Executive's derelict land reclamation targets. We are very careful, and we mentioned this earlier, about the transport infrastructure investments which are being made, and we're hoping to see the moral shift move from private to public transport as a consequence of those developments. So we think we are pursuing sustainable transport solutions, sustainable drainage and water solutions, sustainable construction solutions, and of course the ultimate test of sustainability is to come up with a business that actually covers its cost and makes a profit.

**MAN:** Thank you. Chairman, is that something which the developers round the table would subscribe to?

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes, Mr. Jamieson?

**EUAN JAMIESON:** Yes, that is certainly something that we would subscribe to. The whole redevelopment of the Glasgow Harbour site, which as Steve said, was largely derelict and brown-field, has been done without taking any material to landfill, it's all been successfully re-used and remediated through the site, and a lot of the demolition materials to the tune of about 95% at the moment have been successfully re-incorporated into the new hard landscaping.

**MAN:** And Chair, can I add to that, at the SECC site we're looking at, it was an infilled dock. As I say, it's just grey car-parking at the moment so we've already surveyed the site and checked it for contamination, and fortunately it's free, but in terms of sustainability, one of the things that we would be able to achieve with the critical mass of a casino is a local heat and power plant with energy costs going through the roof all the time and the uncertainty going forward. This is something we're looking for and working with Glasgow Council for a method to turn waste into a fuel. That fuel then is transportable to local generation and heat, but of course you need a critical mass of buildings on the site to make it actually work, so that's another thing that we are looking at to add to the sustainability of a casino development.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. There's one last question we always ask of people. I think everybody that's wanting a regional casino, saying that their place is unique, I think I'm going to turn the question the other way round. Councillor Paris is catching my eye. In what way is Glasgow singularly un-unique, such that it shouldn't have a casino?

**MARY PARIS:** I think it's very difficult to answer that question when ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Well, you don't have to.

**MARY PARIS:** ... we have no one, I'll merely reiterate a point that's been made already, that I don't feel that I have the information in front of me that would allow me to give a full and proper answer to that question.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** No, no, fair enough. I mean, you mentioned that, it seems a long time ago now, it was only this morning, that, I mean, you mentioned, didn't you, that there was, you know, the special social problems of Glasgow. I suppose I could have asked at the time, are they much worse than in many other places do you think?

**MARY PARIS:** I honestly couldn't say, and I think the emphasis in ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** No, well, fair enough. I don't want to press you, I merely wanted to give you the opportunity to say.

**MARY PARIS:** I really don't feel that I'm adequately prepared to answer that particular question.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes. All right then, thanks. I'll turn the question round the usual way then. Of all the things you've said today, Mr. Inch, and you've heard said, what is it that makes Glasgow unique?

**STEVEN INCH:** I think what Glasgow has that no other city or town on your short list has got is the breadth and the depth of the financial advice networks we have in Glasgow. We spent the best part of three years, as I said earlier, coming up with a financial exclusion strategy. The Scottish Executive are now adopting those principles and starting to spread them more widely within Scotland. I think we've been innovative and adventurous. We've worked with, as I said, the 27 advice providers in Glasgow to come up with a single system that everybody's adhered to. They're all using the same computer technology software, so we are now in a position I think to measure exactly what the nature of debt is in Glasgow, why it occurs, what that debt is, and we can then plug that into the refinement of the services these organisations provide to make sure that they actually provide the right services. We're also in a position to measure what financial savings individuals can now make through using these services, so we can do a cost benefit study to show what we spend on it and what we generate by having debt reprofiled, refactured and debt's simply extinguished. That's being taken forward at the moment by the establishment of a new community bank with the private sector, which is our latest attempt to reduce the number of people in Glasgow who are dependent on borrowing at very high levels of interest, and that community bank's based on a model we've seen in Lancashire which works extremely well, and I think all of these things do position us very well to provide the pilot approach you are seeking, to be able to measure what a casino actually does to an area, what it does in terms of debt and how that debt can be mitigated and what particular initiatives work, and I don't think any other city, judging by the submissions I've seen, offer you that.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. Mr. Patrick.

**STUART PATRICK:** I'll just add to Steve's comment to suggest that some of the things which are unusual in Glasgow, not that I'll say they're unique entirely, but they are unusual in Glasgow. The local development company network of those agencies that have been funded through a mixture of public/private support to work in local community areas to champion the regeneration of areas and their track record for the past 20 years, having those involved in the delivery of the benefits, the employment benefits to local people, that is not something you'll find very often round the country, and in particular I would refer you to the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development who review experience and economic development regularly around the world and who would highlight the local development companies as a very specific mechanism in Glasgow.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you.

**LESLEY SAWERS:** Chairman could I also come in because I think Mr. Inch is actually being quite modest.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes, Ms Sawers, sorry, didn't hear you.

**LESLEY SAWERS:** And I actually think that Glasgow has one probably, I'm not a urban regeneration expert but I think Glasgow City Council has one of the strongest track records in the UK in terms of delivering results, and actually over the last 20 years it's tackled some of the, you know, the most horrific social challenges that any city in the UK has faced, so I think if any city can make a super casino work in terms of its regeneration, it's got to be Glasgow, and as someone who's only recently returned to Glasgow to work over the last two years, the private and public partnerships that exist in this city I think are second to none. It's a city that definitely works very much as a team and I'm sure that all the operators here today, the agencies represented, will ensure that we put in place the safeguards to get the maximum benefits with any minimum negative consequences to this city.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Thank you. Councillor Paris or Mr. Rolwegan, I'm just about to wind things up but is there anything you feel we've missed?

**KEN ROLWEGAN:** Well, I said it right at the beginning, that I was really encouraged by the redevelopment that we've seen over these last 30 years in the city, and I don't think it's going to be enhanced in any way. We are on the map, we're a city of culture and of leisure second to none, across the whole city, and I don't see this as being an advantage at all.

**MARY PARIS:** I'm still here too.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** It's the first time anybody's attempted to applaud. It is noted, not necessarily with approval but thank you. Just about to draw things to a close. Mr. Taylor.

**SCOTT TAYLOR:** Thank you very much, Chairman for the opportunity to speak. I think in terms of what makes Glasgow different is its market positioning. Glasgow's rebranded itself and repositioned itself very successfully over the years, and Glasgow's got the style as a very strong strategic brand fit for the casino, the casino fits in very well with the proposition that Glasgow has to offer in the national and international market-place.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Councillor Paris.

**MARY PARIS:** Still me, yes. Well, just to say that, as I pointed out, it's hard to know what to make of economic and social consequences without more detailed figures. At present, if I had to vote on whether or not we had a casino, I would be I think against, but I'm prepared to look at a lot more information before I'd come to a final decision. I still feel there is a very great need for consultation far more widely within the city of Glasgow, with the people of Glasgow, and with the various organisations that might have an interest here. And just to finish off, I think you might be surprised perhaps to hear that I've greatly enjoyed and appreciated this day because it's the first opportunity I've had to debate openly and freely the kind of issues that are involved here. We heard reference to vigorous debate within the council, but if so, I wasn't there. There may well have been within the Labour group, I wouldn't know. There may well have been on Policy and Resources Committee, I'm not a member of it. All that happens in full council is that we approve the minutes of such a committee and it's a whipped vote. My own party put one motion to council in June of this year, asking for more consultation with the general public. What happens is, classically what happens in such cases, I proposed the motion, one of my colleagues seconded it, a Labour spokesperson replied, we had a whipped vote and we all went home, so I really do appreciate the fact that I've been able to speak in front of you today.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Well, it's kind of you to say that. I mean, I do like people to enjoy these proceedings, which is why I don't make it all sort of Gestapo style. Well, frankly, I do believe in getting the best out of people and the best professional opinions and not just to be wound up to say something silly. But the last word conventionally goes to the proposing authority. In case there's anything that, if you bring anything new in, you won't be thanked, and if there's anything you feel has been missed ...

**TOM McWILLIAMS:** Chair, sorry, just before Steve does his last remarks ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Yes, Mr. McWilliam.

**TOM McWILLIAMS:** Glasgow certainly is on the map but in relation to your original question about turning it round to whether we're unique enough not to have it, Glasgow's not complacent. There are over 200 competing countries in the world now and we need to expand our visitor attraction to continue the regeneration of the city, so that's why we need to look at proposals like this.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** OK, thank you.

**STEVEN INCH:** Again, very briefly, Professor, without wishing to repeat too much of what's been said, I think in his introduction this morning ...

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** I'd be grateful if you didn't repeat any of it.

**STEVEN INCH:** I'll say it in a way that sounds different. I think very briefly five points. I think the city council's view is that a regional casino offers the potential to make a system boost to the regeneration of the city. It will certainly accelerate the regeneration of some of the riverside projects, and that is obviously a huge factor in terms of taking the city forward into the future. We see the project as having major physical regeneration benefits. We see the project as having major employment benefits, not just to the city but to the surrounding areas. We see it as having the potential to make a major contribution towards tackling unemployment in some of the areas in Glasgow which have got very high inactivity rates and high levels of worklessness. We think we've got the appropriate procedures in place to link opportunity with need both in physical terms and in social and work terms, and we think, and this was subject to quite extensive discussion in the council, at Policy and Resources Committee, I'm sorry, Councillor Paris, it was at that committee and the first time it was discussed, the leader of the council wanted more information on the social cost, potential social costs, before he would make his mind up and take it back to committee, and I think we've got a lot of effort into looking at the services we provide and the potential responses, so we think, although there will be challenges in there and there will be social cost, we think we've got the procedures and processes in place a) to prevent and b) to mitigate, so we think we've got the square very truly squared off, so to speak.

**PROFESSOR STEPHEN CROW:** Well, thank you very much, Mr. Inch. I think it only remains for me to thank everybody very much, all the participants. I know that what has been said today of course is only the tip of the iceberg in a lot of the preparation that you've all done, so thank you all very much for your attendance. Thanks very much to the members of the public for coming along, would that there were perhaps more of you, but there we are. So, thank you all very much. The examination is now closed, and may God bless your visit, may God bless your travel home. Thank you.